## NEGOTIATING BEING MAPUCHE AND MIDDLE-CLASS: THE EXPERIENCES OF SOCIAL MOBILITY OF THE MAPUCHE INDIGENOUS PEOPLE IN CHILE

A thesis submitted to The University of Manchester for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Faculty of Humanities

2018

DENISSE SEPÚLVEDA SÁNCHEZ SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

### Contents

Abstra	act		6
Declar	ation:		8
Copyr	ight Stat	ement	9
Ackno	wledge	ment	10
		roducing the disadvantage of the Mapuche people and examining their f social mobility in the Chilean context	12
1.1	Introdu	ction	12
1.2	Who	o are the Mapuche people and what is their social context?	18
1.3	Thesis s	tructure and argument	25
Chapt	er 2: Lin	king the analysis of class mobility with ethnic and post-colonial relations	35
2.1	Introdu	ction	35
2.2	Social m	nobility and education	39
2	.2.1 Soc	ial mobility and meritocracy	40
2	.2.2 Edu	cation and Bourdieusian class analysis	44
2	.2.3 Cla	ss identities and the cultural approach	51
2	.2.4 Soc	ial mobility and class identities in Chile	55
2.3	Intersec	tionality	60
2	.3.1 Mo	re than gender, ethnicity and class: intersectionality	60
2	.3.2 Stu	dies of intersectionality: middle-class education and ethnic minorities	63
2	.3.3 Pos	t-coloniality	66
2.4	Conclus	ion	69
Chapt	er 3: Me	ethodology: Researching Mapuche social mobility	71
3.1	Introdu	ction	71
3.2	Rese	earching the consequences of social mobility through a biographical perspe	ctive
3	.2.1 Life	history as a research method	74
3.3	Intro	oducing Mapuche with higher education	79
3.4	The	fieldwork	83
3	.4.1	Pilot interviews	83
3	.4.2	Between Temuco and Santiago	86
3.4.3		The experience of conducting the interviews	89
3	.4.4	Introducing the participants	
3	.4.5	Research positionality	99

	3.5	Data analysis	101
	3.6	Conclusion	102
Ch	apter 4	l: The road to university	104
	4.1 Int	roduction	104
	4.2 The	e contexts of social mobility	106
	4.2.2	I Parental background	106
	4.2.2	2 Early schooling	111
	4.2.3	3 Migration experiences	116
	4.3 Ov	ercoming obstacles on the road to success	119
	4.3.2	The contribution of parents	120
	4.3.2	2 Problems with the Chilean educational system	126
	4.3.3	3 The role of teachers	131
	4.3.4	1 Unequal access to resources and opportunities	134
	4.3.5	5 Class and ethnic discrimination	137
	4.4 Co	nclusion	140
Chapter 5: The process of identification and changing identities			142
	5.1 Int	roduction	142
	5.2 The	e challenge of upward social mobility for people's sense of class and ethnic identity	146
		I Introducing the groups: the 'mobile accommodators', the 'rooted' and the 're-ifiers'	147
	_	2 Being a professional and 'fish out of water' experiences	
		Meritocratic narratives	
	5.2.4	4 Gender Narratives	158
	5.3 Mc	ving up and fitting in - mobile accommodators	162
		L Strategies to 'fit in'	
	5.3.2	2 Ambivalent narratives	167
	5.4 Sta	ying true to your roots	170
	5.4.2	L Dis-identification with the (white) Chilean middle-class	171
	5.5 Coı	nclusion	178
		5: The re-signifiers: the politicization of Mapuche identities	
	•	roduction	
	6.2 The	e social context of the re-signifiers	185
		The role of family in downplaying their Mapuche identity	

6.2.2 Family encouragement to attend university and be successful	. 187	
6.2.3 Discrimination experiences from non-Mapuche and Mapuche	. 189	
6.3.1 Dilemmas in framing class identities	. 192	
6.3.2 When you are not a proper Mapuche: strategies to 'fit in' with Mapuche culture.	. 195	
6.4 The politicization of identities	. 198	
6.4.1 'Making myself Mapuche'	. 199	
6.4.2 Us and them: distinction and legitimation of Mapuche identities	. 201	
6.4.3 The politicisation of Mapuche identities	. 202	
6.5 Conclusion	. 206	
Chapter 7: Conclusion: The complex and entangled upward social mobility experiences of the Mapuche people		
7.1 Introduction	. 209	
7.2 The argument of the thesis	. 210	
7.3 The consequences of social mobility: theoretical and methodological implications	. 217	
Appendices		
Appendix One: Summary of participants	. 223	
Santiago	. 223	
Temuco	. 229	
Appendix Two: Interview schedule	. 235	
Appendix Three: Consent Form	. 238	
Appendix Four: Participant Information Sheet	. 240	
References	. 242	

### List of tables

Table 3.1: Achieved characteristics of the sample8	Ю
Table 3.2: Research sampling strategy8	3
Table 3.3: Araucanía respondents9	5
Table 3.4: Metropolitan respondents9	6
Table 4.1: Overview of the rural/urban migration and class experiences of respondents and	
their families from the Metropolitan region	18
Table 4.2: Overview of the rural/urban migration and class experiences of respondents and	
their families from the Araucanía region11	.0
Table 5.1: Differences among the group of respondents, according to class and indigenous	
dentities and social mobility	0
List of figures	
Figure 3.1: Snowball map8	7
Figure 3.2: Pictures of the demonstrations by Mapuche people in Temuco and Santiago and the	e
occupation of Conadi in Temuco9	2

Word count: 72,773

### **Abstract**

This thesis explores how upward social mobility impacts on the racial and class cultures of Mapuche indigenous people with higher education in Chile, and how this affects their social identities. The research focuses in particular on a sample of socially mobile Mapuche, the biggest indigenous group in Chile, who have managed to achieve a university education and experienced some degree of upward social mobility in their subsequent occupations. This experience of social mobility is often challenging and creates cultural and social tensions, which requires the complex negotiation and renegotiation of identity.

Methodologically, this research adopts a qualitative perspective, examining the life trajectories of the respondents in order to explore the challenges that social mobility creates for groups who are disadvantaged in terms of both their class and ethnic position, and examines how my Mapuche sample negotiated their mobility transitions using a variety of different strategies. It is built on data collected through interviews with a group of 40 educationally mobile Mapuche people who live (i) in the Metropolitan region, where the capital city Santiago is located, or (ii) in the predominantly rural Araucanía region in southern Chile, which historically was part of the Mapuche 'homeland'. The interviews were focused on highlighting their most significant educational and work experiences in their life trajectories.

The argument of this thesis contributes to the understanding of social mobility of indigenous groups from a multi-dimensional perspective, examining how mobility affects both class and ethnic social positioning. In order to understand this, I use a Bourdieusian framework to analyse the process of social mobility transition. The Bourdieusian approach is particularly useful for understanding a key empirical theme that emerges in the sample's mobility experiences, in which they narrate the difficulties of transition as leading to feeling like a 'fish out of water' in their new social locations. However, a cultural class approach does not sufficiently address the intersectional influence of

ethnicity on mobility processes, so I also use a more intersectional analysis to explore how, within my sample, people deployed several strategies in order to negotiate mobility transitions and to 'fit in' to their new social location.

I show that the participants faced considerable difficulties and disadvantages during their attendance at university, but despite these difficulties they all experienced some degree of upward social mobility. However, their experiences of mobility meant that had to face the tensions of racism as well as class and ethnic boundaries which meant that they had to renegotiate not only their class but also their Mapuche identities. I argue that we can see three main different types of responses, dividing the respondents into three groups: the 'mobile accommodators', the 'rooted' and 're-signifiers'. For the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted', their class identities become their dominant identities but in divergent ways (with the 'mobile accommodators' adopting middle-class identities, whereas the 'rooted' stressed their working-class origins). For a third group, the 're-signifiers', their indigenous identities became their dominant identities often with a renewed and politicized focus on their ethnic positioning. These widely varying responses to the experience of mobility show the complexity and dynamic nature of how people manage their identities in processes of transition.

I argue that it is necessary to move beyond both conventional as well as cultural class accounts of social mobility because such approaches cannot properly take into account the additional dimension of ethnic identity transitions which are necessary to fully understand the social mobility experiences of my Mapuche sample. Furthermore, such an analysis requires a post-colonial perspective to take into account the complex positioning of the Mapuche people within Chilean society. I therefore also argue that it is necessary to understand the process of social mobility from a decolonial perspective.

### **Declaration:**

No portion of the work referred to in the thesis has been submitted in support of an application for another degree or qualification of this or any other university or other institute of learning.

### **Copyright Statement**

The author of this thesis (including any appendices and/or schedules to this thesis) owns certain copyright or related rights in it (the "Copyright") and she has given The University of Manchester certain rights to use such Copyright, including for administrative purposes.

Copies of this thesis, either in full or in extracts and whether in hard or electronic copy, may be made only in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (as amended) and regulations issued under it or, where appropriate, in accordance with licensing agreements which the University has from time to time. This page must form part of any such copies made.

The ownership of certain Copyright, patents, designs, trademarks and other intellectual property (the "Intellectual Property") and any reproductions of copyright works in the thesis, for example graphs and tables ("Reproductions"), which may be described in this thesis, may not be owned by the author and may be owned by third parties. Such Intellectual Property and Reproductions cannot and must not be made available for use without the prior written permission of the owner(s) of the relevant Intellectual Property and/or Reproductions.

Further information on the conditions under which disclosure, publication and commercialisation of this thesis, the Copyright and any Intellectual Property University IP Policy (see http://documents.manchester.ac.uk/display.aspx?DocID=24420), in any relevant Thesis restriction declarations deposited in the University Library, The University Library's regulations (see http://www.library.manchester.ac.uk/about/regulations/) and in The University's policy on Presentation of Theses.

### Acknowledgement

First and foremost, my sincere gratitude goes to my supervisors Dr. Wendy Bottero and Professor Bridget Byrne for their constant support even in difficult times, for their wise guidance throughout this thesis and their encouragement. Both as intelligent and powerful women show me that the path inside the academia is possible, and I hope there were more researchers like you.

I want to say thank to my advisor Dr. Andrew Webb who from Chile provided insightful advice and comments to my thesis. Also, I would like to say thanks to Dr. James Rhodes for his helpful and useful comments during all the annual review meetings.

Next, my gratitude to all the participants who are part of my research. Thank you for letting me know about your significant stories, sharing sensible moments and teaching me about your constant fight for a fair world. I hope this thesis contributes to making visible your stories. Also, I want to thank to all the people who helped me during the fieldwork.

I have been very lucky to share this process with my amazing friends that I have met in Manchester: to Chiara who became my sister, for the constant support, kindness and honesty, thanks for those long conversations about being sociologists and trying to change the world; To Cesar that we share the same contemptuous sense of humour, thanks for your support in difficult times; thanks to Andrea for those sociological teas and constant support; to all my sociology friends Alejandro M., Rohini, Ali, Tugba, Rachel, Jingran, Alejandro and Francisca; to all my friends in Manchester Anilena, Aurora, Anita, Patricio, Giulia, Pablo, Italo, Sofia, Paulina Y., Jose, Paulina R., Mauricio, Paula, Hugo, Pato, Felix, Thomas, Angelica and Tania. Thanks to all my friends in Chile, Katy, Barbara, Daniela, Giannina, Carlo, Pilar and Claudia.

My special thanks go to Felipe, thank you for being my partner, my friend, my adviser, thanks for adding fun to this journey, thanks for all your love. Thanks to my parents and my sister who from distance always supported me, thanks for their unconditional love and for believing in me through all these years. This thesis is dedicated to my family, hope this thesis does justice to your stories.

This thesis was supported by Beca Chile-Conicyt and sponsored by COES and CIIR.

# Chapter 1: Introducing the disadvantage of the Mapuche people and examining their experiences of social mobility in the Chilean context

### 1.1 Introduction

This thesis explores the situation of those Mapuche people who have experienced social mobility via access to higher education. More specifically, the thesis addresses the question: how do the social mobility transitions of Mapuche with higher education impact on their racial and class cultures and affect their social identities? To explore this question, I focus my research on people who identify as Mapuche (the biggest indigenous group in Chile) and who are the first generation to attend university. In general terms, the thesis draws on a sample of 40 life stories recounted by a group of educationally mobile Mapuche people who live (i) in the Metropolitan region, where the capital city Santiago is located, and (ii) in the predominantly rural Araucanía region in southern Chile, which historically was part of the Mapuche 'homeland'. In my thesis, I show that the participants faced considerable difficulties and disadvantages during their attendance at university, but, despite these difficulties, they all experienced some degree of upward social mobility. However, their experiences of mobility meant that they had to face the tensions of racism as well as class and ethnic boundaries which meant that they had to renegotiate not only their class but also their Mapuche identities.

The research focuses in particular on a sample of socially mobile Mapuche from the Metropolitan and Araucanía regions in Chile, to compare how the urban and rural aspects of Mapuche culture and disadvantage affect social mobility experiences. The thesis explores the challenges that social mobility creates for groups who are disadvantaged in terms of both their class and ethnic position and examines how my Mapuche sample negotiated their mobility transitions using a variety of different strategies. The starting point of this analysis is the disadvantage and discrimination that the Mapuche face in Chile. Since the period of the Spanish conquest (in 1540), indigenous groups in Chile have faced severe economic, social, territorial, and cultural inequalities.

In fact, there has been a long history of conflict between indigenous peoples and the Chilean State. According to Yopo (2012: 192) this conflict and the denial of the existence and rights of indigenous peoples is demonstrated through 'land deprivation, violence and discrimination, and attempts at co-optation by Chilean society'.

More generally, according to the World Bank (2017), Chile is a country with a deep level of economic inequality, with a Gini index of 47.7 in 2015. A series of Chilean researchers (Garretón and Cumsille, 2002, Bonnefoy, 2013, Castillo, 2009, 2011, Barozet, 2013) have argued that Chilean society has tolerated, accepted and legitimized deep inequalities, especially in the middle and working class (Barozet, 2013). Therefore, it seems that inequalities are a structural problem in Chile. According to Bonnefoy (2013) and Barozet (2013), the presence of some inequalities in Chile is generally recognised, but there are many other inequalities which are invisible, socially accepted and legitimised, especially inequalities which relate to ethnic and gender issues. In that sense, minorities such as the Mapuche people have been invisibilised and discrimination against them has been legitimised. As Stavenhagen (2001) notes, the indigenous peoples in Latin America have had to deal with a disadvantaged position over several centuries, and that disadvantaged position has become something considered 'normal' in those societies. As we later shall see in greater detail, the Mapuche have experienced a significant level of historical disadvantage and remain highly disadvantaged today. However, although many ethnic and gendered inequalities remain unacknowledged in Chile, in 1992, the government introduced an indigenous scholarship scheme to enable more indigenous people to access university. Here we see the problematic policy emphasis on educational mobility as the solution to deep structural inequalities, which – as will be discussed in chapter 2 - has been critiqued by social mobility researchers. However, as a result of this initiative there is a small group of Mapuche people who, despite considerable difficulties, have managed to achieve a university education, either by gaining access to these indigenous scholarships or by going into debt in order to pay university fees. This group has experienced some degree of upward social mobility in their subsequent occupations. It is this experience of social mobility, often challenging and creating cultural and social tensions which require the complex negotiation and renegotiation of identity, that is at the centre of the thesis.

I was drawn to this research because I share a similar background with my participants. I am second generation Mapuche, which means that my father has a Mapuche surname<sup>1</sup>, though I do not. As a result, people do not usually identify me immediately with Mapuche culture, though I am also very aware of the disadvantage faced by the Mapuche people. I also belong to a working-class family from Temuco city, in the Araucanía region, and I am the first generation in my family to attend university. I therefore have first-hand experience of migration and upward educational mobility. Hence, before I started this research, I was wondering, what has happened to people with similar experiences of social mobility? In their new social position, how does their new middle-class status affect their ethnic positioning: are they escaping from the popular stereotypes of minorities or do they still suffer discrimination and racism? What struggles of identity and belonging do they face? What are their narratives about class, gender and race? And what is their relationship with Mapuche culture? Of course, from these questions I reveal my own positionality in doing this research, something which I also address in my methodological discussion. However, as my literature review discusses, it is also the case that a significant strand of social mobility research has raised the question of the social and cultural dislocations and identity challenges experienced by the socially mobile. These challenges are often understood in terms of social class transitions, but it is also clear that questions of ethnic social position complicate this story. However, there is little work on the social mobility of the Mapuche or other indigenous groups. Nowadays, research about Mapuche people focuses on making visible their structural inequalities, for example, there is a group of Mapuche historians that are working on positioning the Mapuche perspective on the relation between Chilean state and indigenous people. So, another reason for my interest in doing this research is the lack of studies focused on the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Mapuche surnames are very recognisable as different from other surnames, because the phonetic common Mapuche surnames are Catrileo, Lemunao, Antileo, Huera, Quidel among others.

narratives of indigenous people about their experiences of upward social mobility, considered from a multi-dimensional perspective, that is examining how mobility affects both class and ethnic social positioning. Most studies about the Mapuche and indigenous groups in Chile are about experiences of discrimination (Merino, 2007; Montecino, 1993; San Martín, 2001; Fundación Ideas National Survey, 1997, 2000, Merino and Pilleux 2003; Merino and Quilaqueo, 2004; Aillañir, 2002), the historical conflict about Mapuche land between the Chilean state and the Mapuche people (PNUD 2013; Pairican 2013; Ordenes 2016; Caniuqueo 2006; Carvajal and Peralta 2006; Tricot 2013), or studies about interculturalism and the recovery of the Mapuche language (Wittig, 2009; Duran, Catriquir and Hernández, 2007; Giannelli, 2008; Salas, 1987). As a result, the research in this thesis attempts to fill a gap, by examining the challenges faced by socially mobile Mapuche in their transition to their new social contexts, focusing in particular on how their experience of transition is not only bound up with changes in their class position, but also with their ethnic and gender positioning and identities, and is further complicated by their geographical location and cultural values.

As mentioned before, I approach the research with the following question: how do the social mobility transitions of Mapuche with higher education impact on their racial and class cultures and affect their social identities? However, I divide this overarching research question into four sub-questions:

- What are the identity consequences of social mobility for those Mapuche people who enter higher education?
- Do these socially mobile Mapuche experience disruption in their transitions to new social contexts?
- What social and cultural strategies do socially mobile Mapuche people employ to cope with the experience of social mobility?
- How do the discourses of socially mobile Mapuche reflect on experiencing racism and discrimination?

This thesis examines the experience of upward social mobility of the Mapuche people and how they negotiate their class and indigenous identities during it. In order to understand this, I use a Bourdieusian framework (Bourdieu, 2010, 1984, 1979; Bourdieu and Passeron, 1977; Reay, 1998; Friedman, 2016; Savage 2001) to analyse the process of social mobility transition, as it is this framework which has the most developed approach to understanding the dislocations experienced by the socially mobile. The Bourdieusian approach to class also places the greatest emphasis on class identities, and in this thesis, I examine how my research participants negotiated their mobility transitions in ways which had important consequences for their identity constructions, but in divergent ways. However, a cultural class approach does not sufficiently address the influence of ethnicity on mobility processes, and so I also use a more intersectional analysis to explore how, within my sample, people deployed several strategies in order to negotiate mobility transitions and to 'fit in' to their new social location. To fully analyse these strategies, social position, social identity and social mobility must all be understood in terms of both class and ethnicity.

In my empirical chapters, I identify three groups of respondents in terms their different negotiations of the experience of mobility. The first group, the 'mobile accommodators' adopted middle-class identities, and in the process of accommodating to their new status distanced themselves from their formative (working-class) identity as well as also distancing themselves from a Mapuche identity. The second group, the 'rooted', stressed their working-class origins, and despite their experience of upward mobility maintained a sense of continuity with an 'authentic' working class identity. Finally, for a third group, the 're-signifiers', their indigenous identities became their dominant identities during their negotiation of mobility, often with a renewed and politicized focused on their ethnic positioning. In order to fully analyse these different strategies, my study also finally considers post-colonial theories (Hall 1996; Canales and Rea, 2013; Antileo, 2012), which help to understand the internal process of colonisation in which the Mapuche people are situated. Most of the Mapuche participants in this study, for example, have suffered some kind of discrimination due to their indigenous heritage, but also have lost

elements of their Mapuche culture. Furthermore, Mapuche identity and culture are strongly stigmatised in Chile, which provokes tensions between being both 'middle-class' and Mapuche, a conflict that all my socially mobile participants experienced and had to negotiate. However, despite this process of colonisation, the 're-signifiers' group were able to re-politicise their Mapuche identity, as a form of agency over their identities. The detachment from Mapuche culture was particularly strong for the re-signifiers group, who grew up in urban 'mestiza' environments, with very limited contact with Mapuche communities or practices. However, despite this, it was this group of participants who came to stress their ethnic identity after their experience of social mobility, and who started to politicise their Mapuche identities. I also show that this 'resignification' process is only one response to the process of colonisation, and that we can see multiple strategies to living in a disadvantaged position, politically, economically and socially.

My contribution to the field of social mobility is to extend the body of research which demonstrates that the experience of upward social mobility often has negative consequences creating dilemmas of social inclusion, identities and belonging, by incorporating a greater emphasis on ethnicity as a feature of these processes. I focus on a minority group whose experiences make it clear that it is not enough to analyse people's transitions in terms of just their class since their transitions are also bound up with dislocations and pressures on their ethnic positioning and identity. Hence, we need to draw on other perspectives to comprehend the consequences of social mobility in a more fully intersectional and post-colonial way. Therefore, my research contribution is to demonstrate that looking at class or ethnicity alone and without an appreciation of the post-coloniality of the Chilean context is inadequate for understanding the situation of the Mapuche. What is needed is an approach that is able to analyse all these factors together, and I attempt to do so in this thesis by integrating the Bourdieusian perspective with intersectional and post-colonial theorising, in order to examine how people, negotiate their social location and identities, not only in terms of class but also in terms of ethnicity, gender and migration. In order to do so it is first necessary to establish the social context of the Mapuche people in Chile, and to consider how they are situated in a position which is shaped by a historic process of violent colonial dispossession which has contributed to their current disadvantage. In the next section I briefly focus on that history and social context.

### 1.2 Who are the Mapuche people and what is their social context?

There are nine indigenous groups in Chile: the Atacameño, Aymara, Colla, Diaguita, Kawashkar, Mapuche, Quechua, Rapa Nui, and the Yagán people. Of these, the Mapuche people are the largest indigenous group in the country. According to the CASEN survey (2015) 9.0 per cent of the Chilean population identifies as indigenous and 83.3 per cent of this population is Mapuche. In the 16th century when Chile was conquered by the Spanish, the Mapuche occupied a large area, from the Copiapo river to Chiloe Island, and from the Atlantic to the Pacific Ocean. The Mapuche territories (Wallmapu in the Mapudungun language) made up a large part of what are now the states of Chile and Argentina (Ruiz, 2008). Today, 81.6 per cent of the Mapuche live in urban areas (CASEN 2015). The language of the Mapuche is Mapudungun, which is an oral language transferred from generation to generation.

Among the Mapuche, there is a concern about the loss of Mapuche culture, due to several factors, such as migration, the assimilation of Mapuche people into Chilean society, and discrimination. According to Antileo (2007), after the occupation of the Araucanía region in the 19th century, the Mapuche people were plunged into poverty. The dramatic loss of their land to the Chilean state led to a wave of migration to urban areas. The Mapuche have continued to migrate to the capital and other cities in search of better opportunities. According to Chernard (2006), when Mapuche people arrive in cities, they frequently hide their indigenous identities, in order to integrate into Chilean society and also because Mapuche values and practices are less appreciated in urban areas compared with rural areas. The parents of many of my research participants migrated to cities as children with their parents and suffered discrimination in schools and then in employment. According to Castro (2001), most of the Mapuche people who migrated to Santiago have occupations related to manual labour and to domestic service,

because of their low level of scholarship. Many decided not to teach their children about Mapuche culture and language to protect them from discrimination. They also wanted their children to gain a good education that included university study. When the Mapuche people started to attend schools and universities, these institutions did not embrace intercultural perspectives and did not include indigenous knowledge or culture in the curriculum.

Racism in Chile is a deeply rooted issue, that can be explicit or implicit, according to the dynamic of power relations. The relationship between the Mapuche population and the Chilean state has historically been characterised by colonial injustice, economic disadvantage, racism and discrimination (Ruiz 2008). First, the Spanish were in conflict with the Mapuche people during the 'Arauco war' from 1536 to 1818 (Bengoa, 1996). Then the Chilean government (from 1818 until now) has tried to subdue the Mapuche people and seize Mapuche land through various colonising processes, including militarisation of Mapuche regions, the introduction of Christianity and the spread of Spanish 'settler' colonists (Ruiz 2008).

Among the numerous conflicts between various Chilean governments and the Mapuche population, there was the "Pacification of Araucanía" (1859-1882) which, despite the name, was a violent process that recontinued the invasion and occupation of Mapuche territories in agreement with the Argentine government (Ruiz, 2008). Then the Chilean government started military action (in 1862) to integrate the Mapuche land into the Chilean state, because they saw the Mapuche as a threat to their sovereignty (Ruiz, 2008) and did not recognise the Mapuche population as another nation. From 1884 to 1927, the Chilean government had the objective of the settlement of land and for that they mobilised foreign colonists (most from Germany, Italy and France) and started to reduce the land occupied by the Mapuche people, leaving the rest of the territories for free to the new colonists. During the Pinochet military regime (1973-1990), two laws were created (N°2.568 and N°2.750) with the objective of reducing the size of Mapuche properties and integrating them into regional and national trade (Ruiz, 2008). According

to these laws, when the land was divided, they were no longer considered to be indigenous. Despite Mapuche resistance, nowadays the Mapuche properties are reduced more than 90%, and they have been transferred to Chilean people through clauses which allow them to rent the land for 99 years.

After the military dictatorship (1973-1990), there was a consensus to settle the historical debt owed by the Chilean state to indigenous peoples. Therefore, in 1990 in Chile the recognition of indigenous people was proposed. In 1993 the "New Indigenous Law" (19,253) was approved, and 'For the first time in the country's history, Mapuche demands were recognized as ethnic demands. The law prohibited the sale of indigenous land to non-indigenous persons' (Waldman, 2012: 59). According to Ruiz (2008) there is growing awareness among the Mapuche of their rights, and a growing demand for dignity though this is partly in response to continuing disadvantage, lack of rights, and colonialist actions by the Chilean state. In 2004, Mapuche protests increased and the government used the Anti-Terrorist Law, which had been introduced during the dictatorship period, to combat them. This enabled the state to prosecute the Mapuche involved in protests as acts of "terrorism" and to increase the sentences of those convicted (Richards 2010; Waldman, 2012). Nowadays, 'many Mapuche areas are still occupied by the military; hundreds of Mapuche have been investigated for actions related to the conflict; there have been illegal searches, interrogations, intelligencegathering operations, use of armed force and human-rights violations' (Waldman, 2012: 63). Waldman (2012) considers that both Left and Right governments did not worry about the recognition of the Mapuche people's rights, and did not guarantee protection under the law, a proper demarcation of territories, or give any assurance of Mapuche rights over their natural resources. Moreover, these governments have continued to perpetrate injustices using institutionalized violence and the use of internal security and anti-terrorist laws, which allow protestors to be treated as criminals.

According to Merino (2007), Chilean society functions in quite a contradictory manner. While a public discourse of tolerance towards indigenous peoples exists, in terms of everyday relations and interactions, the dominant attitude is characterized by distance,

suspicion and prejudice, especially when dealing with Mapuche people. Stavenhagen (2001) argues that there are three kinds of racism that are present in Latin America: legal, personal and institutional. The first refers to legislation and rules that legitimize unequal treatment and so position some populations at a disadvantage. For example, according to Oyarce, et al. (2012), the state has responded to indigenous political movements and the re-occupation of Mapuche land with anti-terrorist legislation from the dictatorship period (1973-1989), militarizing Mapuche land and persecuting indigenous leaders. This state of affairs persists despite denunciations from human rights organizations. The second 'personal' kind of racism is related to stereotypes, prejudices and individual or collective preferences that enable more privileged groups to feel a sense of superiority over racialized groups. For example, a public discourse of tolerance is accompanied by everyday discourses and practices that present the Mapuche as primitive, ignorant, cognitively retarded, lazy, drunken and as an obstacle to progress (Merino, 2007). The third, 'institutional' kind of racism involves the differential treatment of ethnic minorities within public and private institutions. According to Matthew and Jeffrey (2015: 860) institutional racism refers to 'particular and general instances of racial discrimination, inequality, exploitation, and domination in organizational or institutional contexts, such as the labor market or the nation-state'. For example, most Chilean universities do not have classes in Mapudungun, only a few courses that focus on intercultural languages, and also do not include Mapuche history in the curriculum. Universities can therefore be challenging spaces for people who belong to groups considered as 'different' or 'inferior'. Stavenhagen (2001) suggests that in Latin America the manifestation of institutional racism can be subtler than in other countries, nonetheless racist practices are still sanctioned.

Further adding to the difficulties of the Mapuche people, in Chile during the period of the military dictatorship (1973-1989) a neo-liberal economic and political model was adopted which gradually removed the state's social obligations to citizens, reduced public investment in services and welfare, and deregulated markets. This greatly increased inequality in Chile. Despite the return to democracy, this model still

dominates. According to Espinoza, Barozet and Mendez (2013), Chile followed a radical neo-liberal system well before the United Kingdom and United States began their economic reforms in the 1980s. The new economic system in Chile was characterised by the massive privatization of the health and education sector and the public sector (Espinoza, Barozet and Mendez, 2013), 'leaving people to deal with the market individually' (Mendez, 2008:223). On the other hand, due to the neoliberal system expanding the need for and availability of credit there has been an increase in consumption from 1990s, generating new, more affluent life-styles mainly financed by loans and credit. The fact that people can have greater access to credit is related to general ideas in neoliberalism of self-investment, the individualisation of social outcomes, and meritocratic understandings of social success (and failure). In that sense, in terms of social class and mobility, more than 70% of Chilean people now identify as 'middle class' (Torche and Wormald, 2004; Espinoza, 2002). However, according to Mendez (2008) the Chilean middle-class has not increased in the last three decades. Moreover, Barozet (2017) indicates that such 'middle-class' families are characterised by: a monthly income of between 431.9 pounds and 1439.3 pounds per home, their members have finished secondary school and/or university studies, work as employees in the private or public services or have their own small business, and that only 30% of the Chilean population have 'middle-class' characteristics. In Chile 'during the last decade, the public policies focused on improving opportunities to people lost their efficacy, because the social mobility of the working and middle-class tends to be more rigid than before, and also the distance between the upper-class and working-class is still increasing' (Espinoza, Barozet and Mendez, 2013: 170). In Chile, the lack of a welfare state, the increase in consumption and loans, and the emphasis on meritocratic discourses are all related to the increasing perception of the importance of higher education for success in life.

In the case of Chile, while universities do not deny entrance to indigenous peoples, there are structural conditions that make university study difficult for them. For example, the

best universities in Chile are situated in Santiago, therefore people who live in the south of Chile (where most of the Mapuche population remain) have to migrate to obtain this better level of education. Another barrier is cost, as students must either pay university fees or seek a loan or a scholarship to cover tuition and living costs. According to CASEN (2017), 30 per cent of indigenous peoples in Chile live below the poverty line compared with 19.9% of non-indigenous people. Moreover, according to CASEN (2017) the incomes of indigenous people are approximately 412 pounds, 160 pounds lower than the average income of non-indigenous people. Consequently, the Mapuche people are three times less likely to complete higher education than the non-indigenous population of Chile (INE, 2012). It is important to recognize that most Mapuche have also suffered racial and class discrimination since childhood, because of their skin colour, their Mapuche last name, their way of speaking, or their lower socioeconomic background.

After the end of the dictatorship in 1990, the Chilean government started to implement new policies and initiatives toward indigenous peoples, including the formation of the National Indigenous Development Corporation CONADI (1993). CONADI works to develop policies to improve indigenous peoples' access to quality education. For example, the government created an indigenous scholarship scheme in 1992, to enable indigenous people with good marks and a vulnerable economic situation to stay in the education system (Benavente and Álvarez, 2012). Antileo (2012) argues that this transformation of the policies towards indigenous people in the 20<sup>th</sup> century could be interpreted as a shift in power relations between the 'dominant society' and the 'other'. Indeed, the context moved from territorial reduction policies, to assimilation policies during the dictatorship, to the current valuation of ethnic diversity. However, Antileo (2012: 12) suggests that the new multicultural polices focused on indigenous people (after the end of the dictatorship period in 1990) are not totally open to diversity, and represent a new form of colonialism that has transformed, but still retains boundaries between the 'other' (indigenous people) and the colonist. In that sense, the government

follows the interests of social control and domination that can be interpreted as the continuity of the colonial perspective.

According to Fajardo and Ramirez (2012), by 2011 around 20,000 students possessed indigenous higher education scholarships. While these scholarships were hugely important, statistics for 2009 show that only 18.6 per cent of indigenous people managed to attend university compared with 29.9 per cent of non-indigenous people in the same year (Blanco and Meneses, 2011). While it is clear that access to higher education is significant for social mobility and employment opportunities (Navarrete, Candia and Puchi 2013), a study on intergenerational social mobility according to ethnic origin in the Araucanía region by Cantero and Williamson (2009: 22) shows mixed results, in that

The Araucanía Region has a significant social intergenerational rate of mobility, related to higher educational achievements of younger generations. On the question of ethnicity, it shows that Mapuche individuals have less social mobility than non-Mapuche people, where Mapuche have short distance or horizontal mobility. On social structure, it also demonstrates an important transformation process, with fewer agricultural related jobs and wider more socially accepted urban positions.

Moreover, they also note that entry into Higher Education by indigenous people is a recent event and they have to face different disadvantages and discrimination. Despite the barriers to higher education, some indigenous people have managed to overcome the structural obstacles and go on to experience a degree of educational upward mobility that serves to produce social diversity among the Mapuche (see Fajardo and Ramirez 2012). Having set the context for my study, I now turn to a brief description of content, structure and argument of the thesis itself.

### 1.3 Thesis structure and argument

In Chapter Two, I address the theoretical underpinnings to this study. I focus on the strengths and weaknesses of a number of different theoretical approaches which have explored processes of upward social mobility, in order to examine how best to analyse the social mobility of minority groups. The first part of the chapter considers early meritocratic accounts of social mobility in which investment in education is commonly considered as a means to achieve higher social positions, and a way to make society fairer. This, for example, is the assumption of status attainment approaches (Blau and Duncan, 1967), which analyse social mobility as a meritocratic processes of status attainment within a hierarchical social structure. However, the meritocratic assumptions of such approaches have been criticized by studies which point to the continuing importance of social origins influencing social destinations, even in periods of high absolute social mobility, a finding which is seen to undermine the meritocratic case and to show the significance of social class reproduction in mobility processes (Goldthorpe et al, 1980 among others). However, the conventional Nuffield class approach to social mobility has focused on objective mobility and tended to sideline the effects of social mobility on social relations and cultural identity. For this reason, I draw more heavily on Bourdieusian class analysis, which introduces a more cultural understanding of social class and social mobility. For Bourdieu and Passeron (1977), educational credentials are increasingly significant in modern society, but this is not a straightforward process of meritocratic social mobility, since people's educational success is also related to their habitus (their tastes, preferences and values which tend to operate in an instinctive, unconscious way) and their cultural capital. For Bourdieu (1984), educational competition is largely shaped by how an individual's class background affects their ability to 'play the game' of education, in which the class basis of habitus affects people's ability to succeed within the middle-class field of education. Therefore, people who do not know how to 'play the game' are at a disadvantage in educational processes. And, very importantly for my research on the experience of social mobility, a mismatch between

habitus and field may also create a sense of not 'fitting in' (in either their new or old social environments) and create dilemmas for people's identities (Bourdieu, 1984; Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992).

In what follows, however, I argue that although the Bourdieusian perspective is useful for analysing social mobility experiences and their consequences for culture and identity, it is insufficient for understanding the impact of social mobility on ethnic identities. In that sense, I focus on a more intersectional perspective, which acknowledges the interwoven nature of class, ethnic, gender and migration in order to fully understand the experience of social mobility transitions amongst my Mapuche sample. This is because my empirical research found that whilst all the respondents had the experience of social dislocation (habitus/field disjuncture or feeling like a 'fish out of water' in Bourdieusian terms) during the course of their social mobility transitions, this was not only in relation to their class positioning but also with regards to their indigenous identity. As a result, and as I explore in my empirical chapters, my sample deployed several different kinds of strategies in order to negotiate their mobility transitions and 'fit in', in some cases emphasizing their new class identity, in some cases emphasizing a revitalized ethnic identity, whilst others stressed a sense of continuity with their older class and ethnic identities. For this reason, the complex negotiation and interrelation of class and ethnic identities demonstrated by my sample mean that it is not sufficient to draw on the Bourdieusian concept of 'fish out of water' and his cultural perspective on the match (or mismatch) between class habitus and field as a way of analyzing social position and belonging. Instead, in order to fully understand the complex transitions of upward social mobility experienced by my Mapuche participants, we also need to add an intersectional perspective which examines how class, ethnic and gender relations connect with and complicate each other. I focus on an intersectional perspective (Crenshaw, 1989; Byrne, 2015; Rollock et al. 2011, 2013, 2015), which acknowledges the significance of class, ethnicity, gender and also migration in order to fully understand the Mapuche experience of social mobility transitions. Moreover, my study also draws on post-colonial theories (Hall 1996; Canales and Rea, 2013; Antileo, 2012 and Weaver 2001), which enable an understanding of the internal process of colonisation in Chile, in which Mapuche people have historically had a disadvantaged position, but also to understand this process from a different approach, taking distance from a western universalist model of knowledge and its limitations. Also, such a perspective helps to examine from a wider perspective how people negotiate their social location and identities, not only in terms of class but also in terms of ethnicity, gender and migration.

In Chapter Three I address the methodological approach of the thesis. I focus on my use of in-depth biographical interviews to reveal the different experiences of upward social mobility of my respondents. I argue that a qualitative approach, specifically biographical interviews, is the best method for examine how people narrate their understanding of their trajectories and how they dealt with different obstacles and challenges related to their transitions and identities. In this chapter, I describe the process of my fieldwork, the experience of conducting interviews and my own positionality, in order to examine the interview as not a neutral interaction, but rather a positional dialogue constantly in construction. In that sense, I examine the power dynamics between interviewer and interviewee.

Chapter Four sets the scene for the mobility experiences of the sample, by looking at their 'road to university': examining the social backgrounds (both their class and ethnic background, but also their location in urban or rural contexts) of the respondents, as well as their family situation and their educational routes to winning a university place. Drawing on the respondents' retrospective accounts of how their early family and schooling experiences led to university, the chapter focuses on how the respondents narrated their upward social mobility into university as a process of fraught achievement, in the sense that they had to deal with numerous obstacles and challenges during their trajectories. The chapter considers how, in order to attend university, the sample had to negotiate the interplay of changing aspirations, family influences, the role of schools and

universities, and spatial mobility as well as considerable class and racial disadvantages. One central purpose of this chapter is to identify that the respondents experienced different dimensions of social mobility, in the sense that they narrated this process as resulting in a transition in both their class and racial social location, which resulted in more complex social challenges and processes of identity negotiation than in a standard process of class mobility.

I show that to understand the sample's multi-dimensional process of social mobility we need to examine the intersectional nature of disadvantage of the social context in which they are situated. This chapter examines the question of how the identities and positions of the Mapuche people within Chilean society shape their trajectories, by examining how the situation of the Mapuche is bound up with racial disadvantage and discrimination but also by questions of class position, geographical location, and cultural values. The fact of entering university is an unusual event for Mapuche people, and in order to do so the respondents had to gain access to indigenous scholarships and go into debt, in order to pay university fees. For some of my respondents, there were also much earlier challenges in their schooling career, as some had to travel long distances or move from their family home in order to study. I examine the early experiences of social mobility of the respondents in their schooling as they increasingly became identified as 'successful students' who aspired to a university place and consider how this was related to their parents' background, their rural/urban location and their migration experiences. I identify a number of different dimensions (including the role of parents, the role of teachers, problems with the Chilean education system, access to resources and opportunities and class and ethnic discrimination) which affected these early experiences, in some cases acting as obstacles and in other cases helping the respondents to succeed. I argue that whilst the respondents benefitted from the Mapuche's increased access to university and, as 'first generation' university students, had all experienced educational mobility, this does not necessarily translate into an overcoming of inequalities. This is because all the sample had experienced substantial obstacles and challenges during their trajectories to university and had to work harder and make considerable sacrifices to get there. As we shall see in the next chapter, they also continued to experience significant processes of disadvantage and discrimination whilst at university and later in work. Also, I argue that because the respondents' experience of upward social mobility is multidimensional, shaped not only by class processes but also by racial processes as well as rural/urban divides in Chile (and as later chapters will indicate also by gender) it cannot be understood using only a 'conventional' understanding of social mobility trajectories (as in the Nuffield approach's focus on occupational mobility). In this chapter, I therefore employ a broader Bourdieusian influenced 'class cultural' approach to understanding the sample's social trajectories, in which social mobility is understood in terms of transitions between social class locations understood in cultural as well as economic terms, and in which questions of how social mobility affects social identity are much more central.

The Bourdieusian approach is particularly useful for understanding a key empirical theme that emerges in the sample's mobility experiences, in which they narrate the difficulties of transition as leading to their feeling out of place in their new social locations, in Bourdieu's terms feeling like a 'fish out of water' (Bourdieu, 1990; Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992). This theme will be further developed in Chapter Five, where I introduce the argument that the respondents' experience of mobility produced a sense of being 'a fish out of water' that was not only experienced with regards to their sense of class location and identity, but also with regards to their indigenous social position and identities. For that reason, in Chapters Five and Six, I use a more intersectional analysis to explore how, within my sample, we can see that people deployed several strategies in order to 'fit in' to their new social location, in some cases renegotiating their class identity, in others re-emphasising or renegotiating their Mapuche identity, in order to manage their mobility experiences.

Chapter Four establishes that the sample's trajectories into university raised a series of challenges for them, along lines of both class and race and that whilst the sample narrated their experiences as 'success' stories they also emphasized the difficulties of adjustment and 'fitting in' that these transitions required, with many experiencing discriminations in their new social contexts. Chapter Five, 'The process of identification and changing identities', turns to focus in greater detail on how the experience of upward social mobility affected the respondents' sense of identity and their identities claims, during their university and later work period. In the new environments they encountered, the respondents were in the minority along lines of both class and race, so that they often felt excluded and out of place across both of these key dimensions of their social transition. Furthermore, in addition to the complex problems of negotiating social relationships and identities in their new social environments, the sample also had the challenge of managing both their class and indigenous relationships and identities claims between their social origins and their social destinations. In Chapter Four, I argue that it is necessary to employ a wider 'cultural' concept of class in order to fully understand the experience of upward social mobility of my Mapuche sample. However, I also argue that the Bourdieusian concept of class has been much less effective in dealing with ethnic/race and gender relations, so a 'cultural' concept of class is still not enough to explain the complex process of identity construction that my respondents have. The respondents' positionality and identities were affected by their upward social trajectories, in which their class, but also their gender, migration and ethnicity interrelated and intersected to influence the construction of their identities. In Chapter Five, I show that the sample not only had to negotiate 'fitting in' to their social destinations, but also had to manage the process of maintaining social relations with family and friends from their old communities.

The central argument of the chapter is that the respondents tried in different ways to negotiate becoming middle-class at the same time as being Mapuche, with these negotiations prompted by their sense that, for many people they encountered, being

Mapuche was seen as somehow incompatible with being middle-class. This was noted not only for many people in their new social environments but also for some in their environments of social origin. The sample's experiences of upward social mobility were therefore very complex. The participants adopted a number of different responses to upward social mobility in terms of their negotiations of their class and ethnic identities. To analyse this, I consider the intersectional ways in which respondents developed their class and ethnic identities, but also consider their geographical mobility and their experience of discrimination. In Chapter Five, I argue that we can see three main different types of responses, and the chapter divides the respondents into three groups (the 'mobile accommodators', the 'rooted' and 're-signifiers'). For two groups, the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted', their class identities become their dominant identities but in divergent ways (with the 'mobile accommodators' adopting middle-class identities, whereas the 'rooted' stressed their working-class origins). For a third group, the 're-signifiers', their indigenous identities became their dominant identities in a politicized fashion. These widely varying responses to the experience of mobility show the complexity and dynamic nature of how people manage their identities in processes of transition.

In Chapter Five, I focus on two of the groups (the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted') who emphasised their class identities as their dominant identities (with the 'resignifiers' examined in Chapter Six). The 'mobile accommodators' are a group who identified as being middle-class, and in the process of accommodating to their new status distanced themselves from their formative (working-class) identity as well as also distanced themselves from their Mapuche identity. The second group, the 'rooted', are a group of respondents who still maintained a strong sense of working-class identity, despite their experience of upward mobility. This group's attendance at university also helped them move towards a continued but strengthened sense of their Mapuche identity, in part because they framed their social mobility as staying 'true' to their origins and using their new position to help their Mapuche communities.

Chapter Five considers the effects of upward social mobility on the social identification of my Mapuche sample, by focusing on those respondents who emphasized their class identities through the process of transition. However, I also argued that these class identities were still intersected by the ethnic identification of respondents. In chapter 6, 'The re-signifiers, the politicisation of Mapuche identities', I turn to consider the impact of social mobility on the ethnic identities of respondents in greater detail, by focusing on the 're-signifiers' group, as this was a group whose experience of social mobility led to their indigenous identities becoming their dominant identities. In this chapter I also focus in greater detail on the question of why moving between their social origin and social destination was a challenge for respondents in terms of their class and ethnic identities. One key purpose of the chapter is to understand why this group of respondents claimed politicised Mapuche identities after experiencing upward mobility.

The 're-signifiers' are a group comprised of respondents who did not grow up in a social context close to Mapuche culture (ie largely in urban contexts), and in which their Mapuche identities were denied or minimized. However, during university and afterwards in work, whilst this group had experienced upward mobility they started to express distance from a middle-class identity, and instead started to investigate and adopt Mapuche culture, and (re)claiming their indigenous identities in a politicised way. This politicization of their Mapuche identity meant that the 're-signifiers' started to participate in Mapuche cultural groups, some of which had the political goal of advancing collective Mapuche demands (to have a pluri-national state, to officially recognise the Mapudungun language and requesting the autonomy of the Mapuche people). Others started to work to advance the interests of the Mapuche people: taking positions in academia, and in the arts and law sectors with the purpose of reducing inequalities, exclusion and racism against the Mapuche people. The main question of Chapter 6, then, is what was it about their experience of social mobility that prompted this 'resignification' of their identity? The answer, I argue, rests in the tensions between

being both Mapuche and middle-class in Chilean society, a tension which caused particular difficulties for this group because of their initial distance from Mapuche identity and culture.

In Chapter Five, I show that for all the sample, their experience of upward mobility was complicated by the racialized disadvantage and stigma associated with their Mapuche heritage. In Chapter 6 however, I argue that it was particularly complicated for respondents from the 're-signifiers' group to become middle-class at the same time as being Mapuche. This was because the respondents from this group had difficulties in claiming 'authenticity' with respect to both their class and ethnic identification. The 'resignifiers' tended to resist class identification, dis-identifying from being middle-class, because for them the label 'middle-class' implied that their mobility had moved them closer to a white/mestiza Chilean middle-class identity. I argue that, for the 're-signifiers,' moving to a middle-class position or identification was experienced as a challenge and undermining of their Mapuche identities, as they perceived being middle-class and being Mapuche as fundamentally incompatible statuses. In that sense, we can see parallels with Nicola Rollock's et al. (2011, 2014, 2015) suggestion that there are tensions between being black and middle-class, as the intersection of race and class disadvantage creates particular problems for the socially mobile black middle-class, in which black professionals are accorded less respect and status and are sometimes seen as lacking racial authenticity. Therefore, there is an additional burden of upward social mobility for people who are from racial or ethnic minorities – something I explore further in my own research.

In chapter Seven, the conclusion of the thesis, I turn to examine the answers that my empirical research provides to my research question: how do the social mobility transitions of Mapuche with higher education impact on their racial and class cultures and affect their social identities? I argue that the experience of upward social mobility affected respondents in terms of their class position and identities, but also in terms of

their indigenous position and identities, and we can see that respondents managed and negotiated the effects of upward social mobility in complex and quite different ways.

## Chapter 2: Linking the analysis of class mobility with ethnic and postcolonial relations

### 2.1 Introduction

This thesis is concerned with how social mobility transitions impact on the indigenous and class cultures of the Mapuche people in Chile, with a particular focus on how their movement into higher education affects their identities. Here, social mobility is primarily understood as 'the extension of movement between unequal positions' (Bottero, 2005: 205), with special attention to the expansion of educational opportunities. However, in this thesis I also argue that whilst Mapuche social mobility does represent movement between unequal positions this must be understood not just in terms of class position but also in terms of unequal ethnic and post-colonial relations. The main goal of this chapter is therefore to examine how understandings of class mobility need to be understood in tandem with questions of ethnicity and ethnic identities. In this chapter, I consider the conceptual tools required to fully understand the complex and entangled upward social mobility process of the Mapuche people.

In thinking about class mobility, I acknowledge the limitations of conventional approaches to class mobility and I focus on the cultural class approach to class transitions, because of its greater focus on the subjective experience of mobility and on class identities. But whilst I argue that the Bourdieusian perspective is the most useful for analysing social mobility experiences and their consequences in a wider way, it is not sufficient for understanding how ethnicity influences social mobility and for analysing social mobility as also a process of ethnic identity transition. I therefore argue for the need to adopt a more intersectional perspective, which acknowledges the interwoven nature of class, ethnic, gender and migration experiences in order to fully understand the process of Mapuche social mobility transitions. Moreover, to fully understand the ethnic and class disadvantage of the Mapuche indigenous people we also need to

understand the internal process of colonisation in Chile and reflect on the limitations of western approaches to class and social mobility in the Chilean context. I therefore also argue that we must draw on post-colonial theories, which enable an understanding of this internal process of colonisation and help us to understand this process from the minorities point of view.

This chapter focuses on the key debates and theoretical approaches around the consequences of education mobility, in order to think about which issues we need to understand in relationship to the experiences of the Mapuche people. This chapter is focused on a discussion of the implications that such social mobility brings to people. In order to situate my research, I discuss key approaches which question the meritocratic assumptions of social mobility as an indicator of the fairness or openness of a society, and which address the sometimes difficult and unsettling nature of the consequences of social mobility for people's social relations and identities. My thesis also addresses how people's social mobility affects not only their class but also their indigenous identities, and I explore the implications of how my socially mobile Mapuche participants managed these effects in a variety of different ways.

Research on class identities was neglected for many years in class analysis, reflecting the focus on objective rather than subjective class position in the influential Nuffield approach to class analysis. The Nuffield approach focussed on occupational mobility in order to produce an analysis of objective social mobility transitions (Goldthorpe et al, 1980). As a result, as this chapter examines, this approach was criticised for effectively side-lining questions of subjective class position and class identity, with critics arguing that it had led to 'the marginalization of the study of the cultural and subjective dimensions of class at the same time that issues of identity and culture have taken on a higher profile in the social sciences as a whole' (Savage, 2000:1). Consequently, a second 'class cultural' approach (Savage et al 2001, Savage, 2000) emerged as an alternative to the limitations of the 'employment-aggregate' approach. This second approach has strong Bourdieusian influences and adopts a more cultural and social approach to class location and social mobility, placing a much greater focus on the cultural elements of

class with a renewed focus on the formation of the class identities (Savage, 2000). I locate my thesis within this second line of approach, arguing that the experience of inequalities must be understood within a wider cultural perspective, which considers both the structural and cultural aspects of people's class subjectivities and identities, as well as how these also intersect with gender, racial and ethnic identities. As mentioned earlier, this thesis is strongly influenced by the approach associated with Pierre Bourdieu. I employ the Bourdieusian emphasis on habitus/field disjunctures to analyse a key empirical theme that emerged in the sample's mobility experiences, in which they narrated the difficulties of mobility transitions as leading to feeling like a 'fish out of water' in their new social positions. However, in my empirical chapters I also argue that the respondents felt like a 'fish out of water' not only with regards to class, but also with regards to their indigenous identities, and so deployed several different kinds of strategies in order to 'fit in' along these different dimensions. Thus, although my study has a Bourdieusian influence, it also suggests that a focus on class mobility and identities alone is too limited for understanding the diverse experiences of upward social mobility of my Mapuche sample, and for that reason I bring a more intersectional perspective to bear on questions of social mobility.

As a result, this chapter examines how we should consider questions of intersectionality (Crenshaw, 1989), where there is an understanding that class, gender, migration and ethnicity all play a role in processes of the construction of identities and interact with each other in complex ways. Here, intersectionality is primarily understood as 'a widely used and influential model for an understanding of how different modes of social inequality and discrimination are related to each other' (Byrne, 2015: 7.1). I examine studies which have argued that the social mobility of black professionals must be analysed from an intersectional perspective. Nicola Rollock et al. (2011, 2014 and 2015) suggest that the intersection of race and class disadvantage creates particular problems for the socially mobile black middle-class and produces a conflict of identities. Rollock argues it is difficult to be black and middle-class with black professionals accorded less respect and status, but also sometimes seen as lacking racial authenticity. I develop my

thesis using this more expansive approach, arguing that Mapuche experiences of social mobility have to be analysed in a way that understands the complex ways in which identities and inequalities of class, ethnicity and gender are interrelated.

I also argue that it is necessary to adopt a post-colonial perspective, and to go beyond western knowledge to understand the process of social mobility from a decolonial perspective. Stavenhagen (2001) has argued that the indigenous peoples in Latin America have experienced colonial dispossession and disadvantage over so many centuries that their position has become normalised. Most of my research participants were assimilated into western education during schooling and university, for example, and have suffered discrimination and loss of their Mapuche culture. However, despite this, a group of respondents (the re-signifiers) started to politicise their Mapuche identities. I show that this process is one response to the internal process of colonisation of the Mapuche people, in which their indigenous identities are redefined, in a way which calls both capitalism and coloniality into question (Canales and Rea, 2013). However, we can also see other forms of identity reconstruction in the sample, and in this sense, identities need to be primarily understood as 'always fragmented, multiply constructed, and intersected in a constantly changing, sometimes conflicting array' (Hall, 1996:4).

The first section of this chapter considers debates on social mobility and meritocracy, focusing on studies which indicate the limits to meritocratic models by pointing to the continuing importance of social origins influencing social destinations, even in period of high absolute social mobility. Then I move to consider the advantages of Bourdieusian class analysis for analysing social mobility, using a cultural approach which focuses on habitus/field transitions and class identities. Then I address the limitations of Bourdieusian analysis and show the necessity of an intersectional focus of analysis for understanding how the experience of social mobility is a class process, but one bound up with gender, ethnicity, and migration. Finally, I discuss the importance of including a post-colonial perspective to fully understand the consequences of upward social mobility for an indigenous ethnic group in the Chilean context.

## 2.2 Social mobility and education

This thesis focuses on the social mobility experiences of a group of Mapuche people in Chile, focusing in particular on their university and work transitions. Education is often understood as a route for social mobility and a way of achieving a fairer society, in which unequal social positions result from merit and so are seen as somehow deserved. Investments in education, at both the individual and society level, are popularly seen as key mechanisms for improving social mobility and making society fairer - if not more equal. This is the viewpoint in Chile in relation to Mapuche education for example. From 1992 the Chilean government introduced a scholarship scheme targeted at the Mapuche student as part of a policy intervention to improve the situation of this historically disadvantaged group, and to support Mapuche students moving in greater numbers into professional and middle-class occupations. However, class analysts have criticised meritocratic understandings of social mobility and educational success, arguing that structural disadvantage affects people's chances of success, so that achievement in either educational or social mobility processes is not necessarily 'fair' and more generally does not reduce relative disadvantage. For this research, 'social mobility' is understood to be the movement of individuals within a hierarchical social structure in terms of both economic and social status. The thesis considers how these movements are influenced by structural changes, in which inequalities are reproduced. Thus, I follow the approach of class analysts that point out that the reproduction of class inequalities still persists despite an absolute pattern of upward (and downward) mobility, because of stable relative differences in mobility chances, and may also present challenges and even have adverse consequences for the upwardly mobile. This section begins with a brief examination of some of the different approaches to social mobility and education, in terms of how education becomes an important factor to social mobility whilst considering the limitations and advantages of each approach.

## 2.2.1 Social mobility and meritocracy

Commonly, education is considered an important factor in social mobility, which gives the possibility of improving life conditions for people (Reay, 2015). However, as Reay notes, such assumptions have been heavily critiqued by class analysts for ignoring the way in which class advantage shapes educational success and so for providing a justification for inequality. I locate my thesis within the perspective that argues social mobility is not necessarily the solution for addressing inequalities. I argue that, commonly, the increase in access to education does not translate into a reduction of relative inequalities (Reay, 2013).

Early influential perspectives on social mobility studies began researching the movements of individuals in the social structure, analysing the distribution of individuals from different social origins to their 'destinations' across the social structure in order to assess the fairness and openness of society. The idea underlying such work was the notion that the more social mobility there was between origins and destinations, the fairer the society. Accounts of social mobility in Western industrial society had to account for large amounts of social mobility in the post-WW2 period, associated with changes in the occupational structure (with a decline in working class jobs and an increase in technical, managerial and professional jobs). For some, this indicated that western industrial societies had become more open and fairer over time. This was famously argued in Blau and Duncan's (1967) analysis of American mobility patterns, using the 'status-attainment' approach (Blau and Duncan, 1967). Here the concern is with social equity, in terms of the ability of people to achieve success, that is on equality of opportunity rather than on equality of outcomes. Blau and Duncan's *The American* Occupational Structure (1967) focused on the social factors which influenced the movement (up or down) of individuals in the social structure. The study found both high levels of social mobility in American society, but also argued that ascribed factors (such as social background) were less important than achieved factors (such as educational qualifications) in explaining an individual's occupational position. On this basis they

concluded that American society was increasingly 'open' and meritocratic, with relatively little systematic class inequality). A similar argument was made by Saunders (1995; 1996), based on a study in the United Kingdom. He also suggested that individuals' ability are more important than their social background in determining their social destinations, concluding that 'in the end what matters most is whether you are bright, and whether you work hard' (1996:72) and thus placing importance on the idea of social outcomes as meritocratic. From the meritocratic status-attainment perspective, individual attributes are more important than class factors for the success of people.

However, most sociological approaches to social mobility have been sceptical about the popular perception of mobility as a source of social justice (Reay, 2013) or as a process of individual achievement. A very different way of thinking about social mobility is Blackburn and Prandy's (1997) argument that social mobility must be understood in terms of a change in the structure of opportunities, rather than being an individual's movement in the social structure. For these authors, it is incorrect to assume that individual mobility brings about an open and fluid society, giving equal opportunities and fairness to those who are at the bottom of the social scale. Instead, according to Blackburn and Prandy (1997) 'all "achievement" is entirely dependent on socially defined structures and opportunities' (Blackburn and Prandy 1997:493). Class analysts point out that in all Western industrial societies there was an increase in middle-level jobs and a transformation from agricultural to industrial jobs which 'forced' higher levels of social mobility. Because of this, class analysts believe trends in absolute mobility offer a 'misleading picture of how fair a society is because increases in mobility can result from either the increasing significance of achievement in allocation processes or from an improvement in the general opportunities available', and for this reason class analysts 'attempt to control for shifts in the opportunity structure over time, by comparing the relative chances of children from different backgrounds in gaining access to the opportunities available at any given point' (Bottero, 2005, 210). Numerous UK and comparative studies of mobility in Western societies have demonstrated that the relative chances of children from different social classes remain very unequal despite shifts in the opportunity structure, showing the continuing importance of structural inequalities in shaping opportunity and success (Goldthorpe et al. 1980, Savage and Egerton 1997, Erikson and Goldthorpe 1992).

Goldthorpe and Erikson (1992) conducted comparative international research analysing the relative chances of people from different social classes in achieving middle class positions. This Nuffield approach sought to control for shifts in the opportunity structure over time, by comparing the relative chances of individuals from different backgrounds in gaining access to those opportunities available at any given point. Using this technique, the study showed that, despite considerable social mobility, the relative chances of success of children from different class backgrounds changed surprisingly little during the post-war period, instead finding a pattern of 'constant flux' (relative stability within change) with no major differences in social fluidity across most modern industrial societies (Goldthorpe and Erikson, 1992). Goldthorpe therefore argues that social mobility does not bring a more open society, as individuals with different origins have retained the same relative odds of accessing social class positions despite significant structural changes (Mendez and Gayo, 2007). The 'constant flux' is the phenomena where an increase in middle-class positions has increased upward social mobility but the relative differences in access between the groups have remained the same. For class analysts, the 'constant flux' indicates the continuity of inequalities, in which social mobility does not bring equal opportunities to people and does not result in a more open society.

Of course, whilst the relative chances of different classes in social mobility may have remained largely unchanged, nonetheless larger numbers of people from working class backgrounds will have achieved middle-class jobs (albeit dependent on the nature of expanding opportunities). In one sense their achievements can be seen as meritocratic 'success' stories. But another way of thinking about such success can be seen in Savage and Egerton's (1997) criticism of Saunders' study, which defended the use of class as a

concept, and argued that the fact that someone is 'brighter' does not translate into the sole cause of their mobility:

Mobility itself is only possible due to structural changes, and 'ability' is simply a filtering device which distinguishes those working-class children who are able to move up from those who are not. The uncontroversial fact that high levels of measured ability correlate with upward mobility should not- at least from a structural perspective- be confused with a causal explanation of mobility itself (Savage and Egerton, 1997:648).

The authors researched the intergenerational mobility of young people in England, examining the relation between social background and tested the 'ability' of young people, in order to 'understand the key processes that help facilitate the reproduction of class inequality' (Savage and Egerton, 1997:645). They argued that the middle-class has more advantages over other groups, and these advantages are not only because of their abilities to transfer appropriate cultural capital to their children, but because of other structural factors such as economic capital, and advantages from social networks among others. Their results show that class advantage is still important for explaining social mobility, not only in explaining upward social mobility but also for explaining why middle-class children with lower ability scores were insulated from downward mobility. They also found gender differences in mobility, showing that middle-class boys had more resources than girls in the same social class for maintaining their social class positions, 'the class privilege of daughters depend overwhelmingly on their scoring well on ability tests and then (presumably) using credentialist methods to sustain their class advantages. Boys, however, appear to rely less exclusively (though still importantly) on this process' (Savage and Egerton, 1997; 667).

In summary, the principle criticisms aimed at meritocratic understandings of social mobility is that they place too much importance on the notion of achievement and misunderstand the importance of changes in structural opportunity in determining levels of social mobility. My thesis follows the class perspective, arguing that social mobility is

closely related to structural changes and not only related to educational investments strengthening the abilities of people. As Bottero points out 'If social success is based on what people can do instead of who they are (or their social connections or inherited privilege), there should be a weak link between origins and destination, structure and action' (Bottero, 2005: 206). In the case of my thesis, it is possible to see that despite the fact that my respondents have achieved upward social mobility through education this does not means that their inequalities have disappeared. They all had to endure considerable obstacles on their path to university; and they still continue to experience inequality, racism and discrimination, to the extent that for many there are considerable challenges to being recognised as both middle class and Mapuche. This discussion is related to Chapter Four 'The road to university', which identifies the different dimensions of social mobility for the Mapuche people, exploring how family, institutional and spatial dynamics all shaped their mobility trajectories both facilitating and providing obstacles to mobility. It is important to understand that the changing position of the Mapuche in Chilean society is largely due to transformations in the opportunity structure and, in particular, changes in educational policy and access to finance which facilitated their achievement. In that sense, I argue that the improved access to education for the respondents does not necessarily translate into a reduction of their inequalities, due to the obstacles and challenges that they had to deal with during their trajectories to attend university. The continuing effects of those inequalities can be seen in the participants' complex experiences of mobility which meant that they had to face the tensions of racism as well as class and ethnic boundaries, and which required them to renegotiate not only their class but also their Mapuche identities in different ways.

## 2.2.2 Education and Bourdieusian class analysis

The Bourdieusian approach is important to my study as it is more useful for analysing social mobility experiences and their identity consequences than the conventional social mobility research approach. Although the analysis of social mobility has been dominated by the Nuffield approach to class, the study of class inequalities in education has been

much more influenced by Bourdieu's approach (Bourdieu, 1984, Bourdieu and Passeron, 1990). Bourdieu argues that cultural knowledge and educational credentials are assets in the class struggle for advantage, and so are a form of cultural capital: playing a similar role to economic resources.

Alongside cultural capital, economic capital is still an important determinant of the position of people and also regulates the strategies of people to integrate into the social field according to the capacity of material and economic accumulation. Here, variables such as income, occupational category and material possessions are integrated. The lack of economic and cultural capitals may also affect the social relations that individuals can have during their social mobility trajectories. Social capital is a third factor affecting social position, and is defined by Bourdieu (192: 119) as 'the aggregate of the actual or potential resources which are linked to possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition'. In that sense, individuals establish social relations in order to identify and define their position and the others. Another important concept for Bourdieu theory is 'social fields':

It is a network or configuration of objective relations among positions. These positions objectively define its existence and determinations of their occupants, whether agents or institutions, by their present and potential situation in the distribution structure of species of power or capital, whose possession implies access to specific profits in the field and, incidentally, for their objective relations to other positions (domination, subordination, etc.) (Bourdieu, 1995; 64).

The concept of social field is a useful way to contextualise the situation into which people are inserted through their mobility. All fields have their own rules of the game, their own institutions, and their own relations. During their mobility trajectories, the respondents of my study were involved in movements into diverse new and unfamiliar fields, as they went to school, university and work. Their trajectories into these different fields constitute their social mobility experiences. For Bourdieu, the 'rules of the game' in a field (such as the field of education, or the field of professions) determine whether different capitals will be useful or valuable there, and people's ability to 'play the game'

in a field will depend on their possession of economic, cultural and social capitals as well as whether their habitus is adjusted to the field. All of these factors will affect people's ability to achieve social mobility as well as their experiences of mobility if they do manage it.

Cultural capital is defined by Bourdieu as 'cultural property transmitted by families and educational activities, whose value fluctuates with the distance between cultural arbitrariness imposed by families and institutions, inside different groups or classes' (Bourdieu, 1990: 30). Following Bourdieu (1979), the reproduction of social class is related to how cultural capital is transmitted. Bourdieu (1979) points out that cultural and economic capital are strongly linked, in term of time of accumulation. Both require time for the transmission and acquisition from one generation to another. Bourdieu (1984) proposed diverse routes to acquiring cultural capital, distinguishing the cultural capital that people can inherit and the cultural capital that people can acquire. The first is related to all the elements that people can inherit since their birth, it is related to the body and becomes an integral part of a person, working in an unconscious and sometimes invisible way. For example, in the case of this research, this is related to the cultural capital that families may give to respondents, for instance, the educational support families give to respondents during their schooling and university period. In Chapter Four 'The road to university' it is possible to see how the participants' families helped shape their mobility trajectories, by facilitating their studies or when they had the expectation that their child would attend university, or else providing obstacles to mobility when parents did not support their education or their goal of attending university. The second acquired form of cultural capital is related to all the elements that respondents can incorporate in their lives through education, training and credentials. In the case of this research this is related to the cultural capital that respondents acquired outside their families in fields such as school and university.

Bourdieu sees educational credentials as increasingly important in modern societies, which has 'precipitated a shift in upper-class inheritance practices from one of direct transfer of property to reliance upon the cultural transmission of economic privilege:

investment in education gives upper-class offspring the chance to appropriate family privilege and wealth through access to the more powerful and remunerative institutional positions' (Swartz, 1997:181). For Bourdieu, success in education is largely shaped by how an individual's class background affects their ability to 'play the game' of education, in which educational systems are always skewed towards middle-class values and culture. People's habitus (their tastes, preferences and values which tend to operate in an instinctive, unconscious way) are, for Bourdieu, strongly shaped by their class upbringing, so how well people do in education will depend on how well their habitus fits the strongly middle-class nature of the educational field. Working-class children are already at a disadvantage but Bourdieu also believes that the habitus, operating at the level of taken-for-granted assumptions, not only makes people uncomfortable in situations where their habitus does not match with the field, but also guides people to avoid the unfamiliar and adjust their ambitions to what is 'realistic', arguing that 'objective limits become a sense of limits, a practical anticipation of objective limits acquired by experience of objective limits, a "sense of one's place" which leads one to exclude oneself from the goods, persons, place and so forth from which one is excluded' (Bourdieu, 1984: 471).

Bourdieu (1990) defined the connexion between agency and structure as habitus, a key concept which he used to explain the social action (behaviour), but also to associate how people inherit and acquire the cultural capital and other kind of capitals. According to Bourdieu (1990) habitus refers to:

Systems of durable, transposable dispositions, structured structures predisposed to function as structuring structures, that is, as principles which generate and organize practices and representations that can be objectively adapted to their outcomes without presupposing a conscious aiming at ends or an express mastery of the operations necessary in order to attain them. Objectively `regulated' and `regular' without being in any way the product of obedience to rules, they can be collectively orchestrated without being the product of the organizing action of a conductor (Bourdieu, 1990: 53).

The concept of habitus is important (Bourdieu, 1993) as it has the quality to link the past and the present and link agency and structure in the trajectories of individuals. In that sense, the concept of habitus helps us to understand how the trajectories of individuals in this research are constructed through their practices and perceptions. According to Bourdieu (Lamaison, 1986), strategies are a key point in the relation between agency and structure, because through strategies it is possible to find the balance of habitus. Therefore, strategies are defined by Bourdieu (in Lamaison, 1986, 112) as 'the product of a practical sense, of a particular social game'. In my research, I examine how the experience of social mobility is often challenging and created cultural and social tensions for my Mapuche sample, as a result of habitus/field mismatches, but that we can also see different strategies for negotiating such transitions, depending on how people 'play the game'.

In Bourdieu's account, the habitus is the basis for successful social action in any environment, as long as the taken-for-granted assumptions of the habitus match up with the taken-for-granted assumptions organising that environment, of field: 'when habitus encounters a social world of which it is the product, it is like a "fish in water": it does not feel the weight of the water and it takes the world about itself for granted. (Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992: 127). In contrast, the 'hysteresis effect' is, 'a misadaptation of durable dispositions that have out lived the economic and social conditions in which they were produced' (Bourdieu 1990, 62). In other words, when an individuals' habitus is not adjusted to any unfamiliar field they find themselves in (as in the case of working-class children in a middle-class education system for example, or Mapuche young people entering ethnically 'white' universities in which they are in the minority), people often experience the feeling of being a 'fish out of water', a situation where they are unsure of the rules and how to act, lacking an instinctive 'sense' of the right way to behave.

The 'fish out of water' concept has been deployed by several scholars working on social mobility following the Bourdieusian perspective. Such studies focus on the experiences of working-class people who have undergone upward social mobility, arguing that such social mobility often has negative consequences for those who experience it. These

studies are helpful for understanding the dilemmas and tensions my research participants encountered in both their old working-class backgrounds and their new middle-class contexts. For example, Reay et al. (2009) suggests that individuals with working-class backgrounds who attend elite universities have the ability to move between different social contexts, however, despite their ability to adapt differently as they move between their new and old social contexts they also experience ambivalences and tensions which often make them feel they do not 'fit in' anywhere. Grandfield (1991) identified several strategies working-class students in an elite university used to adjust in the new social contexts. He suggests that the students experienced stigma, and as a consequence they hid their working-class origin and experienced ambivalence about their transition. Baxter and Britton (2001) similarly argued that mature students experienced identity fragmentation when they attended university. They therefore suggest that there are negative effects of mobility on the identities of mature students and implications for their relationships in both their origin and destination contexts. Lehmann (2009, 2013) by contrast focused on narratives of moral class advantage amongst first generation university students. In contrast to Grandfield (1991) he suggests that these working-class students emphasised their working-class background, providing accounts of their greater responsibilities and of how they overcome disadvantage, in order to construct a sense of moral – if not social - advantage at university. Friedman (2016) suggests these different kinds of response relate to how social mobility affects the emotional life of individuals. He deploys the Bourdieu concept of 'habitus clivé' (or the 'torn' habitus) to explain such processes, with a torn habitus occurring when socially mobile people feel out of place in both their social origin and social destination, not fully fitting in with the higher level social group they have joined, but also feeling out of place with the group they have left. Friedman argues this means people never feel 'at home' anywhere and so they often feel they have to perform being 'authentic' (rather than, say, being seen as a 'sell-out' or as someone who is playing a social role). Friedman argues the emotional consequences of social mobility differ depending on whether people undergo long or short-range of mobility, and that it is important to consider the speed, direction and range of people's social mobility experiences. He suggests that people who experience short-range social mobility have fewer problems with their trajectories and adapt better to their new social context, because their transition is more gradual. Meanwhile, people who undergo long-range social mobility experience more problems with their trajectories, because they have to deal with feelings of insecurity and inferiority in their new social contexts, but they also have to deal with feelings of abandonment and guilt, when they face their old social contexts. The work of Friedman shows how complex the process of social mobility and its consequences can be.

In the case of my research, in accessing university all of my respondents made a relatively 'long-range' transition from a working-class context to a middle-class professional context, but also made a transition to a white middle-class 'mestiza' context, both of which had consequences for their social positioning and their negotiation of their identities. The consequences are not only related to their employment status, but also related to how well the respondents' habitus fitted - or not - to these new ethnically white, middle-class contexts. In most cases in my sample, people felt that they did not fit into their new social context, and they recounted experiences of feeling like a 'fish out of water' during their higher education and work periods. In these accounts we can see participants experiencing habitus clivé as a result of their social mobility, as they felt out of place in both their places of social origin and social destination. However, they managed the process in different ways. The sample's migration experiences were also related to their class transitions, and the 'distance' travelled was for some a distance between rural and urban social locations. As we shall see, in their narratives the respondents tended to see questions of migration and questions of class as interrelated. However, the experiences of my sample also show that the concept of habitus/field disjuncture and the experiencing of feeling a 'fish out of water' operates not just in class terms, but also in terms of indigenous ethnic positioning and identity. The respondents deployed different kinds of strategies to adjust and 'fit in' during their social mobility transitions, with some expressing distance from their Mapuche identity and claiming a middle-class identity (the mobile accommodators), while others tried to claim 'authenticity' in respect of their class origins or ethnic identification (the rooted and resignifiers).

I have spent some time outlining Bourdieu's concepts of habitus, field and capitals because they are fundamental for this research, and they are the foundation of my analysis of how mobility transitions impact on the ethnic and class cultures and indigenous identity of my Mapuche sample. Bourdieu's framework also influences debates about class identities and in the next section I examine its significance for analysing forms of class and ethnic identification and disidentification amongst my Mapuche sample.

## 2.2.3 Class identities and the cultural approach

This research focuses on how the Mapuche's experience of social mobility requires the complex negotiation and renegotiation of identity. But how should we analyse processes of social identification? As I have previously established, the Nuffield approach to class analysis rose to prominence by its influential approach to social mobility, but increasingly sidelined questions of culture, consciousness and identity. The theoretical argument of Goldthorpe is based on Rational Action Theory, arguing that it is the opportunities (and risks) presented by different class locations which shapes behaviour, allowing Goldthorpe 'to explain how individuals act in class ways even when they lack developed class awareness' (Savage, 2000:85).

However, the failure of the Nuffield approach to address questions of class culture and identity opened up class analysis to claims that a 'death of class' had occurred (Bauman, 1992, Crook et al 1992, Beck, 1992, Clark and Lipset, 1996). The idea that class was no longer significant for people's sense of identity was very effectively challenged by a newer wave of class analysts, but to do so they rejected the narrowing focus of the Nuffield approach and adopted a much broader Bourdieusian approach, with 'class' defined in economic and cultural terms, fusing 'class' and 'status' elements (Bottero, 2015: 546). A number of authors called for a 'reinvigoration' (Skeggs, 2005) of class analysis, requiring a 'wider and deeper' (Reay, 1998) concept of class with a greater

emphasis on cultural practices and identities. In making this argument, however, it was conceded that - at least in the British context - 'old models of class collective cultures are indeed dead and buried' (Savage, 2000:101), with 'class cultures' instead 'viewed as modes of differentiation rather than as types of collectivity' (Savage, 2000:102). This also has consequences for the concept of 'class identities'.

Several studies (Skeggs, 1997; Savage et al, 2001; Reay, 1998) suggest it is difficult for people to claim class identities, and that when asked about class issues individuals tend to respond in a 'hesitant', 'defensive' and 'ambivalent' way, and instead make claims to be 'normal; or 'ordinary' people. This also applies in Chile, with Mendez (2008) suggesting that the narratives of people who identify as middle-class tend to be ambivalent, with the purpose of establishing their 'normalness'. The authors of these studies suggest that class raises issues of moral worth, so people may experience discomfort talking about class matters, and in which the stigmatization of working-class culture makes it difficult for class distinctions to be 'explicitly named and identified' (Savage, 2000: 107). For class cultural theorists, because of this a more 'forensic' approach to class identities is required to explore how class is 'encoded in people's sense of self-worth and in their attitudes to and awareness of others' (Savage, 2000: 107). We can see this in Beverley Skeggs's (1997) ethnographic study of working-class women from England in the late 1980s and early 1990s, which emphasised that such women deployed processes of class 'dis-identification'. She argues that class was still important in the lives of these women, but difficult to articulate. Skeggs suggests that class identities and cultures are relational. Women who participated in the study were interested in the construction of respectability as a defensive way to escape being a working-class woman (an identity they felt was stigmatised and 'spoilt'), because respectability was more associated with the middle-class. We can see similar dis-identifications in some of my own sample, though in this case these were sometimes disavowals of being middle-class, and sometimes dis-identification from being Mapuche, showing the intersections of class and ethnicity. Skeggs' study is also important, because it highlights the importance of the intersections of class and gender, intersections which will also be examined in my own research.

However, despite showing that people often 'disidentify' from their class in personal terms, these studies show that people still mention class in terms of political issues (Savage, 2001: Devine, 1992). Savage (2000, 2016) called this situation 'the paradox of class', where social inequalities increased, but:

Individual's subjective class membership declined. However, the lack of direct class consciousness did not mean that class was not emotionally significant [...] class may not have been so significant in terms of its collective identities, but it was strongly experienced as part of an individual's sense of self (Savage, 2016; 66).

These approaches to class identity as tacit are strongly shaped by Bourdieu and his concept of habitus (and symbolic violence) (Bottero, 2005). Savage (2016) argues that the Bourdieusian perspective 'allowed more flexibility in how the concept of class could be used' (Savage, 2016: 67). As I have already discussed, Bourdieu's account of class relations sees class position deriving from an individuals' combination of different kinds of capitals (economic, cultural, social and symbolic), and whilst individuals are engaged in strategies of competitive struggle, these are largely deployed at an unconscious level (habitus) with their success largely depending on both level of capitals but also the fit of habitus with a particular social space (field) (Mendez and Gayo, 2007). For Bourdieu and the 'culturalist' perspective, it is not necessary to focus on the development of explicit class consciousness; instead the focus can be on the classed nature of cultural practices (Bottero, 2005).

'Culturalist' researchers claim, 'that it is precisely because of the power of class that it is difficult for class to be articulated by people' (Savage, 2001:877) and argue that individualisation involves a modification in how class operates

Individualised cultures articulate an awareness of class, and it is wrong to see cultures of individualisation displacing, rather than existing alongside, class recognition. If we leave behind the romantic baggage which portrays class cultures as collective, then it becomes possible to talk about class cultures as forms of

individualised awareness. Class does not determine identity, but it is not irrelevant either. It is a resource, a device, with which to construct identity (Savage, 2001: 888).

In the case of my research, I argue that the respondents did use class as a resource to construct their identities, however following Savage (2001) the respondents did not identify in a collective way, and their narratives often employed accounts of being 'ordinary' or 'normal' in order to avoid being located in terms of social class. As I shall also explore in later chapters, it would appear that some respondents who dis-identified in class terms did so because they experienced a conflict between their old and new social class positions which created problems for class identification.

Bourdieu's 'cultural' approach to class and his emphasis on habitus has been very influential in shaping debates of class identity and I draw on key elements of it in my own analysis. Nonetheless, there have been criticisms of Bourdieu's framework because of a failure to sufficiently acknowledge the significance of ethnicity and gender. According to Adkins (2004), Bourdieu's theory has relatively little to say about women or gender, because the majority of his work is based in terms of class, and so is not always relevant for a feminist perspective. Skeggs (2005) suggests that:

Even though Bourdieu does explore gender relations in his work, what is striking in all this output is its lack of attention to feminist theory: in *Outline of a Theory of Practice* and in *The Logic of Practice*, where he focuses on how a structured sexual division of labour generates a sexually differentiated perspective on the world. In *Distinction* he examines the gendering of taste and *Masculine Domination* is devoted to exploring sexual difference (Skeggs, 2005: 2).

Rollock (2014) make a similar argument in relation to racial inequalities and identities, suggesting that

Class identity cannot be fully understood without taking account of the intersecting role of race. Specifically, exposing how white identity and white racial knowledge work to inform and protect the boundaries of middle class and elite class positions (to the disadvantage of minoritised groups) remains central to advancing race equity and genuine social mobility (Rollock, 2014: 445).

Rollock's own work (2011, 2013, and 2014) focuses on how people perceive their class location, but her research shows the very significant ways that ethnicity and race also contribute to social identity. The discussion of identity is important for my research because it is necessary to understand whether, how and why people identify with class, in order to analyse the consequences of social mobility and how people develop strategies to fit into their social contexts. Although the cultural approach helps us to understand inequalities with a more complex concept of social class, it is still necessary to include a perspective that takes into account gender and ethnicity as equally important factors as social class. This is particularly important in the Chilean context, since the structure of inequalities in Chile is very complex and we need a multidimensional analysis of the Mapuche's unequal social position to understand their experiences of social mobility and negotiations of identity. For example, my respondents experienced a range of disadvantages, including spatial inequalities (people who were born in rural areas), class inequalities (with most born into working class and poor families), as well as belonging to a discriminated indigenous ethnic group. For that reason, in subsequent sections I discuss the importance of an intersectional analysis and how intersectional influences complicate the experience of social mobility and affect the negotiation of identities. Before I do so, however, I first turn to examine research on social mobility and class identities in Chile. This is because much of the theoretical approaches and research I have considered have been based on Western societies, so we also need to consider how well such models apply to Chile.

## 2.2.4 Social mobility and class identities in Chile

How well do models of social mobility, meritocracy and class identity apply in the Chilean context? Chile has adopted processes of economic development and growth which parallel (and in some respects predate) those found in Western societies, so there are important overlaps but also significant differences. In Latin America, for example, the

discussion of meritocracy is associated with the growth of the middle-class (Mendez and Gayo, 2007). Filgueira and Geneletti (1981) suggested that Latin American societies were becoming increasingly middle-class societies, and so more equal societies from an income distribution point of view. However, it should be noted that neo-liberal policies have increased inequality in Chile, which has a very high level of income inequality as measured by the Gini coefficient, and that Chile still retains a large 'extractive' primary manufacturing sector as well as a large and poor rural population engaged in agricultural work. The Chilean government, during the period of dictatorship (1973-1989) adopted a neo-liberal model which placed responsibility on market competition and individual efforts to achieve social outcomes, gradually removing the state's social obligations to citizens. According to Espinoza, Barozet and Mendez (2013), Chile adopted this radical neo-liberal system well before the United Kingdom and the United States began their economic reforms in 1980. This economic system in Chile has been characterised by the massive privatization of health, education and public companies (Espinoza, Barozet and Mendez, 2013). Consequently, the lack of a welfare state, the increase in consumption and loans, and the emphasis on meritocratic discourses are all related to the increasing perception of the importance of higher education for success in life. It is commonly thought that education can help provide access to more privileged positions, and there is increased demand for educational opportunities which have undergone a considerable expansion (Mendez and Gayo, 2007). However, the emphasis on meritocracy and the expansion of education in Chile has not necessarily reduced inequalities and given better opportunities to individuals, because 'there is an educational devaluation, which is the incapacity of societies to incorporate workers with a better level of education and offer better salaries and working conditions' (Mendez and Gayo, 2007:152).

Given that class analysts have stressed the significance of the structure of opportunities in shaping social mobility outcomes, we need to consider the structure of opportunities in Chile. Chile is a newly industrialized country. The distribution of income is very unequal, as a consequence the gap between the privileged and the rest of society is

greater than for the United Kingdom, for example (Mendez and Gayo, 2007). Also, the categories of class are not the same as those found in the United Kingdom. For example, Chilean analysts identity an informal proletariat, a heterogeneous group representing the majority of population, who do not have control of the means of production and who have unregulated, precarious labour relations. It is argued that this group cannot be equated with the working-class in the United Kingdom, because Chilean incomes are lower and not regulated by the government (Mendez and Gayo, 2007). Moreover, there is an important difference between rural and urban jobs in Chile, where rural jobs are related to traditional agricultural occupations and new forms of temporary employment, which involve part-time jobs related to collecting fruit and vegetables during spring-summer seasons. By contrast, urban sector jobs are related to non-manual occupations, associated with the commercial and service sectors, such as sales, marketing and office workers (Mendez and Gayo, 2007).

There are relatively few studies of class identity in Chile, but Mendez's research (2008) focuses on metropolitan middle-class identities. Influence by the Bourdieusian perspective, she explores how class identities work in a neoliberal, individualised age. Echoing some of the British research discussed earlier, she notes that people did not claim their class identities in a collective way, instead participants asserted forms of identity which claimed their uniqueness. She also suggests that middle-class Chileans asserted their identities by distinguishing themselves from other middle-class people in a horizontal way, making distinctions in terms of appeals to authenticity/artificiality or ordinariness. In this process of differentiation, people experience individualization as bringing tensions between cultural and moral boundaries and different ways of claiming authenticity, in which Mendez suggests there are 'various ways of understanding authenticity: being true to oneself or to one's origins' (Mendez, 2008: 222). This research is important for my study because it is one of the first to focus on the class identities of Chilean people, and it establishes the complex and diverse ways that people identify and

differentiate along lines of social class, which is also a feature amongst my, very different, sample.

What about social mobility in Chile? There is an important group of researchers led by Florencia Torche and Guillermo Wormald (2004, 2005) who focus on the changes in Chilean social structure and mobility since the last decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. They have used survey analysis of the 'Social mobility survey' by ISUC<sup>2</sup> (2001) a national level survey of male householders (aged 25-69, based on 3,544 households). The authors used Erikson and Goldthorpe's (1992) Nuffield approach to social mobility and analysed the Chilean social structure by focusing on occupational class position, in order to ensure the comparability of the data to international datasets. The authors argued that the Goldthorpe class model can be applied to Chilean patterns, despite the fact that Chile is not an industrialized country. Torche (2005) suggests that Chile is unequal but fluid in terms of mobility. She argues that 'Despite vast economic inequality, Chile is as fluid, if not more so, than the much more equal industrialized nations. Study of the specific mobility flows in Chile indicates a significant barrier to long-range downward mobility from the elite (signaling high "elite closure"), but very low barriers across nonelite classes' (Torche, 2005, 422). These studies suggest there is significant mobility out of the working-class but only across short to medium range distances. This short-range mobility can help in the reduction of poverty, however the movement tends to be much lower across long distances, so that in Chile it is difficult to reach privileged positions. This finding needs to be kept in mind in relation to the mobility of my Mapuche sample, who have mainly experienced mid-range mobility, but whose accounts indicate structural barriers that prevent them reaching elite positions.

What about more qualitative studies of social mobility? Araujo and Martuccelli (2015) focus their research in the importance of meritocracy in Chilean society. From a qualitative perspective the authors evaluated people's views by comparing working and

<sup>-</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Instituto de Sociología de la Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile.

middle-class groups at different stages of their school trajectories. They suggest there is 'a strong consensus about the value of merit, and the widespread sentiments of injustice and frustration that it produces in individuals' (Araujo and Martuccelli, 2015: 1504). Amongst their interviewees they identified two strategies of social mobility, one related to acquiring educational credentials and the other related to drawing social capital from the networks that people have. According to the authors, the middle-class tended to see both sets of resources as closely associated, whereas working-class people tended to perceive educational credentials as a way to compensate for their lack of bridging networks. However, they had to deal with structural barriers such as the cost of fees. The participants of my sample found similar barriers in their route to attend university, also, the respondents and their families shared the feeling of trust in educational institutions as the main vehicle of social mobility, because they lacked social networks which could advance them.

Mendez (2002) also analysed the social mobility of Chilean people from the metropolitan region, examining their perceptions of that mobility as well as the strategies, values and cultural practices that influenced the social mobility process. She focused on the meanings associated with social mobility, examining how people's narratives were related to structural process and subjective perceptions. She found that education was the main strategy for families to experience upward social mobility. Also, families deployed other kind of strategies to fit in to their new higher social context, such as participation in middle-class cultural activities. Moreover, she found that working-class families tended to prioritise adopting new cultural practices to be part of their new social context, whereas middle-class families tend to prioritise success in the market. It is interesting that Mendez's analysis emphasises the cultural strategies that socially mobile working-class people deployed in order to fit in. They made an effort to adopt new rules and practices in their life, modifying their habitus. In that sense, my research echoes but also extends this analysis, going beyond by exploring what happens after people adapt their cultural strategies in response to upward social mobility. My own research finds that most respondents did not feel that they fitted in to their contexts, but also that they had different responses according to the social context they wanted to fit into. Some deployed strategies to fit into their social context of origin whilst others oriented to their social context of destination, with additional variation in strategies according to whether people emphasised either their class or ethnic identities or stressed both. These complex negotiations of transition and identity again raise the question of the intersectional nature of social mobility in Chile, and so I now turn to discuss the concept of intersectionality.

## 2.3 Intersectionality

This section considers the concept of intersectionality as a model to analyse the complex and multiple identities of the upwardly mobile Mapuche people in my study. The thesis argues that the experience of social mobility is not only related to class, but also is associated with gender, ethnicity, migration, discrimination, among others. For Anthias and Yuval-Davis (1992) race and racism are also structural processes inter-related with other social divisions, such as class and gender. This section begins with a brief examination of some different approaches to intersectionality, in terms of how the concept has become an important way of analysing identities, whilst also considering some limitations in approaches. I will focus on the work of Nicola Rollock (2011, 2012, 2015) in order to show how intersectional analysis can help us to understand the complexity of processes of social mobility. However, a note of caution is required to avoid the concept of intersectionality becoming an 'inarticulate cover-all concept' (Byrne, 2015: 7.1) which means different things within different theoretical perspectives, that sometimes are incompatible (Byrne, 2015).

## 2.3.1 More than gender, ethnicity and class: intersectionality

The term intersectionality was used for the first time by Kimberle Crenshaw (1989) when she tried to show how exclusion is a complex situation that is not only related to class, gender or race, but is a situation of structural disadvantage that involves all of these.

From a feminist and legal perspective, Crenshaw showed the complex nature of the marginalization of black woman in the United States. She used the metaphor of a road intersection to show that the legal arguments of companies with antidiscrimination policies did not cover the overlapping nature of either the race or gender discrimination that black women suffered (Byrne, 2015). Crenshaw was worried that black women were excluded from feminist and anti-racist perspectives, and she argued that the exclusion of black women had to be rethought and recast, in order to change our analytical structure (Crenshaw, 1989). However, according to Byrne (2015) the metaphor that Crenshaw used has:

the disadvantage of potentially tying us in to a notion of gender and gender hierarchies being essentially separable from the hierarchies of race and class-except where they meet [...] the risk of the vocabulary of intersectionality is that it may solidify, rather than interrupt and critique categories of identification and power (Byrne, 2015: 3).

Relatedly, another concern about intersectional analysis is that it can fall into an 'additive approach', which sees factors of discrimination such as class, gender, race and others, as working independently and not as interrelated. For example, Yuval-Davis (2007) argues that an 'additive approach' is in danger of 'constructing discriminatory/disadvantage power vector as autonomous [...] it basically echoes the 'triple oppression'' (Yuval – Davis, 2007: 565). Anthias (2002) and Yuval – Davis (2007) suggest that a better approach to understanding intersectionality is that of 'mutual constitution', which does not look for the 'junction' of the factors of discrimination and power, but instead argues that these 'triple oppression' factors are 'mutually constituted by each other' (Yuval - Davis, 2007: 565). These concerns suggest that the different dimensions of intersectionality need to be used in a flexible and critical manner in order to properly understand power structures (Byrne, 2015). However, Walby et al (2012) go further, suggesting that the concept of 'mutual constitution' is too simple and not sufficient to 'grasp the varying and uneven contribution of sets of unequal social relations to the outcome' (Walby et al, 2012: 235). The authors propose that 'mutual shaping' is a better concept, because this enables the 'retention of naming of each relevant inequality or project while simultaneously recognizing that it is affected by engagement with the others' (Walby et al, 2012: 235).

McCall (2005) identifies three approaches of intersectionality. The first is 'anticategorical' and is concerned to deconstruct analytical categories and to consider their fluidity. The second approach is 'intra-categorical', and questions the process of boundary formation between categories, with a 'focus on particular social groups at neglected points of intersection, in order to reveal the complexity of lived experience within such groups' (McCall, 2005: 1774). The last approach is 'inter-categorical' and is used to identify and map inequalities among social groups 'alone multiple and conflicting dimensions' (McCall, 2005: 1773). According to Walby et al (2012) the use of category concepts tends to 'obscure the powerful within them' (Walby et al, 2012: 228). They suggest that:

It is useful to avoid terminology, such as 'category' or 'strand', that gives the impression of a unitary object, and instead to use terms, such as 'set of unequal social relations', 'inequality' and 'social system', that draw attention to the complex ontology of the object of analysis. This would help to avoid the lack of focus on the inequalities within each of the intersecting sets of social relations (Walby et al, 2012: 231).

So far, I have considered different approaches within intersectionality studies. For this research, intersectionality is understood as an analytical model, in which relational social dimensions such as class, gender, ethnicity, migration, and discrimination (among others) are all in engagement with each other. This approach is adopted in order to reveal the complexity of the different dimensions of social inequalities, in which it 'is important to note their historical dynamics as well temporarily stabilizing the categories for analysis at one point in time' (Walby et al, 2012: 231). I now turn to focus on some significant studies that address the intersectional influence of class, gender, and ethnic inequalities in education and social mobility.

## 2.3.2 Studies of intersectionality: middle-class education and ethnic minorities

In this section, I discuss a programme of work that has focused on the upward social mobility experience of ethnic minorities, specifically emphasising their experiences in higher education (Rollock and colleagues, 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014 and 2015). This work, developed from the project 'The educational strategies of the black middle-classes', suggests that ethnicity and gender are essential components to the analysis of the complex inequalities experienced by socially mobile black professionals. Their theoretical framework is based on Bourdieu (1984) and Critical Race Theory, and demonstrate the complex, multifaceted and contradictory nature of race inequality, which must be analysed in terms of several capitals which work differently (or have different value) according to race (Rollock, 2012). My thesis explores the social mobility of indigenous people from Chile who clearly do not have the same experiences as minorities from England or the United States, but the work of Rollock and her colleagues is important for showing a way of analysing the complexities of Chilean inequalities from an intersectional point of view.

Rollock criticises the work of Savage et al (2013) and Bourdieu (1984) for not recognising how class locations, dispositions and capitals are all inflected by race; she argues that 'class identity cannot be fully understood without taking account of the intersecting role of race' and that we must recognise the 'the extent to which classed capitals are seen to have weight, worth or legitimacy for different ethnic groups' (2014: 444, 445). In particular, she argues that the extent to which middle-classness is associated with whiteness is under-appreciated, and that 'the intersection of race (white), class (middle) and gender (male) is reflective of a hierarchical power dynamic that is evidenced – yet seldom named by those embodying that identity profile - across the academy or other sectors' (Rollock, 2014: 446). Following this argument, racial identity should not only be focused on minorities, since this also includes white people. This focus on the 'whiteness' of the middle-class helps to explain the ambivalent position of black professionals. They use class signifiers and capitals 'to facilitate access to, and a certain acceptance within,

mainly white (middle class) spaces but crucially, they also disturb and disrupt the fixed, stereotypical perceptions that many whites hold about blacks', however the whiteness of the middle-class field mean that the 'dispositions that are seen to comprise "fit" are exactly those which keep the black middle classes on the fringes of middle classness' (Rollock, 2014: 446, 449).

Rollock's work (2012) explores the intersection of race, class and gender, and how advantage or disadvantage depends on the social context. In this case, her focus is on the ways in which the British Black middle-classes are able to engage with the education system (Rollock, 2012). She argues that ethnic minorities have to occupy a different space, where their identities and experiences are constructed; this space is racialized in a liminal space of alterity (Rollock, 2012). She is interested in how her respondents manage the notion of marginality and how they developed a complex set of resources to manage the interactions of racism and otherness (Rollock, 2012). For that reason, she used her own personal story as a black academic and used counter-narrative (a central tool of Critical Race Theory) to reflect on the 'notion of marginality, resistance and agency' (Rollock, 2012: 72) to reveal how whiteness operated inside the academia and shaped her story as a black middle-class woman. Rollock reveals how ethnic minorities have to deploy strategies to deal with constants tensions and negotiations in white spaces. Moreover, she demonstrates that

Power, status, gender and context interact in multiple sometimes opposing ways to lend a complexity to the experiences and very being of those persons of colours who work to advance the racial justice project even while race is becoming more embedded, more nuanced, thus necessitating increasingly sophisticated strategies for survival (Rollock, 2012: 82).

Rollock's work (2014) is also focused on how people perceive their class location, arguing that it is necessary to take account of the role of race in shaping class location and identity. Amongst her black middle-class sample, she identified a 'middle-class ambivalent' group, who were ambivalent about identifying themselves as middle-class, similar to Savage et al.'s (2001) research. However, Rollock respondents' ambivalence

emerged in relation to their family class background, and race and racism. Two other groups, the 'working class' and the 'middle-class identifiers', were the least ambivalent in their identification, whilst a fourth group the 'working-class with qualifications' were people who identified as working-class with middle-class values. A final group, the 'interrogators' were people who felt they did not fit into any class position, however they reflected critically about the meaning of class. It has been argued that people who experience social mobility develop strategies to fit into their old and new locations, however for minority populations these strategies were also used to help minimize the probability of racial discrimination. This cultural toolkit against discrimination was founded on the way people used language as a vehicle to identify themselves in a social group, as well as mannerisms and body dispositions, clothing and credentials – with all of these related to class but also to gender and race (Rollock, 2011). Rollock's respondents spoke of how 'whites act to protect the boundaries of white middle-class spaces' (Rollock, 2014: 448), and so they had to develop skills to fit into a white space; changing their accent, the way they spoke, and despite the fact that they had the 'the appropriate' capitals, needed to develop further skills to be legitimised in a white structure.

I have argued that intersectionality is central for the analysis of the experiences of upward social mobility and explored work which emphasizes that it is impossible to understand the experience of minorities being middle-class without attending to the role of race and racism. As Rollock shows although individuals deployed their class capitals to obtain advantage in a white space, they still encountered racism and symbolic boundaries which affected their inclusion and their strategies of identity (Rollock, 2015). My thesis extends Rollock's perspective, arguing that, whilst the Mapuche do not have the same experience as minorities from England, they share similar classed and raced strategies for dealing with the barriers of inequalities and discriminations they face in their upward social mobility.

## 2.3.3 Post-coloniality

In adopting an intersectional perspective on the social mobility of the Mapuche in Chile, it is also necessary to address the colonialism which has shaped the situation of this indigeneous people. My research therefore also considers post-colonial theories (Hall 1996; Canales and Rea, 2013; Antileo, 2012, and Weaver 2001) in order to better understand the process of disadvantage that the Mapuche are going through. In Chile there is an increased tendency to address post-colonial studies, above all from Mapuche historians, such as Pairican 2014, Canales 2013, Cabrera 2016, Caniuqueo 2006 among others. Their goal is to understand the relationship between Chilean society and the Mapuche population from a decolonial perspective, as Mapuche history has been told through the colonizers' eyes for centuries. Therefore, their main aim is to reinterpret this history and to make visible all the disadvantages that the Mapuche people experience. Several authors have also proposed a decolonial perspective in response to the limitations of theories which assume a western universalism. According to Bello (2016) otherness, diversity and heterogeneity are key categories employed within academia and the discourses of social movements to counter the universality imposed by western society. De Sousa Santos (2010) argues it is necessary to decolonialise knowledge and emphasises the role of intellectuals in Latin America, specifically indigenous intellectuals, in this process. De Sousa Santos (2011) proposes the idea of 'epistemologies of the south' (epistemologías del sur), 'where the south is not only a geography space, it also represents the position of subaltern, where the south is dominated by the hegemony of the north' (Bello, 2016: 14). Epistemologies of the South have been created in response to Eurocentric universalism, where coloniality still exists as a form of domination. According to Fernandez (2010) the role of indigenous intellectuals in Latin America is important for indigenous movements, which challenge colonial power in society, market and state. The lives of my sample participants are clearly shaped by colonial domination. They are also closely related to a decolonial perspective, as some of them belong to those groups of intellectuals that promote decolonization, as part of social movements that reveal the disadvantages of the Mapuche people and recover their identities as an indigenous group. In that sense, I argue that some of the respondents from my research have started to include practices and narratives related to the decolonial process, as a way to re-signify their identities.

In thinking about the resignification of identities, my approach is influenced by the work of the Jamaican Stuart Hall (1988, 1996; 2000) and his account of how identities are shaped by race and post-colonial relations. He migrated to United Kingdom when he was young, and his migration experience had an impact in the way he analysed society, highlighting the Jamaican diaspora and the minorities' point of view. Hall (1996) points out that identities are often contradictory and are not coherent and unified, because of the influence of shifting cultural contexts on identity constructions.

Identity becomes a "moveable feast": Formed and transformed continuously in relation to the ways we are represented or addressed in the cultural systems which surround us. It is historically, not biologically, defined. The subject assumes different identities at different times, identities which are not unified around a coherent "self". Within us are contradictory identities. Pulling in different directions, so that our identifications are continuously being shifted about (Hall, 1996: 598).

This approach is particularly relevant to my study, because as my empirical chapters will show, the sample engaged in complex identity tensions and renegotiations as they moved between social contexts as part of their mobility transitions. One of my arguments is that respondents experienced dilemma with their identities, as they found it difficult to frame themselves within a specific class identity, but also hesitated about their indigenous identities. In that sense Hall's account of identities helps to understand why the respondents' identities are so complex and changeable.

However, Hall (1988) points out that identities should not be seen as totally flexible, since identities have a positional and conjunctural character, with 'their formation in and for specific times and places' (Hall, 1996, 309). According to Hall (1996) identities and identification are in a constant relation. For him identification is a person's sense of

where they can fit in and what is available for that person. Hall (1996) explained the complex process of identification and the different levels or steps of it. There is distinction between what people think about themselves, whether they can claim a kind of identity, and whether others can dispute this identity. We can see this in my own sample, in the case of the 're-signifiers' group, who had difficulties claiming an indigenous identity that others did not recognise (as 're-signifiers' do not look like 'traditional' Mapuche people and most do not have two Mapuche surnames). It seems there are limits to the flexibility of identity and what people can claim of it.

Another relevant line of research on indigenous identification and identity is Weaver's work in the United States (2001). She follows Hall perspective on cultural identity and 'provides reflections on how internalised oppression/colonization is associated to identity' (Weaver, 2001: 240). Weaver identifies as an indigenous person, specifically as Lakota. She makes similar distinctions between identification and identity as Hall, dividing identities into three facets. The first is self-identification, and Weaver agrees that cultural identities are not static, that there is choice whether or not to accept an indigenous identity, 'although the range of choices is limited by factors such as phenotypical appearances. Choice may also be influenced by social, economic, and political factors' (Weaver, 2001: 244). The author suggests that cultural identity is a way of resisting assimilation, as in the case when indigenous peoples do not grow up in an indigenous community, and as a form of resistance they may not value good marks in schools, because they reject white notions of how they have to live. Therefore, they resist living as white people. Weaver also suggests that when people get older their attachment with their culture increases, generating a revitalization of indigenous culture. The second facet of identity is community identification, where 'identity can only be confirmed by others who share that identity. The sense of membership in a community is so integrally linked to a sense of identity that Native people often identify themselves by their communities' (Weaver, 2001: 245). She notes however that cultural identity differences also can be found among indigenous people from the same

community. The last facet is external identification, and the author asks, 'Who decides who is an indigenous person, native or nonnatives?' (Weaver, 2001: 246). This question is interesting because it raises the issue of the relationship between the government and indigenous groups, and how identification may be shaped by whether the government recognizes people as legitimate. On the other hand, this question can lead to a discussion about authenticity and which attributes characterise a 'legitimate' indigenous person. These questions of self, community and external identification are relevant for my study because we can identify similar processes amongst the Mapuche people in Chile. As my own study shows, the process of identification is very complex, and it is not enough that people identify as indigenous, they need validation from others, external to their contexts, but they also need validation from the people that surround them. These processes were further complicated by their social mobility transitions. For that reason, most of my respondents felt identity dislocation, because they needed to negotiate their identities across multiple contexts and many levels.

## 2.4 Conclusion

In this chapter, I have considered the conceptual tools required to fully understand the complex and entangled upward social mobility process of the Mapuche people, arguing that it is necessary to integrate the Bourdieusian perspective with intersectional and post-colonial theorising, in order to examine how people negotiate their social location and identities, not only in terms of class but also in terms of ethnicity, gender and migration.

In this chapter I reviewed four key sets of debates related to my research. The first area, work on social mobility and meritocracy, argues that the increase in access to education for participants does not necessarily translate into a reduction of inequalities with social mobility related more to structural changes (Savage and Egerton, 1997), than to the educational abilities of people. In that sense, despite the fact that my respondents attended university, they faced a series of structural disadvantages in which their

situation as a minority did not fundamentally change. This raises the question of how class and ethnically disadvantaged groups experience mobility and fit into middle-class fields, and for that reason, I turned to Bourdieusian class analysis, which provides the conceptual tools (such as habitus/field and 'fish out of water' experiences) to better understand the consequences of social mobility. The focus of my research on the consequences of mobility is on how it affects social inclusion and identity, along lines of class but also gender, migration, ethnicity and discrimination. Because class analysis often neglects these dimensions, I also examined a third set of debates which adopts an intersectional approach to understanding how people construct their identities (Crenshaw, 1989, Byrne 2015). I argued that it is necessary to adopt an intersectional approach to fully understand how the participants from my research negotiated both ethnic and class disadvantages and problems of identity when they experienced upward social mobility (Rollock, 2011, 2015). Finally, I argued that because of the complex colonial domination of the Mapuche, it is necessary to employ a post-colonial perspective to address their construction of identities across their experience of social mobility (Hall 1996, Weaver, 2001). Such a post-colonial perspective is also necessary to help understand why some of my participants started to decolonise their practices and politicised their identities.

The theoretical approaches that I considered in this chapter also have methodological implication for my research, because I make a theoretical journey from a conventional class perspective to an intersectional and post-colonial perspective. This journey is necessary because it allows my research to make central the point of view of minorities and their positionality, in this case the place of the Mapuche people in the Chilean context. Also, an intersectional, post-colonial perspective also allows me to reveal my own positionality and to construct my reflection of the process of doing this research. I now turn to discuss my research strategy and the methodological choices I made during my fieldwork in Chile.

# **Chapter 3: Methodology: Researching Mapuche social mobility**

## 3.1 Introduction

In the previous chapter, I examined how the identity consequences of class mobility need to be understood in tandem with questions of ethnicity and ethnic identities. This chapter explains the methodological approach of my research and the different strategies adopted during the process. My core research question asks: how do the social mobility transitions of Mapuche with higher education impact on their racial and class cultures and affect their social identities? However, I divide this overarching research question into four sub-questions:

- What are the identity consequences of social mobility for those Mapuche people who enter higher education?
- Do these socially mobile Mapuche experience disruption in their transitions to new social contexts?
- What social and cultural strategies do socially mobile Mapuche people employ to cope with the experience of social mobility?
- How do the discourses of socially mobile Mapuche reflect on experiencing racism and discrimination?

Following on from these questions, the focus of my research strategy is on investigating how my socially mobile participants experienced their transitions, how they positioned themselves in their new social contexts, and how they narrated their negotiation of their identities through this process. In this chapter, I detail the methodological approach used to address these issues.

The framing of these research questions focuses on questions of identity and how participants perceived and negotiated their social contexts and their trajectories. I therefore adopted a qualitative research strategy using a biographical interview

approach to generate narratives, in line with a number of previous studies on the consequences of social mobility (Reay 2009, Grandfield 1991, Baxter and Britton 2001, Lehmann 2009, 2013, Friedman 2014, Mendez 2008, Savage 2001, Skeggs 1997, Rollock 2012, 2014). I also supplemented my life history interviews with a number of direct observations of Mapuche social gatherings and events. Whilst these observations are not directly discussed in my empirical analysis, they provided further context to my interviews and analysis. As discussed by Roberts (2002) life history is a method in which, through interviews, the researcher asks respondents to generate personal histories with the aim of understanding their changing experiences and their visions of their daily lives, including how they interpret their past, present and future. According to Byrne (2003a: 30) this 'negotiation between the self of the present and the self/selves of the past is an inherent part of telling one's life story'. This thesis is centrally focused on changing understandings their self-identity across their mobility transitions, so this method is particularly useful for exploring participants' accounts of their negotiation with change and potential disruptions to their identities.

This chapter is divided into four sections. The first section focuses on the usefulness of biographical approaches for studying the consequences of social mobility. I discuss the life history method, exploring the advantages (and some disadvantages) of this technique for my research. Then I set out the key characteristics of my respondents, indicating how I generated my sample and its overall composition. The next section details my fieldwork activities, from meeting the participants to the experience of conducting the interviews, with some discussion of my observational activities and a reflection on my own positionality in conduct of the research. The final section details how I analysed the data and considers some limitations of my research approach and findings.

# 3.2 Researching the consequences of social mobility through a biographical perspective

Most research about the consequences of social mobility has adopted a qualitative methodology, as this 'is a particularly suitable method for accessing complex issues such as values and understanding' as 'a flexible medium' which 'to a certain extent, allows interviewees to speak in their own voices and with their own language' (Byrne, 2003a:209). This is a particularly useful approach for exploring the experiences of people who are disadvantaged minorities, such as the Mapuche, since it can give voice to people who 'have been ignored, misrepresented or suppressed in the past' (Byrne, 2003a, 209). As discussed in Chapter Two, my analytical framework links the Bourdieusian perspective with intersectional and post-colonial approaches. These are perspectives which focus on questions of identity, power and positionality and connect well with a biographical research approach which focuses on how identities in context are negotiated over time. For example, the Bourdieusian influenced studies of Friedman (2015), Mendez (2008) and Reay, Crozier and Clayton (2010), discussed in detail in Chapter Two, all utilised a biographical approach. Friedman (2015) suggests that the biographical approach allows a better understanding of social mobility trajectories, as it allows interviewees to frame and interpret their origin and destination class situations without imposing categories or meanings. Similarly, Mendez (2008) was interested in examining how people who identify as middle-class interpreted their own biographies, and she deployed in-depth interviews in order to explore accounts of different kind of trajectories (upward, horizontal and downward). Additionally, Reay, Crozier and Clayton (2010) also saw biographical interviews as the most suited to focus on the perceptions of working-class students in higher education as to whether or not they fitted in to this new environment. Their goal was to identify if 'these students struggle to change and conform to the institutional milieu or to reproduce their identities in an act of resistance, or whether they merely seek validation for who they are; to discern to what extent they fit in or stand out' (Reay, Crozier and Clayton, 2010: 4).

Intersectional research studies also typically use qualitative techniques, and in Chapter Two I highlighted the work of Lawler (1999) and Rollock (2015) who also deployed biographical methods in order to reveal the additional raced and gendered aspects to people's social mobility experiences. Lawler (1999) who also adopts a Bourdieusian approach, focused on women's narratives about their transition from working-class to middle-class contexts, suggesting that experiences of social mobility bring pain and a sense of estrangement. She interviewed 14 women, but focused on the biographies of seven, tracing their trajectories to the middle-class through two routes: education and marriage to a middle-class man. Rollock (2015) combining a Critical Race Theory and a Bourdieusian perspective, explored the experience of being black and middle-class, using biographical interviews to examine her respondents' experiences of race and racism. Sixty-two respondents were interviewed and, after one year, a second interview was conducted with 15 of the respondents, in order to deepen analysis of the complex relationship between race and class in the formation of identity. These studies show the value of biographical approaches in exploring the consequences of social mobility on identity negotiations and I have adopted this approach in my own research.

## 3.2.1 Life history as a research method

My research examines how Mapuche people who are the first generation to attend university perceive their life trajectories and their experiences of upward social mobility. The research examines how respondents negotiated their identities through these life trajectories and their accounts of transition include their perceptions of social-historical transformation. In that sense, qualitative research helps us to examine the complexity of narratives and perceptions. According to Byrne (2003a: 209) qualitative interviews 'provide better access to interviewees' views, interpretations of events, understandings, experiences and opinions. They are also more open to hearing respondents' views "in their own words", which allows for a more complex analysis. Therefore, this approach tends to be used by those who come from an ontological position which respects people's knowledge, values and experiences as meaningful and worthy of exploration'.

Life history interviews are a widely-used method within biographical methods and give precedence to subjectivity and story-telling (Webb and Sepulveda, 2018). Life history is a methodological option which can capture the perceptions of participants and their understanding about their social context in which they are involved. According to Harries (2012: 48) such 'narratives are useful to explore the relationship between multiple levels of experience, as they combine the social with the cultural, historical and political. Focusing the interview on the social, rather than the personal, opens up the potential for respondents to take up discursive repertoires at their disposal and, at the same time, externalise these representations'. By asking people to recount their individual histories it is possible to explore 'how cultural values and traditions influence development across the life cycle' (Atkinson, 2002: 124). Following this approach, respondents are able to choose how they want to tell their stories of mobility and the consequences for their identities.

Accounts of individual histories always connect with wider histories. One of the advantages of life history as a research method is it allows me to explore how the participants' saw their social mobility experiences as connected to their wider situation (their families, the Mapuche community, their schools, universities and jobs). Moreover, a person's account of their life history can show how they understand broader social events, movements and political causes (Atkinson, 2002). In the case of my Mapuche participants, their life histories give us a view on the situation of the Mapuche people in Chilean society, and their accounts show their different positioning within Mapuche politics and social movements. According to Atkinson (2002), life history is useful for researchers interested in determining the relationship between language and social practice, the relationship of self to others, and the creation of social identity. I have adopted it as a research instrument in my own study to examine the relationship between the participants and their old and new social contexts, as well as how they constructed their identities across these transitions.

According to Fitzpatrick (2013) the life history technique can help researchers in three stages of analysis by exploring the individual, subjectivity and reflexivity. In the first, individual stage, the life history technique provides a focus on how my Mapuche sample interacted with their surrounding environment (from their working-class context to their new position in the middle class). In the second analytical stage - subjectivity - life history brings a focus on feelings and emotions, helping us to explore my sample's perceptions and understandings of their experiences. The third analytical stage reflexivity - entails a reflection on the contribution that the researcher makes the construction of meanings throughout the research process, with an acknowledgment of not being outside the theme of the research (Fitzpatrick, 2013). In this regard, in life history approaches there is a tendency to see the researcher as a co-producer of the data which is the product of the interaction between researcher and respondents (Mason cited in Byrne, 2003a). In the case of my thesis, I argue that the interview is not a neutral encounter, but rather a motivated discussion (on the part of both interviewee and interviewer) with the information produced inevitably shaped by the nature of the interaction. I always had to reflect on how the respondents' were being asked to speak about experiences (transitions in their class and ethnic positioning, discrimination and disadvantage) which could be difficult or morally charged for them and in which they might wish to present themselves in a certain light. In that sense, interviews are not an objective process, but rather constructed by interviewer and respondents.

The interview is also influenced by a range of other factors, including the place of the interview, the embodied nature of the encounter, silences, pronunciation, empathy, all of which can affect the communication. In the case of my research, one example of how these factors are relevant was when I interviewed a woman in her house with her boyfriend present with us throughout the interview, despite the fact that I explained to her that we would discuss personal issues. Because of his presence and the fact that he interrupted at various points, I was not confident to ask all the questions in the interview schedule. Moreover, she also felt uncomfortable, and when I asked her about past experiences related with her work and university situation, she sometimes preferred not

to answer. Afterwards, I asked her if she was available for a second interview, in another place and alone. This second interview was totally different to the first, she answered all the questions, there were no moments of silence, no interruptions and our dynamic was more fluent than before. As this example shows, it is always important to consider the interview as a process between interviewer and interviewee.

Whilst bearing these potential constraints and difficulties in mind, according to Byrne (2003a) one additional advantage of biographical methods, like the life history technique, is their flexibility which better allows the researcher to explore issues which can be sensitive, such as racism and prejudice. Biographical approaches are useful because they offer people a chance to reflect on their situation and can help show, for example, how ethnic minorities recognize their positions (Cain, 2007). Bengoa (1999:30) suggests that 'through narratives the Mapuche people can show contradictions of their exclusion: reveal their practices of resistance, accommodation and quiet transformation'. Additionally, through a narrative approach it is possible to explore dimensions not revealed by official history records, as traditionally Mapuche history has been told by their colonisers. Therefore, I also see the process of conducting life history interviews as a tool to give Mapuche people greater visibility and which enables them to tell their own stories. Nonetheless, as a researcher I have the responsibility to ask the right questions, and analyse and write up the research in a manner sensitive to and respectful of their accounts.

My approach to the life history method was to use semi-structured interviews which focused on biographical issues, structuring the interview questions in the order of the life course, whilst also giving the participants the opportunity to construct their narratives and reflection. In the fieldwork section of this chapter, I give more detail about how the interview schedule was structured (the schedule can also be found in Appendix Two), the topics covered as well how participants reacted to questions.

In my initial research strategy, I planned another methodological approach, that of direct observation, as a complement to the life history technique. According to Peretz

(2000:20) 'direct observation witnesses the social behavior of individuals or groups in places of their own activities or residence without changing its ordinary course. The aim is to collect and record all of the components of social life perceived by that particular witness who is the observer'. My thought in planning this method was that it would help to explore beyond the narratives of the participants, for example, by seeing some of my sample's embodied interactions across their different social contexts. According to Schmuck (1997) direct observation allows researchers to examine non-verbal expressions, determine who interacts with who, and allows exploration of how participant communicate and how much time they spend in different sorts of activities. However, direct observation can be a very time-consuming method, and as my fieldwork only lasted seven months I did not have enough time to participate in the daily lives of the respondents. I was focused on collecting the life history interviews of the respondents, and while observations would have been a useful complement to this, I was not able to conduct observation in any detailed way. I did conduct some direct observations of certain selected social and political events that took place during my fieldwork, partly to help generate fieldwork contacts but also to provide some context to my interviews, by viewing Mapuche people interacting in collective contexts. These events included the Mapuche history congress, a workshop on leadership for Mapuche women, and several Mapuche protest events. In addition I participated in several peñas (popular folk parties, which commonly collect money to help someone or to organise some event), I attended some events for Mapuche professionals (one a debate about Mapuche autonomy, the other a net-working event for young Mapuche professionals), and I also attended two courses for Mapuche people (on Mapuche history and their claims for autonomy), one organised by a young group of Mapuche students and another organised by the University of Chile. I also took fieldwork notes of my direct observations during the interviews. These events allowed me to participate in some of the real-life situations of Mapuche people, and whilst my empirical analysis does not reference these observations they provided additional background information for my analysis of the interviews.

# 3.3 Introducing Mapuche with higher education

As discussed in Chapter One, I decided to explore the situation of Mapuche who entered higher education as a case study of how people negotiating their identities in response to the experience of social mobility. For many years the Mapuche people found it very difficult to attend university, and so with improved chances of attending (via indigenous scholarships or loans) university attendance has been a major vehicle through which some Mapuche can experience upward social mobility. But as my research shows, during this transition from working-class to middle class positions, Mapuche professionals experience a series of challenges of adjustment and dilemmas of identity - along lines of both ethnicity and class. Hence, this group of respondents offers a chance to examine a particularly complex experience of social mobility, in which participants found different ways of managing their identities, as ways of negotiating becoming middle-class at the same time as being Mapuche.

In generating my sample, I had three main selection criteria, with the achieved sample comprised of people who identify as Mapuche, who are the first generation in their families to attend university, and who live in either the Araucanía and Metropolitan regions of Chile. In total I conducted 40 interviews, 20 in Temuco (the main city in Araucanía) and 20 in Santiago (the capital of Chile). The reason for selecting participants from these regions was to explore the different experiences of Mapuche professionals from the Mapuche homeland (Araucanía) compared to those whose family (or own) migration had taken them to the capital, where Mapuche are in a minority. Twenty-three respondents are men and 17 are woman. The aim of my sampling was to elicit the narratives of a specific group in Chilean society, rather than to be representative (Mason, 2018). Therefore, my sample is not representative, and I was not seeking that. However, I should also note some skews in my sample. For instance, almost half of the interviewees (19) were members of Mapuche social, political or cultural organizations, because I used a snowball sampling technique, using members of these groups to recommend me to

their networks. Hence, in the sample is likely to over-represent people who are more politically active, and who have a particular point of view on the Mapuche situation.

**Table 3.1:** Achieved characteristics of the sample

- People who have at least one Mapuche surname
- People who identify as Mapuche
- People who have a working-class origin
- People who have HE qualifications
- People who live in Santiago or Temuco cities.

Source: own elaboration

The research sampling strategy focused on comparing respondents who were born and grew up in rural areas (generally seen as closer to traditional Mapuche culture) with respondents who were born and grew up in urban areas, in order to explore how their social contexts affected their experience of mobility and the construction of their identities. According to Chenard (2006) Mapuche people who live in rural areas differ from those who live in urban areas, because urban Mapuche are in the process of losing their indigenous identities, as they tend to hide their identities in order to integrate into their new context. Eleven people in the sample were born in the countryside in a Mapuche community. Eight of them now are living in Temuco and three in Santiago.

Another dimension that I considered in constructing my research sample was the age of participants. The age range of the sample is between 21 and 57 years old. I selected participants from this age range because I was interested in covering a wide age range, covering different periods related to attendance at university (bearing in mind that scholarships for indigenous people were introduced in 1992). The average age of participants interviewed in the Metropolitan region was 31.5 years old, and the age average of participants from the Araucanía region was 34.2 years old, and the total average age for the sample was 32.8 years old. The men in the sample tended to be older on average than the women, because for past generations it was more unusual for Mapuche women to attend university. As a result, it was difficult to find older women who had attended university.

Another characteristic of the sample is that it is composed of people from working-class backgrounds. Additionally, most of the respondents came from very poor families. According to a CASEN survey (2013), seven out of ten of the poorest districts in Chile are in the Araucanía region. The total population in Araucanía is 952,813, with 266,113 (27.9) percent) living in situations of poverty. Thus, the socioeconomic situation of Araucanía is very dramatic in terms of the living conditions of people. For that reason, having a chance of social mobility is both more remarkable and very important for the people who live there. Poverty is perhaps less pervasive in the Metropolitan region, however a CASEN survey (2013) shows that 12 districts have a poverty rate of 14.4%. The CASEN survey considers those with an income under 72,098 Chilean pesos (83.46 GBP per month) as poor people. Among the poorest districts in the Metropolitan region, where some of the interviewees lived, are Renca (20.7% poverty), La Granja (15.9% poverty), and Puente Alto with 15.4%. The level of poverty in the Metropolitan region shows how unequal districts are. Most of the interviewees were living in poor districts and these are the poorest districts in the country, particularly in comparison to those in Araucanía. Most of the participants' parents were educated to secondary school level at most, and with a working-class background. In Chapter Four I discuss in more detail the parents' background and their influence on the participants' mobility.

Another important dimension of the sample is that they all identify as Mapuche and have one or two Mapuche surnames. According to Webb and Sepulveda (2018) the Mapuche are one of the most endogamous indigenous groups in Latin America, so it is likely all are mixed-race, but in Chile there is a marked difference between having two Mapuche surnames and only one. For instance, the respondents with one paternal Chilean surname and one maternal Mapuche surname reported less discrimination than respondents who had two Mapuche surnames or a paternal Mapuche surname (in daily life in Chile people generally only use their father's surname). Mapuche people with only one Mapuche surname are called 'Champurria' in Mapudungun (meaning 'mixed') with this term having a negative connotation for white Chilean people but also for Mapuche people, because they are seen as not 'pure'. Common Mapuche surnames (such as

Catrileo, Lemunao, Antileo, Huera, Quidel) are very recognisable because of their different phonetic make up to mainstream Chilean/Spanish names. However, as we shall see in the following chapters, Mapuche surnames are only one way through which people are identified – or self-identify – as Mapuche. Other ways include: speaking the language (Mapudungun); living on Mapuche land (people who live in urban areas are called 'warriache' in Mapudungun and this also has a negative connotation for many Mapuche people) and being actively involved in Mapuche organizations.

All the sample were the first generation in their families to attend university. As I mentioned in Chapter One, in 1992 the Chilean government started to give indigenous scholarships to poorer students with high marks. With this social policy it was suddenly possible for many Mapuche people to attend university, becoming the first generation in their families to do so. This event provoked a significant change in their trajectories and that of their families. In total 30 of the sample attended public universities<sup>3</sup>, 14 in Temuco and 15 in Santiago. 11 people in the sample attended private universities, six people in Temuco and five in Santiago. Moreover, there were eight participants who attended elite<sup>4</sup> universities. According to Torche (2007), despite the fact that there has been a significant educational expansion in Chile, the most important barrier to mobility remains a lack of access to higher education for those from disadvantaged social origins, so in this respect the sample represent an unusual group.

It is necessary to consider the gender characteristics of the sample, because, as discussed in the previous chapter, it is important to consider the gender dynamics of social mobility, and how gender affects people's transition across different social contexts and fields. For that reason, I sought a gender-balanced sample, and this was largely achieved,

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> There are 18 public universities in Chile, which belong to a network of universities called 'Consorcio de Universidades Estatales de Chile', these universities are characterized as such because they are institutions without a particular interest (such as religious). They received funds from the government. Private universities do not receive government funds and are affiliated with religious, political or economic organisations. http://www.uestatales.cl/cue/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Here, elite universities are universities who are considered top universities featuring in the QS Quacquarelli Symonds rankings. <a href="https://www.topuniversities.com/university-rankings/world-university-rankings/2018">https://www.topuniversities.com/university-rankings/world-university-rankings/2018</a>

as Table 3.2 shows, with a roughly equal gender breakdown between the Santiago and Temuco sub-samples.

**Table 3.2:** Research sampling strategy

	Territory	Gender
	20 Mapuche people living	8 Mapuche women
Total Sample = 40	in Metropolitan region	12 Mapuche men
	20 Mapuche people living	9 Mapuche woman
	in Araucanía region	11 Mapuche men

Source: own elaboration

The next section describes the conduct of the fieldwork in Chile, including the recruitment of the sample, the interviewing process, the observations conducted, and finally, I give an account of how I analysed my data.

## 3.4 The fieldwork

My fieldwork started in July 2015 and finished in the middle of February 2016. Throughout this period, I contacted possible participants, had meetings with experts in Mapuche movement studies, and conducted 40 interviews. I also took field notes, and I took pictures during interviews, as well as of the places and events that were related to my study. Below I give a detailed account of my research design and research strategies during my fieldwork, including a discussion of the some of the difficulties that I faced during this time.

### 3.4.1 Pilot interviews

Before I started my fieldwork, I conducted three pilot interviews in Manchester in 2015. The first two interviews were not with Mapuche people, but rather with Chileans who had experiences of social mobility. This was to test my interview schedule, but also to evaluate my performance as interviewer and how I managed unexpected events. The

first interview was not that successful because, although the interviewee answered questions very briefly and did not develop a narrative as I expected. From this I realised that people have different ways of approaching questions and that I had to consider the things that are not said, the silences and uncomfortable moments in interviews. According to Charmaz (2002: 305)

Not all experiences are stories, nor are all experiences stored for ready recall. Silences have meaning, too...Certainly, silences derive from what people forget or do not know, understand, or take into account. Other silences occur when people grope for words to say something on the edge of awareness that had been unclear and unstated. And some silences result from people's awareness of and actions toward their situations. Such silences may either be intended or imposed: Some people are silenced.

The second interview was different as the interviewee was more open to telling her story and I realised that is very important to consider the dynamic between interviewer and interviewees, taking into account the environment in which the interviews happened and if people feel comfortable to speak about their life. Therefore, I realise that I have to create trust and rapport, and for that reason I started to refer briefly to my own story of social mobility. Moreover, there are moments where people can be vulnerable and affected by telling their stories, as happened in the second pilot interview, where the person started to cry. Hence, I had to consider that stories of social mobility are not always easy to tell, because there may be an emotional burden involved.

In the third pilot interview I had the opportunity to interview a Mapuche person who experience upward social mobility and was living in Manchester. I interviewed her in two sessions, each interview took approximately three hours. In the first interview, I focused in following the interview schedule that I designed, however in the second interview I adopted a more flexible approach and tried to address the gaps of my first interview schedule. For example, I did not originally consider asking about the experiences of their family members, but by asking questions on this I could explore if my pilot interviewee's experiences of social mobility were similar or not to their experiences of their family. Also, I made changes in the order of the interview schedule, as I realised that

respondents needed a few introductory questions that prepared them to embrace what the interview was about. For that reason, I started with questions related to their childhoods and their families and then I moved on to their time at university. This decision to order the interview in term of their biography worked and helped respondents to provide more reflective answer about their lives.

The topics included in the interview were related to different stages of the respondents' lives, focused on their educational experience and transitions. The interview started with demographic questions (name, marital status, university, place of residence among others) divided the interview into five main parts: childhood and family; secondary school; time at university and their sense of identity; and their work and current family situation. I started the interview with childhood, addressing their experiences in primary school and their relationship with their family as a 'warming up' strategy, because the interview could be emotionally demanding as people had to talk of their experiences of ethnic discrimination and different kind of disruptions. Therefore, starting with a less intense subject helped people to develop their narratives about class and ethnic transitions with greater comfort. Then, we moved on to discuss their secondary schooling and their relationship with their classmates. In this period of their lives, respondents started to speak about their first realization of differences among people, specifically when they began to distinguish between their own social position and that of others. The third part of the interview was related to their time at university and their construction of their identities. As we shall see in the following chapters, in this part of their lives, they experienced challenges of fitting into both their new and old social contexts and referred to identity negotiations related to both racial and class transitions. Finally, the fifth part of the interview was related to work and their new family, if they had one. Reflecting on this period of life, they were more conscious about the changes in their lives and I probed on how they felt about their social positions, exploring issues including gender dynamics, maternity, marriage, religion, food practices, patterns of parenting, and their plans for the future.

## 3.4.2 Between Temuco and Santiago

My fieldwork started in Temuco city for practical reasons, my family lives there, and as I know the city and people it was easier to start there to generate contacts. My original idea was to stay in Temuco for three months and then move to Santiago. However as more people agreed to interviews, I had to travel according to their schedules, therefore I was traveling between both cities<sup>5</sup> every two weeks. I recruited people through the snowballing method in which 'the researcher accesses informants through contact information that is provided by other informants. This process is, by necessity, repetitive: informants refer the researcher to other informants, who are contacted by the researcher and then refer her or him to yet other informants, and so on' (Noy, 2008: 330). One consequence of snowball sampling is that interviewees tend to be part of a particular network, which may not be representative professional Mapuche society. Before the fieldwork I started to use Twitter as a way to explore what kinds of Mapuche were involved in different social networks and also, through this I became aware of a range of Mapuche cultural, social and political groups. Therefore, Twitter was very useful at the beginning of my fieldwork for understanding the social context I was entering. I only sent an internal message to one person through this way, however, because the snowball method was very successful in generating my sample.

As Figure 3.1 shows, I partly used my personal network to generate contacts (leading to seven interviews in Temuco, three in Santiago). In fact, I started this process in Manchester, before I arrived in Chile. Before the interview, I sent an email to contacts explaining what my research was about and how long the interview would take, and I let them choose the place of the interview. Also, I told them I was doing my PhD at The University of Manchester. This information initially led some people to reject the interview, because they did not want to be studied by someone that represented a foreign university. I did not expect such an effect. Therefore, I told subsequent contacts where I was studying a bit later in the introduction process, so they could get to know

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The distance between Temuco and Santiago is 678 kilometers, the trips is around nine hours by bus.

me. On the other hand, others saw it as positive that I was studying in England and told me about their experiences of travelling or they started to ask me about my experiences in England. Consequently, my positionality as an interviewer had consequences about the information my respondents gave me about their social mobility experiences.

Denisse Denisse Denisse Key Violeta Diego Carlos Key Antonio Key nformant 2 Paulina Javier Eugenio María Claudio Eliana Gaspar Denisse Denisse Matías Diana Patricio Manuel Emilio Mauricio Araucanía Region Metropolitan Region Roberto

Figure 3.1: Snowball map

Source: own elaboration

When I arrived to Temuco I contacted a person who had worked with Mapuche people for many years (I got his mobile number through a friend who is his nephew). We had a meeting and he gave me his view about Mapuche people in Araucanía and the political movement that was developing. He was my first key informant and gave me several contacts that he thought fulfilled the profile that I was looking for. In the end, thanks to him I interviewed four people and they gave me the contact details of more people to interview. Eight of my interviews in Temuco were in the respondent's work place, which meant they had a shorter time for the interview, and for that reason I had to return to

complete it, due to its length. Also, although I explained what the interview was about, some people did not fully realise that we might be talking about sensitive topics which they sometimes found upsetting. This was a more common among the respondents from Temuco, who had more experiences of racism and discrimination than the respondents living in Santiago. I will further discuss in the following section. The other interviews in Temuco were in cafés or else respondents' houses and the interviews in people's homes were very useful for giving me a deeper sense of their families and their social contexts.

As previously indicated, I also attended Mapuche social and cultural events partly to observe, but also to make contacts for my sample. I first went to a Mapuche professional event, which was promoting the idea of successful Mapuche. After the event, I spoke to people to generate contacts, and subsequently interviewed five people who also gave me the contact details of more people to interview in Temuco and in Santiago. From this point, I started to participate in many events related to Mapuche people and I began to create connections with people who belong to Mapuche organizations. For example, I attended another event at Universidad de la Frontera, where Mapuche people gave presentations about the Mapuche history and social movement. Here among the presenters I met my second key informant who put me in touch with three interviewees and also with a third key informant, who invited me to a Mapuche history conference in Chillan (a city in central Chile). His help enabled me to interview three more people. During the Mapuche history conference I had the opportunity to interview one respondent. Also, I spent four days with a Mapuche historians' group, and I am still in contact with them. Most of the interviews in Santiago were in respondents' houses or cafés around the city. Here, interviews lasted between three and five hours. Most participants seemed to enjoy the interview, and because it was sometimes like 'psychological therapy' for them and an opportunity to tell their story, they mostly did not care about the duration of interview. When participants did not have enough time, we divided the interview into two or three parts. I made contact with members of another Mapuche group, the Rumtun organization (a Mapuche cultural studies centre with a focus on Mapuche rights) located in Santiago. There I interviewed some members of the group and also acquired contact with the fourth key informant. I met the fifth key informant in a workshop about Mapuche women, and then I stopped looking for key informants, because the information started to become repetitive and I felt I had reached saturation.

## 3.4.3 The experience of conducting the interviews

During the interviews, I used a series of strategies to obtain the best quality of information as possible. As I mentioned before I spoke about my own experience of social mobility in order to create a space of trust between the participants and me. At the beginning, in the initial interviews, I did not tell respondents immediately about my Mapuche heritage, because at the end of the interview I wanted to ask them their opinion of my ethnicity, that is if they thought that I was Mapuche or not, and why. I did this in order to explore their parameters of identification and how they classified a person as Mapuche. However, I realized that afterwards when the interview had finished, the respondents started to ask me questions about my Mapuche story and changed their attitude to me with a stronger sense of identification apparent. Therefore, I realized that telling my sample about my Mapuche heritage was important, because they felt a big difference according to whether a researcher is Chilean or a Mapuche person. However, I felt my question about identification was important as well. So, I decided to disclose my Mapuche heritage at the beginning of the interview to people who seemed more radical about Mapuche culture, that is, to people who were more dubious about doing the interview because I was studying in Manchester or because I only had one Mapuche surname. I still asked them at the end the interview their impression about my heritage, despite the fact that they were aware of the information. However, for those people in the sample who did not ask about my Mapuche link, I did not disclose my heritage and only discussed it at the end of the interview, with the question about identification. There were different reactions to my Mapuche heritage, some people saw me as Mapuche and accepted that I consider myself to be Mapuche, whilst others did not identify me as Mapuche person because I do not have two Mapuche

surnames. Another group had a very open concept about who is Mapuche and for them the fact of studying Mapuche people and culture was enough to make me a Mapuche person for them.

The duration of interviews was around three to five hours. I noticed that people from Santiago were more likely to embrace all the interview process, compared to respondents from Temuco whose responses were more truncated. This was because the participants from Temuco often did not sufficient time due to their jobs. Their ages of respondents are also a factor, because the respondents from Santiago were younger and had more availability, because they did not have the same pressure from their jobs and families. I tried to avoid taking notes during the interview, but the interviews were audio recorded. I also took pictures of each of the participants and their houses, in order to situate them in their social contexts and to act as an aide memoire for me during my analysis of the interviews. These photographs are not shown in order to protect the sample's anonymity.

Another factor to consider is that during the period that I was interviewing (July 2015-February 2016) several important political events occurred related to the Mapuche people. They are likely to have made the respondents more sharply aware about questions of Mapuche rights and politics. The events included the occupation of Mapuche communities<sup>6</sup>, a truckers' demonstration<sup>7</sup> and the dismissal of the Governor of the Araucanía region<sup>8</sup>. The National Corporation of Indigenous Development (CONADI) which is a government body, was first occupied by four Mapuche communities and by time the occupation finished, more than 40 other indigenous communities had joined it. The objective of these Mapuche communities was to demand from the Government and the Chilean people their indigenous rights and the recovery of their

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> For more information see: <a href="http://www.emol.com/noticias/Nacional/2015/09/07/748554/Carabineros-desaloja-sede-de-la-Conadi-de-Temuco-tras-tres-semana-en-toma.html">http://www.emol.com/noticias/Nacional/2015/09/07/748554/Carabineros-desaloja-sede-de-la-Conadi-de-Temuco-tras-tres-semana-en-toma.html</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> For more information see: <u>https://www.ctvnews.ca/world/clashes-break-out-in-chile-as-truckers-protest-arson-attacks-1.2537039</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> For more information see: <a href="https://www.escribanocl.wordpress.com/tag/despido-de-f-huenchumilla/;">https://ciperchile.cl/2015/12/29/huenchumilla-la-historia-del-hombre-de-oro/</a>

lands occupied by the Chilean State. The occupation lasted for 35 days but it had little reaction or visibility amongst the rest of Temuco. The situation only became visible for non-Mapuche when the Governor (the only Mapuche in the Chilean Government) was fired for sending a proposal to the government recommending the recognition of the Mapuche people as a separate nation. Specifically, he proposed that Chile should be a pluri-national country, but the Chilean Government only responded by firing him. The conflict ended without the Mapuche demands being met.

At the same time that the Mapuche communities were occupying CONADI, a group of truckers started a caravan from Temuco to Santiago city. Their goal was to show the Government that they are victims of Mapuche terrorism. They went to Santiago with their burnt trucks to make public the consequences of terrorism. This was a national event and all the media covered it. When they arrived in Santiago there were demonstrations in favour of the truckers (people from the conservative side) and against (people from liberal side). A Government minister met with the truckers, in stark contrast with the Mapuche campaigns where Government members refused to meet Mapuche representatives. The truckers have been a target for protest because they represent forestry companies which have occupied traditional Mapuche territory. In this charged political context, I asked the participants what they thought about these conflicts. This strategy was useful, because most respondents adopted a position about the conflict and, at the same time, they related this position to their own stories and identities. Some did not take a position on the events, but simply discussed what was happening. Others argued that all Mapuche people are affected in some way by these events. For some, this has had a direct impact on their lives, and they told me of being accused of burning wood or trucks. People use the term 'los quema bosques' (people that burn forests) for this.

Figure 3.2: Pictures of the demonstrations by Mapuche people in Temuco and Santiago and the occupation of Conadi in Temuco













Source: own elaboration

In order to get a better understanding of their lives, I tried to share more time with the participants outside the interview. For example, one participant from Temuco invited me to her house and taught me how to knit in the Mapuche way. Another invited me to a history congress, where I was able to meet other Mapuche people. In Santiago it was more difficult to share such time with respondents, because the distances were longer,

therefore I met interviewees the city centre. However, I became close to some people who belong to the Rumtun organization who invited me to activities such as seminars, parties and a demonstration.

My empirical research is based on the interview narratives of the sample rather than my observation of events and activities. However, my participation in different events allowed me to set the interviews in the wider context of Mapuche culture, organisations and families. However, after each meeting, event, seminar and trip, I documented my field notes, which were more reflective about my research process – and through these observational notes, I was able to critically reflect on my own performance as a researcher.

The interviews were conducted in Spanish and after each interview I took notes about my impressions of the participants, the important items they mentioned, how they behaved, the limitations of the conversations, how I asked the questions, which questions were more important for them and if the interview was easy going or not. As you might expect, some participants were more relaxed than others and there were a few for whom it was more difficult to obtain information about their lives. Some respondents were tentative in their responses and I had to earn their trust. This was why I also shared information about where I, or other interviewees (anonymously of course) had had similar experiences in order to develop rapport and lighten the mood. The intention in interviews was to make it feel more like a conversation. Nonetheless, the interviews were intense emotionally and required a lot of focus. I learnt the hard way that it was not possible for me to do more than one a day. I explained to participants that they could stop the interview if they feel uncomfortable or want to clarify a question. Some information was withheld from transcripts if they said they did not want it to be shared.

## 3.4.4 Introducing the participants

As I mentioned before, in total I conducted 40 interviews, 20 in the Metropolitan region and 20 in the Araucanía region, of which 23 were with men and 17 with woman. Before the fieldwork I did not consider migration as an important factor, however most of the respondents (21 people) had experienced internal migration of some sort - either migrating from rural areas to towns/Temuco/Santiago, or from towns to Temuco/Santiago, or from Temuco to Santiago. Of those undertaking internal migration, 15 were men and 6 women. As noted by Valdes (2008), in in Latin America indigenous people are more likely to migrate than non-indigenous people and men tend to migrate more than women.

In regard to marital status, seven people were married (all men), and 33 people were single (though some had children). The women in the sample were more likely to be single though this is connected to their younger age profile. Perhaps reflecting my sampling strategy, more than a half of the sample were working in professions or areas related with Mapuche culture, for example, working in an intercultural secondary school, working in a corporation for indigenous people or designing Mapuche modern dresses, researching about Mapuche culture, working on the new Chilean constitution, and one person filming a movie about the Mapuche territorial conflict. Tables 3.3 and 3.4 outline some key characteristics of the sample, broken down into those recruited from Temuco and those recruited from Santiago. I also give some additional brief biographical details about the sample in Appendix One.

**Table 3.3: Araucanía respondents** 

N	Participa nts	Gender	Profession	Age	Migration	Marital Status	Belongs to an organizati on
1	Carlos	Male	Secondary school teacher	45	Countryside-Temuco	Married with children	No
2	Matias	Male	Political scientist	21	Small town-Temuco	Single	Yes
3	Eduardo	Male	Secondary school teacher (mathematics)	30	Countryside-Temuco	Single	No
4	Jose	Male	Journalist	40	Countryside-Temuco	Divorced, with children	Yes
5	Enrique	Male	Dentist	27	Small town-Temuco	Single	No
6	Antonio	Male	Architect	38	Small town-Temuco	Single	No
7	Vicente	Male	Accountant	53	Countryside-Temuco	Married with children	No
8	Joaquin	Male	Lawyer	50	No	Married with children	Yes
9	Roberto	Male	Designer	38	Countryside-Temuco	Divorced, with children	Yes
10	Patricio	Male	Agro Engineer	39	Countryside-Temuco	Married with children	Yes
11	Arturo	Male	Lawyer	26	Small town-Temuco	Single	Yes
12	Teodoro	Male	History teacher	25	Countryside-Temuco	Single	Yes
13	Leticia	Female	Nursery Teacher	29	No	Single	No
14	Sofia	Female	Primary school teacher	34	No	Single	No
15	Daniela	Female	Teacher of special education	21	Countryside-Temuco	Single	Yes
16	Marcela	Female	Secondary school teacher (chemistry)	30	No	Single with children	No
17	Angelica	Female	Clothes designer	25	No	Single	No
18	Fernanda	Female	Journalist	43	No	Single	Yes
19	Maria	Female	Social worker	44	Small town-Temuco	Single	No
20	Eliana	Female	Secondary school teacher (history)	25	Small town-Temuco	Single	Yes

Source: own elaboration

**Table 3.4: Metropolitan respondents** 

N	Participants	Gender	Profession	Age	Migration	Marital status	Belong to an organization
1	Diego	Male	Engineer	26	City-Capital	Single	No
2	Diana	Female	Nurse	26	City-Capital	Single	No
3	Claudio	Male	History teacher/Political scientist	57	City- Capital	Married	Yes
4	Paulina	Female	Engineer	26	Countryside-Capital	Single	No
5	Victor	Male	Accountant	28	Countryside-Capital	Single	No
6	Luisa	Female	Accountant	27	Countryside-Capital	Single	No
7	Manuel	Male	Male Nurse	24	City-Capital	Single	No
8	Violeta	Female	Midwife/Psychologis t	43	No	Single	Yes
9	Catalina	Female	Biologist	29	No	Single	No
10	Laura	Female	Journalist	33	No	Single With children	No
11	Hugo	Male	History teacher	32	No	Single	No
12	Emilio	Male	Actor	30	No	Single	Yes
13	Ana	Female	Anthropologist	33	No	Single	Yes
14	Eugenio	Male	Secondary school teacher	49	No	Married	Yes
15	Mauricio	Male	Musician/announcer	24	No	Single	Yes
16	Armando	Male	Lawyer	34	No	Single	Yes
17	Loreto	Female	Linguist	23	No	Single	No
18	Gaspar	Male	Engineer	30	No	Single	No
19	Clara	Female	Journalist	25	No	Single	Yes
20	Javier	Male	Historian	31	No	Single	Yes

Source: own elaboration

As we shall see in later empirical chapters, migration is an important factor in my research analysis, and over half of the respondents (21 people – 15 men and 6 women) had some experience of internal migration. Tables 3.3 and 3.4 indicate what kinds of migration they had undertaken (it should be noted however that in Chapter Four a rather different categorisation of migration experience will be employed, also taking into account the prior migration of the participants' families).

Migration in Chile has been associated with urbanisation processes as people move from rural regions looking for better opportunities (Castro, 2001:5). According to Castro (2001), the main factor behind people migrating is the desire to help to their families in economic terms, and men are more likely to migrate more than women. However, all my participants attended university, and their motivations to migrate can be considered as different from Mapuche people who migrated looking for less skilled work. Their parents sent them to boarding schools or universities or they had to move to the city in order to benefit from greater work and educational opportunities. As Temuco is a more rural and less developed area, there are more career opportunities in Santiago, so my respondents also moved for this reason. My sample therefore consists of a distinct sub-set of Mapuche migrants, whose motivation to migrate was much more centred on gaining better educational and professional opportunities. Regarding membership of a Mapuche organization, 19 people in the sample belonged to an organization. Six of the interviewees belonged to the Enama Mapuche Corporation (a non-profit legal group that promotes Mapuche interests and rights), one belonged to the Aitue Corporation (which promotes the social and cultural development of the Araucanía region), one to the Chile Intercultural Foundation (a group that promotes intercultural understanding and challenges cultural stereotypes), three to Mapuche historical associations, two to the Mapuche political party Wallmapuwen and six people to the Rumtun Mapuche organization organization (a Mapuche cultural studies centre with a focus on Mapuche rights).

When I arrived in Temuco, one of the participants worked at Enama<sup>9</sup> and he put me in contact with other participants who belonged to this organization. Enama's main goal is to "influence public debate and contribute to the construction of the Plurinational Chile of the XXI Century" (Enama, 2015). Enama is composed of Mapuche professionals, from various professional disciplines, mostly from rural communities. The organization encourages the cultural and social commitment of its members, giving back to their communities and people (Enama, 2015).

Chile Intercultural<sup>10</sup> is a non-profit foundation, independent of political or business interests. The Foundation 'seeks to participate in the construction of an intercultural country through the training of indigenous leaders and organizations, creating instances of dialogue and recognition, and publication of comprehensive proposals consistent with the multicultural reality of our country. Thus, allowing the creation of strong and empowered towns and regions' (Fundacion Chile Intercultural, 2015). The Aitue Foundation<sup>11</sup> is different from the other two foundations, because it is more focused on the Araucanía region than the Mapuche people. It is concerned with the social and cultural development of the region, but this includes promoting Mapuche culture and values. The main objective of the foundation is to 'contribute to analysing matters relating to the indigenous peoples of Chile, contributing to society with opportunities for dialogue, generating studies and following up on public policies that contribute to the recovery and development of culture, the improvement of indigenous institutions capable of promoting the rights and duties of people, sustainable development and promoting the encounter and dialogue between different cultures that inhabit our country' (Fundacion Aitue, 2015).

In Santiago I interviewed six people who belonged to the Rumtun organization<sup>12</sup>, 'a research centre formed by Mapuche academics and professionals interested in creating

α.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Webpage: http://enama.cl/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Webpage: http://chileintercultural.org/index.php/voces-mapuche/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Webpage: <a href="http://www.fundacionaitue.cl/home/">http://www.fundacionaitue.cl/home/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Webpage: <a href="http://www.uchileindigena.cl/nace-centro-de-estudios-mapuche-rumtun/">http://www.uchileindigena.cl/nace-centro-de-estudios-mapuche-rumtun/</a>

spaces of reflection on themes of political rights, bearing in mind the autonomy and selfdetermination of indigenous people' (Rumtun, 2015). Compared with the other three organization, Rumtun is the most liberal and left leaning. Two of the participants belonged to the Mapuche National Movement, Wallmapuwen<sup>13</sup>. Their main goal is the creation of a Mapuche political party: in the words of their web page 'our main objective is to achieve, as part of a multinational, multilingual and decentralized state in Chile, an autonomy statute for the Region of La Araucanía, plus some bordering districts in the regions of Bio-Bio and Los Rios, which should take the name of Wallmapu (the traditional Mapuche settlement during the nineteenth and twentieth century)' (Wallmapuwen, 2015). Three of the participants belonged to the Mapuche History Society<sup>14</sup>, whose goal is the diffusion of Mapuche thinking and information related to Mapuche society and other indigenous peoples. This group focuses on the welfare of the Mapuche people in general, and most of its members are professionals. All these groups identify issues related to the Mapuche population and the Chilean State, and all want to advance Mapuche culture or rights in Chile. They differ according to how politicised their methods are, and as I show in later chapters, the varying membership of the sample in these different groups was connected to their sense of their ethnic identity.

#### 3.4.5 Research positionality

As I said before, I introduced myself to interviewees as a person who has experienced educational mobility in that I come from a working-class family from Temuco city. With some of the sample (those more radical about Mapuche identification) I introduced myself as Mapuche from the start of the interview, with others only later on. However, whenever I disclosed my indigenous heritage, I realised that this changed the sample's attitudes towards me. Some of them were friendlier and they gave me more information about their life and the Mapuche situation in general. Some of them started using Mapuche words, for example, referring to me as 'lamngen' (which can mean sister in

13 Webpage: http://wallmapuwen.cl/

<sup>14</sup> Webpage: https://www.comunidadhistoriamapuche.cl/

Mapuzungun, but also means one of us). Therefore, I used that moment of disclosure to obtain more information about the participants and tried to share more time with them. The sample were curious about my trajectory and my Mapuche knowledge and sometimes they gave me advice about how to deal with living 'between' the Mapuche and Chilean worlds. On the other hand, others did not have the same reaction. For some, I was not really Mapuche for a range of reasons. They started asking me questions like: do you speak the language? Which community are you from? Which Mapuche last name do you have? From my answers they decided that I was not Mapuche enough. Clearly, how the interviewees viewed my positionality affected the conduct of the interviews, although in variable ways which allowed me to explore further the notion of 'authentic' Mapuche identity. However, their responses also affected me emotionally, and made me reflect on my own situation.

I often interviewed people who shared a similar story to me which sometimes made me feel close to them and in some parts of the interview, I felt I understood what they wanted to say. This could be positive because it created a more equal relationship and greater rapport, as I was not just the woman from a foreign university, but also someone with shared experiences of social mobility and belonging to a minority group. On the other hand, I realised that gender was important in the interviews too, and here there were more differences. As a female researcher, I felt that my female respondents acted more equally when they spoke with me, and they assumed that I knew the culture, because I was researching about it. But in the interviews with men, while most of them were very friendly and open with me the older men tended to tell me their story in a patronizing way, and I felt that they wanted to teach me about Mapuche society. The men who were living in Temuco acted in a more patriarchal manner than men from Santiago, perhaps because the men from Temuco were older and I generally found that younger people were less patronizing with me. By contrast, the female respondents did not try to teach me about Mapuche culture or life.

Some of the male participants tried to flirt with me, mistaking the fact that I was kind and interested in their lives as interest in a personal way. An interview represents a moment of intimacy and is emotionally intense, however, some male participants confused the invisible boundaries of the interview which, I argue is a patriarchal behaviour. In that sense, Harries (2016) suggest that women are represented and objectified inside and outside the academy. One such experience was after an interview late at night. The participant asked me 'where are you going now?', I answered 'to my home', pointing out the direction I was heading. Then he said 'I am going in this direction as well' and I said 'do not worry, I will take the bus, it is not problem' but he insisted on going in the same direction. Then, he asked me if I had a boyfriend, I said yes, meanwhile I was waiting for the bus. In that moment, he started to ask me personal questions, about my boyfriend and my relationship with him. As we were waiting more than 20 minutes for the bus, he asked where I lived, when I told him which neighbourhood, and he said, 'I have a friend there, I am going with you'. I felt uncomfortable in that moment, because I did not understand what his motivations were. As the bus never arrived, I decided to take a 'colectivo' (a shared taxi but with more people), meanwhile I called my family, saying I was going home and he took the same 'colectivo'. He insisted on coming to my house and only left when I insisted on it. I recorded this uncomfortable situation in my notes, but it was not the only experience, another participant asked me to go out with him several times, even though he was in a relationship, but I never responded. Harries (2016) suggests there is a sexualisation in research practices. In that sense, I experienced various complex moments, where I had to negotiate and challenge my subordinated role as a female researcher which some male respondents attributed to me.

## 3.5 Data analysis

The data analysis started during the fieldwork. After each interview I transcribed and sometimes I had to translate some part of the interview to my supervisors, because it was in Spanish and they need to see what the interview was about. I protected the information of participants with pseudonyms. In the transcription, I included pauses and

silences, describing what was happened in that moment, in order to have a precise representation of the interviews. As previously noted, my fieldwork notes also recorded other non-verbal dimensions of the research. I transcribed all the interviews and entered them into NVivo to obtain a global sense of my data. Using NVivo I developed initial coding categories relating to experiences during childhood, secondary school, the university period and work. I coded the sample's perception of their social contexts and important moments in their lives (such as starting a family, promotion, or attending university) and used an iterative technique. However, when I had to code complex dimensions such as how ethnic identity related to class identity, I did this by hand, because it was easier for me to manage the data. Drawing on both analyses, I also wrote short reports on each respondent detailing key aspects of their biography, but also indicating selected quotes which indicated their interpretation of their mobility and migration experiences and their negotiation of their class and ethnic identities. These reports were the basis of the classification I discuss in Chapter Four, in which I distinguish three groups of respondents (the 'mobile accommodators', the 'rooted', and the 'resignifiers') in terms their quite different identity negotiations in response to the experience of mobility.

## 3.6 Conclusion

This chapter has outlined the research strategy and methods employed in this study and the methodological decisions that I took during this process. I have argued that the life history approach is the most useful methodological tool for exploring the respondents' experiences of social mobility and their identity negotiations. I have detailed my sampling strategy and noted that the use of snowball sampling through Mapuche organizations has some drawbacks, in that my sample are more likely to be organization members and more politically active than the wider Mapuche population. But as later chapters will show, the sample still exhibits a range of cultural and political engagement, as well as different mobility trajectories and identity constructions, so can be regarded as reasonably diverse. I have also discussed the power relations between researcher and

participant, and how this affects the conduct of interviews, with a special focus on my role as a female researcher. I have argued that my own positionality - in terms of my identity as an indigenous woman, but also as a student of the University of Manchester - clearly affected my research relationships with my participants but not necessarily in a consistent manner, creating dilemmas and distances with some but also empathy and rapport with others. I have outlined the conduct of my fieldwork and how my research strategy was developed in order to be able to best explore how my socially mobile participants experienced their transitions, how they positioned themselves in their new social contexts, and how they narrated their negotiation of their identities through this process. I now turn to look at the answers to these questions in the empirical findings of my research.

# **Chapter 4: The road to university**

## 4.1 Introduction

Chapter Four is a scene-setting chapter, which describes the mobility experiences of the sample, looking at their 'road to university'. The chapter examines the social backgrounds of the sample, considering their class and ethnic background, but also their location in urban or rural contexts in Chile. The chapter explores how these aspects of their social background, as well as other aspects of their family situation, affected their educational routes to winning a university place. Drawing on retrospective accounts of their early family and schooling experiences, the chapter focuses on how the respondents narrated their upward social mobility into university as a process of achievement, but one fraught with numerous obstacles and challenges.

Few Mapuche people enter university, and to do so the respondents had to gain access to indigenous scholarships and go into debt, to pay university fees. I show that whilst the respondents benefitted from their access to university this did not necessarily translate into an overcoming of inequalities, as all the sample experienced substantial disadvantages and discrimination during their trajectories to university. For some, there were also much earlier challenges in their schooling career involving travelling long distances or moving from their family home to study. Even though all the respondents managed to attend university, their accounts of their social mobility show that they experienced this as challenging and difficult. However, we can also see differences within the sample. All the respondents achieved social mobility; nevertheless, some respondents faced more difficulties and greater transitions than others. To analyse these differences in social mobility experiences, I explore the background social contexts of the respondents - from their childhood until adulthood – to consider how their social context influenced their route to university.

The chapter is divided into two main sections. Firstly, in the section 'The Context of Social Mobility', I establish how the respondents had different experiences of social mobility and I consider key differences in their experience of disadvantage in their early schooling, their parents' background and their migration experiences. However, despite experiencing considerable difficulties on their road to university, they all overcame these obstacles. In the second part of the chapter, 'Overcoming Obstacles on the Road to Success', I identify different dimensions that influenced their path to success such as: the role of parents, the role of teachers, problems with the Chilean education system, access to resources and opportunities and interpersonal experiences of discrimination.

All the respondents (40) come from a broadly similar socioeconomic background, and 21 of them had experienced some level of personal internal migration from rural-urban contexts within Chile<sup>15</sup>. In exploring the respondents' experiences of social mobility, I draw on the theoretical approach of Pierre Bourdieu (1984, 1979), exploring how the respondents had to deal with barriers relating to their lack of economic, cultural and social capitals during their social mobility trajectories. But this chapter also examines the question of how the ethnic identity and position of the Mapuche people within Chilean society shaped the sample's trajectories. I argue that my sample's sense of their social location is not only bound up with their class position, but also by an ethnic position framed by racial disadvantage and discrimination, as well as by questions of geographical location, and cultural and familial values.

The main argument of chapter is that the respondents experienced different dimensions to their social location in the sense that they narrated their social position as being *both* a class and ethnic social location, and one compounded by rural/urban inequalities and by different experiences of migration. As later chapters will show, because the sample understood their social position in multidimensional terms, they also saw their social

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Internal migration may be defined as migration within national borders. In the case of this thesis, internal migration refers to the migration that interviewees undertook to attend university or to obtain a job. This migration could either be from the countryside to Temuco or Santiago, or else from towns to Temuco or Santiago.

mobility in multidimensional terms. I therefore argue that their multidimensional experience resulted in more complex social challenges and processes of identity negotiation than in a standard process of class mobility.

# 4.2 The contexts of social mobility

In this section I explore three main aspects of the contexts of the social mobility of my sample. The first aspect is related to the parental background of the respondents, where I summarise the educational and occupational level of the respondents' parents. The second aspect is the early schooling period of respondents, where I summarise the educational contexts of the respondents and I introduce differences in relation to attendance at rural versus urban schools. All of these contexts where shaped by class disadvantage, and by the respondents' lack of economic and cultural capital. However, these contexts to the respondents' social transitions were also shaped by ethnic disadvantage, as well as by the disadvantage of rural areas which is bound up with the colonial dispossession of the Mapuche people. Finally, I consider the respondents' migration experiences, which are intertwined with their class and ethnic disadvantage, and where I examine two different kinds of migration experiences, short and long-range migration.

## 4.2.1 Parental background

The best way to start describing the respondents' social mobility stories is through summarising their parents' occupational and educational levels as well as their own migration experiences. Through the background of their parents it is also possible to identify the different motivations and different types of support available to the respondents, and in later sections I shall explore in more detail the support the respondents received from their parents to achieve a better level of education and to attend university.

Tables 4.1 and 4.2 provide a summary of the respondents' social background, by detailing their parents' occupational and educational level, as well as their own or family migration experiences (indicating whether the respondents are a first, second or third generation migrant to a town/city). The rural-urban divide in Chile and the migration that many Mapuche have undertaken in relation to rural inequalities is an important part of the mobility stories of many of my sample. In Chapter Three I discussed how some degree of geographical movement is a very common experience for the sample. However, in this chapter I focus on a more specific kind of migration experience, from the countryside to cities – which only some of the sample had undertaken. All my respondents were living in cities<sup>16</sup> (Temuco or Santiago) at the time of the study, but whilst some were first-generation migrants to cities, others were present there due to the prior migration of their parents or grandparents (ie they were second or third generation migrants to cities). The tables also divide the respondents from the Metropolitan and the rural Araucanía regions.

Overwhelmingly, both tables show that the respondents come from primarily working-class backgrounds with parents who were educated to secondary school level at most. There is no significant difference between fathers' and mothers' occupational and educational levels. Most respondents had parents who had both completed secondary school (12 from the Araucanía region and 8 from the Metropolitan region). For 16 of the respondents (10 from Araucanía, 6 from the Metropolitan Region) one or both of their parents had only attended primary school, and one respondent had a parent who was illiterate. Therefore, most of the sample had parents with limited ability to support their children in educational terms. However, as we shall see, they did support their children in emotional and practical terms.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> 5 were living in towns close to Temuco

Table 4. 1: Overview of the rural/urban migration and class experiences of respondents and their families from the Metropolitan region

Respondents	Occupation of Father	Occupation of Mother	Educational level of Father	Educational level of Mother	Generation who migrated from the countryside to cities
Violeta	Bartender	Food shop assistant	Incomplete Primary school	Incomplete secondary school	Second generation
Paulina	Working in a warehouse	Housewife	Secondary school	Secondary school	First generation
Mauricio	Jeweler	School assistant	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Manuel	Bouncer	Housekeeper	Primary school	Incomplete Primary school	Second generation
Luisa	Farmer	Housewife	Primary school	Incomplete Primary school	First generation
Loreta	Working in a warehouse	Nursing assistant	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Laura	Laborer	Housekeeper	Primary school	Primary school	Third generation
Javier	Teacher *17	Teacher *	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Gaspar	Road keeper	Housekeeper	Secondary school	Primary school	Second generation
Eugenio	Laborer	Housewife	Secondary school	Secondary school	Second generation
Emilio	Builder	Housekeeper	Incomplete secondary school	Incomplete secondary school	Second generation
Diego	Carpenter	Housewife	Complete primary school	Incomplete primary school	Second generation
Diana	Retired from army	Housewife	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Claudio	Bartender and tailor	Housewife	Secondary school	Primary school	Third generation
Clara	Call Centre worker	Civil registrary worker	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Cata	Baker	Baker	Incomplete Primary school	Secondary school	Second generation
Armando	Road keeper	Housekeeper	Secondary school	Primary school	Second generation
Ana	Working at municipality	Salesperson	Incomplete Secondary school	Secondary school	Second generation
Victor	Farmer	Housewife	Incomplete Primary school	Incomplete Primary school	First generation
Hugo	Teacher	Teacher	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation

Source: own elaboration

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> There are parents who are working as teachers without having attended university, because the Chilean educational system before the dictatorship period (1973-1989) was different, and people were trained as teachers during secondary school.

The parents from both the Metropolitan and Araucanía regions had similar, relatively low-level occupations. Most respondents had a parent with a working-class job (20+) and a few (5+) had parents with service class employment. Where both parents were in paid work, 8 respondents reported both parents in a working-class job, 5 respondents reported both parents in service class job, and 6 respondents reported one parent with a working-class job and one with a service class job. In recollecting their childhood years, the respondents frequently mentioned the fact that their parents had low skill jobs, and had to work long hours, so sometimes they did not see their parents because they came home late at night or had to travel distances to work.

Table 4.2: Overview of the rural/urban migration and class experiences of respondents and their families from the Araucanía region

Respondents	Occupation of Fathers	Occupation of Mothers	Educational level of Fathers	Educational level of Mothers	Generation who migrated from the countryside to cities
Vicente	Farmer	Weaver	Primary school	Incomplete Primary school	Third generation
Teodoro	Farmer who works with wood	Housewife	Secondary school	Secondary school	First generation
Sofia	Gas seller	Housewife	Incomplete secondary school	Incomplete secondary school	Second generation
Roberto	Farmer	Housekeeper	Incomplete Primary school	Primary school	First generation
Patricio	Deceased	Worked in many things	Primary school	Secondary school	First generation
Matias	maintenance of the forest machines	Cook in a school	Secondary school	Secondary school	Second generation
Maria	Farmer	Deceased	Secondary school	Secondary school	Second generation
Marcela	Farmer	Post office worker	Secondary school	Secondary school	Second generation
Leticia	Bus Driver	Housewife	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Jose	Deceased	Dressmaker	Secondary school	Secondary school	First generation
Joaquin	Entrepreneur	Housewife	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Fernanda	Deceased	Housewife	Incomplete secondary school	Incomplete Primary school	Second generation
Enrique	Teacher*	Teacher*	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Eliana	Unknown	Housewife	Not known	Secondary school	Second generation
Eduardo	School assistant	Housewife	Primary school	Primary school	First generation
Daniela	Bus driver	Housewife	Secondary school	Primary school	Second generation
Carlos	Farmer	Housewife	Incomplete Primary school	Illiterate	First generation
Arturo	Assistant medical technologist	Librarian	Secondary school	Secondary school	Third generation
Antonio	Working at school	Working at school	Secondary school	Secondary school	Second generation
Angelica	Deceased	Housewife	Secondary school	Secondary school	Second generation

Source: own elaboration

As regards migration into towns/cities, and which generation of migrant the respondents belonged to, we can first see how common migration was amongst the respondents or their parents/grandparents. Secondly, respondents from the Metropolitan region were

more likely to be second or third generation migrants (with only three respondents who were 1<sup>st</sup> generation migrants), compared to respondents from the Araucanía region (with six 1<sup>st</sup> generation migrants). When I divide by gender and region, it is possible to see that in the Metropolitan region there are more women in the first generation (25%) compared to only 9% of the men; whilst in the Araucanía region there are no women who are first generation migrants, compared to 50% of the men. This suggests that the migration of men is more socially accepted than the migration of women. This gender difference will be discussed later in the section of migration experience. I have established the parental background of the respondents to more fully understand how their social context has influenced their mobility experiences. I now turn to look at those mobility experiences in greater detail, starting with their early schooling – with a particular focus on the schooling of my rural sample.

# 4.2.2 Early schooling

To understand the challenges that the respondents experienced in relation to the educational system, it is necessary to clarify that the Chilean educational system tends to be unequal and unfair. We can identify educational inequalities along lines of class, ethnicity and also along the rural/urban dimension. There is considerable educational stratification in Chile with a wide range of educational institutions: public schools where people do not pay fees, semi-private schools where people pay half of the fees and the rest is paid by the government (monthly fees are between 124 to 250 pounds), and private schools where people pay all the fees. There are different kinds of private schools: the most expensive have a Catholic orientation, but there are also private schools with a secular orientation. The monthly fees of private school vary between 150 to 714 pounds, with the most expensive located in the Metropolitan region 18. Most feepaying schools are totally out of the financial reach of working-class people, whose monthly salary is around 337 pounds. Most of the highest ranked primary and secondary schools belong to the private system, except for some prestigious public schools, which

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> More information see: <a href="http://www.mime.mineduc.cl/mime-web/mvc/mime/ficha">http://www.mime.mineduc.cl/mime-web/mvc/mime/ficha</a>

are located in Santiago. Consequently, in Chile it is very difficult to get access to a good quality education without paying<sup>19</sup>. Most of the sample respondents had to attend public schools, because their parents did not have sufficient income to pay school fees. 10 respondents attended public rural schools, 25 respondents attended urban public schools and 5 attended semi-private schools. Consequently, considered as a group, the sample were at a disadvantage in their route to university compared to students from private schools, which are regarded as providing a higher quality of education.

There are also considerable inequalities in schooling in rural areas compared to urban areas, which create formidable challenges for rural students. Firstly, there are insufficient schools in rural areas. For that reason, people who live in rural areas have to attend the closest school which is often at significant distance, between two and seven kilometres from the community. Sometimes, families decide that students should attend the (largely free) public boarding schools in rural areas, because that is the best solution when Mapuche families do not have the money to pay the school fees, transport and the accommodation costs for their children. Other rural families prefer that their children attend what are seen as better schools located in small towns, with the purpose of improving their educational level. But again, rural students often must leave home or travel considerable distances for their schooling. These rural inequalities are compounded by ethnicity. According to the National Statistic Institution (2002), the Araucanía region has the highest percentage of Mapuche people in Chile (29.5%), above all in the rural area (29%). For that reason, in rural primary schools most of the students are Mapuche.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> There are school scholarships that students can obtain but most of the respondents attended public schools (or in some cases a semi-private school), therefore, these school scholarships were not as significant to them as the scholarship support required to attend university. The most important of these school scholarships are the President of the Republic Scholarship (in which students with high marks and from working class families can apply to obtain 31 pounds per month) and the indigenous scholarship (in which indigenous students can apply - to obtain 122 pounds twice per year for primary school students, and 253 pounds twice per year for secondary school students). A few of the respondents had applied for an Indigenous scholarship but were unsuccessful, whilst only a few had managed to obtain the President of the Republic scholarship during their schooling period.

Take the example of Paulina, who gives an account of her experience of going to school every day:

I live in the countryside, in the XX community...the school was not near, we walked like one hour every day...I went with my sisters and my cousins...I suffered, for the walking, for the cold, for the sun (Paulina, IT engineer, 26, from the countryside).

Paulina's account is typical of the respondents who attended rural schools, with her experience marked by the distance she had to travel to school but also by the fact that those attending the school were all mostly Mapuche people. But for many of the respondents, their schooling career involved not only a geographical distance to travel, but also a social distance. Eduardo, for example, gives an account of having to move from a rural school to a school in town, which he presents as a process of increasing separation from other Mapuche students. He also presents his schooling trajectory as unusual for people from his Mapuche community:

I studied the primary in a school near to my community, and then I went to the town to follow my secondary school. The rural school was around 10 minutes to my house and all were Mapuche students, we were 6 or 8, 8 I think, then when we went to study to secondary school, we went two only, because the others got married (Eduardo, Secondary school teacher, 30, from the countryside).

In Eduardo's rural school, all the students were Mapuche and they had a common classroom shared with students of different educational levels. However, in secondary school he was in the minority, as it was not a common thing for Mapuche rural people to attend secondary school and university in that period, as the majority got married at an early age.

Six of the rural respondents had to attend boarding schools for their primary or secondary schooling. The reason for the respondents attending boarding schools was usually due to the financial constraint of their families (because their parents did not have enough income to maintain all their children at home). It was a good alternative to send some of their children to boarding school, because for no (or a minimum) fee, such

schools provided food and a place to sleep, and students had more time to study without the need to take up paid work. The respondents had different responses to this experience. For some, it was an opportunity to feel independence but for others it was a bad experience, due to the poor conditions and bad educational quality of the schools. Vicente explains his situation when he was a child in positive terms:

I went to a boarding school, because we were a big family, because we were a lot, nine brothers and sisters. In that time, during the dictatorship period it was difficult here in Chile. We worked from when we were children. I was in a boarding school in Cajón (town near to Temuco). That was to help the family economy, because we were many days outside the house, three of us were in the boarding school...but when I was in the boarding school it was like I was free, I was four years there, so it helped me to be independent (Vicente, accountant, 53 years old, from small town).

Despite the fact that attendance at boarding school helped the respondents' families in financial terms the conditions of boarding school were not always the best. Sometimes respondents did not want to attend because they suffered from the cold and hunger there and felt cut off from their families. Eduardo, by contrast to Vincente, focuses on the bad conditions of his boarding school:

I studied in a primary school in my community...then I finished the primary school and I went to the town to continue the secondary school and then I went to Temuco...The first year I was in a boarding school, but I did not like it, because it was very cold, I was hungry, and I wanted to be with my family. So, I was only one year and in the second year I was living in my house...from my home to my school are 3 kilometres, so I was living in my house and going to school for 3 years (Eduardo, Secondary school teacher, 30 years, from the countryside).

Most of the respondents (30) attended urban schools, which were either located in the cities of Santiago, Temuco, or in small towns. The accounts of the respondents who attended schools in more urban areas are different to those from rural areas, because they were not focused on the bad material conditions of their schools. Instead, respondents from urban areas focused on whether their schools were of good or bad

educational quality. Perhaps unsurprising as they are educational success stories, most of these respondents related their experience in an urban school with having a good quality of education and obtaining good marks. Fernanda, for example, was typical of the respondents in urban areas who attended a school near to their home:

I was in a public school, near to my home. I was a good student, I never had good study habits, but I was going well (Fernanda, Journalist, 43 years old, from Temuco).

Most of these urban respondents did not construct a narrative of attending an urban school as a sacrifice or challenge, because it was normal to them and the schools were near to their home. In contrast, respondents who attended rural schools constructed a very different narrative, in which they often emphasised the disadvantages of their situation, and the risks that they might be drawn into paid work and/or marriage, which would take them away from their schooling. For that reason, the accounts of the rural respondents were narrated in a more elaborated way than that of the urban students. It is important therefore to note here an important variation in the social mobility trajectories of the sample, because even though all the respondents were from working class families and had Mapuche heritage, their experiences of schooling were substantially different, with the rural members of the sample experiencing considerably more disadvantages and difficulties. The rural/urban dimension of inequality in Chile has a significant impact on the sample's social mobility routes, and as I explore in this chapter, is connected to their patterns of migration - from rural areas to towns, and from towns to cities – in search of better educational and work opportunities. As my discussion of their early schooling suggests, the sample's routes to university were shaped by their parental background as well as their parental migration experiences.

# 4.2.3 Migration experiences

The migration experiences of the respondents were chiefly migrations from the countryside to the cities of Temuco or Santiago, or else from smaller towns to Temuco or Santiago. Most of the respondents from the Metropolitan region were born in the region and had not migrated themselves. For that reason, this section on migration is largely focused on respondents from the Araucanía region, whose major motivation for migration was to acquire a better level of education, in terms of finding good schools or universities. Their parents sent them to boarding school/university or they moved to a city in order to improve their lives. Another motivation was the chance of obtaining better jobs opportunities, and in these cases the respondents tended to migrate from the Araucanía region to the Metropolitan region, because of insufficient job opportunities in Temuco. In their accounts of their geographical movement the respondents stressed the difficulties related to their economic and social background which meant that they had to move to improve their options, but they also talked of the difficulties of moving from home without their families.

According to Castro's study of the migratory process of the Mapuche people in Chile (2001) the main factor for past generations of migrants was the desire to help their families in economic terms. However, for my respondents their migration process was a response to requirements of university study and was seen as investment in the future, with the expectation of higher returns from university graduates.

In this chapter, I focus on migration from the countryside to cities. As can be seen in Tables 4.1 and 4.2, seven respondents had experienced migration from the countryside to the city, meaning that they were the first generation of urban migrant in their families. Whereas from a wider perspective, there were 16 men and 5 women in the sample who had experienced some form of migration, that means not only from the countryside, but also includes migration from town to cities, and from Temuco to Santiago. Men have more chance to travel in comparison to women, especially men from rural areas. As mentioned in Chapter Three, male migration is associated with cultural factors, because

commonly men's role is related to the public sphere and having to provide incomes to their families, whereas women are more associated with the private sphere, caring for the family. All my research sample attended university, however, so consequently we might expect that their motivation and opportunities would be somewhat different to other Mapuche migrants.

In thinking about the complex nature of migration experiences (and how this affects the difficulties respondents experienced) it is necessary to distinguish between short and long-range migration. Respondents from the Metropolitan region typically did not migrate at this stage of their lives, except for one who moved from Santiago to Concepcion (a city near to Temuco) to study at university. Respondents with short-range migration experiences often shared the situation that their migration started in their schooling period, as in the case of seven respondents from the countryside who moved to the close town to their communities to study. Others moved from town to cities, however, four of the sample moved from small towns to Temuco. Most of the sample experiencing short range migration were in the Araucanía region.

Short range migration was most typically the option for the respondents who lived in the countryside (or in small towns) and was undertaken to acquire better schooling or to attend university. Enrique, for example, explained his own experience of migration during his schooling:

The truth is where I studied my primary school was in a town in the coast in the Araucanía region...the study expectation was not more than secondary school and years ago, when I was in primary school, I mean 20 years ago, I did not have expectation to finish primary school. Finishing secondary school was an achievement and attending university was very difficult...So I studied there until 6<sup>th</sup> year of primary school, in 7<sup>th</sup> year I moved to Temuco looking for a better educational option, and then the secondary [school] I also did it here in Temuco (Enrique, Dentist, 27, from the countryside).

In Enrique's case, his parents decided to move to provide Enrique with more opportunities to continue his education, showing a high degree of investment in their

child's education, as well economic sacrifice to achieve it. Respondents experiencing short-range migration often produced narratives of this movement as a process of sacrifice, because they had to separate from their families, they suffered economic difficulties or had problems adjusting to city life. It also seems that this group tended to return to the place where they born, perhaps because going back to their place of family or community was easier than for people who had experienced long-range mobility.

Respondents who had experienced long-range geographical migration had typically done so to find jobs. Most of them were from the countryside and small towns and had moved to Santiago. However, their mobility was gradual with different stages to it, starting with a movement from the countryside to a town, to attend primary or secondary school, then from a town to Temuco, to attend higher education, and finally from Temuco to Santiago to acquire work. Another characteristic of this group is that most belonged to the young generation of respondents, aged between 24-28 years old, who were unmarried and did not have children at the moment of migration. The accounts of this group show a variety of different motivations for movement, ranging from personal discovery, looking for job opportunities, and moving away from bad economic situations.

Take the case of Manuel, who was born in a small town near to Temuco, whose motivation to move was to look for better opportunities:

I think trying to find a better lifestyle or grow up, because I am very much a nerd, is like growing up. Also, one of the reasons I moved to Santiago was that I wanted to pursue studying. I think that trying to be a better professional, trying to look for more knowledge. I think that was my motivation, to be where I am (Manuel, 26, Male nurse, from small town).

Manuel moved to acquire more cultural and educational capital to improve his social position. Paulina saw her motivation to move as related to a personal challenge of expanding her horizons:

When I moved to Santiago, my plan was getting out of Temuco, because I was living there too long and I needed a change of environment for a while, I was in a comfort zone and I needed to get out of my comfort zone and acquire experience working, if I have the option to come back to Temuco it will be in two years at least (Paulina, 26, IT Engineer, from the countryside).

An important section of the sample did not migrate (19), with most from the cities of Temuco or Santiago because of the migration of their parents or grandparents. This cluster had an advantage compared to the other respondents, because they did not have to move to study or suffer the consequences of living far from parents and relatives.

Despite the shared working-class and Mapuche background of all the respondents I have shown that their experiences of migration were substantially different. It is therefore necessary to consider a wider dimension to social mobility trajectories, as different experiences of short and long-range mobility created very different experiences and challenges to their social mobility. Of course, all of the sample are mobility 'success stories', and overcame the obstacles in their path, so it is worth considering how this was achieved (whilst accepting the limitations of individualised stories of mobility 'achievement'). In the next section I consider the factors that facilitated and constrained the sample's mobility, though my interest is less on explaining their 'success' than in understanding how they constructed their experiences of transition. In later chapters I will consider how these experiences shaped their negotiation of identity. In section two, I examine how for some respondents, the experience of social mobility was more difficult than for others, but also show that all of the sample constructed the process as one of fraught achievement and of overcoming serious obstacles, and I consider the range of dimensions that influenced their experiences of social mobility.

# 4.3 Overcoming obstacles on the road to success

What obstacles - and support - did the sample emphasise in their accounts of social mobility? In this section I focus on five key dimensions that could either operate as

constraints or could facilitate the achievements of the sample. The first dimension is related to the contribution of parents, in terms of whether respondents saw their parents as a help or hindrance during their educational trajectories. The second dimension is related to accounts of problems with the Chilean educational system and how respondents had to negotiate schools with bad conditions, and low educational quality. The third dimension is related to the role of teachers in the schooling and university period and how teachers gave cultural capital to respondents that they could not acquire at home. The fourth dimension is related to access to key resources and opportunities, in terms of how geographical access to good schools, scholarships and loans helped respondents to overcome their financial difficulties. Finally, the fifth dimension is related to the interpersonal discrimination – both class and ethnic - that respondents had to negotiate.

# 4.3.1 The contribution of parents

Here I consider in more detail how parental background influenced the respondents' educational trajectories and how some parents did not support their children's ambitions to attend university. According to the respondents' accounts, most of their parents suffered poverty, discrimination and migration in their lives and did not have the opportunity to attend university themselves. Therefore, for parents it was a complicated scenario to support their children's educational options, because they often did not have the skills to do so, and they also had the dilemma of choosing what was best for their children in their constrained socio-economic conditions. On the one hand, some parents took the decision to encourage their children to attend university, without knowing what that might involve. On the other hand, some parents did not see the university as a possibility until respondents had good marks and started to talk about going university, and then these parents started to support them, but without necessarily knowing how to do so. Finally, there were parents who refused to accept that their children could attend university, not seeing it as a realistic alternative for them. However, their children were able to go to university without parental support, because they started to work

before attending university and or else independently looked for scholarships and loans to pay the fees.

One significant group (15+) of the respondents spoke of their parents supporting their university ambitions, but without a specific plan, because the only way their parents had to support them was through emotional terms. Victor, neither of whose parents had completed primary school, saw more difficulties than his parents:

When the moment arrived, I realised that they had more faith than me, actually it seems that they always knew that I would attend university, however I was not too convinced....because I found that was something far away, expensive, hard to access, that maybe that had too many hurdles, the conditions that I grew up eh made more difficult to access, it was not normal, I mean in the class or society that I was living, no, normally it is not permitted (Victor, Accountant, 28, from the countryside).

Victor's quote is typical of most of the respondents, who reported receiving emotional and educational support from their family members in the first stages of their schooling; however, educational support progressively diminished over time, when the interviewees encountered more complicated educational challenges. This group of parents supported their children in emotional terms and promoted their continuing education; however, they could not contribute in practical terms and were more concerned to maintain their households, due to their constrained financial situation.

Social mobility is not only related acquiring better and more education it is also related to acquiring a disposition to change:

I thought to attend university as an option after having the results of the university test and I saw I had good result. Only there I saw the university as a real option, before not... but I considered it a difficult stage, because it was a challenge, because it was discovering or experimenting in a way that nobody in your family did before. It was difficult with my parents, because for example I compared myself with other classmates that their parents attended university, even in the moments of doubt about what was the process of attending university, my classmates could ask their parents. However, in my case, I could not ask them, they were looking at me and

wishing me good luck. So, I had to look for advice from others to know what was about and continue to progress inside of the unknown (Victor, Accountant, 28, from the countryside).

Parents had an important role in preparing their children for the possibility of university, even though they lacked cultural and educational capital. Eduardo, whose parents completed primary school, explained that he had emotional support from his mother:

Because my father nooo...probably it was like attending university and...he did not see the point...but the person who always was supporting me was my mother, like, not in economic terms, but emotionally. My mother always believed in what we were doing, and she saw what my father could not see (Eduardo, teacher, 30, from the countryside).

Eduardo's quote shows disagreement between his parents about his education, and is typical of a pattern among the respondents, where mothers played a more supportive role in the educational path of respondents than fathers. This situation can be explained by the traditional gender division of labour inside Chilean families, where mothers more commonly have the role of giving emotional support to their children. For most respondents, their mothers provided the emotional support for them to follow university education, whereas fathers' roles were more about giving economic support to their families whilst tending to take distance of their children in emotional terms. However, even though Eduardo did not initially have the support of his father to attend university he did go, because his father's social network changed and so did his attitude to the importance of education:

I did not see in my father too much interest to support me when I attended to my studies. But, then in fourth and fifth year, I saw in my father, for example, he was motivated, we had conversation about that, in the beginning or end of the academic year he gave me extra money to support me. There, my father perspective changed, when he started to work in that school. But my oldest sister, she did not receive the support that should have received" (Eduardo, Teacher, 30 years old, from the countryside).

Most of the respondents' parents aspired for their children to have better lives than they had. However, the respondents had clearer expectations than their parents about their future and so they often had to convince their parents that university was a good option. Laura, whose parents had only completed primary education, explained what she had to do to apply to a very prestigious school in Santiago:

I prepared myself, I was studying alone...when I saw what is about, and there were subjects that I never saw in my primary school. So, I had to go to the library to study things that I never saw. I think it was one of few times that I was studying a lot and my mother supported me bringing me tea 'the tea for the girl who is studying'. I could not study with her, because in the end I had to teach her, and I needed time. And my father was looking from afar; he really did not have a study method...So the school had more affinity with girls who had professional parents (Laura, Journalist, 33, from Santiago).

Despite her parents' aspirations, they did not have sufficient economic or cultural capital to help Laura. So, despite Laura's ambition to attend university, she found obstacles that made her trajectory more difficult than she expected:

Yes, I entered immediately. I had good results in the test and I had the 11<sup>th</sup> or 10<sup>th</sup> position in my career. I obtained a scholarship, obviously because I had to apply, because I fulfilled the profile of a good student, I had good marks and, I did not have the money to do it. My parents would have to go into debt for that, my mother was a housekeeper and my father, a labour, so where? I obtained the university scholarship and I entered immediately, the scholarship covered 1000 pounds of 1200 of fees, so I obtained the rest from other scholarships, so in the end I covered the fees with my scholarships and I did not pay anything (Laura, Journalist, 33 years old).

In the case of most respondents, their family socialization did not provide them with much cultural capital, however their parents (or at least their mothers) encouraged them that education was the way to improve their social position. So, personal skills, such as being a good student, became important in the respondents' lives, because their aspiration for a better social position could only be achieved by acquiring cultural capital in school – which they all did. However, despite being successes in school, there were

still gaps in their cultural capital. Most respondents had good marks in school, but when they began university most of the respondents realised that they lacked certain key knowledge or skills necessary for the university field.

Another group (5) of respondents reported their parents were not totally convinced that their children had a chance of attending university, because they did not have enough economic capital to pay their university fees. Also, they did not have this kind of aspiration for their children. Nevertheless, they started to support their children when they saw that they had good marks and could obtain a scholarship to attend university. However, they did not know exactly how to support their children. Their initial hesitation was because they did not see university as a realistic option for their children. Matias, whose parents completed secondary school, explained this hesitation of his parents about financial issues:

First, the incomes issues, which that would be very difficult that they could pay university. I was clear, so I told them that the credit and scholarship today are a possibility...but always it was with their support, a lot of support...however, obviously, I felt that they had that natural apprehension to the income issues, the issue of financing me...but they were worried, I mean, they knew that studying at university involved bigger expenses than involved in secondary school, but in all moments, they support me (Matias, Political scientist, 21, from small town).

Moreover, Matias' parents did not agree with the career that he choose, and he had to convince them to study the career he wanted:

And they were thinking...first was the conversation of explaining about the career, according to what I understood what political science is about. Second, I had to tell them that my success would depend on my capacities, if I continue working or not, or if I won money or not... but that political science was a career that I liked in that moment...I said to them if I study law, probably I would earn a lot of money...but I would apply to a career that I do not like and that was the main discussion, but they understood and in the end they supported me (Matias, Political scientist, 21, from small town).

This group (5) of parents did not know how to support their children, and they did not see university as good option for them, as in the case of Diego, whose parents did not complete primary school and who promoted a 'realistic' route for him:

Look, I do not know if they wanted or not, but I really know that for them was not an option. In fact, they choose a technical school, the same that a cousin attended. The idea was that I would have a technical qualification and start to work, because the university was something out of reach. My father is a carpenter, my mother is a housewife, I have a younger brother. Actually, they never thought about it like an option. They thought the best that they could give me in that moment, and that was a technical school where I could work (Diego, Engineer, 26, from Temuco).

Diego's family did not have a social network to show them that university could be a realistic option, and their social capital led Diego's parents to opt for a known pattern (registering Diego in the same school as his cousin). Nonetheless he did enter university:

Entry to university was not in my father's plan, it was something that I managed, because the school had some resources, like vocational tests...many universities went to the school to talk about careers...there I started to have the curiosity. There were vocational tests that showed me the path and it was totally clear. Then, there were scholarships to take the university test. Also, the school started to have extra courses to prepare to attend university, after our classes. There were teachers that reinforced to you the university subjects and the attendance on the courses was voluntary. Therefore, I started to attend these courses and applied to scholarships and started to know more about that. When I won the scholarship, I felt that I could attend university (Diego, Engineer, 26, from Temuco).

Diego found in his school the support that he did not find in his parents. Bourdieu (1979) proposes diverse routes to acquiring cultural capital, distinguishing the cultural capital that people inherit from that they can acquire. The second type is related to the incorporation of new capitals, and it was this type that the respondents acquired outside their families in fields such as school and university.

One interesting thing about the last quotes is how the respondents justify their parents not supporting them to attend university. In fact, as this subsection shows, the

respondents' accounts show their parents dealt in different ways with their children's desire to attend university and highlight that their parents lack of economic and cultural capital could be a constraint on their social mobility path. Most of the parents who hesitated or did not want their children to attend university had a low, primary school, educational level while parents who had expectations that their children attend university were more likely to have secondary education. Most parents were not able to supply much economic or cultural capital to the respondents, and though some families did give considerable support to their children during their schooling and university period this was often of a restricted kind, lacking knowledge of how best to proceed. Other families were less supportive of their children's ambitions, and here we can the influence of habitus guiding people to avoid the unfamiliar and adjust their ambitions to what is a 'realistic' 'sense of their place' (Bourdieu, 1984: 471).

# 4.3.2 Problems with the Chilean educational system

We have seen that the respondents overcame the constraints of their background, partly because they did well in school and their schools supported them, being the bridge that respondents needed to compensate them for their lack of familial cultural capital. However, the sample's schooling experiences varied substantially, and this subsection focuses on these different kinds of social mobility experiences during the school and university period, to identify diverse obstacles related to the Chilean educational system. These diverse educational challenges included: the experience of attending poor schools with low educational quality; difficulties of attending school due to poor availability (particularly in rural areas), family problems or distance; or problems associated with being a good student in a bad school. Of course, others reported more straightforward stories of being a good student in a good school, but most reported some challenges or obstacles.

One group of respondents (10) attended public rural schools, where conditions were poor. In these cases, the respondents were attending schools near to their Mapuche communities, with high numbers of Mapuche attendees, but also where most people in

the schools tended to be poor and with low levels of education in their family. Vicente, who started university when he had already a family and a job, explained his situation when he was a child:

Because I had very bad education, that school was for country people. They came from Puerto Saavedra; there were Mapuche and non-Mapuche people. The requirements were low. We had classes in the morning and in the afternoon, we had agricultural activities...It was like having free time. We had an hour of study and we went to the bed. For that reason, for me secondary school was difficult, I was not the best student (Vicente, Accountant, 53, from small town).

The intersection of a lack of financial resources and living in a rural context was related to a poor quality of education, where respondents had to attend either a school near to their houses or a boarding school which prepared children to work instead of attending university. Here social conditions played an important role when respondents started their education, suffering the consequences of inequalities in Chile, where belonging to working-class families is related to poor educational options:

When I was young I thought to attend university, but I did not. Later, I got married, then after being married I started university, when I was 33 years old. Before, I could not enter university, because my parents' situation did not allow it. Neither, was I totally convinced to do that. Later, I had the idea to go to university, because of my jobs, I realised that I needed the technical part. There I decided, because I said, 'I cannot work in this way', so I decided to attend university and pay for it by myself (Vicente, Accountant, 53, from small town).

Two respondents started the university as adults, because their economic circumstances did not allow it when they were young. Moreover, when they were working, they realised that higher education was necessary, because their educational capital was not enough. Most respondents suffered from economic hardship during their schooling period:

Basically, the economic issues also had influenced the social contexts, the contexts were too demanding, in the sense that there were many things, that as a child or young person were to work basically, and not thinking of studying anymore. As I said before, my father passed away when I was 13 years old, and my mother did

not have any income, so the situation was too tricky (Patricio, Agronomist, 39, from the countryside).

It is possible to see that these experiences had a deep impact on the respondents lives, with some still experiencing an emotional burden when they remembered these events, and more than one respondent started to cry when I asked about the economic scarcity in their childhood. They had diverse ways to describe and interpret their stories, focusing their discourses on material scarcities and the marginalised position that they had. But despite the economical scarcities that Patricio suffered, he still managed to enter university:

I did the university test, I prepared it with the knowledge that I could obtain it outside secondary school. I remember that I had good results, despite the bad school that I studied at. Even then, I had the option to enter to university, with the special quota that the university had for indigenous people, but I did not take it, no...no I did not take it, because I thought in my economic situation...I could not register for the university if I did not have the possibility to pay the university fees and that in some way encouraged me and I saw the possibility that the university was an option...So, finally it was that, then I worked one year and a half, I saved money and the rest of the time I prepared for the university test and thanks god, I could enter (Patricio, Agronomist, 39, from the countryside).

The university gave entrance opportunities for indigenous people; however, this did not cover the financial gap for them. This failure to consider the economic situation of indigenous people suggests this was a less than appropriate policy for helping them to study at university.

One group of the respondents (6) attended schools of a good educational quality, even though they were public or semi-private schools. However, these kinds of school work in a different way, having a large number of students (4000 average, with 35-45 students per class) and so they stream students within the school, offering different courses to students they deem 'good'. Consequently, to obtain an education that will get them into university, students have to get recognised as 'good' students. Some public schools are

recognised as the most prestigious schools in Chile. Students from poor families can attend them, but to do they must pass a very difficult entrance test.

Of the respondents who attended schools with a good educational quality and then attended prestigious universities (6), all were from Santiago. Their trajectories were a bit different from the experiences of the rest of the respondents, because despite their economic problems, they attended good schools and, due to their academic performance, obtained scholarships that paid all their university fees. Violeta, for example, spoke of her experience in a school in a poor neighbourhood:

I went to a school that was focused on good students; I studied in a school of the primary education network, which was a network of schools that I think only worked in Santiago...it is supposed that these schools were focused on poor sectors, but with a very good quality education. When I started in that institution, they did an experiment, they chose the best students and they created a course and the rest who were good students as well, but not the best, in another course. I attended the course where attended the best students, so they were intelligent, some with social conscience, because we all came from peripheral sectors (Violeta, Midwife/Psychologist, 43, from Santiago).

Violeta represents the group of respondents (6), who were very good students and attended prestigious universities. However, these trajectories were not free from difficulties, because they belonged to working class families whose financial situation was not good, so they had to negotiate how to enter university:

There was pressure from my social context, there was no hope to finish the career, because I remember when I was going to study at university and I had to do the test, more than one neighbour told my mother 'but you have to register in a technical school, how she is going to university?' And that was many years ago, around 24 years ago. The university was a difficult goal, there were not private universities. I mean, if you did not enter public universities, there were no universities, and everybody knew that attending university was not a trivial thing...so in that time was a big challenge, but I knew that were many cousins that attended university, but they did not finish (Violeta, Midwife/Psychologist, 43, from Santiago).

Some of the oldest respondents did not have the same opportunities to study as the younger respondents and had to make an extra effort. Loreta, one of the younger respondents, spoke of higher levels of expectation in her school.

I was studying in a prestigious secondary school. So, when you started they told you that most of the girls attend university and public university. Therefore, most of these schools had very ingrained this kind of narrative, that we will be professionals. It was part of the accepted discourse and teachers also encouraged you...It happened that in my class there were many girls that had very good marks, therefore inside my class I was not the best, but I had good marks (Loreta, Linguist, 23, from Santiago).

Respondents from Santiago also had the advantage that they lived in the capital, because for them it was easier to apply to prestigious schools and then universities with scholarships, whereas respondents from Temuco and countryside had a more difficult situation. They had to migrate to Santiago in order to attend these prestigious schools and universities, and that involved an extra expense which their parents could not afford. But even the more advantaged students, like Loreta, had financial constraints:

The university gave me a scholarship because of my good marks and the good result of my university test, the university paid me everything, the fees and the registration, everything. My parents were proud of me, I was the first, and then obviously that my sister was going to attend university as well. Also, the university gave me a scholarship, so for them was a big relief; because they knew that they did not have to pay anything and without debt (Loreta, Linguist, 23, from Santiago).

Despite the fact that Loreta was a good student her parents were concerned about the financial situation. Many of the respondents spoke of being special or being part of a special group of students, because their teachers and schools recognised them as good students. This singling out seemed to be connected to them developing different aspirations compared to their classmates; they started to think of studying at university, but without a concrete plan, only continuing to be a good student. But these respondents started to recognise themselves and their trajectories as unusual, due to their good marks and the recognition of their teachers and schools. Educational institutions divided

respondents' trajectories, where one group experienced more obstacles than others in educational terms. But for all of them their schooling became important for acquiring and modifying their cultural capital. We now turn to consider the role of teachers in this process.

# 4.3.3 The role of teachers

The subsection focuses on the important role of teachers during the respondents' schooling and university period. Some respondents reported that some of their teachers did not support them and even hindered them in their studies. However, these respondents overcome these difficulties because they had other support from their school or parents. Others had the support of teachers, who were really concerned that the respondents continue their studies, becoming the bridge that respondents needed to compensate for their lack of familial cultural capital.

The following quotes represent the experiences of the respondents who attended urban schools, with narratives of attending bad quality schools, and of how teachers could be an obstacle to acquire a good quality education. Javier, for example, spoke of his experience in secondary school:

The school was middle class or low middle class; there were classmates from different realities, from marginal neighbourhoods, where the thing that people did not have was money. The school had a discourse of entry to university, but teachers recognised that most people would not enter there. It was strange thing. On the one hand, they told you that 'you have to work hard to enter to university', and sometimes they said, 'in case you do not enter to university there are alternatives'. The context was ambiguous. For my generation it was clear that it was difficult to enter. The school band played all the time 'the dance of marginal' [a song that became an anthem in the 80s, during the dictatorship period] and teachers felt sad about the situation (Javier, Historian, 31, from Santiago).

Respondents who had their childhoods in the 1980s, when the economic situation was bad in Chile, had fewer possibilities to enter university. In that sense, the teachers'

discourse - encouraging children to obtain work instead of going to university - was 'realistically' adjusted according to the social situation in that moment:

The first time that I applied to university I did not gain entry, so I worked as a salesman in a market in Santiago and that year also I dedicated it to study in the pre-university<sup>20</sup> course. It was expensive, we paid that amongst us all. I studied and worked at the same time (Javier, Historian, 31, from Santiago).

Javier had to work and study in a pre-university course to compensate for the educational and cultural capital that his school and teachers failed to provide. But other respondents spoke of the importance of a teacher's support for obtaining better educational options. Luisa explained how obtaining good marks marked her out as promising for her teachers:

I always had the third position in my class, I had high marks. The school was bad, but I was...we were five students that had very good marks and we had the same level, in fact all attended the same university...the English teacher always encouraged us to do more, to learn more, we did activities. I think she wanted to prepare us very well, better than the rest...because we are good students, because we were different to the rest of our classmates (Luisa, Accountant, 27, from the countryside).

The interesting thing about Luisa's quote is that due to her teacher's support, she felt she was an unusual student who had the possibility to continue her studies:

I do not regret it, but it was difficult, because I did not understand so much the career and when I started to study, most of my classmates were from a business secondary school [a school focused in preparing students for technical accountants]. Therefore, they knew about accounting and finance. I did not understand anything, absolute anything. So, that was difficult, but little by little I started to level up. The first semester was very hard, but then I levelled up and by the end of first year I had good results, even the career director, who was my professor, said congratulations, because I had good marks, when I started without any knowledge (Luisa, Accountant, 27, from the countryside).

132

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Pre-university courses prepare students for the university test. There are free pre-university in schools, after classes. Also, there are pre-university courses that students have to pay fees to enter.

Nonetheless, as Luisa's quote shows, despite attending university most of the respondents had to appeal to their own resources to compensate for the insufficient cultural capital they received from their families and schools. They had to produce strategies to manage their lack of educational and cultural resources, for example studying extra hours before and during the university period and appealing to others to teach them about courses. Manuel explained how teachers helped him because he was a good student:

I had to change primary school, because the school was poor, and the school had courses only for four years of primary school, so I had to go to Temuco to finish my study and there also teachers encouraged you. Above all the maths teacher always encouraged us to go to university, so that we can be outstanding people. Always, I mean...until primary school, I was the student with the best marks and then in the secondary school, I studied in a public school and I was in a course with students who had only good marks (Manuel, Nurse, 24, from small town).

Manuel did not get the marks to study medicine so chose to study nursing. He could have waited and applied again to medicine, but due to his lack of knowledge about the university application process and scholarships he chose to enter university immediately on a nursing course:

The university test result arrived, so we went with my father to a cyber cafe, because we did not have the internet and I saw my results and I said to my father 'I am not going to study medicine' and then I arrived home, very sad, my father very sad as well. When I arrived home, my mother asked how my results were and I said bad, I started to cry and she said 'I could register you in a pre-university course and then you can study medicine', but I said no, because in that period, the universities did not inform you about scholarships and loans, different than now. Therefore, I said to them I am not going to lose my opportunity of scholarship applications. Moreover, I was preselected for everything (scholarships and loans), so I said I am going to study something now, then my cousin gave me a nursing book and I decided to study nursing (Manuel, Nurse, 24, from small town).

Like Manuel, around five of the respondents said that they did not choose the career that they wanted, because they did not have high enough marks. Others chose their career because their family pressured them into it, while others said their goal was studying at university, but without a clearly defined career option. Again, we see that whilst the respondents acquired sufficient cultural capital to attend university, usually with the help of teachers, they still often lacked detailed cultural knowledge of the university environment and its procedures, which created difficulties for them at university – a subject which I will return to in later chapters.

# 4.3.4 Unequal access to resources and opportunities

The subsection focuses on the access to resources and opportunities that the respondents had. Here I argue that the financial issues the respondents and their families faced in relation to the cost of university could in part be solved through access to scholarships and loans. However, resources and opportunities are not just financial, and factors associated with geographical distance and migration were fundamental for many of the sample's social mobility experiences, because their major motivation for migration was to acquire a better level of education. However, these migration experiences arose from inequalities and created obstacles and constraints.

As previously mentioned, as the respondents were from working-class families, their families lacked the income to pay for good schools or university. The respondents had to achieve high marks to obtain university scholarships. However, not all their applications were successful, so they also applied for government loans or in some cases, paid all their university fees from their own funds. In cases where respondents had paid their own fees, their families had given them the money, mostly by getting credit from banks (two respondents worked during their university period to pay the fees). Overall, nine respondents had a full 100% scholarship, six respondents had a 50% scholarship and a 50% loan for their fees, six respondents had a 50% loan and paid the rest from their own/family funds, eight paid all their fees from their own/family funds, and 11 respondents had a 100% loan. Without scholarships or loans most of the respondents

could not attend university or support themselves during the process. Clara shows the importance and pressures of getting a scholarship:

When I was in the last year of secondary school I became a little crazy, I mean, I was very focused on the university test, I had classes all day and then I attended a free pre-university course and I had classes from Monday to Friday. So, I focused very much, in fact I felt frustration when I did not have good enough results to enter history, because I studied a lot. I started the university very scared, but at the same time I had the satisfaction that I achieved the first goal, to enter to university, in a public university, to have access to scholarship (Clara, Journalist, 25, from Santiago).

Getting a scholarship did not solve all problems. Armando , for example, explained his economic difficulties at university:

When I arrived at university, I applied to the university halls, but they opened in September and I was applying in March, so I had to manage where I had to live. I obtained a food scholarship, so I had at least one meal per day. Therefore, with some pounds I could have breakfast and dinner, but at least that scholarship helped to get lunch and sometimes I saved bread and with that I had my dinner (Armando, 34, Lawyer, from Santiago).

Armando used a variety of strategies to manage:

I managed to stay in the university halls for two years, enough to learn to live and obtain scholarships. Because, my career was very demanding, so that I could not work and study at the same time. Therefore, I chose to study and survived with some scholarships, and I stayed in the university halls. It was a kind of a loan they gave you, I did not pay, but when you finished the course they asked you to pay. In the university hall, I had a bedroom, that was not the most comfortable, but I had somewhere I could sleep and breakfast, not a great experience (Armando, 34, Lawyer, from Santiago).

Armando represents a group of the respondents who experienced more pressure than other students, because they had to maintain good marks, otherwise they could lose their university place. Such respondents were very aware of the extra hurdles they had

to overcome to get to university, which gave them a sense of difference:

When I entered to university, we were in a very difficult financial situation, but it was something like...inside, like how to collect money to photocopy. I studied with an indigenous scholarship, so there is another issue, it is true that I obtained the scholarship, but to obtain the scholarship was something that I had to beg for, they asked you for several documents, is unbelievable. So, I never felt economic discrimination, but I could see the difference (Clara, Journalist, 25, from Santiago).

Clara related her narrative of achievement in obtaining a scholarship to the feeling of belonging to a different and unequal group, one who had to appeal to desperate strategies to cover all the expenses of university.

As we shall see in Chapters Five and Six, the movement to university often gave the respondents a heightened sense of their difference, on both class and ethnic lines, which prompted renegotiations of their identity. However, the movement that the respondents experienced during their mobility was often geographical as well as social, and while migration gave the sample better opportunities (to attend better quality schools, to gain entry to university or to get better jobs) it also created obstacles and difficulties, partly through the shock of moving into unfamiliar environments and where they were in the class and ethnic minority. We can see these difficulties of migration very clearly in the respondents' schooling and university period. Teodoro, for example, who was born in the countryside, moved to Temuco to study at school and described his first days at boarding school:

My best memories in that period of time, almost all Mapuche and rural people, but there I lived things, because boys are crueller, they said 'te dio la indiada' ['you behave as angry as an indigenous person' - people say 'indio' in a derogatory way, to highlight the fact the person is indigenous] that I heard (Teodoro, History teacher, 25, from the countryside).

Teodoro continued describing his life in that period:

The first days were strange, I was never outside of my home....no, and it was hard the first days. I could not sleep, I stayed in front of the wall for a while, when my parents left me there. Nonetheless, then I realised that there were others like me and we started to talk (Teodoro, History teacher, 25, from the countryside).

There were also difficulties in moving to look for work. Luisa, who was born in the countryside but moved to Santiago for work, explained how her life suddenly changed due to her migration:

I was the only one that dared to leave home, go away and it was like I did not think twice, I mean I was young, I was like 22 years old, so for me was ok ready, I am going to Santiago, I never considered the importance of that, once when I was already here, it was hard to get used to...I was missing a lot, the workload was heavy, money was not enough, because now I did not have my father's help, so my income was not too good at that time, so it was a little bit hard, but then I got used to it, because in the end, all the jobs are here in Santiago, in the south it is hard to find one, I tried to find one but it is hard, the income is not enough, so no, I am thinking that I will stay here (Luisa, 27 years old, Accountant, from the countryside).

Luisa's quote is typical example of the effect of migration where respondents often did not understand the full implications of the decision to move. For some, their move was a positive decision, but others emphasised negative aspects, such as arriving alone to an unknown city and deal with the unknown. The respondents' experience of migration varied however, as only about half had to move for better educational or employment opportunities in their place of residence, while another half — chiefly urban-based respondents — were already better located for these opportunities.

#### 4.3.5 Class and ethnic discrimination

So far, I have described the obstacles the respondents faced on their road to university related to their lack of economic and cultural capital. These structural class inequalities were also strongly shaped by the structural ethnic disadvantage of the Mapuche in Chile. However, these structural obstacles do not fully capture the social position and mobility

experiences of the respondents, since these were also shaped by their experiences of interpersonal ethnic and class discrimination. Most of the respondents had experiences of ethnic and class discrimination and their accounts of their social position and mobility trajectories were strongly shaped by these experiences. Again, the rural/urban dimension and the different experience of migration complicates these accounts. The respondents' experience of discrimination varies according to their migration experience, because people who did not migrate (mainly those from the Metropolitan region) had different understandings of discrimination, and associated discrimination more with their class location and inequality, whilst by contrast people who had migrated tended to associate discrimination more with their ethnic background.

Respondents who grew up in Santiago largely gave accounts of discrimination based on the divisions between people who lived in their largely poor neighbourhoods and the more affluent people who attended their schools. Clara, who grew up in a poor neighbourhood, explained her that mother still felt they were discriminated against for their poverty there:

My mother told me now that when we were children eh...I did not remember. It happened that our neighbours did not invite us to the birthdays, any, because we were many, because we were....my mother always told us because we were the poorest of the road. Therefore, we were too many, and apparently, neither could we bring a gift, I do not know, my mother felt this discrimination when we were children (Clara, Journalist, 25, from Santiago).

Clara herself did not feel this at the time, because her social network was her family:

I do not remember very well, because I had good time, I had many sisters and we had fun together. So, I did not feel the necessity of have more friends in the neighbourhood. I had a friend and that was enough (Clara, Journalist, 25, from Santiago).

However, encountering a wider social circle, often when the respondents moved to a better-quality school with more middle-class pupils, often caused problems for respondents. The respondents also experienced shifts in their ethnic social location, and

migration into new social contexts also prompted experiences of ethnic discrimination. This discrimination associated with being Mapuche was for some related to their Mapuche surname, for others related to their skin colour and for others was related to the Mapuche territory they had come from. Matias, for example, explained how in school he was marked out as 'different':

In primary school my classmates bothered me...because my last name basically. I see that as a silly thing, like something that happened when we were children, because obviously, they will bother you for your last name X, in the end, you think and you laugh about it, now I laugh about my last name...and...I remember a teacher that one day he told me that because of my last name I will never go further than the average. That yes, I had very clear, that he told me (Matias, Political scientist, 21, from small town).

The social transitions the respondents experienced and the discrimination they encountered in new social contexts meant the respondents started to develop a sharper realisation of their social location, and to experience the stigma associated with coming from a working-class family and having an indigenous heritage. In later chapters, I will explore how the sample deployed different strategies to 'fit in' to their new social locations, along lines of class and ethnicity, with varying consequences for how they negotiated their identities during their social mobility.

Respondents had to deal with barriers and difficulties across multiple dimensions in order to attend university and to obtain a more prestigious social position. The traditional understanding of social mobility -as a shift in class location - is not sufficient to understand the complex transitions across multidimensional social locations that each respondent experienced. For that reason, in chapters 5 and 6, I will adopt an intersectional analysis to analyse the social mobility trajectories of the Mapuche people.

#### 4.4 Conclusion

This chapter has looked at the sample's road to university, and the social contexts that shaped their experience of social mobility. The chapter has shown that the sample had to negotiate the interplay of changing aspirations, family influences, and the role of class and ethnic disadvantage in order to attend university. The sample spoke of their social mobility into university as a process of fraught achievement, in which they had to deal with numerous obstacles and challenges. Some of the challenges related to their working-class background, and the lack of economic and cultural capital in their families. The respondents managed to overcome these disadvantages in achieving a university place, but to do so they all had to gain access to indigenous scholarships and/or go into debt, to pay university fees. And though they acquired cultural capital through their schooling, they were still hampered by a lack of knowledge of the university field. For Bourdieu (1984), educational competition is shaped by how an individual's class background affects their ability to 'play the game' of education, in which levels of economic and cultural capital and the class basis of habitus affects people's ability to succeed within the middle-class field of education. The sample negotiated a university place, but their accounts were still those of people who came from families who did not know how to fully 'play the game' and they stressed their difficulties and disadvantages in educational processes.

The sample's structural class inequalities were also strongly shaped by the structural ethnic disadvantage of the Mapuche in Chile, with other challenges related to ethnic discrimination and patterns of rural disadvantage. For respondents from rural backgrounds, a lack of local opportunities meant some had to travel long distances or move from their family home to study. Migration was, for some, a key aspect of their changing social context through mobility. The disadvantage of the Mapuche in Chile has entailed extensive patterns of migration from rural to urban contexts in search of better opportunities, and whilst the sample had all experienced some degree of geographical movement associated with their social mobility, their narratives varied depending on

whether they were the first generation to move to a city or had grown up in a city. All of the sample spoke of how their social mobility (to more prestigious schools, to university, to higher-level jobs) had moved them into unfamiliar and challenging new environments in which they were in the minority and exposed to discrimination. Those raised in cities tended to frame these experiences more in terms of class discrimination, whereas those moving to cities from rural contexts tended to emphasize their experiences of ethnic discrimination.

Chapter 4 establishes that the sample's trajectories into university raised a series of challenges for them, along lines of both class and ethnicity and whilst the sample narrated their experiences as 'success' stories they also emphasized the difficulties of adjustment and 'fitting in' that these transitions required, with many experiencing discriminations in their new social contexts. However, when they discussed their social contexts (old and new) they framed them in complex multi-dimensional terms, not just in terms of their class situation but also in terms of their ethnic social location, and compounded by questions of rural/urban inequalities, gender and experiences of migration.

Because the respondents emphasized different dimensions to their social location, their accounts of their social mobility across social locations was also multidimensional. As Chapters 5 and 6 will now explore, the sample narrated their social mobility as resulting in a transition in both their class and ethnic social location, and this resulted in more complex social challenges and processes of identity negotiation than in a standard process of class mobility.

# **Chapter 5: The process of identification and changing identities**

# 5.1 Introduction

The previous chapter explored the respondents' route to university, and the complex obstacles (including material hardships, lack of local opportunities, and racial and class inequalities and discrimination) that they faced on their journey. Despite these obstacles, the entire sample achieved a university education and some degree of upward social mobility in their subsequent occupations. In Chapter Four, I argued that when the sample discussed the background social contexts of their mobility, they framed them in complex multi-dimensional terms, emphasizing their social context not just in terms of class situation but also in terms of ethnicity. Chapters Five and Six turn to consider the consequences of upward mobility for the women and men in my sample, with these consequences also explored in multidimensional terms. I particularly focus on how the need to manage the experience of transition led the sample to complex renegotiations of their class and ethnic identity. In that sense, this chapter and the next draw on Stuart Hall's (1996; 2000) definition of identities in which:

Identity becomes a "moveable feast": Formed and transformed continuously in relation to the ways we are represented or addressed in the cultural systems which surround us. It is historically, not biologically, defined. The subject assumes different identities at different times, identities which are not unified around a coherent "self". Within us are contradictory identities. Pulling in different directions, so that our identifications are continuously being shifted about (Hall, 1996: 598).

Both Chapter Five and Six illustrate that the respondents' identities changed in different ways and in different fields, showing that identities are flexible and not essential. This chapter first establishes how the experience of upward social mobility, both at university and later at work, affected the respondents' sense of identity and their identity claims in these contexts. The experience of upward social mobility represented a challenge to the respondents' sense of their class position and identity, as they had to manage social

relationships and identities between their social class of origin and their class of destination. But the experience of upward social mobility also provided a challenge to respondents' ethnic identities, as they had to manage social relations and indigenous identity claims across their social origins and destinations. One key issue concerns how class and ethnic identity are complexly entangled, partly because middle-classness was sometimes perceived - by the respondents' social connections, but also sometimes by themselves – as being problematically connected with their Mapuche identity. Of course, Mapuche professionals are very much a minority in the middle-class in Chile. According to a United Nations Development Programme study (PNUD, 2017) in Chile class inequalities have a strong ethnic and racial connotation, and most upper-class people are white, while indigenous peoples tend to occupy the lowest positions in the social structure. Therefore, indigenous people do not fit the typical profile of the Chilean middle-class, and they stand out in these contexts, with their presence there often being remarked upon, and felt, as being not 'normal'. As a consequence, some – though not all - of the sample did not feel inclined to identify with their new middle-class context, because they felt out of place there. In what follows, I examine the different ways in which my sample tried to negotiate becoming middle-class at the same time as being Mapuche. As we shall see, the individuals in the sample adopted a number of different responses to the challenges of social mobility to their class and ethnic identities, which are explored in this chapter, and the next.

Respondents had complex experiences of upward social mobility in which their sense of identity was affected not just by their class and ethnic locations but also by differential processes of geographical mobility, and by varying experiences of discrimination and racism (in both their place of origin and destination). As I shall show, the extent of people's geographical mobility was an important influence on the experience of social mobility. We might view this partly as a question of 'distance' from Mapuche culture. Those members of the sample who undertook longer-range geographical movement (or whose parents had already undertaken such movement) as part of their mobility transition had different experiences and identity claims from those with short-range or

no geographical movement. For example, those respondents who experienced social mobility whilst staying in the Araucanía region had to navigate their altered class situation with their Mapuche networks and communities (what we might see as managing 'being Mapuche' whilst being middle-class). However, those respondents experiencing social mobility in Santiago had to navigate a different set of circumstances where Mapuche people were very much in the minority (what we might see as managing 'being middle-class' whilst being Mapuche). Similarly, the experience of classed and raced discrimination was also variable, with some respondents having early experiences of both (at school etc.), whereas for others, the experience of discrimination was felt as being more marked later on, as part of their social mobility transition (on arrival at university etc.). These varying experiences helped to shape different responses and identity claims.

In order to show in detail how complex and diverse the dynamics of the sample's changing identities were, I divide the respondents into three main groups, according to the different ways in which they developed and managed their class and ethnic identities, taking into account their range of geographical mobility, and their experience of discrimination. However, this division is for analytical purposes and I am not suggesting the sample's identities are fixed into groups. As Hall (1996) indicates, the identities of people are flexible and not essential.

The first group are the 'mobile accommodators', a group who identify as being middle-class, distancing themselves from their formative (working-class) identity and also distancing themselves from their Mapuche identity. The second group is the 'rooted', a group who still maintained a sense of working-class identity, despite their upward mobility experience. This group's attendance at university also helped them move towards a continued but strengthened sense of their Mapuche identity. The last group are the 're-signifiers', a group whose mobility experiences meant they now identified as being middle-class, taking distance from their formative (working-class) identity, but who had also started to re-signify their Mapuche identity during and after attending university. Each group has an intricate dynamic of different kinds of influences and

intersections that I will explain in the following sections. I outline the characteristics of these three groups in greater detail in the next section. Here I note however, that the respondents had all experienced significant shifts in their social circumstances which resulted in equally significant forms of change in their identities, which – in line with the wider literature – we can view as a process in which people tend to 'fit in' or identify with their social contexts (Granfield, 1991; Diprose, 2008; Rahman, 2013; Benson, 2014; Karlgren, 2015; Bathmaker et al 2016). However, people can choose to 'fit in' with different aspects of their social contexts, and the distinction between the three groups in my sample helps to contextualise the ways in which respondents negotiated both their class and their Mapuche identities in complex processes of management and adjustment.

In this chapter, I only analyse the first two groups, the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted', leaving the analysis of the third group, the 're-signifiers', to the following chapter. I have undertaken this division in the analysis because, for both the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted', their experiences of upward mobility were such that their class identities became their dominant identities. In other words, this chapter is mainly focused on questions of class identity, examining how, for these two groups, upward mobility was primarily experienced as becoming middle-class and meant a process of managing their new class identities. For 'mobile accommodators' this meant a kind of assimilation with their new middle-class position and entailed not expressing a strong Mapuche identity. For the 'rooted' group this meant the denial that mobility had changed their identities, which was expressed as a form of 'normal' or 'ordinary' class identity and a renewed and reinforced sense of their Mapuche identities. In Chapter Six, however, I shift the analyse to consider the 're-signifiers' group, tackling this group separately because the 're-signifiers' were people who reacted to, and expressed their class transition through a politicisation of their ethnic identities. For this group, the process of mobility had the most impact on their sense of ethnic identity, as they changed their identity claims with their dominant identity becoming their Mapuche identities. If this second chapter focuses on questions of class identity, then the third chapter focuses on mobility and ethnic identification and why some people emphasised their ethnic identity in new ways. However, it should be emphasised that, for all three groups, questions of class and ethnic identity were always complexly entangled and cannot be considered in complete isolation from each other.

The first section introduces the three groups in greater detail and examines the common challenges that respondents from all three groups experienced due to their social upward mobility, examining their experiences of dislocation in their university and work periods. The second section of this chapter then moves to focus on the 'mobile accommodators', the group who assimilated to their new middle-class identities in the process of expressing distance from both the working-class and indigenous aspects of their previous identities. The last section of this chapter considers the 'rooted' group, the group who tried to manage the experience of mobility by still trying to 'fit in' to their social origins whilst maintaining a sense of 'unchanged' identity in terms of both their Mapuche and 'origin' class identities.

# 5.2 The challenge of upward social mobility for people's sense of class and ethnic identity

In this section, I examine the common challenges that upward mobility brought to all of the respondents' lives. Among these challenges it is possible to see that all of the respondents had the experience of feeling like a 'fish out of water' (Bourdieu, 1984, 1992), of being 'out of place' or of not 'fitting in' during their higher education and work periods. Another similar challenge was related to the respondents' experiences of social dislocation which was associated with a sense of distance, or not 'fitting in', with both their class and indigenous contexts of origin. For many, whilst they had experienced social mobility, it was a challenge to manage the process of 'fitting in', with either their social origins or their social destinations. As we have seen in Chapter Four, migration experiences were also related to the sample's class transitions, and respondents tend to mix questions of migration and class in their narratives. In that sense, some respondents found that the process of struggling between their old class identities and their new

middle-class identities was also a process of migration, as in the case of individuals from poor rural families who also had to manage the double transition to prestigious jobs far away in the capital. The sample's accounts of their mobility were strongly meritocratic, but we can partly relate this meritocratic emphasis to some of the strains of fitting in to their new social environments. Finally, I examine how gender issues are related to the upward social mobility experiences of the respondents. It seems that most of the respondents tended to downplay gender issues in their narratives of class and ethnic identities.

# 5.2.1 Introducing the groups: the 'mobile accommodators', the 'rooted' and the 'resignifiers'

Before considering these experiences, let us first consider the characteristics of the three groups in the sample who have been distinguished according to the different ways in which they developed and managed their class and ethnic identities during their experience of social mobility. Table 5.1 shows the different social characteristics and transitions of these three groups, the 'mobile accommodators', the 'rooted' and the 'resignifiers'.

The 'mobile accommodators' group (15), is characterised by respondents who emphasised their experiences of upward social mobility. Respondents from this group objected to both the class and indigenous aspects of their previous identities; they perceived themselves to be middle-class and considered their Mapuche identities as less significant. During and after university they started to distance themselves from Mapuche culture. Moreover, this group had experience of long-range class mobility, as people in higher status and higher salary professions. These jobs were also related to the private sector, where people tend to have higher salaries and acquire greater status than in the public sector. In this group were accountants, a lawyer, engineers, nurses, an architect, a dentist, teachers, a journalist and a biologist. There are two different subgroups in this category. Eight were born in the countryside, in small towns and in Temuco. They had experience of long range geographical mobility as they moved to the

capital looking for better employment opportunities. For this subgroup, it could be assumed that they have strong Mapuche identities, because they were raised within the Mapuche culture. But they started to abandon their Mapuche and working-class identities due to their experiences of upward mobility and long-range migration. Another subgroup is comprised of seven respondents, who were born in Temuco to Mapuche parents who had emigrated from the countryside. This group did not have a strong Mapuche identity, because their parents and relatives decided not to teach them about Mapuche culture following on from experiences of discrimination upon moving to the city. Their experiences of upward mobility did not lead them to a focus on their Mapuche culture (unlike the re-signifiers) and their narratives were focused more on their achieved social position than their Mapuche identities.

The 'rooted' group comprises seven respondents who are mainly composed of men. Despite their upward social mobility, they still tried to 'fit in' to their social origin group, both in terms of their Mapuche identity and class identity. It would appear that these respondents were trying to justify their class transition through reinforcing the idea of not changing their class position and reinforcing their Mapuche identities. Most of them still perceived themselves as working-class, and they tended to experience shorter-range class mobility than the mobile accommodators, in professions with a lower status and salary (such as teachers, journalists, designers, engineers, social workers) after attending universities with mid-level access requirements. In comparison with the 'mobile accommodators', the jobs of the 'rooted' were in the public sector. All of this group are from the countryside but moved to Temuco or other small towns successively in order to increase their educational opportunities, e.g. by attending university. These respondents grew up in a traditional Mapuche social context, compared to the other respondents; and they presented narratives strongly related to Mapuche culture as a strategy to identify with their class position of origin.

The 're-signifiers' group (18) comprises respondents whose narratives emphasised a focus on and re-signification of their Mapuche identities. Some of them perceived themselves to be middle-class (11) whilst others still saw themselves as working-class

(7). Most had experienced long-range class mobility, attending universities with highlevel access requirements and achieving professions with a high status and salary (such as historians, teachers, engineers, actors, musicians, lawyers, journalists, linguists, anthropologists, psychologists and designers). In the same vein as the 'mobile accommodators', people from this group tended to have higher paying jobs in the private sector. Most of the respondents from this group did not have experience of migration (15): the majority are from Santiago. The re-signifiers did not grow up in a traditional Mapuche social context (which respondents variously defined in terms of having a Mapuche surname, speaking the Mapuche language, living on Mapuche land, participating in Mapuche cultural or political groups) and, until their mobility, were the group most distanced from Mapuche culture. However, when this group of respondents began higher education, they started to become aware that there are other dimensions than simply having a Mapuche surname that designate someone as being part of the Mapuche people. Therefore, they started to engage with what I call the traditional aspects of Mapuche identities; learning to adapt and practice these dimensions in their lives, in order to recover traditional Mapuche culture and to reclaim 'legitimate' Mapuche identities.

Chapter Four, 'The road to university', explored the different kinds of migration that respondents had experienced, identifying three distinct groups: people who had experienced short or long-range migration, as well as people who had not experienced migration. In that chapter, I argued that people's experiences of hardship and discrimination in their route to social mobility were complexly related to their migration experiences. Here I also divide respondents into three groups, this time according to how they developed and managed their class and ethnic identities during their experience of social mobility. However, in this categorisation it is still apparent that class, ethnic and migration transitions are related. For instance, people who experienced short-range migration (people from the countryside or smalls town who migrated to Temuco) and who also had short-range class mobility (achieving professions with a lower status and salary and attending universities with mid-level access requirements) are the major

constituents of the 'rooted' group. By contrast, people who experienced long-range migration (respondents who migrated from the countryside, smalls towns, and Temuco to Santiago) also tended to experience longer range class mobility (attending universities with mid-level access requirements but also achieving higher status and higher salary professions) and are more associated with the 'mobile accommodators' group. Finally, the group who did not migrate (most stayed in Temuco and Santiago) and who also tended to experience long range class mobility (achieving professions with a high status and salary and attending universities with high-level access requirements) are the major constituents of the 're-signifiers' group.

Table 5.1: Differences among the group of respondents, according to class and indigenous identities and social mobility.

Categories/ Groups	Mobile Accommodators	Rooted	Re-signifiers
Class identities	Perceived themselves as being middle-class.	Perceived themselves as being working-class.	Variously perceived themselves as being middle-class and working-class.
Ethnic identities	Long-range class mobility. People with a higher place in their class destination. Prestigious and wealthy professions plus universities from Temuco (middle access requirement).  Started to lose their Mapuche identification during or after university/distancing themselves	Short-range class mobility. People with a lower place in their class destination. Modest and low paid professions plus universities from Temuco (middle access requirement).  Started to reinforce their Mapuche identity during and after university.	Long-range class mobility. People with a higher place in their class destination. Prestigious and wealthy professions plus elite universities from Santiago (high access requirement). Started to identify as Mapuche and recover their culture during and
	from Mapuche culture.	after university.	after university.
Members	7 men, 8 women	6 men, 1 women	10 men, 8 women
Level of migration	Long-range geographical mobility/ no migration experiences, with the majority from Temuco.	Short-range geographical mobility.	No migration experiences, with the majority from Santiago.
Discrimination experience	During their childhood and mostly related to ethnic background.	During their childhood and mostly related to ethnic background.	During their childhood and mostly related to class background.

Source: own elaboration

### 5.2.2 Being a professional and 'fish out of water' experiences

All the three groups experienced upward social mobility which created significant changes in their lives, their social relations and their conditions of existence. The university and work period played a fundamental role for respondents, and though the way that they developed their identification to their new social context varied, all of them, in their different ways, were dealing with the difficulties of managing how to combine their social origins with their new social position. Take the example of Victor, who belongs to the 'mobile accommodators' group. He was born in the countryside and moved to Santiago looking for better job opportunities. His account shows how attendance at university changed life for both himself and his family:

### What do you think were the most significant events in your life?

I think the most significant event was telling my family that I am a professional; I think that is the most important event. The other part could be the resources that improved my life and their [his family] lifestyle. I think there are important things...that were important milestones that improved the quality of their lives, and the fact that I could reward them, for me that was very satisfactory (Victor, 'Mobile accommodators', Accountant, 28).

Attendance at university played a significant moment in Victor's life, but this was also a collective process, with his family playing a part in his struggle for success and sharing in his achievements. Another example of the importance of being a professional is the case of Eduardo, who belongs to the 'rooted' group. He was born in the countryside, moved to Temuco to study, but he is currently living in the countryside again. His account shows how becoming a professional gave him the opportunity to help his family:

# What do you think were the most significant events when you attended university?

Once I had to apply to continue studying, because I failed a course. Therefore, I lost the university credit benefits. So, I went to talk to the person in charge of finance in the university. I told him my case, that I was living at the Mapuche university hall and we did many activities and sometimes we did not have time to study, and I did not want to study my course anymore (...) and then he told me 'you never are going to be a real contributor to society, if you do not have a profession. You can have

good intentions, but the only thing that will validate you socially is with a profession, so we are going to give you a chance'. Therefore, (...) I have the memory that that guy trusted me (...) and then I could prove what he told me, because last year our house burned down, and the only way that we had to start again was thanks to my professional status. I could ask for credit from a bank (...) but if I did not have a profession, if I did not work, the situation would have been extremely different, because socially that is what counts (Eduardo, 'rooted', Teacher, 30).

Eduardo had a different perspective compared with Victor to about the importance of attending university and being a professional, because Victor described his emotional experience, whereas Eduardo described the economic contribution that his upward educational mobility brought to his family.

It should be noted that most of the respondents narrated the transition to university and work in terms of 'fish out of water' experiences, with their experience of social mobility making them rethink not only their class but also their Mapuche identities, as I shall explain in greater detail in the next sections. We can therefore identify dissonance between habitus and field, not just in class terms, but also in terms of ethnicity. We can see this feeling of being 'out of place' in the account of Armando, who belongs to the resignifiers group. He was born in Santiago but moved to a city near to Temuco in order to study at a prestigious university. His account of his university experience emphasises such dislocations in terms of a perceived lack of economic and cultural capital but also social discomfort.

I felt out of place sometimes, because for example going to parties. Law courses, sometimes demanded that one have a higher socioeconomic level and I did not have it. Therefore, it was not that people excluded me by saying, 'we are not going to parties with you'; a classmate told me that she did not want to lend me her CD, because I would not have the money to return her CD, if I lost it: It was not like that. My classmates drank a lot...but that demanded money and I did not have it, therefore I started to feel out of place. Well, also with other things like the places that they went to, like the clubs... I did not go there. As I told you I had a good relationship with everyone, but the social context was too cold and boring, so my social relations were outside of that [he refers to outside of the law context, as he had friends from the social sciences courses], there I felt free, relaxed and complete... when I had to return to the law context, in those moments I felt out of

place, I felt that I was not part of the traditional profile of a law student (Armando, 'Re-signifiers', Lawyer, 33).

Armando felt like a 'fish out of water' with his higher status classmates and so pursued a different social network with students that he considered to be his equals, outside of his law course. Now, he regrets that decision, because he feels that he lacks the necessary networks for his career.

Most of the sample experienced a sense of social dislocation and of not fitting in during as a result of their social mobility, either in relation to their social origins, their social destinations, or both. However, they responded in different ways, with different kinds of identity work. Some of the sample expressed conflict and tension related to their indigenous identities, others expressed conflict and tension related to their class identities, whilst others expressed dislocations associated with both their class and indigenous identities at the same time. An example of the latter can be seen in the case of Ana, from the re-signifiers group. Ana has always lived in Santiago, has only one Mapuche surname and does not have the stereotypical 'physical Mapuche profile' (she is tall, white and has brown hair). She comes from a working-class family who lived on the periphery of Santiago. Her quote shows how she felt like a 'fish out of water' at an elite university in Santiago, from the perspective of both class and ethnic identity:

It was different at university, in fact I never felt comfortable, and my classmates were from the elite...I noticed that they had a different socioeconomic background. Therefore, I had to make a double effort, because it was difficult for me, I had to read the books and summarise them, because I did not have a good educational formation...and I felt that their interests were very different from my interests. I felt I was from the proletarian population... On the other hand, I remember a class where we had to say what our origins were. Therefore, a classmate said 'well, I am 'champurria' [a person who has one Mapuche surname and one Chilean surname) I only have my father's Mapuche surname...I lived here, I worked on that'. So, when I had my turn I said, 'my story is similar to that of Antonia' and she said 'no, we are not similar', so I felt different, I distanced myself, maybe because I went to parties and she did not, maybe I had different kinds of friends, but her family was

'champurria' like my family...we were very similar in my opinion, but she disagreed (Ana, 're-signifiers', Anthropologist, 33).

This quote shows that social mobility can result in an experience of dislocation in relation to both class and ethnic identities. Ana's account shows how difficult the university period was for her, because she did not have enough cultural capital when compared to her classmates. But she also struggled to be recognised as a Mapuche because, for her classmate, Ana's profile was insufficient to be recognised as an 'authentic' Mapuche person. It was not enough that Ana identified as Mapuche; she needed the validation of others. Later, Ana reinforced her Mapuche identity in response to this questioning of her ethnic identity.

When respondents described their social mobility achievements, they often referred to the significant moment that provoked a change in their lives, such as attending university, starting a new job or their migration experiences. For example, the accounts of the 'mobile accommodators' group tend to emphasise geographical and class transitions, probably because they had longer range migration experiences, and the journey from their class origins to their class to class destinations was also more remarkable (e.g. from very poor families in the countryside to prestigious jobs in Santiago). Take the case of Paulina, who moved to Santiago to start a new job. She spoke about how she was made more conscious of her ethnic heritage in her new job environment:

#### Now, in this new Job, how many Mapuche are there?

Ehh no, I mean I do not know, because I do not have too much contact with them, because here [Santiago] it is more different than Temuco (...) people here are rougher than those in Temuco. Therefore, I was not used to those kinds of people or the environment (...) So I feel weird here, but in Temuco no, because there I was normal, there are more Mapuche people and you feel a part of that and not so weird; here I don't feel normal (Paulina, 'mobile accommodators', engineer, 27).

Paulina felt 'out of place' in her new job in Santiago, because of her Mapuche heritage. She added that people from her new job teased her about being a person who burns trucks, because people accuse Mapuche people to stop trucks in highway and burn, therefore is common to say to Mapuche people the 'quema camiones' people who burn trucks or being a terrorist, which is another current stereotype of Mapuche people. In that sense, despite her upward social mobility and geographical mobility, she could not easily adapt to her new environment, due to her experience of exclusion. Another example of the importance of geographical and class transitions is the case of Violeta, who belongs to the 're-signifiers' group. She went to the United States to study a Masters' degree and then a PhD, but she did not finish the PhD, because she felt 'out of place', despite the fact that her academic performance was good, and she had a good relationship with her supervisor. In her quote, she explains this was mainly due to her relationship with other Chileans in the United States:

Most people who were studying there had a higher socioeconomic status (...) They were people with a high status, eh...sons and daughters of landowners, sons and daughters of the manager of the Mercurio [one of the most popular newspapers in Chile, with a very conservative point of view] (...) It was particularly difficult to have a relationship with them. I could not make Chilean friends. It was noticeable - the class difference, it was super notorious (...) at the beginning I tried to integrate, but then when they realised your surname and that you were from Renca (a poor neighbourhood in Santiago) and you were not from the PUC [one of the most prestigious universities in Chile which is associated with posh people], and you were not ABC1, neither did you study at their school, they were indifferent with you (...) they did not care about you, you did not belong there, even if you were Chilean (Violeta, 're-signifiers', psychologist/midwife, 43).

The case of Violeta is interesting, because she did not have contact with Chilean upperclass people until her experience in the United States. However, due to her PhD course in the United States, Violeta started to get in touch with a Chilean upper-class group. All were in the same situation, studying masters and PhDs, which ostensibly made them equals. However, class boundaries started to appear, despite the fact that they shared the same educational level and nationality. In Violeta's case the experience of upward social mobility, geographical mobility and the acquisition of cultural capital were not enough to belong to the group. Here, symbolic capital status played an important role in drawing boundaries between Violeta and the rest of the Chilean group.

#### 5.2.3 Meritocratic narratives

Most of the respondents from this research expressed meritocratic narratives of their mobility, though they also recognised the boundaries that they had to face. Littler (2013) suggests that the meritocracy concept – which emphasises effort and intelligence as the basis of a competitive hierarchy - is well known for legitimating inequality, validating upper-middle-class values and rejecting working-class values. In that sense, most of the participants emphasised the sacrifices and efforts that they had to make in order to attend university and to obtain good jobs. The respondents highlighted the fact that few people had helped them in their upward social mobility, with their narratives focused on their individual efforts to make to improve their lives. Take the case of Javier, who is from Santiago and belongs to the 're-signifiers' group. He characterised the attendance of Mapuche people at university as meritocratic:

Professional Mapuche people are a typical generation from the 90s, from positive discrimination policies, from the possibility of the incorporation of Mapuche people into university. I think Mapuche society is very meritocratic, everyone is where they are because of their efforts (...) I believe that there are professionals that have to recognise themselves as Mapuche and make a contribution to their identity. There are people who work in IT; those people could create software for plays of the Arauco war. People who create toys; they should create toys for Mapuche, people who study history: they should write about Mapuche history. In that way I can see their contribution, the strengthening of the project (Javier, 're-signifiers', Historian, 31).

Respondents' accounts of their upward social mobility experiences became synonymous with their efforts and sacrifices. As discussed in the previous chapter 'The road to university', the Chilean higher education system has a series of barriers that

disadvantages people from an underprivileged background from entering university, so it was a big achievement for the sample to finish university - and perhaps unsurprising that they focused on their individual efforts and achievement. Another example of this emphasis on the meritocratic nature of their path is the case of Victor. His account emphasised his own capabilities, leaving aside other factors in his social mobility and downplaying all the difficulties he had experienced during his trajectory (such as being Mapuche):

# What do you think are the most important milestones in your work experience up until now?

I think that the most important issue is recognition. When a boss recognises you and you know that he did not do it for flattery; he truly recognises that you made an effort that was not the best, but they recognised your efforts and they told you so. That is very important to me [....] so for me those milestones are [....] those processes are important. I say 'hey, you motivate yourself and I say, yes, I am capable', I am capable, there is nobody else to blame anything on (...) that I am Mapuche, that I was bad at university, or this or that, 'I am capable and we can...' (Victor, 'mobile accommodators', accountant, 28).

It would appear that the meritocratic narrative helped some respondents to validate their life stories, demonstrating their great achievement in terms of upward mobility, in the sense of highlighting the fact that despite their past class position, they still managed to attend university, or could move to the capital and obtain good employment. Victor also used a meritocratic narrative in order to disassociate his achievements from being Mapuche; distancing himself from Mapuche culture. Other accounts also emphasised that being Mapuche or from a working-class background need not hold a person back, as in the case of Luisa, who stressed that her personal achievement could encourage others with the same profile:

# Do you think that being a Mapuche professional gave you a kind of responsibility?

-Eh, more than responsibility, I feel that you become an example where you can demonstrate that it is possible, because I am Mapuche and come from a modest family and yes, yes you can do it. Today all my brothers are fine, I am fine too, you cannot have a big salary, but it is enough to be well (...) More than that responsibility, I feel proud to show that you can and beyond the fact that you are a Mapuche, is the fact that you come from a modest family and I say 'hey, you can, you can get ahead' (Luisa, 'mobile accommodators', 27, accountant).

In the previous section, I argued that the sample very frequently narrated their mobility as creating social strains, often feeling like a 'fish out of water'. We can see the sample's stress on the meritocratic aspects of their mobility as one response to these strains, as their emphasis on their own efforts and ability was part of narrative which presented them as being just as good (if not better) than anyone else in their new social contexts. For some of the respondents, we can also see this emphasis on meritocracy as part of desire to be seen as someone 'normal', or to be 'one of them' - ie middle-class - though not all of the sample accepted a middle-class identity. For other respondents, meritocratic claims also expressed narratives of being responsible and hard-working, which might be a reaction against pejorative stereotypes of the Mapuche. The narratives of these participants, as in the case of Victor and Luisa, expressed the idea of their individual competence because they had achieved professional employment, at the same time dissociating the stigmatised aspects of their ethnicity. In later sections, I will look at class and ethnic disidentification in greater detail.

#### 5.2.4 Gender Narratives

In Chapter Four 'The road to university' I showed the influence of parents on the respondents' attendance at university. That positive influence came more from their mothers, who imparted a narrative of agency through educational improvement. Mothers tried to influence their children not to reproduce the same (unequal) gender roles and relations that they had to deal with, wanting their children to live in a more independent way. Take the case of Clara, who related her mother's encouragement for her to attend university:

At the beginning my father wanted us to start work...eh but my mother was always strong in that sense, and she insisted that her daughters had to attend university; in fact, we all studied at public universities (Clara, Journalist, 25, re-signifiers).

Most of the respondents reported that their mothers tried to encourage their children to have better educational opportunities. Some of the respondents' mothers insisted, especially to their daughters, that through education they could reach emancipation, in economic terms, but also in relation to men. Take the case of Sofia, who highlighted her mother's discourse of being independent:

I think she always said to me that I do not have to depend on a man, and if I want to depend on a man I had to study [...] she always...always supported me. For example, if tomorrow I want to buy a house, she will say 'ok, buy it'. She is not like 'my darling, why do you want to go?' My father is the opposite, he will say 'but, why do you want to go? Ok buy the house, but stay here with us, and then you rent the house'. My mother is not like that, my mother said to me 'you have to do your thing, you have to live your life and do whatever you want, do you want to travel? Ok, work and then travel, do you want to buy this? Ok work and then buy it, never depend on a man'. I probably grew up like this, because my mother still told me 'if you want to be a mother, ok be a mother, if you do not want a husband, do not have one, but be a mother anyway' that is my mother's thinking, not that of my father, my father tries not to get involved, but my mother yes...improve your life, buy everything, but do not depend on a man (Sofia, Teacher, 33, mobile accommodators).

Mapuche women suffer different kinds of exclusion, there is a triple discrimination to Mapuche woman: for being women, for being Mapuche and being poor. According to the Census (2002), Mapuche women have an economic activity rate of 32.2%, this percentage is low compared to that of the total female population (35.3%) and the total male population (67.2%). There is also educational exclusion, and according to the Census (2002) 7.3% of Mapuche women do not attend any educational institutions, compared to 3.2%. of non-indigenous women. Moreover, according to Calfio and Velasco (2005:1) 'Indigenous women in Latin America experience violations of their human rights related to gender: outrages, forced sterilizations, inadequate health services, disregard for their traditional language and clothing'. The respondents' experience of upward social mobility is not only related to acquiring a better level of education and the transformation of class and ethnic identities; it is also related to how the role of men and women are perceived and the way in which the current generation of Mapuche people

have different interactions and practices from the past generation. However, when most respondents narrated their experience of upward social mobility gender aspects were not emphasised. This is despite significant gender inequalities in Chile. According to the CADEM Survey (2017) 61% of people suggest that Chile is a very sexist society. Around 4 out of 10 women declare that they suffered from harassment and 36% of women declare they suffered discrimination in their jobs. Moreover, according to the National Statistics Institute (INE) (2016) the income gap between men and women in 2016 was around 31.7%, making Chile the Latin-American country with the second biggest income gap. Yet for most the sample, there was no clear connection made in the interviews between upward social mobility, class and ethnic identities and gender issues.

However, with a few women from the 're-signifiers' group something different happened. These few women had a rather different narrative related to their reconstruction of their class, ethnic and gender identities. This difference is only found in this subgroup, perhaps because the 're-signifiers' were more aware of their process of ethnic identification, which they had explicitly reclaimed. The re-signifiers consciously made a change in their lives in order to be closer to Mapuche culture (this process will be discussed in Chapter Six), and they were consequently more reflexive about their identifications. The men in this group only associated their process of identification in class and ethnic terms and not with gender. It seems that being a man in Chilean society is synonymous with privilege, therefore most of them were not questioning of their gender role in society. When I asked about the role of men and women in Chilean society, these men recognized that women are in a less privileged position and acknowledged that while there have been improvements, there is still continuing inequality for women. However, they did not integrate this discourse into other parts of the interview.

Only one person gave an account of gender discrimination – compared to the widespread accounts of class and ethnic discrimination from the sample. It was only in the case of Paulina where the intersectionality of gender and ethnicity appeared. Paulina, from the 'mobile accommodators' group, was the only one who explicitly

described gender discrimination in her job, when her colleagues teased her for being a woman and Mapuche:

In my job there are almost only men, so I felt different, because I am a woman and Mapuche, so that was too much.

Did they (colleagues) make differences in the job because you are a woman? Eh yes, eh at the beginning, they got into my life, like my personal life, eh more or less, my sentimental life. I do not know, I felt uncomfortable, it was like, I am Mapuche and a woman...there were other women in my job, Spanish, from many places, and I felt a little different, maybe they went through this process before, but as I was new, I had to face that (Paulina, IT engineer, 26, mobile accommodators).

Paulina identified feeling discomfort in her job, because her colleagues put boundaries up because she is Mapuche and a woman. She never used the word discrimination, but on many occasions, she repeated that she felt different, weird, or unwelcome in her job.

Byrne's (2003b) discussion of narrative representations of the self identifies different kind of narratives when people tell stories about their lives. Byrne suggests that 'the notion of sameness, depends on the positionality of people, in terms of race, class and gender' (Byrne, 2003b; 29). This point is important, because most of the respondents constructed their narratives and their positionality in terms of class and ethnicity, with few considering gender as a factor for change in their mobility stories. The sample's gender position and identities were perhaps more 'naturalised' and normalised than their class and ethnic identities. The exceptions were the cases of Ana and Loreta from the 're-signifiers group'. Ana described very precisely her process of ethnic identification, and how she changed her perspective about Mapuche culture and gender. In her narrative, she made an affirmation about her emancipation saying that her search for ethnic identity was not related to a man: 'To be Mapuche I do not need a man'. Loreta explained that her upward mobility changed her attitude around gender and ethnic issues, saying: '[university] helped me to see other problematic areas that I was interested in and I could see them clearly and these are the gender and Mapuche perspectives'. In these two quotes it is possible to see narratives in which the

construction of the self reflects ruptures of identities related to class, ethnicity and gender.

The aim in the first half of this chapter section was to introduce the common challenges that respondents experienced due to their upward social mobility. Two of the most common challenges that all respondents referred to were experiences of feeling like a 'fish out of water'. All reported the experience of not fitting into their new social settings but some also now felt out of place in their old social settings, which we can see as habitus clivé (or the torn habitus) (Bourdieu, 2000), in which people feel out of place in both their places of origin and destination, and so never really 'fit in' anywhere). This sense of dislocation was associated with managing class and indigenous identities in the context of social mobility, but also with different migration experiences. However, whilst everyone in the sample experienced some sense of social dislocation as a result of their social mobility, they managed the process differently. I now turn to examine these varying responses in greater detail.

As I have previously argued, in this chapter I focus on the two groups in the sample who emphasized and renegotiated their class identities during their process of social mobility. The 'mobile accommodators' are a group who identified as being middle-class, and in the process of accommodating to their new status distanced themselves from their formative (working-class) identity as well as also distancing themselves from their Mapuche identity. The second group, the 'rooted', are a group of respondents who still maintained a strong sense of their working-class identity, despite their experience of upward mobility.

## 5.3 Moving up and fitting in - mobile accommodators

In this section, I focus on the 'mobile accommodators' whose response to social mobility was to adapt to the dominant social characteristics of their new social position, resulting in an assimilation of their new middle-class position and a downplaying or distancing from their Mapuche identity. The 'mobile accommodators' (15 respondents) are a group

who expressed their experiences of upward social mobility through stories of moving up and 'fitting in', in narratives of cultural assimilation into the middle-class. We can also see these narratives as expressing ambivalent identities (Savage et al, 2001), in the sense that they still sometimes hesitated about their class identity and did not always easily position themselves in particular social class categories. In other words, respondents tried to adapt to their new middle-class position and considered their Mapuche identities were less significant, or even a hindrance in their new social position.

### 5.3.1 Strategies to 'fit in'

As previously argued, most of the respondents from this research experienced their social mobility as a transition which created challenges of 'fitting in' with either their old or new class positions (or both). In university and in professional contexts, they had to navigate a different set of circumstances where Mapuche people were very much in the minority, and often marked out as unusual in those contexts. In the case of the respondents from the group of 'mobile accommodators' most tried to 'fit in' with their new middle-class position.

Take the case of Enrique, who, in another part of the interview, explained the strict profile that students of odontology had to follow (how to speak, what to wear and how to behave), in order to belong, and how he had to adapt to his new middle-class context:

The mass absorbs you, obviously you're going to adapt to the situation that you're in, the way that I had to develop myself, and how I had to get on. On the contrary, if I had not adapted, the doctors would not see that I was appropriate; I would be out of the loop (...) I realised how the situation was and I adapted: I mean, I did not put my dream of being a dentist at risk for the stupidity of going against the trend, are you crazy! That happens to people who go against the system. I mean, the three or four idiots who are going against the system, they do not change anything, ever. The alternatives are to spend your life frustrated, trying to change something that you won't achieve or you adapt and you are happy. I adapted, and I am happy (Enrique, Dentist, 33).

Enrique felt that he had not developed adequate cultural knowledge due to his working-class origins. For example, when he started university, he did not know some of the courses that his classmates had completed when they were at high school. For him, it was very difficult to learn English because he had not taken this course before, yet his upper-class classmates knew more than three languages. Enrique adapted in many ways: he had to learn English, he started to speak differently, and he had to study more than his classmates to reach their level. Therefore, he modified his habitus in order to achieve the profile that his new context required. He validated his position around integration into Chilean society.

However, the process of 'fitting in' could result in difficulties for the mobile accommodators as they had to employ several strategies in order to attain middle-class profiles and sometimes, despite these strategies, they still felt that they did not really 'fit' into their new social context. So, whilst Enrique was able to adapt to his new middle-class context, some of the respondents despite their attempts at 'fitting in' could still feel like a 'fish out of water'. For example, there is Sofia, who attended two universities. At the first university she studied engineering, but she felt she could not fit in there and so she moved to another university in order to study to become a primary school teacher. At the first university, she felt like a 'fish out of water' because it was a big cultural shock for her, which was one of the reasons for her university change. However before moving to the second university she lost weight in order to 'fit in':

Good, good experiences, I learnt so much. I got to know many people, and it was fun. I had a good time! Very good, nothing to say, it was the opposite of the first university. Here [second university] I enjoyed myself; I liked to go to university. Can I say something? Because I do not know if it is related, I experienced something else when I was at the university... if you are ok with me saying it?

#### Yes!

Ok, for example I lost weight - a lot - so when I went to the second university I had another disposition! When I attended the first university, I felt like an outsider in everything, and when I attended the second university I said, 'here I will trust'. I had another perspective and another aptitude for university, and also people were totally different, there was a variety of people, of tastes, interests, with different

hair colours, each with their own style, there were also people wearing fur coats [before the interview she referred to people from her first university wearing the same kind of expensive clothing], but it looks different because there were a lot of different people, at the first university all of them were wearing furs, so that was it (...) you arrived and they received you in another way (Sofia, Teacher, 33).

Here there is an intersection between gender and class, in the sense that in the Chilean context people tend to associate success with people who have a slim physical appearance. According to Polizzi (2014) physical appearance has a social function in Chile which allows the possibility of attaining better jobs and access to a specific social context. Moreover, according to Arreguin et al. (2016) women are under more pressure to have an ideal physical appearance, which provokes anxiety. Sofia lost weight as a strategy to modify her profile, in order to 'fit in' more easily with her new middle-class context. Sofia's quote shows how the inclination of respondents may change, depending on the social field that they are involved in, and how they want to identify, or not, with a particular context. According to Bourdieu (Lamaison, 1986), strategies are a key point in the relation between agency and structure, because through strategies it is possible to find the balance of habitus. In this regard, Sofia indicates that she applied strategies in order to not feel like an outsider again at the second university, and for her, changing her appearance was the best strategy to modify her habitus. The case of Laura is similar to Sofia, because both had a cultural shock on entering university, the difference is that Laura attended an elite university in Santiago where social differences were more notorious, therefore the cultural shock was bigger than for Sofia:

When I entered university, for me all were blond and posh, it was the first impression, but most of them were very posh and it was very shocking, the fact that I had to share with them, because I said 'what do I have in common with them?', I am not going to say, 'hello, how are you?' they would say 'I went to ski and you?' and I did not haha, in fact that happened to me a few times, for that reason I felt uncomfortable (...) the first day of class, we had to pray, so we had to stand up and pray, there I said 'what is going on here, it seemed that everyone prayed and I was afraid of seeing just blond people, because I had a problem with that, I discriminate against upper-class people, so that was the only bad thing in university, but in the end I found a group of friends like me (Laura, Journalist, 33).

Laura was expecting to see differences between her classmates in terms of class, but she still felt uncomfortable and out of place in this new social context. Here Laura did not mention strategies to integrate with her upper-class classmates, on the contrary she tried to avoid them and found a group of friends similar to her. Moreover, she did not expect a difference in religious terms. Here we can see that in attending an elite university some cultural values, in this case related to religion, were expected and imposed with a failure to respect different beliefs, as in those of Mapuche culture or other kinds of religion. Here, university did not represent an inclusive place and the imposition of values can be understood as a colonist strategy making other cultures like the Mapuche marginalized and invisible.

The majority of respondents from the mobile accommodators group had experiences of discrimination in their new social environments; however, they did not always frame this as discrimination. Members of the 'mobile accommodators' from the countryside spoke more readily of discrimination in their childhood, but in their adult lives said that they did not experience discrimination. Some mobile accommodators framed discrimination at work as a question of making sure they fitted in, establishing their 'normalcy' in their new destinations. Take the example of Luisa, who is from the countryside and moved to Santiago in order to find better job opportunities.

I have a good relationship with my colleagues. Obviously, you can find all kinds of people at work - bad colleagues, good colleagues - but for example they have not said anything bad to me or looked at me differently for being Mapuche, never. Maybe they said 'ahh that (being Mapuche) is good'; there were people who told me 'oh it is so nice that you are Mapuche' and I said, 'it is normal', 'I am normal like you', they almost looked at me as I if I was part of a museum. I feel normal, but I never feel discrimination here at work (Luisa, Accountant, 27).

Luisa denied having been discriminated against in her work context, even though her account indicates her colleagues highlighted her ethnicity and expressed othering statements about the Mapuche. However, Luisa used narratives such as 'being normal', being the same', and 'I am capable' in a defensive way to show that she was an equal in

her social context, despite discrimination. Respondents in the mobile accommodators group framed their experiences of discrimination as the basis for their strategy for integrating into their new class position and mestiza Chilean society. We have already seen an example of this in the case of Paulina considered earlier, who suffered discrimination in her job, and who also used the words "normal" and "the same" as a defence against the distinction that her colleagues made about her as a professional Mapuche woman:

### What is your opinion about the Mapuche professionals of today?

Mapuche professionals? About that... it should not be something different, because we are the same, we do not have many differences. I mean now [after her experience of discrimination] I feel different for being Mapuche and for being a woman [because she moved to Santiago for a new job], but I do not know if other people experienced the same (Paulina, 26, IT engineer).

In contrast with the case of Luisa, who denied experiences of discrimination, Paulina felt different when people knew that she was Mapuche. Her claim of being 'normal' was her defensive reaction to the patronising way that their colleagues treated her. In the accounts of the mobile accommodators there were repeated references to "being one of them", "being normal" and "being part of society", and it seems that integration into a professional environment played an important role for this group of respondents. However, their experiences of discrimination show the symbolic barriers that they had to face in being a professional Mapuche person, and the tensions of managing 'being middle-class' whilst also being Mapuche.

#### 5.3.2 Ambivalent narratives

Some of the respondents expressed ambivalent narratives when they had to position themselves within the social structure. So far, I have argued that the experience of social mobility changed the mobile accommodators' inclination towards their class identities and that respondents from this group started to adjust their lives to the new social contexts, in order to fit in with their new middle-class position. In this sense, they took on more middle-class identities. However, the respondents' accounts also expressed

ambivalence in talking about class and we can see forms of class dis-identification when they described their class position. Take Victor's quote for instance; where an ambivalent narrative is related to dis-identification from class categories:

I do not think that social condition is an issue, I think that firstly we are people; the social condition does not matter, I mean I am not going to say 'hey, I attended university and my salary is this' it is not necessary, for what? I do not understand why we have to divide societies...but, as a person, I am not going to say, 'I am middle-class or upper class or poor' for what? (Victor, Accountant, 28).

Savage et al (2001) indicate that people sometimes use narratives of being 'ordinary' or 'normal' and engage in class dis-identification when class labels are stigmatised or loaded with questions of moral evaluation. We can see this in Victor's account. To complicate Savage et al's analysis, however, the mobile accommodators not only dis-identified in terms of class, but also dis-identified from their indigenous identity, in part because they felt conflict between their old and new class and ethnic positions. An example is Enrique, who experienced both short range migration and long range social mobility, and who indicated that he had adjusted to his new situation in a way other Mapuche could not. Enrique therefore presented identity distance from a negative characterisation of other Mapuche people:

#### When you moved to Temuco, was it difficult for you to have new friends?

No, to be honest, it was not difficult to have new friends, but I think it is because of my personality, the way I am, because I realised that when I saw other classmates, they were much more withdrawn. In fact, I realise that about Mapuche people. Now they are my patients, they are much more withdrawn, slower. But, I think that is because they are used to living in a different way. Obviously when they go from a town to a city, they are sometimes faced with another system, another time, everything has to be fast. We all have goals to reach and we have to finish fast, and they live in a slower way. For that reason, I think they are slow, but they are much shyer, and I saw my classmates who were much shyer than me, so it was hard for them to make friends; but for me it was not hard (Enrique, dentist, 27).

Enrique saw himself as different from other Mapuche, distancing himself from a stigmatised understanding of Mapuche identities. He set out his social network and personality as more suitable to the way that people lived in the cities and opposed to the ways of other Mapuche people. Another example is the case of Manuel, who experienced long range migration and long range social mobility, and who emphasized of professional Mapuche to 'be an example' to people in rural communities, and thus also his distance from them:

# What is your opinion about being a Mapuche professional? Do you think that it gives you a kind of responsibility?

Yes, I think that you have to have a responsibility...a kind of responsibility In what sense?

With regards to...to try to carry out the culture. I feel that I am not very responsible in that sense, but...I believe that you have to be responsible for that. I believe that above all, people who...are living in communities [people from the countryside] and move to be professionals, they are an example to others...and they have to...you always have to search for success in a certain way (Manuel, 26, nurse).

Manuel indicated that he did not know much about Mapuche culture which may also be part of why he did not feel a part of this group. Most respondents from the 'mobile accommodators' group shared common characteristics. For example, they all had experienced difficult mobility trajectories, had undergone long-range migration and shared a lack of knowledge about Mapuche culture. As a consequence, it is perhaps unsurprising that the respondents did not express a strong sense of Mapuche identity, despite the fact that they saw themselves identified as Mapuche by others. In their new social environments, the mobile accommodators felt that they had to manage or downplay both their class origins and their ethnic identity. The mobile accommodators' reaction to their mobility therefore had a number of consequences for their identity claims. Firstly, they adopted strategies to 'fit in' in with their new middle-class position. Secondly, their narratives emphasised meritocratic achievement, naturalising their upward mobility. Thirdly, most of the respondents identified as being middle-class, and distanced themselves from aspects of both their class origin and indigenous identity,

sometimes also presenting ambivalent narratives about these. For example, we have the case of Enrique, who distanced himself when he spoke about Mapuche people, or the case of Manuel who spoke about the responsibility of Mapuche people living in the countryside as different from his own responsibility, or the case of Luisa who denied the experience of discrimination, but who felt she had to stress that she was 'normal' in order to adjust to her new social context, distancing herself from her Mapuche identity.

For the mobile accommodators their social mobility also meant a 'distance travelled' from their social origins in terms of their identity claims. But this was just one response to social mobility in the sample. In the next section, I introduce the 'rooted' group, who share some of the same background characteristics as the 'mobile accommodators', such as living in the countryside when they were young, experiencing discrimination during their childhood, as well as undertaking migration as part of their mobility. However, while the 'mobile accommodators' tended to 'fit in' with their new social context, the 'rooted' group's response to their mobility was quite different, as they adopted strategies to maintain a sense of 'fitting in' with their social origin group, both in terms of class origin and Mapuche origin. For this group, negotiating their mobility meant adopting strategies, and identity claims, in order to 'stay true' to their roots.

### 5.4 Staying true to your roots

The 'rooted', are a group of respondents who, despite their experience of upward mobility, still maintained a strong sense of their working-class identity. This group's attendance at university also helped them move towards a continued but strengthened sense of their Mapuche identity, in part because they framed their social mobility as staying 'true' to their origins and using their new position to help their Mapuche communities.

The 'rooted' group is comprised of respondents who, in response to their upward social mobility, adopted strategies to still try to 'fit in' with their social origins, in terms of both Mapuche and class origin. Like the mobile accommodators, this group experienced tensions between their social origin and social destination, but managed these tensions differently, by distancing themselves from middle-class assimilation, instead reinforcing the idea that they had really not changed their class identities and had also remained loyal to their Mapuche heritage. This was partly because middle-class assimilation was also seen as deracination – becoming mestiza. In other words, the rooted dis-identified from a middle-class identity in order to maintain a claim to 'authentic' working-class and Mapuche identities. There are seven respondents from this group, mainly men. Most of the respondents experienced short range geographical mobility. All are from the countryside, but moved to Temuco or other small towns successively, in order to increase their educational opportunities, e.g. by attending university. These respondents grew up in a traditional Mapuche social context compared to other respondents in the research, and their attendance at university was a remarkable event in their lives and those of their families, and their cultural, economic and social capital displayed a significant change. But most of them also maintained strong connections to their communities of origin, living relatively close to their rural origins or working in jobs connected to the Mapuche community (as agricultural engineer, teachers, social worker etc). So, they also had to actively manage the tensions that their mobility created with these older connections. In their negotiation of mobility, we can see the intersectional nature of identity, as the tensions of their new middle-class position meant that the 'rooted' expressed a strong sense of Mapuche identity, but partly as a strategy to still 'fit in' with their social origin class.

#### 5.4.1 Dis-identification with the (white) Chilean middle-class

Despite, or perhaps because of, their mobility, respondents from this group tended to identify as being working-class and strengthened their Mapuche identities. There were several reasons why respondents did not identify with their new class position. One

reason was that the respondents in this group had always been more conscious of their Mapuche identity and working-class background since childhood, because of the ethnic and socioeconomic discrimination they suffered during primary and secondary school. For the 'rooted' group, experiences of discrimination had started earlier in their lives compared with the other groups. Take the case of Eduardo, who was born in the countryside, and then moved to Temuco for his schooling. He worked in Temuco during the week and returned to his rural area during the weekends. Eduardo's experience of discrimination due to his Mapuche heritage made him feel ostracised, with a culture shock when he first moved to a new town:

I am from a countryside school, where there is no distinction between Mapuche and another type of person, whereas in the city there is a distinction. As I had good marks I went into an elite class...so everything was different. I arrived from the countryside, shyer, quieter, and my classmates segregated me sometimes. Or maybe they said things like "that black who is there' or things like that...then I felt discrimination from my classmates...when the teacher took attendance, I was the only one with a different surname, which sounds different with an 'ao' (sound), 'ao' that was mine! Everyone has a surname which finishes in er or ir... I don't know... as normal. And my surname was the only one that sounded different, so then I felt different (Eduardo, Secondary teacher, 30).

Eduardo's ethnic identification was shaped by discrimination and exclusion, and such experiences seemed to provoke in respondents a more explicit sense of being working-class and with an indigenous identification.

Another reason why the rooted group did not identify with their new class position was because they felt they did not' fit in' in with their new middle-class position. Take the example of Maria, who felt excluded from her colleagues and their lifestyle:

[At work] I did not feel comfortable and it has to come down to two factors. One is the status of professions [as a social worker she did not have the same status as doctors where she worked] and the other is the social circle or places that they [her colleagues] used to go to. I noticed very much (...) for example in the conversations

they had and sometimes I said, 'oh my god' haha, because I did not know... if someone celebrated her birthday, for example in a very exclusive club, that I did not know, the others said 'ay, I can't believe it! And how is this so? I mean I had to celebrate my birthday there! And it had to be there, you know? 'How much?' So, I said 'luckily, I celebrated my birthday!', But I realised that they strengthened in that aspect, and I did not fit in there (Maria, social worker, 44).

Reay, Crozier & Clayton (2009) note the disquiet, ambivalence and insecurity that can come from habitus/field dissonances, and this was a theme in the rooted group's accounts of their move into middle-class environments, where individuals felt 'out of place'. But the field crossing was not just into middle-class environments but also ethnically white ones, and the rooted's experience of hysteresis (Bourdieu, 200) was also along lines of ethnicity. This was the case for Patricio, who referred to his rural, indigenous origins to explain why he did not 'fit in':

#### Can you tell me about the classmates that made you feel unwelcome?

Yes, because in the first year of university, that happened. They already had a study group, and they had their parties. Therefore, they knew that I was from the community [the countryside], they knew that I was not participating. As they knew that, one person told a joke 'well, you cannot go, because'...I do not remember the context, but I felt very bad. He excluded me immediately from his group (...) I was not fitting in. So, he knew that, for example, if we were going to a party, we were not talking about the same things. In that period, it was harder for me than it is now (Patricio, Agronomist, 39).

The 'rooted' group reacted to 'not fitting in' to their new fields through a process of disidentification, much like the 'mobile accommodators'. However, this dis-identification process occurred in the opposite direction. Instead of dis-identifying from their working-class and Mapuche heritage as happened with the mobile accommodators, the rooted group instead resisted adopting a middle-class identity. This was partly because for them middle-classness implied white assimilation and class superiority. So, the 'rooted' group dis-identified with the idea that they had assimilated into the white/mestiza Chilean middle-class. One way to resist the middle-class identity that made them feel uncomfortable was by strengthening their Mapuche identities, for example, by learning

Mapudungun, or attending Mapuche groups, when they attended university or after. In this way, they demonstrated that they had not abandoned their Mapuche identities. Patricio, for example, said that higher education changed the way in which he perceived his Mapuche identity:

### Did you change when you arrived at university?

Ehh yes, despite the fact that I do not speak the language [Mapudungun]... the fact that I am from a Mapuche community; we have a different voice tone. I mean, in the university period I lost everything, the few words that I knew in Mapudungun were the product of spending time with my classmates.... Coincidentally my three brothers and sisters, who attended university, were more interested in the topic (recovering their culture). Because my oldest brother went to work in Santiago and my other brother is living in Temuco, they are under another system. In fact, his participation in the guillatunes [Mapuche rituals] is very low. The brothers and sisters who finished university, in some way valued the cultural topic much more...and I think, the fact that we experienced many things in our lives, it helped us to say that in some way it is our duty to get the cultural topic back (Patricio, Agronomist, 39).

Patricio's quote shows the respondents in this group perceived there was a danger of losing their Mapuche identities. University represented a threat of assimilation into the white middle-class. But in fact, attendance at university, where this danger was keenly felt, was crucial for the rooted group to reemphasise their Mapuche identity. Here, it is possible to see how the respondents renegotiated their identities in relation to the tensions of new social environment by reemphasising their social origins. This was not just a process of reinforcing their indigenous identities but also maintaining their sense of being true to their working-class origins. The rooted group all identified with the working-class. Take the case of Eduardo, who stressed his class origin as being a decisive aspect of his identity:

Yes! I consider myself to be working-class. I am never going to be upper class, even if I have a lot of money...I do not like this kind of classification, because how do you calculate the upper class? Because of financial terms? Because of the way that people are? For their values? Therefore, what happens when a poor person wins

the lottery? I think they will never be upper class. So then, why? Maybe because of their cultural history, their personal story, their family story, their network (...) I always say I am Mapuche; I am from a Mapuche community, from the countryside. I think that is my... I do not know... if I consider it my label, but I consider myself like that. It is where I emerged, I am emerging. I was always from there, and will always be from there (Eduardo, Teacher, 30).

Eduardo displayed class dis-identification from his middle-class position, and his identification with his working-class origins was also bound up with a strong ethnic identification. The respondents in this group did not want to claim middle-class identities, so they sought ways to maintain their sense of an authentic working-class identity. According to Bennett (2015) people claim authenticity to give a sense of continuity to their lives and their position in society. In that sense, Eduardo tried to connect to his working-class heritage, identifying with the working-class and as a Mapuche person, in order to bring a sense of continuity with his past and present social identities. However also common to this group was the sense of wanting to avoid the notion that they had 'sold out' or abandoned their past communities and prior identities. This was partly because they were still connected to these communities, living in Temuco or small towns closer to their rural communities in Araucaria, visiting the countryside during the weekend, or with their work related to Mapuche communities. Because of this they felt tensions about their mobility not just in their new social contexts but also in their old ones. So, another strategy that the 'rooted' group used to dis-identify from the middle-class entailed downplaying their experience of social mobility in order to not be 'out of place' in Mapuche culture. Take the example of Teodoro, who was born in the countryside and moved to Temuco in order to attend university. He felt the need to downplay his social mobility when he returned to his formative social context:

Four months ago, a person from another community died, an old lady, she was 100-years-old or more according to others...and I went normally dressed, in the same way that I would in the countryside and unlike when I go to work. I went to buy food, as you cannot go without bringing something to a Mapuche funeral. I bought rice, pasta, cheese, things for the family, bread, wine. There were a lot of people and I arrived with my uncles and some of them looked me and started to whisper.

They said 'hey, he is the son of...'. So, I realised, and I said hello as usual and gave my condolences. I said hello as always, and we started to talk, and they asked me if I was teacher and I said yes in as normal a way as possible. Therefore, the elderlies realised that 'he attended university, he is a teacher, he is working at a university, but he is still the same', above all, in a context where they stopped talking in Mapudungun and I arrived talking in Mapudungun, telling jokes (...). So, I arrived as always, I was, as humble as possible, I did not arrive without anything and I was also talking in Mapudungun. I mean I never felt like I was in an exclusion situation, quite the opposite (Teodoro, History teacher, 25).

Teodoro felt he had to cover/manage many aspects of his middle-class profile, in order to be accepted by his old Mapuche and working-class social contacts. He tried to demonstrate that he did not have a privileged position, and did not feel superior, and for that reason he explicitly embodied a 'humble' Mapuche and working-class habitus. In the community where Teodoro lived, he occupied a high status and privilege, but he worked to make sure this did not have a negative influence on his encounters in his formative social context. For that reason, Teodoro tried to minimise the symbolic and cultural capital that his educational trajectory had created in him.

Respondents from the rooted group had narratives strongly related to Mapuche culture, because they grew up in a traditional Mapuche social context and remained closely connected to those communities. The experience of mobility therefore had to be negotiated within these communities, as respondents tried to resist the notion that mobility was incompatible with their Mapuche identities. Take Jose, who was keen to show that social mobility and affluence were consistent with a Mapuche identity by evoking the pre-colonial wealth of Mapuche culture. He insisted that mobility did not mean becoming 'ahuinqueo', a Mapuche word which means non-Mapuche, but in this context meant becoming Chilean, white and upper class.

I do not feel different from when we were Mapuche in the past...I am convinced that we were a very rich society, with abundance, luxury, social events and it is documented. We were extremely rich...and our jewels, our formal outfits, our manners, our Mapudungun show that, all these things say that we were an extremely rich society. I do not feel that I am an 'ahuinqueo' [ie non-Mapuche, or becoming Chilean, white and upper class] I do not see myself like that. I see that

finally we can feel like our ancestors. That perspective of social climbing is very interesting, because it is an antidote to not being 'ahuinquis', because in the end, you do not say, I want to be like the white person. This is related to becoming more Mapuche and recovering the Mapuche practices, protocol and the respect among the Mapuche (...) there are values of a society with high powers. So, when I talk with others I said, 'the possibility of transcending in economic and professional terms, is not a transcendence of being 'huincas', it is a transcendency to recover the heritage', recover the prestige of our ancestors, before we were like that, before they (the Spanish-Chilean) transformed us (Jose, journalist, 40).

The respondents deployed a sense of Mapuche authenticity as part of a dis-identification with the white middle-class. Reay (2005) suggests that authenticity is classed, and for working-class students in her British study 'authenticity most often meant being able to hold onto a self which is rooted in a working-class past' (Reay, 2005: 404). But in my own study, the respondents associated class and ethnicity when they referred to authenticity. In that sense, the negative connotations of middle-classness were bound up with not being Mapuche, and it seems that the sample feared jeopardising their Mapuche identity by becoming socially mobile and they resisted this in various ways. Some asserted their authentic connection with their working-class origins or reemphasised their Mapuche culture— in both strategies claiming that nothing really important had changed with their upward mobility. Jose, by contrast, insisted that being middle class did not mean being 'huinca', though it is also possible to see that Jose appealed to the 'traditional Mapuche status and identity' in order to justify his new middle-class identity.

#### 5.5 Conclusion

In this chapter I have shown whilst all the respondents had the experience of social dislocation (habitus/field disjuncture or feeling like a 'fish out of water' in Bourdieusian terms) during the course of their social mobility transitions, this was not only in relation to their class positioning but also with regards to their indigenous identity. As a result, the sample deployed several different kinds of strategies in order to negotiate their mobility transitions and 'fit in', In this chapter, I have explored two subgroups of respondents: the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted'. Despite a common experience of upward social mobility these two groups displayed very different ways of negotiating their class and ethnic identities. The 'mobile accommodators' identified as middle-class, taking distance from their Mapuche background, whereas the 'rooted' identified with their working-class origins, as a way to distance themselves from their new class position and to be closer to their Mapuche heritage. All of these respondents faced dilemmas related to how their mobility created tensions across their social origins and social destinations. Both groups presented ambivalent narratives in terms of both their class and indigenous identities. And in both groups, respondents used strategies to 'fit in' - but facing in different directions, with the mobile accommodators renegotiating their identities to fit into their new-middle-class social context, whilst the rooted sought to 'fit in' with their old working-class and Mapuche social context.

In Bourdieu's account, when the taken-for-granted assumptions of the habitus do not match up with the taken-for-granted assumptions organising the field, people feel like a 'fish out of water' (Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992: 127). This 'hysteresis effect' that occurs when an individual's habitus is not adjusted to an unfamiliar field means that people often feel unsure of how to act, lack an instinctive 'sense' of the right way to behave and more generally feel out of place. All of the sample spoke of their mobility creating such experiences, but this was not just on the basis of class, as people from working-class backgrounds entering middle-class professional environments, but also on

the basis of ethnicity, as Mapuche entering ethnically 'white' environments. The complex negotiations of class and ethnic identities demonstrated by my sample mean that it is not sufficient to draw on the Bourdieusian concept of 'fish out of water' and his cultural perspective on the match (or mismatch) between class habitus and field as a way of analyzing social position and belonging. The experiences of my sample show that the concept of habitus/field disjuncture and the experiencing of feeling a 'fish out of water' operates not just in class terms, but also in terms of indigenous ethnic positioning and identity. So, to fully understand the experiences of my Mapuche participants, we also need to add an intersectional perspective which examines how class, ethnic and gender relations connect with and complicate each other.

Friedman (2016) suggests that different identity responses relate to how social mobility affects the emotional life of individuals. He deploys the Bourdieu concept of 'habitus clivé' (the 'torn' habitus) to explain such processes, with a torn habitus occurring when socially mobile people feel out of place in both their social origin and social destination, not fully fitting in with the social group they have joined, but also feeling out of place with the group they have left. Friedman argues this means people never feel 'at home' anywhere and so they often feel they have to perform being 'authentic'. We can see this in the case of the 'rooted' group in my sample for example. But their situation is complicated by their experience of ethnicity and also by their experience of migration. Friedman argues that people who experience short-range social mobility adapt better to their new social context, because their transition is more gradual, whilst those who undergo long-range social mobility experience more problems, because they have to deal with feelings of insecurity and inferiority in their new social contexts as well feelings of abandonment and guilt in relation to their old social contexts. However, for the 'rooted' group their experience of mobility had not moved them geographically very far from their old class and indigenous communities, and it was their continued connections with these communities that contributed to habitus clivé and their identity renegotiations. The sample's migration experiences were also related to their class and ethnic transitions, and the question of the 'distance' travelled was for some also the distance (or not) between rural and urban social locations.

In the next chapter, I focus the analysis on the 're-signifiers' group and their process of ethnic identification from a new middle-class position. The 'rooted' and 're-signifier' groups have something in common in that they both sought to reinforce their Mapuche identities, despite the fact that both groups took rather different mobility paths. It would appear that both groups adopted similar strategies to strengthen their indigenous identities in response to tensions created by their mobility. However, the 're-signifiers' expressed their identity renegotiations in a politicisation of their indigenous identities, much more so than the 'rooted'.

### **Chapter 6: The re-signifiers: the politicization of Mapuche identities**

#### **6.1** Introduction

In the previous chapters I have shown that the stigmatisation of Mapuche identity and culture in Chile creates tensions between being both 'middle-class' and Mapuche, which all my socially mobile participants experienced and negotiated in various ways. However, despite this process of colonisation, the re-signifiers group reclaimed and politicised their Mapuche identity. This is of particular note, as the re-signifiers group were initially the most detached from Mapuche culture, as they grew up in urban 'mestiza' environments, with very limited contact with Mapuche communities or practices. However, it was this group of participants who reconstructed their ethnic identity after their experience of social mobility, and who started to politicise their Mapuche identities. This is consistent with Hall's (1996) work, which is opposed to a notion of identity as essential, and suggests that people's remade ethnicities are produced through ongoing identity work.

The previous chapter explored how, for the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted' groups, their class identities became their dominant identities. I now turn to analyse how, for the re-signifiers group (comprising 18 members of the sample), their indigenous identities became their dominant identities. This chapter continues to consider the consequences of upward mobility for the respondents, with a particular focus on questions of identity and the need to manage the experience of transition. In the case of re-signifiers group, I answer the question of why moving between their social origin and social destination was a particular challenge in terms of class and ethnic identities and examine why they claimed politicised Mapuche identities after experiencing upward mobility. Specifically, I address how this issue arose during their time at university and later at work, with their experiences there shaping a renewed sense of group identity which decisively affected their identity claims.

In terms of class identification, half of the re-signifiers felt that they were middle-class because of their level of education, whereas the other half identified as working class, because of their economic situation. However, they did not make strong class identity claims compared to their ethnic identity claims. According to Hall (1996) identities are often contradictory and should not be understood as coherent and unified. I argue that the members of the re-signifiers group experienced a conflict or dilemma regarding their class identities, as they found it difficult to locate themselves in a specific class identity without experiencing ambivalence or an awareness of the negative connotations of class (particularly middle-class) labels for their ethnic identity. As Savage et al. (2001) note people often tend to hesitate about naming their class identities, with a reluctance to position themselves in particular social class categories. However, as I have previously argued, for my sample class hesitation was linked to ethnic identity and its construction. For many there were tensions between being both Mapuche and middle-class. We have considered some different responses to this tension in Chapters Four and Five, in subgroups who variously downplayed their ethnic identity (the mobile accommodators) or downplayed their mobility emphasising the continuity of their class and ethnic identities (the rooted). The re-signifiers show a different kind of response, adopting a renewed and politicised sense of their indigenous identity, but we can see this as not just as a response to a sense of guilt or tension about their upward social mobility, as – unlike the rooted - these respondents tended to hesitate about both their class and indigenous identities.

These hesitations were partly because the re-signifiers group did not grow up in a social context close to Mapuche culture. On the contrary, their parents had decided to not teach them about the Mapuche language or cultural heritage (partly as a cultural assimilation response to ethnic discrimination). That situation changed when the resignifiers went to university, when they started to learn more about Mapuche culture and began to identify more explicitly as Mapuche. According to Zapata and Oliva (2011) it is important to distinguish between people who affiliate to a group or society and

people who only have lineage with the group. Whilst people may have Mapuche lineage (a relationship with the group through, for example, having a Mapuche surname) they may not feel a strong identification, whereas people who affiliate to a group have a stronger social commitment (through for example actively claiming their Mapuche heritage and working for the benefit of Mapuche society). In that sense, I argue that when the re-signifiers group started higher education, they already recognised their Mapuche lineage but it was not a very strong feature of their social identity, and it was only during university that they began to affiliate to Mapuche culture, developing a stronger sense of being Mapuche and also developing a commitment to reducing the inequalities and discrimination faced by the Mapuche in Chile. This process, in which the re-signifiers started to develop more elaborated Mapuche identities, required an active range of strategies (using the Mapuche language, visiting Mapuche land, participating in Mapuche social and political groups and learning about the culture) in order for the resignifiers, as urban Mapuche professionals, to be able to claim an 'authentic' Mapuche identity. In Bourdieusian terms, respondents initially had the experience of feeling like a 'fish out of water' with regards to traditional or 'authentic' Mapuche social contexts and so they deployed strategies to 'fit in'.

The main question explored in Chapter Six, is what was it about this group's experience of social mobility that prompted this 'resignification' of their identity? The answer, I argue, rests in the tensions between being both Mapuche and middle-class in Chilean society, a tension experienced by all the sample, but which caused particular problems for this group because of their initial distance from Mapuche identity and culture, which meant they experienced difficulties in claiming 'authenticity' with respect to both their class and ethnic identification. The re-signifiers tended to dis-identify from being middle-class, because for them middle-classness implied assimilation into the white Chilean middle-class. I argue that the 're-signifiers' felt moving to a middle-class identification compromised their claims to Mapuche identities, and they saw being middle-class and Mapuche as incompatible.

Most of the re-signifiers did not experience migration (15 out of 18) with the majority from Santiago (15). They did not grow up in a Mapuche cultural context, which is associated with rural areas of Chile. However, when they attended university, they began the process of adopting Mapuche culture. I will show that in that process they frequently struggled to be recognised as Mapuche by both Mapuche people and white Chileans. Sometimes the re-signifiers were seen to lack legitimacy by Mapuche people who had a stronger link with Mapuche culture (that is since their childhood). This has been a common experience for urban Mapuche over a long period of time, and there are even explicit labels (mapurbe or warriache) for Mapuche who are the second or third generation to live in cities, and who are seen as cultural exiles. The re-signifiers group have some similarities to the 'rooted' group, because they attempted to keep or reinforce their Mapuche identities, however the 'rooted' group were closer to Mapuche culture since their childhood and conducted more identity work on their class identities (maintaining claims to a working-class identity). By contrast, the re-signifiers focused their identity work on their ethnic identity, and they expressed a more politicised sense of their Mapuche identities, with this process starting at university.

This group started to re-signify their indigenous identities from a new social position - urban, professional and politicised - as a response to the non-recognition of their Mapuche identities. Some started to participate in activist Mapuche groups positioning political demands (to have a pluri-national state, to officially recognise the Mapudungun language, and requesting the autonomy of Mapuche people) to the rest of Chilean society. Others started to work for Mapuche people, in academia, or the art and law sectors, with the purpose of reducing the inequalities, exclusion and racism against Mapuche people. According to Hall (1996) one of the consequences of globalization is the strengthening of local identities or the production of new identities, as a response to the experience of cultural racism and exclusion. Hall argues that the grouping of identity in response to 'othering' by a dominant culture does not however lead to a unified identity, since such identities are always related to a series of other differences. Therefore, these new identities not only have a political character (positional and

conjunctural), but also 'identity and difference are inextricably articulated together in different identities, the one never wholly obliterating the other' (Hall, 1996: 309). Most mestiza/white Chilean people perceive the Mapuche as 'the other' with a unified identity. However, as we have seen in previous chapters, one contribution of my own research is the demonstration that the identities of my Mapuche sample are very diverse, with ethnic identification complexly bound up with class and mobility, and the experience of migration.

The first section of this chapter introduces the social context of the re-signifiers and examines how and why their Mapuche identities were initially denied – by them and others. The second section then focuses on the experiences of the re-signifiers when they started to adopt Mapuche culture, expressing distance from middle-classness and reclaiming their indigenous identities. I explore this as a further example of the sample managing the experience of upward mobility by trying to 'fit in'. The last section of this chapter considers how they re-signified their indigenous identities, from a new social position.

## **6.2** The social context of the re-signifiers

In this section, I examine the most significant social characteristics of the re-signifiers group, in order to understand in detail why their Mapuche identities were initially denied and how their class and indigenous identities were constructed. Respondents from this group were mostly living in Santiago, without a strong connection to their Mapuche heritage. This was a result of the ethnic discrimination their parents had experienced when they moved from the countryside to the capital, leading to them adopt strategies of cultural assimilation for their families which downplayed their Mapuche heritage.

#### 6.2.1 The role of family in downplaying their Mapuche identity

In order to avoid discrimination for their children, the parents of the re-signifiers group had chosen not to teach their children about Mapuche culture. They also rarely visited

their Mapuche communities in the south of Chile. As we can see in case of Loreta, for most of these respondents Mapuche culture was unfamiliar, and some experienced family resistance to learning about it. In many cases, this resistance from their families was less explicit, however, in this case, the conflict is more explicit:

#### Did you family teach you about Mapuche culture?

No, nothing, I mean nothing. My grandfather neither. He was very quiet, he never told us, neither to my aunts [...] now I am talking about that with my family and it is like that I am collecting piece by piece and putting them together [...] Also it is complicated for me that with my mother now it is not easy to talk about the issue. I am participating in a community [a group who learn and practice Mapuche ceremonies, but in an urban context] [...] One day I told her that I was going to dress as Mapuche and she almost died, it was horrible. We had a big fight. The Wetripantu [a Mapuche celebration] was on the same date as Father's Day and she was very angry. She never cared about Father's Day, I do not know why she cared about this particular day [...] she told me that she never taught me about these practices, 'I never taught you that, so why you are doing it?' [...] I do not care that my grandfather did not teach her about the culture, but I am upset that I cannot talk about the subject, it is like I always have to censor myself with that [...] At the beginning it was fine, but it is like the closer I am to Mapuche culture, the more tensions there are (Loreta, linguist, 23).

This group of participants were initially distanced from Mapuche culture and faced resistance from their families when they tried to participate in it, during or after their higher education Loreta had difficulties with her family when she started to be interested in Mapuche culture, and had to manage tensions between her old social context (working-class and with a downplayed ethnic identity), and her new social context (middle-class and with a reclaimed Mapuche identity). Following Hall (1996) we can suggest that Loreta was dealing with multiple identities across different social contexts.

Most of the parents of the re-signifiers had banned the speaking the Mapuche language. That was the case for Daniela whose grandparents forbade family members from learning Mapudungun:

Did you say that in your home it was forbidden to speak the language, why? Because my grandfather was discriminated against for being Mapuche, when he was young. Therefore, he did not want the same to happen with his sons, so he emphatically forbade them from speaking Mapudungun (Daniela, teacher of special education, 21).

Daniela was the first in her family to do something different: at the time of the interview, she was learning Mapudungun. Nonetheless, it took two generations to start learning again as it was expressly against the wishes of the grandfather, perhaps playing a patriarchal role. Other parents had a more a passive attitude about teaching Mapuche culture to their family, as in the case of Armando:

My father never hides being Mapuche, but he did not bother to show us how to claim that [Mapuche identity], ok, eh...like he stayed in an in-between situation. He is like saying 'OK, I am not going to hide it, but neither I am going to [emphasize it] ...' I believe that, because he did not [show Armando about being Mapuche]. But I appreciate that, because there are people who hide [their Mapuche identities], and change their Mapuche surname (Armando, Lawyer, 34).

Parents (and grandparents) had a fundamental role in the construction of the respondents' initial identities. In the case of the re-signifiers group, their parents did not encourage them to claim their Mapuche identities during their childhoods, and so they grew up without knowing (or knowing a minimum) about Mapuche culture. As we shall see in the section, they only started to claim their indigenous identities during and after university.

#### 6.2.2 Family encouragement to attend university and be successful

Chapter Four 'The road to university' considered the difficulties that respondents had on their path to university. We saw the important role of parents in encouraging their children to attend university. However, it is important to note that the parent of the resignifiers were the most aspirational and encouraged their children to attend university more vigorously than the parents of the other groups. The parents of other groups had encouraged their children to pursue better educational opportunities, but the parents of

the re-signifiers had pressured their children to attend university. Armando, for example, emphasised his father's role:

# When was the first time that you started to think about university? How was the process? Who helped you?

It started when I was a little child. My parents taught me the need or gave me the need to attend university [...] I believe that the desire to attend university started with the motivation of my father, because my father sold ice-cream on the street and in that time, he was selling ice-cream in Providencia [a posh neighborhood of Santiago]. So, he knew that there was a prestigious secondary school there. Well, the truth is that my family wanted me to attend the 'Instituto Nacional' [the most prestigious boys' only public secondary school in Chile], but as I was the first generation to attend that kind of important school we did not know about the bureaucratic and administrative process. When I applied, we did not do it on time, but I had the chance to attend the second option which was 'Lastarria' [the third most prestigious boys' school in Chile]. That was the first jump, the first important step to attend university, it was a very difficult step, but I did the step, so I had to face it (Armando, Lawyer, 34).

Armando's father wanted him to attend the best secondary school in Chile, but despite Armando's good performance he could not attend it, because of a lack of cultural and social capital. However, his father's aspiration for him to get the best possible education continued. Another case is Loreta, who had a similar experience of encouragement from their parents to attend university:

Since I was a child my mother always brainwashed us that we had to attend university. My mother was very prepared, like she prepared us psychologically that when we finished primary school, we had to move to a better school. For that reason, she made me apply to the 'Liceo 1' [the best public secondary school in Chile, attended only by girls], also with that goal I believe, to attend university. But I believe that she constantly told us that we were going to attend university. Therefore, my sister and I, never doubted it (Loreta, Linguist, 23).

Re-signifiers had strong encouragement and even pressure from their parents to attend university, much more so than respondents from other groups. Their parents used all the strategies that they had, in order for their children to attend university, and strongly endorsed their social mobility. This suggests that, for these parents, the aspiration to

achieve educationally was given more emphasis than ideas of Mapucheness or attachment to traditional cultures

#### 6.2.3 Discrimination experiences from non-Mapuche and Mapuche

Another characteristic of the re-signifiers is that they suffered discrimination, in terms of both class and ethnicity but in a different way from the other respondents in the sample. The respondents from the mobile accommodator and rooted groups had dealt with ethnic discrimination from an early stage in their lives and it was only later when they attended university that they faced exclusion in terms of class. Thanks to their early experiences they were always aware of their Mapuche identities and their difference from non-Mapuche people. However, most members of the re-signifiers group had the opposite experience, having to deal with class discrimination from when they were children, and so always aware about class distinctions, but it was only later at university that they faced exclusion in ethnic terms. Take the case of Emilio, who experienced discrimination in his school:

My mother was working as a housekeeper in Providencia [elite neighborhood in Santiago] and we were living there, in some typical big houses that had another house for the housekeeper. Therefore, I attended a secondary school there, with few brown people. There was a little class struggle [...] in the sense that they [his classmates] oppressed you. It was like the posh boys knew that when they had a housekeeper, they knew who they are, in social terms. When the housekeeper's son arrived, they knew their position and they made you feel it. I refer to that struggle, to the class struggle [...] When they played football they were indifferent to us. They celebrated birthdays and they did not invite us, even teachers made the distinction (Emilio, Actor, 30).

These childhood experiences made the re-signifiers well aware of class differences and their disadvantaged position. This continued when the respondents were adults, as most of them experienced class exclusion at university or work. This can be seen in the case of Catalina, who attended one of the most prestigious universities in Chile, however she

felt out of the place, due to the elite social context of university. In her quote, she explains her relationship with her classmates who were from a higher social class:

Noo, I always self-excluded from everything, always, not always, but was like I felt that I was not going to fit. Therefore, I took distance on my own, but not in a bad way, however I always preferred to do things in that way, I do not know if that is good or bad (Catalina, Biologist, 30).

The case of Catalina shows how class boundaries continued at university, despite her educational mobility, and she felt that university was an unfamiliar social context in which she was out of place. Her strategy to feel comfortable was to avoid social contact with her classmates. But the re-signifier respondents also had experiences of ethnic discrimination, from mestiza but also from Mapuche people too.

Ana made a distinction between her mother's generation and her own generation, in terms of how Mapuche people had to deal with experience of discrimination and/or exclusion:

My mother always told me, that she felt so discriminated, so transgressed, that all people teased her, because of her surname and to be honest I had a different personality, so nobody told me 'india' [a derogatory way to refer to being indigenous], never. For example, nobody treated me badly for my physical appearance, because I do not have, I did not have them [Mapuche physical traits]. Therefore, I never felt different, I felt just like anyone (Ana, Anthropologist, 33).

Ana's mother was part of the generation who migrated from the countryside to Santiago and she faced different difficulties to Ana, who felt that she faced fewer boundaries and exclusion than her mother. Partly because the re-signifiers did not initially make strong claims to being Mapuche and were sometimes not recognised as Mapuche by others, their early experiences were not framed by ethnic discrimination. But whilst her generation's discrimination might be less overt, it was still felt by the re-signifiers. Take the case of Violeta who pointed out subtle differences in how she was treated as a Mapuche woman:

#### Did you feel discrimination in your life?

No, I think more when I was adult, but not too discriminated, but I became upset that people did not know how to pronounce my surname (...) in general I did not feel discriminated against in my jobs, but I think that I am very susceptible to people treating me in a bad way. I am very sensitive to any kind of prejudice, like jokes, or conversations or kind of looking (...) like yesterday I went to the civil registry to have my new ID and I lost my ticket, so I asked the lady if she could give me my ID anyway and she was very annoying and she said 'Cari how? Caroha what?' [mispronouncing Violeta's Mapuche surname] and I said 'no, Carileo' and she said 'ay! Caro what' (Violeta, Psychologist/Midwife, 43).

This section has introduced the most significant characteristics and early experiences of the re-signifiers group. Next, I explore how this affected their subsequent construction of their class and ethnic identities during their social mobility transitions across different contexts. One interesting aspect of their experience of exclusion and discrimination that is further explored in the next section, is that the re-signifiers had to deal with situations where people did not identify them as Mapuche people. The key aspect of the resignifier's identity constructions is that they all sought to reinforce their Mapuche identity in their university period, and I now discuss how respondents had to use several quite active strategies in order to ensure that people would acknowledge them as 'authentic' Mapuche people.

# 6.3 The challenge of claiming authentic class and Mapuche identities 'now I can say I am Mapuche'

In this section, I show that the re-signifiers group started to become aware and take interest in their Mapuche identities when they started to attend university or started to work. This process of Mapuche identification was accompanied by tensions in class identification, because it was problematic for the re-signifiers to identify with their class middle-class destination. They tried instead to assimilate to Mapuche culture, therefore, they had to use several strategies to 'fit in'.

#### 6.3.1 Dilemmas in framing class identities

Respondents from this group experienced tensions with their class identities, as they adapted to the rules of their new social contexts and struggled to fit in. Most members of the re-signifiers group had attended prestigious high schools in order to gain admission to university. It was in high school where the re-signifiers experienced a cultural shock – largely along lines of social class - as the first time that they felt a 'fish out of water'. Take the case of Gaspar, who attended the most prestigious secondary public school in Chile, associated with excellence and with an upper middle-class intake. Gaspar felt like a 'fish out of water' there, more so than at university, because his secondary school was more exclusive:

#### Did you feel embarrassed at university to say where you were from?

Not at university, that happened at secondary school. Do you hear about 'Instituto Nacional'...in some ways that school for its style was very similar to university, for that reason the university was easier than school at the beginning, because of many things that you could experience in the first year of university, I was living at school, where I found all of Santiago together in one place...eee and as a boy, that made me feel scared. Therefore, in that period, I was a liar, so I kept quiet or lied. For example, I said that I could not receive people at home, because nobody was there, but in reality, it was because I did not have anything to offer to people who wanted to visit me. Sometimes I kept quiet, because I am Mapuche [referring to the Mapuche cultural trait of being silent or quiet] ... but I had to [hide]...for one or two years there. The rest I could adapt faster, but at the beginning it was very complex (Gaspar, Engineer, 30).

Some concealed their class position but some also, like Gaspar, tried to hide their Mapuche heritage. These early experiences of feeling like a 'fish out of water' meant the re-signifiers developed a self-conscious reflexivity (Reay, Crozier & Clayton 2009; MacNay, 2008) before the respondents from other groups, as part of their strategies to 'fit in' to their old and new social contexts as young adults. Reay, Crozier & Clayton (2009) suggests that people who develop this self-conscious reflexivity start a process of self-improvement which is incorporated into their habitus. We can see this in the resignifiers' self-conscious adoption of the Mapuche culture and language, during and after

university. But this self-improvement was aimed at making ethnic identity claims, rather than class identity claims, because the re-signifiers felt ambivalent about their new middle-class destinations.

The respondents from this group not only experienced tensions fitting into middle-class contexts, they also experienced conflict between their old and new class identities. Half of the respondents from this group identified as middle-class based on their education level, but the other half still identified as working-class based on their economic situation. And all the re-signifiers, whether they saw themselves as working or middle-class, experienced conflicts in framing a specific class identity. One such conflict was a feeling of guilt about their new social position. That was the case for Emilio, who identified as middle-class but felt ambivalent about this identity:

I am middle class, who flirts with the upper-class and flirts with the working-class. For an actor it is very important to move socially. In order to perform the role, I have to play. I am not aspiring to, well I think thanks to my profession I have what I wanted. I felt that I travelled. When I was a child I wanted to travel....

# Do you think that you betrayed your class? [earlier Emilio had used the word 'betray']

Yes, a lot, I am classless. When I had to travel and stayed in huge hotels with everything...when I went to Europe, it was beautiful, and I thought that my parents will never see that. There I felt sadness; I felt that the world is built in an unfair way, 'Why did I get to live that?' I understood that they can see through my eyes and maybe they do not want to travel. But yes, it was an event that moved me, because I thought of my family (Emilo, Actor, 30).

Here we see tensions in class identity as a consequence of social upward mobility. Loreta shows another kind of conflict between her old and new class identities. In her case she reflects on how her educational mobility will change her lifestyle:

## What do you think is your current social position? Is it different from your parents?

A professor explained about social class. She explained that we can still be living in the same house, but because we attended university, we belong to another social class and I think is true. I mean, when I was younger, and people asked me, I said 'lower middle-class' [she elsewhere indicated lower middle-class was a higher

social class than she really had]. But now in the space that I am, it is not negative to say that I am living in a poor neighborhood. I feel that in secondary school everyone hid that [where they lived]. In the university, at least, in the bubble that I am, which is philosophy, I value much more those things and I can say firmly that I am from La Palmilla. Before I did not say it and even if you can say that you do not feel embarrassed, the fact that I hid that means something. I still feel that I have the same social class, where I live, I have the same trajectory as before, but I feel that in the future I will move and I feel that I will have a better social class, but these categories are so lax [...] but I know it will happen and in fact I asked myself that and I feel that you are becoming bourgeois, you have other interests and forget others. I would like to be a professional and not only because of my own social mobility. I do not like to not help in anything, in fact I would like to be teacher someday and teach in a school where I live (Loreta, Linguist, 23).

Loreta had similar strategies to Gaspar, as both tried to hide their social class origins at secondary school, but this also gave them a sense of heightened reflexivity about their social class position and identities. Loretta was ambiguous about her class mobility, feeling – like the 'rooted' subgroup – that she had not really changed, and she also felt conflict about assuming her new class identity, because she saw bourgeois middle-classness as something negative and selfish. For that reason, Loreta felt guilty about her new social class and as strategy to manage this, Loreta tried to justify her middle-class mobility with the idea of giving something back to her class origins, by teaching poor students in her neighbourhood. Another example is Gaspar, who also felt tensions between his working-class origins and middle-class destination, which made him feel ambivalent about claiming middle-class identity:

#### Do you think that higher education helps you to change your social position?

No, I am lower middle-class, because my identity did not change at university, where it should. I did not look for those opportunities, I did not look, because maybe I did not take them when I had the opportunity. Due to this, I could work as a traditional engineer, and I could have had a salary which corresponded to the 10% highest salaries in Chile [...] but I choose that social condition [lower middle-class] and university let me have it, but I choose not to take it...

#### Do you think that your social position is different from your parents?

Yes, yes, very different, because if you are looking from an arriviste perspective, you can say that you are engineer, you know, I do not do it, but I am conscious about that. Due to this, if by chance a policeman stops you in the road and I say I am engineer, that maybe can help me. Therefore, I am conscious that I have a

different social position, beyond conversations, groups of people to which I have a relation. So, I mean, if I meet with some friends we could to talk about politics, you know. My father also could meet his friend, but maybe he does not find an environment more, more conducive to talk about politics [...] I am conscious about that and acknowledge this difference (Gaspar, Engineer, 30).

Gaspar's quote is contradictory, because he identified with the lower middle-class, but at the same time he recognised the new social status that his profession brings to him. He expressed a similar response as the 'rooted' group, identifying with his class of origin, in order to qualify or take distance from being middle-class. Gaspar also compared his cultural capital with his father. In that sense, despite Gaspar dis-identifying from a middle-class position, he referred to class hierarchies when he compared their cultural capital.

#### 6.3.2 When you are not a proper Mapuche: strategies to 'fit in' with Mapuche culture

Most of the re-signifiers did not grow up in what they defined as a traditional Mapuche social context – lacking key dimensions conventionally associated with being a Mapuche person: such as having a Mapuche surname, speaking the Mapuche language, living on Mapuche land, or participating in Mapuche groups and knowing about Mapuche culture. Respondents from this group sometimes felt excluded from other Mapuche people because of this. Take the case of Emilio, who felt that he was not a proper Mapuche because he lived in Santiago and was an actor:

On the other hand, being Mapuche from Santiago is feeling that you are not too Mapuche like Mapuche people from other places. You start to discriminate against yourself. Also, some Mapuche people look at you with suspicion, for being an actor. I know that some look at me in a good way, but also people look at me as a sell-out [...] I am the only one that decided to be an actor (Emilio, Actor, 30).

Respondents from the re-signifiers group expressed distinctions between the 'authentic' Mapuche from the south (living in Temuco or in the countryside near Temuco) and Mapuche people from Santiago. Due to this distinction, individuals felt that they were not authentic Mapuche people. Being an actor is a not traditional profession for

Mapuche people, who tend to be found in professions related to education and agronomy, so individuals from Santiago who had wider career opportunities felt they were less authentic than Mapuche from the south of Chile. As a result of not being recognized as Mapuche, the re-signifiers started to ask what it really means to be a Mapuche person, and if they could get closer to that profile. In doing so, they accepted that Mapuche people from the south represented authentic Mapuche culture, even when they felt discriminated against by southerners. Gaspar, for example, felt excluded by Mapuche people who lived in rural areas:

#### Did a Mapuche person discriminate against you? Do you feel different?

Yes, yes. In the south that happens a lot, when I told people that I am living in Santiago. The Mapuche reacted like, not aggressively, but they put up boundaries. I do not know why that happened, could be like their own fear or like are suspicious. Even when I try to be respectful, because I am Mapuche from the city...I have a very respectful definition about the culture, but at the same time I have less than they have, their experiences and that. In that way, they exclude me, you know, because they do not engage with me, when I want to have a conversation [...] well, they said to me 'the santiaguino' [from Santiago] or 'the Mapuche from Santiago'. So, there is a barrier (Gaspar, Engineer, 30).

Gaspar accepted that he was less Mapuche for living in the city and having fewer experiences related to Mapuche culture, but he also felt excluded on this basis. Armando also felt excluded from Mapuche identity, because he did not know the Mapuche language:

Identity is constructed in many ways and some seem incompatible with others. For example, you interviewed someone who is born and lived in the city, you did not interview a Mapuche who is living in the countryside and that makes an important difference. A few days ago, I went to a seminar and a lady said that indigenous people are classified or defined by whether or not you speak or the language. Therefore, she excluded me immediately, because I do not speak it and based on that I am not Mapuche, [that is] horrible! I do not know if speaking [Mapudungun] makes a difference, but it is something important. But, I think that you are going to be defined by the aspect that makes you Mapuche or not (Armando, Lawyer, 34).

On the other hand, the re-signifiers group also found their ethnic identity disputed by people who were not Mapuche. As respondents living in cities, they did not wear typical Mapuche outfits and they usually did not have the physical profile of Mapuche people, because most of them had only one parent with Mapuche heritage. Their appearance and habitus were that of city-dwellers (Bourdieu, 1984). For that reason, people did not immediately recognise them as Mapuche people. Take the case of Gaspar, who identified himself as Mapuche, but said other people did not:

Sometimes people have told me that I do not look like as a Mapuche, so I considered that very negative, because I have had my Mapuche identity since a very early stage in my life. I worked in a politicized way in a Mapuche group, during secondary school and that helped me a lot. Therefore, that people told me that, it is not good (Gaspar, Engineer, 30).

Gaspar had made efforts in school to build a Mapuche identity, and the fact that non-Mapuche people did not recognise him as such troubled him. All the respondents from this group felt a pressure to be an authentic Mapuche. Violeta had similar experiences where non-Mapuche people did not recognise her as Mapuche:

They think that you have a particular profile, because you have to have an indigenous surname and it does not fit in that way, therefore they are surprised, this thing upsets me (Violeta, Psychologist/Midwife, 43).

All the respondents from the re-signifiers group felt that they lacked sufficient Mapuche symbolic and cultural capital to be recognised as 'true' Mapuche people. As a result of finding their indigenous identities in dispute, the re-signifiers started a process of reclaiming a more authentic Mapuche identity. They started to use strategies to compensate for their cultural gaps, seeking out Mapuche social groups, and starting to practice and acquire Mapuche values, in order to be better able to claim an authentic Mapuche identity.

According to Stuart Hall (1996) identities and identification are in constant relation. For him identification is a person's sense of where they can fit in and what is available for

that person. Hall (1996) explains there is distinction between what people think about themselves, whether they can claim a kind of identity, and whether others can dispute this identity. For Hall, identities are flexible, changing across different contexts, and he rejects an essentialised notion of the concept, suggesting that identities have a positional and conjunctural character, with 'their formation in and for specific times and places' (Hall, 1996, 309). However, Hall (1988) points out that identities should not be seen as totally flexible. We can see this in my own sample, as the 're-signifiers' group had difficulties claiming an indigenous identity that others did not recognise (as 're-signifiers' lacked Mapuche symbolic and cultural capital and did not look like 'traditional' Mapuche people). It seems there are limits to the flexibility of identity and what people can claim of it, with certain kinds of work or symbolic capital necessary to getting identity claims recognised. In attempting to claim a more authentic Mapuche identity, the members of the re-signifiers group not only deployed cultural strategies to acquire more traditional Mapuche culture, they also proposed a new perspective on being Mapuche by politicizing their identity claims, in which being Mapuche was constructed as fighting to advance the Mapuche people. In the next section, I develop this argument in detail.

### 6.4 The politicization of identities

In this section I examine how, as result of their social mobility and feeling tensions with both their old and new class identities, the respondents started to re-signify their Mapucheness. They did so from an urban and middle-class position, both of which are often seen as incompatible with Mapuche identity. The respondents from this group not only attempted to reclaim aspects of Mapuche culture, but also sought to 're-signify' what it means to be Mapuche, reworking it as a political identity they could legitimately lay claim to. They recognised that urban Mapuche are different to the rest of the Mapuche population, and whilst they sought to reclaim past notions of traditional Mapuche identity (learning the language, learning about the culture etc) they also organised their identity claims around new social practices, such as participating in

Mapuche cultural or activist groups in the city, and they also sought jobs associated with Mapuche culture (as in the case of Mauricio, who re-oriented his music career to focus on Mapuche music), or else framed their professional work as helping the Mapuche people.

#### 6.4.1 'Making myself Mapuche'

When the re-signifiers began higher education or started work, they started to develop a greater interest in their Mapuche heritage. This was partly through discrimination experiences there, but also as they became aware that there were other dimensions to identifying as Mapuche than the traditional characteristics:

#### Which were the most significant aspects for you of attending university?

I think it was very important to me, not only from an educational perspective, I have a degree and that stuff. Also, because it helped me to see another issue that I was interested, and I could see them clearly and these are the gender and Mapuche perspectives. If I did not attend university, I do not know if I would feel interested in Mapuche culture. Due to this, I learnt the Mapuche aspects at university. Before that moment, there was nothing that interested me in knowing about my Mapuche heritage (Loreta, Linguist, 23).

#### When did you realise about your Mapuche identity?

I think at university, because I started to...I always heard that people said very bad things about Mapuche people, so I started to have an interest, why did that happen? Or the language, why are we losing it? Why do people not speak the language? Why is it so discredited? You know. Therefore, that made me become closer, and realised that I am Mapuche, that it is not only a surname, and I can contribute to keep the culture and learn about that (Angelica, Clothes Designer, 25).

Whilst the respondents from this group started to reclaim their Mapuche identities by practicing traditional aspects of Mapuche culture (such as learning Mapudungun), their process of identification with Mapuche culture was complicated by other dimensions, such as class and gender. Their reclaiming of Mapuche identity was not simply a process of immersion in traditional Mapuche culture (since their position as urban Mapuche limited their claims to such culture), but also a re-working of it. That was the case for

Ana, who expressed her identification as a Mapuche person as a process of independence:

For example, I met a guy who is Mapuche and he was from a Mapuche community, but he lived in Santiago. I was deluding myself with that guy, but he moved to Belgium and I cried a lot. Therefore, I had to do my fieldwork, so I took my bag and I went to a Mapuche community and I said, 'to be Mapuche I do not need a man', I am Mapuche, so that was my first statement. After that, I did not care what people say, if someone told me I am not Mapuche, I did not care, but it was a process. However, I felt confident when I knew about the culture, when I knew the cultural codes. When I was living in the countryside, I saw how living in the rural area is. I slept where people slept, I ate what people ate there. Therefore, I do not feel that is a historical situation, maybe if my family would have lived in the south, maybe those things would not have happened, but that is what I had to live and that cannot determine if I am Mapuche or not. Therefore, that was the process that now I can say I am Mapuche (Ana, Anthropologist, 33).

Ana used strategies to 'fit in' to this new social context for her, practicing living as a 'traditional Mapuche' person, by living in the rural area and following all the rituals and practices there. But her narrative was contradictory (she said she did not care what southern Mapuche people said about her identity, however she still wanted to be accepted) because of her ambiguous situation as an urban, professional Mapuche acquiring the culture. Eliana did not know that she had Mapuche heritage until she was 18, when her mother told her about her father. Eliana saw building her Mapuche identity as a reworking of her sense of self, and part of a process making her more confident:

Look, I believe that I am working on the construction of my identity as Mapuche, for three years. Because, before it was like, more like I had to overcome psychologically. Because, as I say, I was very submissive, very quiet, with no opinion. But, that was because I had a learning problem when I was a child. I do not know, I did not have the correct stimulation, I do not know what was the problem, but it was difficult. In that time, the bullying did not have a name, but my classmates teased me a lot. I had a difficult time in the school [...] I had to be more emotionally stable to develop my identity, and that happened at university and when I was in the fourth year I appeared. In the fourth year, I managed to overcome that and started to develop this side of my identity, of being Mapuche (Eliana, History Teacher, 25).

Eliana related being working-class with bullying and learning problems she experienced at school. The process of reclaiming a Mapuche identity was different from other respondents, in that growing up she did not know about her heritage, whereas the other re-signifiers knew but did not claim Mapuche heritage until they were adults. However, all the members the re-signifiers group felt that to claim an authentic Mapuche identity they needed to discover Mapuche history, learn the language, and participate in Mapuche groups and rituals. The process of identification differed for the re-signifiers group (not everyone moved south to learn the culture for example), but it was generally a process complicated by their status as mapurbe or warriache (urban Mapuche) and their distance from Mapuche culture, in which their identification as Mapuche was often a contradictory process.

#### 6.4.2 Us and them: distinction and legitimation of Mapuche identities

Respondents from the re-signifiers group made a distinction between their own process of claiming Mapuche identity and that of others whose identity claims, according to the re-signifiers were not sufficiently respectful of traditional Mapuche culture, and so less authentic or legitimate. Take the case of Ana, who distinguished her own efforts to adopt Mapuche culture from the situation of her sister:

My sister says that she is Mapuche, but I believe that the process of identity is not the same. I realized the process of listening. That is very important. At the beginning, I started to meet Mapuche people and they started to tell me things about the culture, that I did not know. Therefore, I was learning, I returned to my Mapuche community of origin, I came back to visit my grandfather, to visit my cousins, and others did not do that kind of thing. Also, I lived in Temuco, that year I went to Mapuche ceremonies, Mapuche funerals, I participated in protests [...] then I come back, I am here, and it has been like a process. Therefore, I feel that I am very respectful in that sense, I was living the total process, and sometimes I hear that some people say with arrogance that 'yes, we all are Mapuche!', yes but, you have to learn the culture. I mean, if someone discusses it with you it is for some reason, you have to listen, you have to understand the contexts. So, I am situating myself in that space (Ana, Anthropologist, 34).

Ana presented the process of claiming a legitimate Mapuche identity as a process requiring a significant level of commitment to the culture. Most of the re-signifiers emphasized the effort and compromises they had made to be part of Mapuche culture and also pointed to their efforts to work improving the social conditions of Mapuche people in Chile. Mauricio, who always has lived in Santiago, changed his work as a musician when he reclaimed his Mapuche heritage:

The first time that I started with the idea of 'mapuchizarme' ['making myself Mapuche'] was when I was 18 years old, during the time that I had to decide what I wanted to study. My family began to realise that I began to compose songs, [..] so they showed me Victor Jara and Violeta Parra [famous for their protest songs] and started my interest in social songs [...] then I turned against it and said 'no, I am not doing that' [...] so, I avoided Mapuche people. I lived with the criticism of people from the left and Mapuche people from the city, who told me that 'I was a renegade against my people, there are people who are dying and you are singing rubbish things'...then when I decided to face the topic and I decided to do my album, that represented my vision of the Mapuche nation, from Western society. My path to recover the ancestral... [...] now I live with the criticism from the other side, they say 'that I take advantage of Mapuche culture, to get press', I live with both sides. That is the vision that people have about me. But those things are natural, before I did not dare to talk in a politicised way about the Mapuche, I was not prepared (Mauricio, Musician, 24).

Mauricio's account indicates that for him 'becoming Mapuche' meant consciously taking the decision to incorporate his Mapuche heritage into his life and work. However, also Mauricio felt judged: initially for being a person with Mapuche heritage who did not promote a politicised view of the Mapuche and then later, for being a person who used his Mapuche heritage to be famous. For urban Mapuche, claiming Mapuche identities meant having to negotiate the politicised dimension of being Mapuche.

#### 6.4.3 The politicisation of Mapuche identities

Zapata and Oliva (2011) distinguish between people who affiliate to a group or society and people who only have lineage with the group. People who affiliate to a group have

a stronger social commitment and can also make more authentic identity claims, through for example actively re-claiming their Mapuche culture and working for the benefit of Mapuche society. For the re-signifiers, claiming an authentic Mapuche identity was not just about learning Mapuche culture but also about working to advance the Mapuche people, and was strongly politicised. Take the case of Loreta, who reflected about her social compromise with Mapuche cultural identity:

I feel that is important the part of Mapuche view of the world but also the political part is important, and I feel that in the lof [Mapuche clan structure] that is blurred and we are far away from the politicized way [of being Mapuche]. It is like everyone lives their own process of strengthening our identities, but they do not get involve in the political side. The fact that some are going to protests and others are not. I would like to have developed more that political part. Like having a clear idea how can I participate actively, but I am still looking for how I can do it [...] I still do not know the language, and I would like to know it and help so that the language will be revitalized [...] I feel that when I am committed with learning Mapudungun, then I will have a clearer attitude (Loreta, linguists, 24).

Loreta emphasised the need to focus on the more politicised aspects of Mapuche identity, but it also seems that respondents felt they needed to a reach a certain level of knowledge of Mapuche culture in order to develop this more politicised point of view. This was because they felt a responsibility to properly represent Mapuche culture in other social spaces, but also because that knowledge was necessary to legitimise their identities and activities for other Mapuche people. Emilio felt the responsibility of being a Mapuche in the public eye:

I have an impact on people, even now. When they [non-Mapuche people] try to talk about it [the Mapuche conflict]. They are not that relaxed, if we talk about the Araucanía region or when they ask me as a representative of indigenous people. Especially when there was the movie premiere [a film about the Mapuche conflict], where people asked me, what was my opinion of the topic? There I understood the role that you play. The role that others give to you. I am not going home asking myself how the Mapuche politicians are doing. I know more Mapuche people, who was one of the first famous Mapuche that faced being Mapuche in front of society. You feel like you start the day by giving excuses for being Mapuche and go to bed

giving excuses. The questions also surround you. That happened after university (Emilio, Actor, 30).

As they moved into new middle-class social contexts, the respondents had to face the responsibility of representing their Mapuche culture to others. They felt forced to represent the politicised aspects of Mapuche culture, specifically the current Mapuche conflict, because that topic is generally all that is known about Mapuche culture. Moreover, they also felt a responsibility to demonstrate that they were different, that they were Mapuche professionals, and so show people that the stereotype of the Mapuche terrorist is wrong. This shows another step of the process of identification (Hall, 1996; 1988) in which identity is partly about what people have to do to make others think about them in a certain way. In this case Emilio and the other members of the resignifier group chose to embrace the politicization of their identities, acting to represent Mapuche culture and viewpoints. It was the re-signifiers who were the most likely in the sample to belong to Mapuche political, non-profit community or activist organisations. So, for example, three of the re-signifiers belonged to the Enama Mapuche Corporation (a non-profit legal group that promotes Mapuche interests and rights), one belonged to the Aitue Foundation (which promotes the social and cultural development of the Araucanía region), one to the Chile Intercultural Foundation (a group that promotes intercultural understanding and challenges cultural stereotypes), two to Mapuche historical associations), and two to the Mapuche political party Wallmapuwen, with a further six members of the Rumtun Mapuche organization (a Mapuche cultural studies centre with a focus on Mapuche rights). For the re-signifiers, membership of these organisations was an important part of their re-signification of their Mapuche identity in political terms. As urban professionals they could still claim Mapuche identity in terms of their contribution to Mapuche culture through their political and activist work.

Emilio emphasized the responsibilities of his identity as a Mapuche professional. Other members of the re-signifiers group were more optimistic about the re-signification of Mapuche identities. Take the case of Arturo, who spoke about the new generation of Mapuche people:

#### Do you think that you belong to a Mapuche elite?

That elite no, I think we are, there is a replacement, I do not know if you can call it elite, because that word has an exclusionary meaning. I see that like the identity of the Mapuche elite, that is connected with people from the past who were looking after the wellbeing of people, there were good, fair and brave [people]. I think that many young people want to reclaim that logic [...] many people of my age between 20 and 30, who have that idea [....] They realise that they have to make the next step, and are taking responsibility for our problems, more than leaving our problems to the state and the state solving our problems and see how in a progressive way we are excluding among us (Arturo, Lawyer, 26).

This idea that Mapuche professionals must work to solve their political problems was an important part of the identity claims of the re-signifiers, but most also felt this must be based on a knowledge of traditional Mapuche culture. Take the example of Ana, who shared this idea of the new politically active generation of Mapuche people, but who felt that they must learn about the culture first:

Here we live with a strong claim to the Mapuche question. I think it's fine. I think it's good that, this process comes as revitalization. I like that there are spaces, in fact I would like more, partly I feel my experience, I would like that many Mapuche could know about their family or other people could live the same the process that I had, they could know, where their family are, their context. I have my grandfather's land title [...] when I talk to someone, I always say that they have to learn to listen, they [Mapuche people] will challenge you first, but then they will teach you (Ana, Anthropologist, 34).

The re-signifiers group faced different social barriers to fitting in as urban professional Mapuche, related to both their class and indigenous identities. They recognized the barriers to their indigenous identity claims that arose from their urban professional status, and so in trying to claim legitimate Mapuche identities for themselves distinguished between people who simply identify as Mapuche and people, like themselves, who make the effort to learn Mapuche culture:

There are people who are more fundamentalist, are more traditional and others who have the 'mapuchometro' [this term means a measure of how much people know about Mapuche culture] evaluating people. Sure, in effect there are people like that and I believe as society is something super traditional, because Mapuche people always are characterized by the fact it is not homogenous, on the contrary it is a heterogenous society, in their thinking, their political movement, etc. Therefore, I believe, that sometimes there are people who are more traditional and there are people that suddenly feel Mapuche. Hence, they want to go to rituals and ceremonies and they do not understand the protocol [...] my process was very slow, step by step, I knew older people that taught me. So, I saw people that say, 'hey, do not take picture' and they did not say it in a nice way, because, those people [who take photos] did not know the culture and it is invasive [...] but I was very respectful in that process [...] sometimes it has become trendy to say I am Mapuche. I saw people that rapidly became Mapuche. Therefore, the identity is very complex and personal, but also, I believe that you have to respect, give a respect to people and more if you want to be the voice [of the Mapuche] in some areas or if you want to classify yourself like 'I am Mapuche', so, for that reason, I believe that the process should be slow, a constant learning of identity (Clara, Journalist, 25).

Clara's narrative indicates the heterogenous and complex nature of Mapuche identities but locates herself towards the more 'legitimate' end of those identity claims, in her respect and knowledge of traditional Mapuche culture, even if she did not grow up in this culture. These divisions were highlighted in most of the re-signifiers' accounts, and I have argued here that the politicization of the re-signifiers' Mapuche identity was part and parcel of their initial detachment from Mapuche culture, which meant they had to work harder to make a legitimate claim on Mapuche identity.

#### 6.5 Conclusion

In this chapter, I have shown how the respondents from the re-signifiers group had a different response to their upward social mobility experience than the mobile accommodators or the rooted groups, which produced very different identity constructions. The re-signifiers group reclaimed their Mapuche identity, through a very active and self-conscious process of indigenous identity construction, which became their dominant identity.

I have argued that the re-signifiers faced the challenge of being 'authentic' in terms of both their class and Mapuche identities. The re-signifiers did not grow up in a Mapuche cultural context, and they only began the process of adopting Mapuche culture and claiming Mapuche identity when they attended university. I have shown that as urban professionals they frequently struggled to be recognised as Mapuche by both other Mapuche people and by white Chileans. Their response to their social mobility was to focus their identity work on their ethnic identity, attempting to construct more 'authentic' identity claims by acquiring more knowledge of traditional Mapuche culture, participating in Mapuche social groups, but also by expressing a more politicised sense of Mapuche identity. Many of the groups the re-signifiers joined had the political goal of advancing collective Mapuche demands (to have a pluri-national state, to officially recognise the Mapudungun language and requesting the autonomy of Mapuche people). Others started to work to advance the interests of the Mapuche people; by taking positions in academia, and in the cultural and law sectors with the purpose of promoting Mapuche interests and culture, and reducing the inequality, exclusion and racism experienced by the Mapuche people. Because their reclaiming of Mapuche identity was complicated by their status as mapurbe or warriache (urban Mapuche) which limited their ability to lay claim to traditional Mapuche culture, they sought to 're-signify' what it means to be Mapuche, reworking it as a political identity they could legitimately lay claim to. So, whilst their reclaiming of their Mapuche heritage did entail learning more about traditional Mapuche culture, it also entailed the politicised re-signification of Mapuche identity, in terms of fighting for Mapuche culture and rights.

We can see the re-signifiers' politicisation of their Mapuche identities as one response to the internal process of colonisation of the Mapuche in Chile, in which the Mapuche people have experienced long-term dispossession, discrimination and disadvantage. The re-signifiers had gained entry to university and to professional positions, giving them access to access to cultural capital that previously was denied to the Mapuche people. The re-signifiers used their new position to reclaim their Mapuche heritage and to develop a politicised form of Mapuche identity focused on advancing the culture, rights

and interests of the Mapuche people. However, as we have seen in Chapters Four and Five, there could also be very different responses to the experience of social mobility. Some in the sample reacted to their mobility by instead emphasising their (old or new) class identities, some sought to deny or downplay their indigenous identity, whilst others adopted a much less politicised version of Mapuche identity. In the next chapter, the conclusion of the thesis, I draw together the different arguments of the empirical chapters in order to consider the broader implications of this research for the understanding of Mapuche social mobility, as well as for more general debates on social mobility and identity.

# Chapter 7: Conclusion: The complex and entangled upward social mobility experiences of the Mapuche people

#### 7.1 Introduction

In Chile, studying at university is seen as the main route for social mobility, in which educational achievement can remove the influence of social origin on social destination. Whilst we can question whether the influence of social origins on social destinations has significantly decreased in Chile (Espinoza, Barozet and Mendez, 2013), it is certainly true that from the 1990s (after the dictatorship period) there was an expansion of educational opportunities that substantially increased the number of people attending university in Chile. Moreover, in 1992 the Chilean government also started to give scholarships to indigenous people in order to integrate them to the educational system and there has also been an increase in the number of indigenous people at university. However, there are few studies which investigate the implications of the upward social mobility of indigenous people. Therefore, this thesis addresses the question: how do the social mobility transitions of Mapuche with higher education impact on their racial and class cultures and affect their social identities?

I employed a research strategy of in-depth semi-structured interviews focused on biographical issues, with a sample of 40 Mapuche people to explore their experiences of upward social mobility. Adopting a social biographical perspective on social mobility I have analysed the Mapuche experience of mobility in the wider context of Mapuche indigenous and class social disadvantage in Chilean society. I argue that the experience of upward social mobility affected respondents in terms of their class position and identities, but also in terms of their indigenous position and identities, and we can see that respondents managed and negotiated the effects of upward social mobility in different ways. I have demonstrated that the process of upward social mobility is very complex and entangled, with different ways of negotiating identities, bound up with a

range of factors such as class, ethnicity, migration and discrimination. The chapter is organized in two sections. The first section summaries the main arguments of the thesis. The second section discusses the implication of my thesis for debates on the Mapuche population and debates on social mobility.

### 7.2 The argument of the thesis

Here I outline the main arguments of my research and discuss the conclusions of this thesis. In Chapter Two I set out the theoretical background with which I have approached this study. Because my research question asks about how mobility transitions affect people's social identities, I have focused on debates which explore processes of class cultures and identity, drawing on Bourdieusian class analysis, which adopts a more cultural understanding of social class and social mobility. However, the central argument of this chapter is that the social mobility process of the Mapuche people must be understood not just in relation to class transitions but also in relation to questions of ethnic position and identities. The Mapuche are a minority group whose experiences of transition are not just a question of class shifts since their transitions are also bound up with dislocations and pressures on their ethnic positioning and identity. Hence, I argue we need to draw on other perspectives to comprehend the consequences of social mobility in a more fully intersectional and post-colonial way. In particular, it is necessary to understand why my participants spoke of their mobility as a process of 'fraught achievement' in which they experienced considerable challenges of adjustment to their new social situations. Despite the fact that the sample had all achieved higher social positions because their higher education, their social origins still mattered in their trajectories and in their social destinations, also they had different trajectories depending on their social and geographic origins. For example, people who grew up in rural areas faced difficulties related to distance from schools, living in boarding schools and scarcities that people from urban areas did not experience to the same level. We can see in Chapter Four the impact of structural disadvantages on the respondent's trajectories, along lines of class and ethnicity (but also the rural/urban dimension), and they had to deal with numerous obstacles and challenges on the route to university. The sample's difficult experiences of transition and adjustment continued at university and afterwards in their new professional positions, and to explain this I turned to studies which have examined the experiences of working-class people who have undergone upward social mobility, and which explore how such social mobility often has negative consequences for those who experience it. These studies were helpful for understanding the dilemmas and tensions my research participants encountered in both their old working-class backgrounds and their new middle-class contexts.

In that sense, the Bourdieusian class approach (1984; 1992) offers a helpful explanation of these difficulties of transition, locating them in habitus/field mismatches related to people's cultural capital and habitus. For example, Reay, Crozier & Clayton's (2009) work examines how individuals from working-class backgrounds who attend elite universities have the ability to move between different social contexts, but also experience ambivalences and tensions which often make them feel they do not 'fit in' anywhere. I have drawn on these arguments to examine how the respondents' class backgrounds continued to influence their trajectories, affecting their abilities to fit into their new social positions. However whilst all my respondents had the experience of social dislocation (habitus/field disjuncture or feeling like a 'fish out of water' in Bourdieusian terms) during the course of their social mobility transitions, this was not only in relation to their class positioning but also with regards to their indigenous identity, leading to complex processes of identity negotiation and class and/or ethnic dis-identification (discussed in Chapters Five and Six).

Because of this complexity in the sample's identity transitions, I argued that we also need to add an intersectional perspective to the Bourdieusian framework, in order to examine how class and ethnic relations complicate each other. Here, I take into consideration ethnic, gender and migration disadvantages. I have argued that Bourdieusian accounts

of social mobility do not properly address the additional dimension of ethnic identity transitions which are necessary to fully understand the social mobility experiences of my Mapuche sample (Rollock, 2012, 2015). For example, only an intersectional approach can explain the processes of ethnic dis-identification discussed in Chapter Five. There I examine how respondents from the 'mobile accommodators' sub-group dis-identified from their Mapuche identities in order to 'fit in' to their new class position, because their experience of transition was one where their middle-class and Mapuche identities were incompatible. Furthermore, such an analysis requires a post-colonial perspective (Hall 1996, Weaver, 2001), to take into account the complex positioning of the Mapuche people within Chilean society. Chile is a country that was colonized by the Spanish centuries ago, leading to the exploitation of its indigenous people, creating both a disadvantaged position for them and the erasure of their Mapuche culture which has continued to the present day. Many Mapuche people have become detached from Mapuche culture, partly through migration experiences into cities and partly through their (or that of their parents/grandparents) discrimination experiences there. For some respondents, their parents or grandparents made a deliberate effort to distance the families from Mapuche language and culture in order to assimilate in to Chilean workingclass cultures. The detachment from Mapuche culture was particularly strong for the resignifiers group (see Chapter Six), who grew up in urban 'mestiza' or white environments, with very limited contact with Mapuche communities or practices. However, despite this, it was this group of participants who came to stress their ethnic identity after their experience of social mobility, and who started to politicise their Mapuche identities. I therefore also argue that it is necessary to understand the process of social mobility from a decolonial perspective.

Chapter Three provides an account of the methodological approach of the research, detailing how I adopted in-depth biographical interviews to explore the different perceptions and experiences of mobility amongst a sample of Mapuche people with higher education. My thesis is positioned within the literature which examines the

sometimes negative consequences of social mobility (Reay 2009, Grandfield 1991, Baxter and Britton 2001, Lehmann 2009, 2013, Friedman 2014, Mendez 2008, Savage 2001, Skeggs 1997, Rollock 2012, 2014). Most of these studies adopt a biographical approach, as the best method for understanding people's sense of their transitions, and for examining the diverse ways people negotiate their identities and I have followed that method of approach. I have approached the interview as a symbolic space where interviewee and interviewer jointly construct the discussion, and do not view this an 'objective' process, but rather as an account shaped by the context and positionality of both participants. For that reason, I discussed my own positionality in the research, as a middle-class woman with a claim to Mapuche heritage - in the sense that I have one Mapuche surname but may not be acknowledged as Mapuche by some people. I reflected on how this influenced the process of interview and my research relationship with respondents, and argued that this was a variable process, creating dilemmas with some participants which I had to negotiate but also being a source of empathy from others, and providing a means to discuss the nature of Mapuche identity within the interview.

Chapter Four 'the road to university' is the first of three empirical chapters, and explores how different structural factors such as ethnic and class background influence the educational trajectories of the respondents. These structural processes are related to different factors: such as the sample's parental background and their own limited access to resources, the sometimes unsupportive attitude of parents and teachers, the unequal resourcing and quality of the Chilean education system, and the different migration, ethnic and class discrimination experiences of the respondents. In Chapter Four I explore how all the sample were able to overcome these obstacles and achieve a university place. In this sense, my sample's accounts are all 'success stories', and narratives of how they overcame obstacles. However, these narratives show considerable variation as my respondents dealt with the effects of their upward social mobility in quite different ways. All the respondents experienced social mobility; nevertheless, some respondents faced

more difficulties and the need for longer social and geographical movement than others. Despite the fact that all the respondents experienced upward social mobility, their social origins continued to affect their trajectories and their adjustment to their social destinations. I also pointed out that the fact that respondents were able to change position in Chilean society was not only because of their own achievements and struggles, important though these were, but also because of the transformation of the structure of opportunities in Chile and their access to finance for their higher education through scholarships and/or university loans. This chapter showed the connection between the different dimensions the respondents' social location and their accounts of their social mobility, because both were narrated in terms of class and ethnicity. In that sense, respondents understood their social position and social mobility in multidimensional terms, and for that reason their process of identity negotiation was more complex and entangled.

Chapter Five 'The process of identification and changing identities' examines the consequences of the sample's experiences of upward social mobility in multidimensional terms, focusing on their negotiation of their identities in class and ethnic terms. I argued that the respondents negotiated their class and their Mapuche identities in diverse ways in complex processes of management and adjustment. All of these responses arose because identification with the middle-class at the same time as an identification with Mapuche heritage was experienced as incompatible by the sample, but they dealt with this incompatibility in different ways. I identify three groups of respondents in terms their different negotiations of this. The first group, the 'mobile accommodators' adopted middle-class identities, and in the process of assimilating to their new status distanced themselves from their formative (working-class) identity as well as also distancing themselves from a Mapuche identity. The second group, the 'rooted', stressed their working-class origins, and despite their experience of upward mobility maintained a sense of continuity with an 'authentic' working class and indigenous identity. The 'rooted' took distance from a middle-class identification and downplayed their mobility in order to remain connected with Mapuche culture, because they grew up in a traditional Mapuche context. Finally, for a third group, the 're-signifiers', their indigenous identities became their dominant identities during their negotiation of mobility, often with a renewed and politicized focused on their ethnic positioning. It is important to recognize that these groups have different origins, the 'rooted' coming from and staying nearer rural areas, the 're-signifiers' and 'mobile accommodators' tending to have grown up in urban areas. In this process, we can see that some respondents tended to dis-identify from their class identities, echoing the arguments of Savage et al (2001) who indicate that people use strategies of dis-identification (employing narratives of 'ordinariness' or 'authenticity'), in order to avoid being located in terms of social class. In that research, it is argued that people dis-identify in order to avoid the negative social connotations associated with being 'working class' or even 'middle class'. Mendez (2008) has suggested that in Chile it is also difficult for individuals to claim their class identities, due to people feeling there is a tension between being 'authentic' in relation to their origins or being authentic in terms of individualised 'selffashioned' middle-class identities (being 'true to oneself'), which she describes as a tension between cultural and moral boundaries, arguing that Chilean middle-class identities have undergone a process of individualization. I have argued that when we look at socially mobile people in the Chilean context we can see that dis-identification is a strategy that some of the sample deployed when they had to locate themselves in term of class (as we see with the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted'). However, Mendez (2008) did not consider ethnic identities and, as I have shown here, people can also dis-identify in terms of ethnic identities. In my research, we can see that some of the respondents used the same strategy of dis-identification not only when they tried to describe their class position but also in relation to their indigenous identities. Therefore, the process of dis-identification is a more complex one, because class and ethnic identification are entangled with each other and in sometimes contradictory ways. I argue that participants who dis-identified from their class and ethnic identities did so because they experienced a conflict between their old and new social positions and identities. To analyse this, it was necessary to adopt an intersectional approach, in order to consider that respondents sometimes dis-identified not just in terms of class, but also in ethnic terms.

In Chapter Five I focused on the process of identification of the 'mobile accommodators' and the 'rooted' - both groups who placed most emphasis on their identities during their mobility. In Chapter Six 'The re-signifiers, the politicisation of Mapuche identities' I focused on the experiences of the 're-signifiers' who emphasized their indigenous identities through the process of transition. For the 're-signifiers', the fact that they attended university worked in their favour because they then had access to Mapuche cultural capital that previously had been denied to them. Hence, from this position they could reinforce and reclaim their Mapuche identity. The detachment from Mapuche culture was particularly strong for the re-signifiers group, who grew up in cities with very limited contact with Mapuche communities. However, despite this, it was this group of participants who came to stress their ethnic identity after their experience of social mobility. I argue that – partly because of their distance from Mapuche culture which affected their ability to make 'authentic' indigenous identity claims - these respondents embraced the politicization of their identities. According to Hall (1996), one response to the experience of cultural racism and exclusion is the strengthening of local identities or the production of new identities. I argue that something similar has happened with the Mapuche people in Chile. Popular representations of the Mapuche people amongst the majority mestiza/white population of Chilean perceive the Mapuche as 'other' with a unified identity (Stavenhagen, 2001). However, the real situation is very different because, as my own research demonstrates, the Mapuche people are very diverse, and exhibit complex and entangled forms of identity. The 're-signifiers' negotiated their identities, re-signifying how they positioned themselves in their social contexts and managing their experience of social mobility through a reclaiming and politicization of their ethnic identity. However, this 'resignification' process was only one response to the process of colonisation and, as Hall (1996) notes, we can see multiple identity responses to living in a disadvantaged position, politically, economically and socially.

# 7.3 The consequences of social mobility: theoretical and methodological implications

In this thesis I have researched the identity consequences of upward social mobility for those Mapuche people who were the first in their families to attend university. My central research question is: how do the social mobility transitions of Mapuche with higher education impact on their racial and class cultures and affect their social identities? However, I also divided this overarching research question into four subquestions:

- What are the identity consequences of social mobility for those Mapuche people who enter higher education?
- Do these socially mobile Mapuche experience disruption in their transitions to new social contexts?
- What social and cultural strategies do socially mobile Mapuche people employ to cope with the experience of social mobility?
- How do the discourses of socially mobile Mapuche reflect on experiencing racism and discrimination?

Overall, I have argued that the process of Mapuche social mobility is complex, multidimensional and entangled, and this influenced the respondents' negotiation of their identities in different ways. The fact that the Mapuche are a disadvantaged and discriminated minority brings more complexity to their situation, because their experience of their mobility trajectories meant dealing with difficulties and challenges in terms of class, ethnicity, discrimination and migration. I have argued that the respondents saw their social position in multidimensional terms, and so also understood their social mobility in multidimensional terms, which means that as analysts we must focus on both their class and ethnic social location, but also their location within rural/urban inequalities in Chile and by their different experience of migration.

The respondents undertook social mobility from a position of class disadvantage, due to their lack of familial economic and cultural capital, but also from a position of ethnic disadvantage, as well as the disadvantage of living in poor rural areas for those from Mapuche communities. Once respondents entered university, they continue to face challenges related to their disadvantaged social origins. My first research sub-question asks what are the identity consequences of social mobility for those Mapuche people who enter higher education? We can see that the experience of going to university had a very significant impact for the sample's identities, not only by facilitating the sample's subsequent move into middle-class jobs. At university, the respondents were in the minority along lines of both class and race, so that they often felt excluded and out of place. At university, the sample all narrated experiences of feeling 'out of place' either in class or ethnic terms or both – and these created dilemmas of adjustment and identity negotiation which continued at work. For some, university also offered the chance to reclaim a greater knowledge of Mapuche culture and identity. The sample's negotiation of these and later challenges affected how they constructed their identities – but they adopted different tactics of response. In that sense, through all of the empirical chapters I have explored how the sample experienced the challenges of transition through different dilemmas of adjustment (in both their new and old social locations) which resulted in a range of ways of negotiating their identities.

In relation to my second research sub-question, about whether my sample experienced disruption in their mobility transitions, this study confirms the findings from previous studies about the difficult and sometimes negative consequences of upward social mobility (Rollock 2012, 2013, 2015; Savage et al 2001; Weaver 2011). In particular, I have argued that the respondents faced dilemmas of transition related to both their class and indigenous identities. The consequences were not only related to their employment status, but also to how well the respondents' habitus fitted - or not – to these new ethnically white, middle-class contexts. The respondents' experience of mobility frequently produced a sense of being 'a fish out of water', that was not only experienced

with regards to their sense of class location and identity, but also with regards to their indigenous social position and identities. And for some in the sample, the rooted group, these dislocations were not just about 'fitting in' to their new social contexts but also about managing the tensions of transition in their old social contexts, with experience of habitus clivé, in which the rooted had to manage the feeling of not really belonging anywhere. All the respondents from my sample experienced social dislocation during their upward social mobility transitions, albeit in different ways. For example, despite the fact that most of the 'mobile accommodators' had the intention of assimilating to their new middle-class contexts and taking distance from Mapuche culture, they still experienced dislocations in middle-class contexts because they had not developed adequate middle-class cultural capital due to their working-class background. The 'rooted' also experienced dislocation when they encountered middle-class contexts, however instead of assimilating to the middle-class, they downplayed their mobility and stressed their working-class origins as a way of retaining 'authentic' identities loyal to their Mapuche heritage and communities. Finally, the 're-signifiers', who had been the group most distanced from Mapuche culture, tried to reconnect with it by reclaiming and resignifying their Mapuche identity, in the process downplaying or expressing ambivalence about their class location. However, the 're-signifiers' experienced dislocation in both encounters in middle-class and Mapuche contexts, in part because of their difficulties in claiming 'authentic' middle-class or indigenous identities. As part of this process of transition disrupting their identities, the respondents often expressed ambivalence about claiming class or ethnic identities (Savage et al, 2001), because it was difficult to position themselves as they experienced problems of assimilation related to the tensions and contradictions of their situation as Mapuche middle-class professionals in Chilean society. Here we see the influence of structural disadvantage but also interpersonal discrimination and racism. My fourth research sub-question asks: How do the discourses of socially mobile Mapuche reflect on experiencing racism and discrimination? I have argued that most of the respondents narrated significant experiences of discrimination and racism which made their trajectories and the claiming of their identities more difficult and more complex. Throughout the empirical chapters I have shown that respondents were involved in a complex and intersectional process of claiming their identities, partly in response to experiences of discrimination in terms of class, but also in terms of migration and ethnicity, all of which compounded and personalized their sense of feeling 'out of place'. Their identity negotiations must be understood as part of their attempt to manage these difficult experiences.

This leads to my third research sub-question: What social and cultural strategies do socially mobile Mapuche people employ to cope with the experience of social mobility? Savage et al (2001) suggest that narratives of being 'normal' or 'ordinary' are related to class-identification, when people do not want to classify themselves in a specific social class categorization, due to how class categories are stigmatised or moralised. In the case of my research, my respondents deployed dis-identification in both class and ethnic terms. Despite the fact that the 'mobile accommodators' wanted to fit into their new middle-class position, they expressed unease and discomfort when they described their class position and, as a strategy to manage this, dis-identified from their ethnic heritage, taking distance from the stigmatised cultural traits stereotypically associated with the Mapuche. By contrast, the 'rooted' used a dis-identification strategy from middle-class identity, as they tried to still fit in with their social origin group (in working-class Mapuche communities), and took distance from middle-classness, because that compromised their Mapuche identity and represented not being 'authentic' and loyal to their social origins. The 're-signifiers' adopted a third strategy and resisted a straightforward middleclass identity as part of re-claiming and asserting their Mapuche heritage, but in doing so they re-signified their Mapuche identity in a politicised way which also allowed them to frame their middle-class professions as part of their work for the Mapuche community and political cause. In all of these strategies, we can see different ways of negotiating the incompatibility of being middle-class and Mapuche in Chile, which reflects the disadvantage, exclusion and discrimination that the Mapuche face. For all the sample, identification with both seemed very difficult.

My research has shown that the Mapuche experience of social mobility shares some similarities with the tensions of being 'Black and middle-class' in England identified by Rollock (2012, 2013, 2015) and also to the ways in which indigenous people in the United States use cultural identity as a way of resisting assimilation identified by Weaver (2001). However, my research also demonstrates the complex ways in which indigenous people negotiate their identities. As my own study shows, the process of identification is complex because it is not enough that people identify as indigenous, they need validation from others, external to their contexts, but they also need validation from the people that surround them. These processes are further complicated by their social mobility transitions. I suggest that future research should be focused on a comparative perspective, in order to study the similarities and differences across different social contexts, and in different countries. More practically, it would be helpful to further research the minority experience of university in Chile and to address the structural disadvantages inside university by understanding how university policies, rules and practices include minorities (or not) in these processes. Finally, it would be interesting to further investigate the role of gender in indigenous people's narratives of identities and social mobility, because in my thesis there was not a strong connection between gender and narratives of class and ethnicity related to social mobility. Therefore, it would be important to research other indigenous groups, in order to see if the relative absence of gender issues in people's narratives is restricted only to the Mapuche group, who have not developed these discourses, or because it is a common characteristic of indigenous people in Chile. In terms of methodological issues and with more time, it would also be interesting to extend this thesis with an ethnographic approach which spends more extended time with Mapuche professionals, in order to more directly observe the dynamics and practices of this group across the different contexts of their mobility.

The research in this thesis has attempted to give voice to an excluded minority group, and to make more visible the situation of a 'minority within a minority' by focusing on

the experiences of upwardly mobile Mapuche professionals and showing how they must still negotiate inequalities and discrimination at university and work. On the one hand, this thesis attempts to make more visible the complex identity process that this group of Mapuche people have experienced, including the difficulties of maintaining an 'authentic' indigenous identity as an upwardly mobile professional. My aim in making this process more visible is not simply analytical and I argue research of this kind should contribute to creating social policies that regulate, integrate and help minorities in institutional spaces such as university and work places. These policies should not focus only on increasing the number of minorities who enroll in university, but also needs to improve their experiences once they get there, and so also need to focus on the representation of diversity and the inclusion of different cultures, above all stigmatized minorities. On the other hand, in this thesis I have argued that upward social mobility is not a fairytale and a panacea to improve the social conditions of people. Acquiring higher education can help to change people's social position but does not necessarily remove all the disadvantage and discriminations that they experience. For that reason, I have argued that many of the consequences of upward social mobility experiences are negative and meant my respondents had to deal with complex dilemmas about their identities and their position in the society. However, for some mobility led to a cultural re-signification of their Mapuche identities, and they became part of a decolonising movement of Mapuche intellectual and political groups. Despite the fact that these respondents also had to deal with various disadvantages, dilemmas and challenges as a result of their upward mobility, this helped them to reconnect to their denied culture and to advocate for the Mapuche community and cause in Chilean society. This resignified politicization of Mapuche identities is a rather different way of thinking of how social mobility might advance the position of the Mapuche people – but nonetheless shows the complexity of the experience of social mobility.

# **Appendices**

# **Appendix One: Summary of participants**

#### Santiago

Diego

Age: 26 years old

Educational level: Higher education, Temuco

**Institution:** Middle-status University

Career: IT Engineer

**Job at time of interview:** Unemployed. His last job was not related to his degree.

Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** He migrated from Temuco to Santiago in order to find a job six months ago.

**Organization:** He did not belong to any Mapuche organization.

**Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

Diana

Age: 26 years old

Educational level: Higher education

**Institution:** Middle-status University, Temuco

Career: Nurse

Job at time of interview: Hospital Nurse Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She migrated from Temuco to Santiago in order to find a better job, she has

lived in Santiago for 1 year and 6 months.

**Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization.

Last name: She has only one Mapuche last name.

Claudio

Age: 57 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education with postgrad in Spain.

Institution: Middle-status university, Temuco

Career: Political science lecturer

Job at time of interview: Professor and researcher

Marital status: Married with 3 children

Migration: He migrated to from Temuco to Santiago more than 20 years ago. He has

plans to go to the USA in a year's time because his family is living there.

**Organization:** He belongs to a Mapuche organization.

Last name: He has only one Mapuche last name

**Paulina** 

Age: 26 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status uUniversity, Temuco

Career: IT Engineer

Job at time of interview: Computer Programmer

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She migrated from Temuco to Santiago in order to find a better job. She has

been living in Santiago for 6 months.

**Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization.

Last name: She has two Mapuche last names.

Victor

Age: 28 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education

**Institution:** Middle-status University, Temuco

**Career:** Accountant

Job at time of interview: Accountant and financial auditor

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He migrated from Temuco to Santiago 5 years ago, in order to find a better

job

Organization: He did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** He has two Mapuche last names.

Luisa

Age: 27 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status university, Temuco

**Career:** Accountant

Job at time of interview: Financial accountant

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She migrated from Temuco to Santiago in order to find a better job. She has

lived in Santiago for 5 years.

**Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization.

Last name: She has two Mapuche last names.

Manuel

Age: 24 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

Career: Nurse

Job at time of interview: Surgical nurse Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He migrated from Temuco to Santiago 1 year ago, to find a better job.

Organization: He did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

Violeta

Age: 43 years old

Educational level: Higher education, master's degree

Institution: Elite University and Low-status University, Santiago

Career: Obstetrician and psychologist

Job at time of interview: Consultant in community relations

Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** She was born in Santiago and lived there most part of her life. She worked in Temuco for one year. Also, she went to the USA to do a masters, and then a PhD, but she

could not finish because she missed her family. She lives in Santiago.

**Organization:** She belongs to a Mapuche organization.

**Last name:** She has only one Mapuche last name.

Catalina

Age: 29 years old

Educational level: Higher education

**Institution:** Elite University and Low-status University, Santiago

**Career:** Biological and commercial engineer

Job at time of interview: Bank worker Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** She was born in Santiago and has lived all her life there. **Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization.

Last name: She has two Mapuche last names.

Laura

Age: 33 years old

Educational level: Higher education

**Institution:** Elite University

Career: Journalist

Job at time of interview: Director of communications in a research centre

Marital status: Single, 3 children

**Migration:** She was born in Santiago and has lived all her life there. **Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization.

Last name: She has only one Mapuche last name.

**Emilio** 

Age: 30 years old

Educational level: Higher education

**Institution:** Low-status University, Santiago

Career: Actor

Job at time of interview: Actor and teaching performance

Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** He was born in Santiago and has lived all his life there.

**Organization:** He belongs to a Mapuche organization **Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

Mauricio

Age: 24 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Low-status University, Santiago

Career: Radio announcer

Job at time of interview: Musician Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** He was born in Santiago and has lived all his life there.

**Organization:** He belongs to a Mapuche organization **Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

Loreto

Age: 23 years old

Educational level: Higher education, Masters

**Institution:** Elite University, Santiago

**Career:** Linguistics

Job at time of interview: Assistant on a university Indigenous research project

Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** She was born in Santiago and has lived all her life there. **Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization.

**Last name:** She has only one Mapuche last name.

Gaspar

Age: 30 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Elite University, Santiago

Career: Engineer

Job at time of interview: Self-employed engineer

Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** He was born in Santiago and has lived all his life there. **Organization:** He did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

#### Clara

Age: 25 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education **Institution:** Elite University, Santiago

Career: Journalist

Job at time of interview: Journalist associated with a university Indigenous research

project

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She was born in Santiago and has lived all her life there.

**Organization:** She belongs to a Mapuche organization. **Last name:** She has only one Mapuche last name.

#### Eugenio

Age: 49 years old

Educational level: Higher education, postgrad masters and PhD

**Institution:** Middle-status University, Temuco

**Career:** University lecturer

Job at time of interview: University Lecturer on indigenous matters

Marital status: Married without children

Migration: He was born in Santiago and has lived most of his life there. However, he

went to Temuco to study at university. He now lives in Santiago.

**Organization:** He belongs to a Mapuche organization **Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

### **Javier**

Age: 31 years old

Educational level: Higher education, masters and PhD

**Institution:** Middle-status University, Santiago

**Career:** History teaching

**Job at time of interview:** University researcher

Marital status: Single 1 child

Migration: He was born in Santiago and lived most of his life there.

**Organization:** He belongs to a Mapuche organization

**Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

Hugo

Age: 32 years old

Educational level: Higher education, postgrad master and PhD

Institution: Middle-status University, Santiago

**Career:** History teaching

Job at time of interview: University researcher

Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** He was born and has lived all his life in Santiago. **Organization:** He does not belong to any Mapuche organization

Last name: He has only one Mapuche last name.

Ana

Age: 33 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status University, Santiago

**Career:** Anthropology

Job at time of interview: Coordinator of Indigenous issues for a Municipality

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She was born in Santiago and lived all her life in the same neighbourhood.

**Organization:** She belongs to a Mapuche organization **Last name:** She has only one Mapuche last name.

**Armando** 

Age: 34 years old

Educational level: Higher education, PhD

**Institution:** Middle-status University, Concepcion

Career: Law

Job at time of interview: Unemployed Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He was born and lived in Santiago: he moved to the south in order to go to

university.

**Organization:** He belongs to a Mapuche organization **Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

#### Temuco

**Carlos** 

Age: 50 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education, postgrad masters

Institution: Low-status University, Temuco

**Career:** Primary teacher

Job at time of interview: Coordinator of a secondary school

Marital status: Married with two children

Migration: He was born in a rural community and then he migrated to Temuco in order

to work and then study at university.

**Organization:** He did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** He has two Mapuche last names.

**Matias** 

Age: 21 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

Career: Political science

Job at time of interview: Administrator in a Mapuche organization

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He was born in a town in Araucania and then he migrated to Temuco in order

to study at university.

**Organization:** He belongs to a Mapuche organization **Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

Eduardo

Age: 30 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

**Career:** Primary Teacher

**Job at time of interview:** Teacher in secondary school

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He was born in a rural community and then he migrated to Temuco in order

to study at university.

Organization: He did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** He has two Mapuche last names.

Jose

Age: 40 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

Career: Journalist

Job at time of interview: Journalist Marital status: Divorced one child

Migration: He was born in a rural community and then he migrated to Temuco in order

to study at university.

**Organization:** He belongs to a Mapuche organization **Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

## **Enrique**

Age: 27 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

Career: Dentist

Job at time of interview: Dentist and director of a clinic

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He was born in a town in Araucania and then he migrated to Temuco in order

to study at university.

Organization: He belong does not belong to Mapuche organization

**Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

#### **Antonio**

Age: 38 years old

Educational level: Higher education, postgrad master

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

Career: Architect

Job at time of interview: Government consultant for a territorial project for an

indigenous organisation.

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He was born in a town in Araucania and then he migrated to Temuco in order

to study at university. He lives in Temuco.

**Organization:** He did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** He has only one Mapuche last name.

# Joaquín

Age: 51 years old

Educational level: Higher education,

**Institution:** Middle-status University, Santiago

Career: Lawyer

Job at time of interview: Lawyer and business manager

Marital status: Married 2 children

Migration: He was born in a town near to Temuco, migrated to Santiago in order to study

at university, and now lives in Temuco.

Organization: He did not belong to any Mapuche organization

Last name: e has only one Mapuche last name.

#### Roberto

Age: 36 years old

Educational level: Higher education,

Institution: Low-status University, Temuco

Career: Designer

**Job at time of interview:** Owner of two design businesses

Marital status: Single 2 children

**Migration:** He was born in a rural community near to Temuco and then he migrated to Temuco in order to study at university and now he return to lives in the same a rural

community.

Organization: He belongs to a Mapuche organization

Last name: He has two Mapuche last names.

#### **Patricio**

Age: 39 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education,

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

**Career:** Agronomy engineering

Job at time of interview: Local Council administrator.

Marital status: Married, 2 children

Migration: He was born in a rural community near to Temuco and then migrated to

Temuco in order to study at university and now lives in a rural community.

Organization: He did not belong to any Mapuche organization

Last name: He has two Mapuche last names.

#### **Arturo**

Age: 26 years old

Educational level: Higher education, he is still studying

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

Career: Law

**Job at time of interview:** Director of a Mapuche foundation

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He was born in a town near to Temuco and then he migrated to Temuco in

order to study at university.

**Organization:** He belong to Mapuche organization

Last name: He has one Mapuche last name.

Teodoro

Age: 25 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

**Career:** History teacher

Job at time of interview: Teacher in secondary school and researcher

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: He was born in a rural community near to Temuco and then he migrated to

Temuco in order to study at university.

**Organization:** He belongs to aMapuche organization

Last name: He has two Mapuche last names.

Leticia

Age: 28 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education, masters **Institution:** Middle-status University, Temuco

**Career:** Nursery Teacher

Job at time of interview: Nursery Teacher in a private school

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She has lived in Temuco all her life.

**Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** She has one Mapuche last name.

Sofia

Age: 33 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education

Institution: Middle-Status University, Temuco

Career: Teacher

Job at time of interview: Teacher in a private school

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She has lived in city for most of her life. Now she lives in a town near to

Temuco.

**Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** She has two Mapuche last names.

#### **Daniela**

Age: 21 years old

Educational level: Higher education, she is still studying

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

**Career:** Special education

**Job at time of interview:** Coordinator of the youth section of a Mapuche organisation

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She was born in a town near to Temuco, moved to Temuco to attend

university and now lives in Temuco.

Organization: She did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** She has one Mapuche last name.

#### Marcela

Age: 30 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status university, Temuco

**Career:** Chemistry Teacher

**Job at time of interview:** Teacher in a primary school

Marital status: Single with 2 children

**Migration:** She was born and now lives in Temuco.

Organization: She did not belong to any Mapuche organization

Last name: She has one Mapuche last name.

# **Angelica**

Age: 25 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education

Institution: Low-status University, Temuco

Career: Clothes Designer

**Job at time of interview:** Independent designer

Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She was born and now lives in Temuco.

**Organization:** She did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** She has one Mapuche last name.

#### **Fernanda**

Age: 43 years old

Educational level: Higher education

Institution: Middle-status University, Temuco

Career: Journalist

Job at time of interview: Consultant and Journalist

Marital status: Single without children

**Migration:** She was born and now lives in Temuco **Organization:** She belongs to a Mapuche organization

**Last name:** She has one Mapuche last name.

Maria

Age: 44 years old

Educational level: Higher education

**Institution:** Middle-status University, Temuco

**Career:** Social Work

Job at time of interview: Consultant Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She born in a community near to Temuco and then she migrated to Temuco

in order to study at university.

Organization: She did not belong to any Mapuche organization

**Last name:** She has one Mapuche last name.

Eliana

Age: 25 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education **Institution:** Middle-status University

**Career:** History teacher

Job at time of interview: Teaching assistant Marital status: Single without children

Migration: She was born in a town near to Temuco and then she migrated to Temuco in

order to study at university.

**Organization:** She belong to a Mapuche organization **Last name:** She does not have Mapuche last name.

Vicente

Age: 53 years old

**Educational level:** Higher education

Institution: Low-status University, Temuco

**Career:** Accountant

Job at time of interview: Accountant Marital status: Married 3 children

Migration: He was born in the countryside near to Temuco and then he migrated to

Temuco in order to work and then to go to university.

**Organization:** He does not belong to any Mapuche organization

Last name: He has one Mapuche last name.

# **Appendix Two: Interview schedule**

#### **Background Information**

- Age
- Current employment
- Highest educational qualification
- Place of living (neighbourhood)
- Marital status and family members

#### **CHILDHOOD**

- 1. Tell me about your family?
- 2. Do you have brothers and sisters?
- 3. How is your relationship with your father?
- 4. How is your relationship with your mother?
- 5. How is your relationship with your brothers and sister?
- 6. Did they attend university?
- 7. What is their jobs?
- 8. How do you describe your childhood?
- 9. What kind of school did you attend?
- 10. How were your marks there?
- 11. Did you have friends?
- 12. Did you see social difference between your friends and you?
- 13. Which was the role of your teacher at school?
- 14. Did your parents support you during the school period?

#### **UNIVERSITY EXPERIENCE**

- 15. When you did first think about gone to university?
  - Why did you want to go to university?
- 16. Did you know about the experiences of others Mapuche going to university?
- 17. Did you know about the experiences of others in your family going to university?
- 18. Did you get help/support in going to university?
  - Family, friends, others?
- 19. What was the reaction of your family when you went to university?
  - What do they think about university?

- Do you think if you are (opposite) female/male they think the same about going to university?
- 20. What was you view of what university would be like?
- Did it match up to your experience?
- Did you do anything to prepare for it?
- How do you prepare to go the university? How long it takes you?
- 21. What was it like when your first days that you went to university?
  - It was easy to fit it?
  - Did you ever feel out place at university?
  - In the case of you feel out place, did people realise you feel out of place?
  - Do you feel culture shock?
  - Do you feel out place going to university?
- 22. What were the significant aspects of going to university?
- 23. Do you think the difficult/good experiences have relation with your gender identity?
- 24. How easy did you find it to make friends?
  - With Mapuche people?
  - With other groups?
  - With female or male?
  - As a female/male did you have to change your behaviour to fit it in those groups?
- 25. Did you tend to group together with other Mapuche students?
- 26. Did you have the idea there were more Mapuche men or Mapuche female studying in your university?
- 27. Did you avoid Mapuche people?
  - Where their situations where you felt uncomfortable?
  - What did you feel in that moment?
- 28. Did you avoid non-Mapuche people?
  - Where you felt uncomfortable?
  - What did you feel in that moment?
- 29. Did you think you experienced discrimination? Could you tell me about that?

- 30. Did you feel you are ever treated differently because you are Mapuche?
  - Did you saw experiences of discrimination of other Mapuche? And others?

#### **CAREER EXPERIENCE**

31. How did you start you career out of university? Or – what was your first job on leaving university?

Was difficult find a job?

- 32. Did you go into a job where there were others Mapuche?
  - If not, was that an issue?
- 33. Did you feel you had to change your behaviour to fit it in your job?
  - Do you think that for be female/male had to change your behaviour to fit it in your job?
- 34. Do you remember any awkward situations in your job related to being Mapuche?
- 35. Do you think people respond to you different because you are Mapuche?
- 36. Do you ever talk about being Mapuche with someone?
- 37. Do you ever talk about being Mapuche with other Mapuche?
- 38. Do you socialise with people of job at workplace?
  - Do you socialise with people outside of workplace?
  - For festivities? For celebration? For drinks? For food?
  - Do you ever talk about Mapuche related things with your work colleagues?
- 39. What do you think about common stereotypes about Mapuche?
  - Do you care?
  - Do you feel uncomfortable with that stereotype?
- 40. Do you think your friends and colleagues have stereotypes about Mapuche?
  - How do you feel about that?
- 41. What do you think about other stereotypes (non-Mapuche) for example?
- 42. Are there any tensions for you about being a professional female/male Mapuche?
- 43. Do you think that in your workplace respect the cultural differences?
- 44. If you look back in your life, how do you describe your life work trajectory until now?
- 45. What do you think about being a professional Mapuche nowadays?
- 46. What does means be Mapuche for you?

# **Appendix Three: Consent Form**

# **University of Manchester**

# **School of Social Sciences**

# An investigation into the social mobility experiences of indigenous peoples

**CONSENT FORM** 

If you are happy to participate please read the consent form and initial it:

		Pleas e Initia I Box
1.	I confirm that I have read the attached information sheet on the above project and have had the opportunity to consider the information and ask questions and had these answered satisfactorily.	
2.	I understand that my participation in the study is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time without giving a reason	
3.	I understand that the interviews will be audio-recorded	
4.	I agree to the use of quotations that are anonymous. If a quotation of yours is used in the final text, your confidentiality will be preserved by using generic names; for example, "I from Temuco" (Teacher, 30 years old, Santiago).	

I agree to take part in the above project			
Name of participant	Date	Signature	
Name of person taking	Date	Signature	
consent			



# **Appendix Four: Participant Information Sheet**

An investigation into the social mobility experiences of indigenous peoples

# **Participant Information Sheet**

#### Who will conduct the research?

My name is Denisse Sepúlveda Sánchez and I am doing my PhD in the University of Manchester, School of Social Sciences, Sociology department. My research is about the social mobility experiences of Mapuche people with higher education qualifications. The interviews will be undertaken between July and December 2015, in Santiago.

#### What is the aim of the research?

My research looks at how mobility affects people's social identity and everyday social practices. The study will provide information of academic value. It will contribute to social research on how social mobility affects class inequalities and ethnic discrimination. The purpose of the interviews is to ask people who have experienced social mobility how they view their experiences, both positive and negative, and if they think their social mobility has affected their social identity?

# About your participation in the research

You will be asked to tell your story in an informal interview, which should last from two to three hours. There are no right or wrong answers. I am interested in your experiences and views. You will be asked to reflect on your life story and some of the most important experiences of your life. Because you will be discussing personal details, it is possible that emotional issues or sensitive personal information about your or your family may be discussed during the interview. You can refuse to answer any question or stop the interview at any time. Your participation will not involve monetary payment. I would like to record the interview and the form attached gives you the option to refuse this.

### What happens to the data collected?

Your interview will be recorded, transcribed and translated. Your identity will be anonymised, and every effort will be made to ensure that no information that could

personally identify you, or people mentioned in your interview, will be included in any reports of the study findings. Some selected quotations from the interview may be used in academic writing, for my doctoral thesis and academic publication.

#### What happens if I do not want to take part or if I change my mind?

Your participation in this research is voluntary and you can decide to withdraw at any time if you wish to.

## Will the outcomes of the research be published?

When the research finishes, you will be able to access the final outcome of the study, by receiving the full-text via email or paper.

Contact for further information

If you have any questions or concerns you can contact:

Denisse Sepúlveda Sánchez denisse.sepulveda@postgrad.manchester.ac.uk; denissesep@u.uchile.cl

+44 7732944159 / +56452346466

If you have any concerns about my role as researcher, you can contact my PhD supervisors at the University of Manchester:

Dr Wendy Bottero, email: wendy.bottero@manchester.ac.uk, Tel: +44 0161 275-0267

Dr Bridget Byrne, email: bridget.byrne@manchester.ac.uk, Tel: +44 0161 275-2503

If a participant wants to make a formal complaint about the conduct of the research they should contact the Head of the Research Office, Christie Building, University of Manchester, Oxford Road, Manchester, M13 9PL.

## References

Aillañir, C.G. (2001). Prejuicio étnico subyacente en la pedagogía de aula que aplican profesores no mapuches respecto de sus alumnos mapuches en dos escuelas de la comuna de Padre Las Casas. Undergraduate thesis in Intercultural primary education, Universidad Católica de Temuco, Chile.

Anthias, F. (2002) Beyond feminism and multiculturalism: locating difference and the politics of location. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 25 (3), 275-394.

Anthias, F. & Yuval-Davis, N. (1992). Racialized boundaries: Race, nation, gender, colour and class and the anti-racist struggle. London & New York: Routledge.

Antileo, E. (2007) Mapuche y Santiaguino: El movimiento Mapuche en torno al dilema de urbanidad, working paper series 29. Available at: <a href="http://www.mapuche.info/wps">http://www.mapuche.info/wps</a> pdf/antileo070700.pdf [accessed 18 March 2018]

Antileo, E. (2012). Nuevas formas de colonialismo: Diáspora Mapuche y el discurso de la multiculturalidad. Master thesis in Latinamerican studies, Universidad De Chile Facultad De Filosofia y Humanidades Escuela De Postgrado.

Araujo, K. & Martuccelli, D. (2015). La escuela y la cuestión del mérito: reflexiones desde la experiencia chilena. *Educação e Pesquisa*, 41, 1503-1520.

Arreguín, R., Sandoval, S. & Gonzalez-Jurado, J. (2016). Preocupación por la apariencia física en usuarios de empresas multideportivas de México. *Revista de Psicología del Deporte*, 25 (2), 329-337.

Atkinson, R. (2002). The life history interview. In: Gobrium, J. & Holstein J. (eds) *Handbook of Interview research, context and Method*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage publications.

Barozet (2017). Serie sobre clase media (4): Ese gran miedo a resbalar, Ciper, centro de investigación periodística. Available at: <a href="http://ciperchile.cl/2017/05/17/serie-sobre-clase-media-4-entre-la-meritocracia-y-el-pituto/">http://ciperchile.cl/2017/05/17/serie-sobre-clase-media-4-entre-la-meritocracia-y-el-pituto/</a> [Accessed 18 March 2018]

Barozet, E. (2013). Experimentación en torno a la tolerancia a la desigualdad en Chile: un juego de clasificaciones y justificaciones. *Seminario internacional Desigualdad y Movilidad en America Latina*, Mendoza, Argentina, 2-29 June 2013.

Bathmaker, I. (2016) Bathmaker, I., Ingram, N., Abrahams, J. *et al.* (2016). *Fitting in and Getting on: Higher Education, Social Class and Social Mobility. The degree of generation*. UK: Palgrave Macmillan.

Bauman, Z. (1992). *Intimations of postmodernity*. London: Routledge.

Baxter, A. & Britton, C. (2001). Risk, identity and change: Becoming a mature student. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 11(1), 87-104.

Beck, U. (1992). Risk society. London: Sage.

Bello, A. (2016). Belonging or identity? Implications of two categories for indigenous cultural rights and fighting against racism. *Antropologias del Sur*, 6, 13 -27.

Benavente, J. & Álvarez, P. (2012) Evaluacion de impacto de las becas de educacion superior de Mineduc, informe final. Intelis, Verde. Facultad Economia y Negocios Universidad de Chile.

Bengoa, J. (1996). Historia del pueblo Mapuche (siglo XIX y XX). Santiago: Ediciones SUR.

Bengoa, J. (1999) Historia de un conflicto: El Estado y los Mapuches en el Siglo XX. Santiago: Editorial Planeta.

Bennett, J. (2015) Narrating family histories: Negotiating identity and belonging through tropes of nostalgia and authenticity. *Current Sociology*.

Benson, M. (2014). Trajectories of Middle-class Belonging: The Dynamics of Place Attachment and Classed Identities. *Urban studies*, *51*(14) 3097-3112.

Blackburn, R. & Prandy, K. (1997). The reproduction of social inequality. *Sociology*, 31(3), 491 – 509.

Blanco, C. & Meneses, F. (2011). Estudiantes indígenas y educación superior en Chile: acceso y beneficio. In: *Inclusión Social, Interculturalidad y Equidad en Educación Superior*. Seminario Internacional Inclusión Social y Equidad en la Educación Superior. 2° Encuentro Interuniversitario de Educación Superior, Temuco, Fundación Equitas, Chile.

Blau, P. & Duncan, O. (1967). *The American Occupational Structure*. New York: John Wiley.

Bonnefoy, J. (2013). Justice sociale: De la mobilisation à la mobilité sociale. L'expérience de l'injustice au Chili (1990-2010). PhD thesis in Sociology, EHESS, Paris.

Bottero, W. (2005). Stratification: Social division and inequality. Abingdon: Routledge.

Bourdieu, P. & Passeron, J. (1977). Reproduction in education, society and culture. London: Sage.

Bourdieu, P. (1979). 3 Stages of Cultural Capital. *Actes De La Recherche En Sciences Sociales*, 30, 3-6.

Bourdieu, P., 1984, *Distinction: a social critique of the judgement of taste*: London, London: Routledge.

Bourdieu, P. (1985). The Effect of Social Field and the Effect of Professional Bodies. *Actes De La Recherche En Sciences Sociales*, 73-73.

Bourdieu, P., & Wacquant, L. (1992). *An Invitation to Reflexive Sociology*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1995), Respuesta por una antropología reflexiva (Responses for a reflective anthropology). Mexico: Grijalbo.

Bourdieu, P. (2000). Pascalian Meditations. Cambridge: Polity

Byrne, B. (2003a) Qualitative interviewing. In: Byrne, B. & Searle, C. (Eds). *Social Research Method*. London: Sage.

Byrne, B. (2003b). Reciting the self: narrative representations of the self in qualitative interviews. *Feminist Theory*, 4, 29-49.

Byrne, B. (2015). Rethinking intersectionality and whiteness at the borders of citizenship. *Sociological Research Online*, 20 (3), 16.

Cabrera, J. (2016). Conceptual complexities of colonialism and postcolonial. Approaches from the case of the Mapuche people. *Izquierdas* 26, 169-191.

Cadem survey (2017). Plaza Pública Cadem: Estudio N° 165.

Cain, A. (2007) Social mobility of ethnic minorities in the Netherlands. The peculiarities of class and ethnicity. Delft: Eburon.

Calfio, M. & Velasco, LF. (2005). Mujeres indígenas en América Latina: Brechas de género o de etnia. Seminario Internacional, CEPAL, Santiago de Chile.

Canales P. & Rea C. (2013). Claro de luz. Descolonización e intelectualidades Indígenas en Abya Yala, siglos XX y XXI. Santiago: Ediciones IDEA-USACH.

Caniuqueo, S. (2006). Siglo XX en Gulumapu: de la fragmentación del Wallmapu a la unidad nacional mapuche. 1880-1978. In: Mariman, P., Caniuqueo, S., Millalen, J., et al, Escucha, winka...! Cuatro ensayos de Historia Nacional Mapuche y un epílogo sobre el futuro. Santiago: Lom, pp. 129-217.

Cantero, V. & Williamson, G. (2009). Intergenerational social mobility by ethnicity: Empirical evidence Araucanía Region, Chile. *Universum*. 24(1), 22-40.

Carvajal, A. & Peralta, J. (2006). *A Desalambrar. Historias de mapuches y chilenos en la lucha por la tierra.* Santiago: Editorial Ayun.

CASEN Survey (2017) Informe de desarrollo social 2017, Ministerio de Desarrollo Social. Available at: <a href="http://www.casen2017.cl/">http://www.casen2017.cl/</a> [Accessed 18 March 2018]

CASEN Survey (2013) Encuesta de caracterización socioeconómica nacional. Una medición de la pobreza moderna y transparente para Chile. Available at: <a href="http://observatorio.ministeriodesarrollosocial.gob.cl/documentos/Presentacion Result">http://observatorio.ministeriodesarrollosocial.gob.cl/documentos/Presentacion Result ados Encuesta Casen 2013.pdf</a> [Accessed 26 March 2018)

CASEN Survey (2015) Encuesta de caracterización socioeconómica nacional. Ampliando la mirada sobre la pobreza y la desigualdad, Ministerio de Desarrollo Social Subsecretaría de Evaluación Social 22 de Septiembre de 2016. Available at <a href="http://observatorio.ministeriodesarrollosocial.gob.cl/casen-multidimensional/casen/docs/CASEN 2015 Ampliando la mirada sobre la pobreza desigualdad.pdf">http://observatorio.ministeriodesarrollosocial.gob.cl/casen-multidimensional/casen/docs/CASEN 2015 Ampliando la mirada sobre la pobreza desigualdad.pdf</a> [accessed 10 July 2017]

Castillo, J. (2009). "¿Cuál es la brecha salarial justa? Opinión pública y legitimación de la desigualdad económica en Chile". *Estudios Públicos* 113, 237-266.

Castro, M. (2001) El proceso migratorio de la población Mapuche en Chile: su adaptación e integración a la vida urbana. *Scripta Nova. Revista Electrónica de Geografía y Ciencias Sociales. Universidad de Barcelona* 94 (19).

Charmaz, K. (2002). Grounded theory analysis. In Gubrium J. & Holstein J. (Eds.). *Handbook of interview research*, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Chenard, A. (2006) La identidad Mapuche en el medio urbano *Meli Wixan Mapu*. Available at: <a href="http://meli.mapuches.org/spip.php?article177">http://meli.mapuches.org/spip.php?article177</a> [Accessed 18 March 2018]

Clair, M. & Denis, J. (2015). Sociology of racism. *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences, 2nd edition,* 19, 857-863.

Clark, T. & Lipset, S. (1996). Are social classes dying? In: D. Lee and B. Turner (Eds.) *Conflict about Class*. Harlow: Longman.

Comunidad Historia Mapuche (2015). Available at: https://www.comunidadhistoriamapuche.cl/ [Accessed Sept 2015]

Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A Black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics. *The University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 140, 139-167.

Crook, S., Pakulski, J. and Waters, M. (1992). Postmodernization. London: Sage.

De Sousa Santos, B. (2010). *Descolonizar el saber, reinventar el poder*. Montevideo: Ediciones Trilce-Extensión universitaria, Universidad de la Republica.

De Sousa Santos, B. (2011). Epistemologías del sur. *Utopía y Praxis Latinoamericana*, 16 (54), 17–3.

Devine, F. (1992). Social identities, class identity and political perspectives. *The Sociological Review*, 40 (2), 229-252.

Diprose, R. (2008). Where' your people from girl? Belonging to race, gender and place beneath clouds. *Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies*, 19(3).

Duran, T., Catriquir, D. & Hernández, A. (2007). Revitalización del mapuzugun. Una visión crítica desde la educación intercultural, la sociolingüística y la antropología. In: Duran, T., Catriquir, D. & Hernández, A. (eds) *Patrimonio cultural Mapuche. Volumen 1*. Temuco: Editorial UC Temuco, pp. 107-125.

Enama (2015). Available at: <a href="http://enama.cl/">http://enama.cl/</a> [Accessed Sept 2015]

Erikson, R. & Goldthorpe, J. (1992). *The constant flux. A study of class mobility in industrial societies*. Oxford: Clarendon Press,

Espinoza, V. (2002). La movilidad ocupacional en el Cono Sur, Acerca de las raíces estructurales de la desigualdad social. *Proposiciones*, 34, 25-43.

Espinoza, V., Barozet, E. & Méndez, M. (2013). Estratificación y movilidad social bajo un modelo neoliberal: El caso de Chile. *Lavboratorio*, 25, 169-192.

Fajardo, V. & Ramirez E. (2012). Proceso de formación universitaria de estudiantes mapuche de la Universidad Católica de Temuco y sus expectativas de inserción en sus territorios de origen. Documento de Trabajo Nº 1 Serie Estudios Territoriales. Centro Latinoamericano para el Desarrollo rural.

Fernández, B (2010) Quienes son los intelectuales indígenas ecuatorianos? Aportes para una construcción intercultural de saberes en América latina. *A parte Rei, Revista de Filosofía*, 71.

Filgueira, C. & Genelett, C. (1981). *Estratificación social y movilidad ocupacional en América Latina*. Santiago: Cepal.

Fitzpatrick, D. (2013) Using biography in qualitative research Methods. Working paper, University of Manchester.

Friedman, S. (2016). Habitus clivé and the emotional imprint of social mobility. *Sociological Review*, 64, 129-147.

Fundación Aitue (2015). Available at: <a href="http://www.fundacionaitue.cl/home/">http://www.fundacionaitue.cl/home/</a> [Accessed Sept 2015]

Fundación Chile Intercultural (2015). Available at: <a href="http://chileintercultural.org/index.php/voces-mapuche/">http://chileintercultural.org/index.php/voces-mapuche/</a> [Accessed Sept 2015]

Fundación Ideas & Universidad de Chile. (1997). Primera encuesta sobre intolerancia y discriminación: Informe y análisis. Santiago.

Fundación Ideas & Universidad de Chile. (2000). Segunda encuesta sobre intolerancia y discriminación: Informe y análisis. Santiago.

Garretón, M. and Cumsille, G. (2002). Las percepciones de la desigualdad en Chile. *Proposiciones* 34, 45-56.

Giannelli, L. (2008). La lengua nativa entre los mapuches urbanizados de Santiago de Chile. Un ejemplo de análisis en el marco de la hegemonía lingüístico-cultural. *NAE*, 24, 23-31.

Goldthorpe, J., Llewellyn, C. & Payne G. (1980). *Class structure and social mobility in modern Britain*. Oxford: Clarendon.

Granfield, R. (1991). Making it by faking it: Working class students in an elite academic environment. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*, 20 (3), 331-351.

Hall, S. (1988) New Ethnicities. In: Mercer, K. (ed) *Black Film, British Cinema*, a special issue of ICA Documents 7. London: British Film Institute, Institute for Contemporary Arts.

Hall, S. (2000). Who needs 'identity'?'. In: du Gay, P., Evans, J. and Redman, P (eds.). *Identity: a reader*. London: Sage Publications.

Hall, S., (1996). Old and new identities, old and new ethnicities. Globalisation and the world system. London: Macmillan Educational, 42-68.

Harries, B. (2012) Talking race in everyday spaces of the city. PhD thesis in Sociology, School of Social Sciences, University of Manchester.

Harries, B. (2016) What's sex got to do with it? When a woman asks questions. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 59, 48-57.

INE (2016). National Statistics Institute. Chile.

INE. (2002). Census of Population and Housing. Santiago: Statistics National Institute.

INE. (2012). Census of population and housing. Santiago: Statistics National Institute.

Karlgren, G. (2015). Narratives of Belonging in a Suburb of Change. PhD thesis, Department of Sociology, Stockholms Universitet.

Lamaison, P. (1986) From Rules to Strategies: An Interview with Pierre Bourdieu. Cultural Anthropology, 1 (1), 110-120.

Lamaison, P., (1986). From rules to strategies: An interview with Pierre Bourdieu. *Cultural Anthropology*, 1, 110-120.

Lawler, S. (1999) Getting out and Getting Away: Women's Narratives of Class Mobility. *Feminist Review*, 63, 3-24.

Lehmann, W. (2009). Becoming middle class: How working-class university students draw and transgress moral class boundaries. *Sociology*, 43(4), 631-647.

Lehmann, W. (2013). Ethnicity as social capital: an examination of first-generation, ethnic-minority students at a Canadian university (with Aisha Birani). *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 23(4), 281-297.

Littler, J. (2013). Meritocracy as Plutocracy: The Marketising of 'Equality' Within Neoliberalism. *New Formations: A Journal of Culture/Theory/Politics*, 80-81, 52-72.

Mason, J. (2002). Qualitative researching. Thousand Oaks, CA.: Sage Publications...

Mason, J. (2018). Qualitative Researching. UK: Sage.

McCall, L. (2005). The Complexity of Intersectionality. Signs, 30(3), 1771-1800.

McNay, L. (2008) The trouble with recognition: Subjectivity, suffering, and agency. *Sociological Theory*, 26 (3), 271-296.

Méndez, M. (2002). Experiencias y Significados asociados a la idea de movilidad social en el relato de doce familias floridanas. *Revista Mad* (6).

Méndez, M. (2008). Middle class identities in a neoliberal age: tensions between contested authenticities. *The Sociological Review*, 56, 220-237.

Mendez, M., & Gayo, M. (2007). El perfil de un debate: Movilidad y meritocracia. Contribución al estudio de las sociedades latinoamericanas. In Franco R., León A., & Atria R. (Eds.), Estratificación y movilidad social en América Latina. Transformaciones estructurales de un cuarto de siglo. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Merino, M. (2007). El discurso de la discriminación percibida en Mapuches de Chile. *Discurso & Sociedad*, 1(4), 604-622.

Merino, M. & Pilleux, P. (2003). El prejuicio étnico desde una perspectiva del análisis del discurso. *Onomázein*, 9, 169-86.

Merino, M. & Quilaqueo, D. (2004). Estereotipos y prejuicio étnico hacia los mapuches en textos complementarios a la asignatura de Historia. *Campo Abierto*, 23, 119-138.

Montecino, S. (1993). Diagnóstico sobre inserción laboral de mujeres mapuche rurales y urbanas. Santiago: Universidad de Chile. Facultad de Ciencias Sociales, Programa Interdisciplinario de Estudios de Género.

Navarrete, S., Candia, R. & Puchi, R. (2013). Factores asociados a la deserción/retención de los estudiantes mapuche de la Universidad de la Frontera e incidencia de los programas de apoyo académico. *Calidad en la educación*, 39, 43-80.

Noy, C. (2008) Sampling Knowledge: The hermeneutics of snowball sampling in qualitative research. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 11:4, 327-344

Órdenes Delgado, M. (2016). Conflicto mapuche-campesino en la Araucanía: un análisis a partir de la Estructura de Oportunidades Políticas (EOP). 1967-1973. *Izquierdas*, 26, 126-163.

Oyarce et al (2012) Desigualdades territoriales y exclusión social del pueblo mapuche en Chile Situación en la comuna de Ercilla desde un enfoque de derechos. Cepal y Unelfe, Pu Lof Mapu Xawun ATM.

Pairicán, F. (2014). *Malón. La rebelión del movimiento mapuche. 1990-2013*. Santiago: Pehuén Editores, **pp 419.** 

Perezt, H. (2000). Los métodos en sociología: La observación. Quito: ABYA YALA.

PNUD (2013) Informe sobre Desarrollo Humano 2013 El ascenso del Sur: Progreso humano en un mundo diverso ISBN 978-92-1-126340-4 <a href="http://www.undp.org/content/dam/venezuela/docs/undp-ve-IDH-2013.pdf">http://www.undp.org/content/dam/venezuela/docs/undp-ve-IDH-2013.pdf</a>

PNUD (2017). *Desiguales, orígenes, cambios y desafíos de la brecha social en Chile*. Chile: Ugbar Editores.

Polizzi, P. (2014). Chilescopio Survey. Consultora visión humana. Available at <a href="http://www.visionhumana.cl/">http://www.visionhumana.cl/</a> [accessed March 2018].

Rahman, K. (2013). Belonging and Learning to Belong in School: The Implications of the Hidden Curriculum for Indigenous Students: Discourses. *Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, *34*(5), 660-672.

Reay D. (2013) Social mobility, a panacea for austere times: tales of emperors, frogs, and tadpoles. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 34(5-6), 660-677.

Reay D. (2015). Habitus and the psychosocial: Bourdieu with feelings. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 45:1, 9-23.

Reay, D. (1998). Rethinking social class: Qualitative perspectives on gender and social class *Sociology* 32 (2), 259-275.

Reay, D. (2005) Who goes where in higher education: an issue of class, ethnicity and increasing concern. Paper presented at the Institute for Policy Studies in Education, University of Birmingham, February 2005. Available at: http://asp.wlv.ac.uk/Level3.asp?UserType=11&Level3=1659 [Accessed 26 March 2018].

Reay, D. Crozier, G. & Clayton, J. (2010), "Fitting in" or "standing out': working-class students in UK higher education. *British Educational Research Journal* 32(1), 1-19.

Reay, D., Crozier, G. & Clayton, J. (2009). 'Strangers in paradise'? Working-class students in elite universities. *Sociology*, 43 (6): 1103-1121.

Richards, P. (2010). Of Indians and terrorists: How the state and local elites construct the Mapuche in neoliberal multicultural Chile. *Latin American Studies*, 42, 59 – 90.

Roberts, B. (2002). Biographical research. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Rollock, N. (2012). The Invisibility of race: Intersectional reflections on the liminal space of alterity. Special issue: Critical race theory in England. *Race Ethnicity & Education*, 15 (1), 65-84.

Rollock, N. (2014). Race, class and the harmony of dispositions. *Sociology* 48 (3), 445-451.

Rollock, N., Gillborn, D., Ball, S. & Vincent, C. (2011). The Public Identities of the Black middle classes: managing race in public spaces. *Sociology*, 45 (6), 1078-1093.

Rollock, N., Gillborn, D., Vincent, C. & Ball, S. (2015). *The colour of class: The educational strategies of the Black middle classes*. London & New York: Routledge.

Rollock, N., Vincent, C., Ball, S. & Gillborn, D. (2013). Middle class by profession: Class status and identification amongst the Black middle classes. *Ethnicities*, 13(3), 253-275.

Ruiz, C. (2008) Síntesis Histórica Del Pueblo Mapuche (Siglos XVI-XX). In Historia y luchas del pueblo mapuche. Ediciones de Le Monde Diplomatique, Santiago, 2008, pp. 59-64 Elicura Chihuailaf, Rosamel Millamán Reinao, Alain Devalpo, Jaime Massardo y Carlos Ruiz Rodríguez http://www.rebelion.org/docs/74335.pdf [accessed 16 March 2018]

Rumtun (2015). Available at: <a href="http://www.uchileindigena.cl/nace-centro-de-estudios-mapuche-rumtun/">http://www.uchileindigena.cl/nace-centro-de-estudios-mapuche-rumtun/</a> [Accessed Sept 2015]

Salas, A. (1987). Hablar en mapuche es vivir en mapuche. Especificidad de la relación lengua/cultura. *RLA*, 25, 27-35.

San Martín, B. (2001). La representación de los Mapuche en la prensa nacional. Doctoral thesis in Linguistic, Universidad Católica de Valparaíso, Chile.

Saunders, P. (1995). Might Britain be a meritocracy? Sociology, 29 (1): 23-41.

Saunders, P. (1996). *Unequal but fair?*. London: Institute of Economic Affairs.

Savage, M. (2000). *Class analysis and social transformation*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Savage, M. (2016) The fall and rise of class analysis in British sociology, 1950-2016. *Tempo Social*, 28(2), 57-72.

Savage, M. & Egerton, M. (1997) Social mobility, individual ability and the inheritance of class inequality. *Sociology* 31 (4), 645 - 672.

Savage, M., Bagnall, G. & Longhurst, B. (2001). Ordinary, ambivalent, and defensive: Class identities in the Northwest of England. *Sociology*, 35:875.

Savage, M., Devine, F., Cunningham, N., et al. (2013). A new model of social class? Findings from the BBC's great British class survey experiment. Sociology, 47 (2), 219-250.

Schmuck, R. (1997). *Practical action research for change*. Arlington Heights, IL: IRI/Skylight Training and Publishing.

Skeggs, B. (1997). Formations of class and gender. London: Sage Publications.

Skeggs, B. (2005) The making of class and gender through visualizing moral subject formation. *Sociology* 39 (5), 965–982.

Skeggs, B. (2005). Introducing Pierre Bourdieu's analysis of class, gender and sexuality. In: Adkins, L. &. Skeggs, B. (eds) *Feminism after Bourdieu*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Stavenhagen, R. (2001). Conflictos étnicos y estado nacional: conclusiones de un análisis comparativo *Estudios Sociológicos*, 19(1), 3-25.

Swartz, D. (1997). *Culture and power: The sociology of Pierre Bourdieu*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Torche, F. (2005). Unequal but fluid social mobility in Chile in comparative perspective. *American Sociological Review*, 70 (3), 422-450.

Torche, F. & Wormald, G. (2004). *Estratificación y movilidad social en Chile: entre la adscripción y el logro.* Santiago: CEPAL.

Tricot, T. (2013). Autonomía. El Movimiento Mapuche de Resistencia. Santiago: CEIBO.

Walby, S., Armstrong, J. & Strid, S. (2012). Intersectionality: Multiple Inequalities in Social Theory. *Sociology*, 46(2), 224 – 240.

Waldman, G. (2012). Historical memory and present-day oblivion: The Mapuche conflict in post-dictatorial Chile. *Time & Society*, 21 (1), 55-70

Wallmapuwen (2015). Available at: http://wallmapuwen.cl/ [Accessed Sept 2015]

Weaver, H. (2001). Indigenous identity: What is it and who really has it? *The American Indian Quarterly* 25(2), 240-255.

Webb, A. & Sepulveda, D. (2018). Re-Signifying and negotiating indigenous identity in university spaces: A qualitative study from Chile. *Studies in Higher Education* (in review).

Wittig, F. (2009). Desplazamiento y vigencia del Mapudungún en Chile: Un análisis desde el discurso reflexivo de los hablantes urbanos. *Revista de lingüística teórica y aplicada*, 47(2), 135-155.

World Bank (2017). Gini index <a href="https://datos.bancomundial.org/indicador/SI.POV.GINI">https://datos.bancomundial.org/indicador/SI.POV.GINI</a> [accessed 10 February 2018]

Yopo Díaz, M. (2012). Políticas sociales y pueblos indígenas en Chile: Aproximación crítica desde la noción de agencia. *Universum (Talca)*, 27(2), 187-208.

Yuval-Davis, N. (2007). Intersectionality, citizenship and contemporary politics of belonging. *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*, 10 (4), 561-574.

Zapata, C. & Abarca, G. (2007). Indigenous peoples and higher education in Chile: the case of the Mapuche. *Calidad en la educación*, 26, 57-59.

Zapata, C. & Oliva, M. (2011). Experiencia de inserción e impacto institucional de los becarios del Programa Internacional de Becas de la Fundación Ford con ascendencia y adscripción indígena en la Universidad de Chile. In: Díaz P. (Ed.). *Pueblos indígenas y Educación Superior en América Latina: Experiencias, tensiones y desafíos* (pp. 43-71). Santiago de Chile: Equitas.