

Chapter 2: Theoretical Framework

‘There is more to life than books, you know, but not much more’

(‘Handsome Devil’, 1984)

Roy Shuker (1994:01) states that ‘to study popular music is to study popular culture’. This claim may seem evident; however, the idea of what ‘popular’ means is still debatable. If on the one hand ‘popular’ refers to something that appeals to a great amount of people, on the other hand, it can also be seen as something that is produced for or by a sector of the population who are not part of the elite. In the case of popular music, the word ‘popular’ usually refers to the chart-oriented products of record companies. If the use of the word ‘popular’ produces two different understandings, ‘popular music’ generates no less doubt. To define popular music is a complex task. Richard Middleton (1990) suggests that every song or music can be considered popular because it must be popular with someone. The criteria to what counts as popular in music, and the genres that can be considered as popular music are not very clear. ‘Classical music clearly has sufficient following to be considered popular, while conversely, some forms of popular music are quite exclusive (e.g. trash metal)’ (Shuker, 1994:05-06). This study can be considered part of popular music studies because the chosen genre of music (i.e. indie) and the artist who performs it (Morrissey) have some commercial appeal, which means that both genre and artist have a considerable following to produce profit. However they both enjoy a respectable status among critics and public.

Unlike the majority of studies in popular music studies, this thesis does not focus on performance⁹ or audience, but on the work fans do and specialised journalists used to do: providing translations of the lyrics for other fans. This means that the original lyrics, however important they may be to their audience/author, are not the main focus here, but rather the points of reference for amateur translation work. The Brazilian audience’s passion for popular music helps to explain why part of the audience (i.e. music journalists and fans) decided to invest their time producing the translations.

⁹ Performance is taken into consideration here when it intervenes in the lyrics’ meaning. Goddard’s (2002 and 2009) and Rogan’s (2006) guides into Morrissey’s lyrics and the music which accompanies them.

The musical experience is usually perceived as a whole, but ‘everything within the song has a double substance: musical and textual. It is not possible to say that the most important part of the song, of its success, does not lay on the musical part. However, the song presents itself as a whole as music-speech’ (Morin 1965:02). Most of Morrissey’s Brazilian fans declared in virtual communities¹⁰ that the first thing to call their attention to the artist was the instrumentation of his songs, but what kept them buying the records for 27 years was the lyrics.

In the context of this thesis, ‘music’ is used to denominate the instrumental part, ‘vocal’ to refer to any sound produced using a performer’s vocal chords, and ‘lyrics’ for the words used within the length of the track. ‘Song’ is used to designate music and lyrics as a whole unit. Although the lyrics are mainly investigated as individual textual pieces, it is clear that ‘the interrelationship of words and music can indeed form a coherent whole. In such a case, understanding the words is necessary to understand that coherence’ (Robinson 1980). For an immense part of the Brazilian audience of popular music, the understanding of the lyrics depends highly on translation. The interrelationship of music and lyrics in Morrissey’s oeuvre can be extended to the use of sound effects and sample ‘noises’¹¹. These sound effects or sample noises, even when not appearing in the original lyrics sheet, are considered here as part of the lyrics when the translators added them to the lyrics the translators present as their Source Text before translating them. This practice is reproduced here in order to follow the translators’ means to produce meaning in their translations.

The emotional power of the song cannot be underestimated. Alan Merriam (1964:218) states that ‘there is probably no other human cultural activity which is so all-pervasive and which reaches into, shapes, and often controls so much of human behaviour’. The development of new technologies to produce, reproduce and stock music/songs tightened songs relationship with the audience.

¹⁰ The main communities dedicated to Morrissey in Brazil are: *Morrissey Brasil* (Morrissey Brazil <http://www.orkut.com/Main#Community?cmm=75962>), *Fanáticos por Morrissey* (Morrissey’s fanatics <http://www.orkut.com/Main#Community?cmm=654224>) and *Morrissey – Letras Traduzidas* (Morrissey – Translated lyrics <http://www.orkut.com/Main#Community?cmm=15197779>).

¹¹ By sound effects and sample noises, I mean all other vocal interferences present in performance (whether in studio or live). Morrissey uses to add other voices to his songs, such as extracts of movies, plays, laughs etc. A great number of sound effects, such as guillotines, chainsaws, cows mooing, bells, can also be heard to produce meaning and facilitate the understanding of the message.

Music¹² has become entirely mobile: it can follow us around the house, from living-room to kitchen and bathroom; on journeys, as ‘in-car entertainment’ and ‘the walkman effect’; across national and political boundaries; in and out of love and work and sickness (Frith, 1996:236).

The musical experience has been individualized because ‘it has become a soundtrack to everyday life, and thus a central part of personal development and identity for many people’ (Hargreaves & North 1999:73). The psychological use of music must be taken into consideration in the light of its cultural uses. The use of music as a social event is also an important part of the musical experience. Most ceremonies (such as weddings, church services, parties) and some activities (such as exercising or driving in busy traffic) are marked by music. This social function of music also covers its employment ‘by people as a means of identifying themselves with particular subcultures, lifestyles, ethnic groups and social classes’ (Hargreaves & North 1999:77). In particular, adolescents use music in a variety of ways. For them music serves as a distraction from their troubles, a strategy to manage feelings such as loneliness and changes in their mood. The numerous attendance at concerts also proves that the social aspect of music is still strong. Some scholars, such as Theodore Gracyk (1996:75) and Lawrence Grossberg (2002), believe that the rock concerts are nothing else but a night out since ‘recordings, not compositions, are the primary musical work’. The recorded song in the form of LPs, CDs, computer files or videos are the main sources of Morrissey’s songs for Brazilian fans and their booklets/subtitles the source of the lyrics they rework as translations. The music experience for these fans goes beyond the ones described by Hargreaves & North (1999), these fans feel the need to appropriate the artist’s lyrics, translating them according to their own understanding of the lyrics, sometimes resignifying the lyrics according to their own experiences, in order to have a fulfilling music experience.

2.1 Popular Music

Adorno is the first academic to consider popular music as an object of study. On ‘Farewell to Jazz’ (1933), Adorno vehemently criticizes that popular music movement due to its overlaying of superficial change upon underlying musical elements that are repeated from time to time. These musical features were enough for Adorno to

¹² Frith uses the term ‘music’ in a generic sense, meaning popular music and songs.

categorise popular music as a mass market product. In brief, Adorno (1941) considers popular music as low art when compared to classical music.

According to Adorno, the key terms to differentiate popular music from ‘serious’ music are standardization and non-standardization. He states that standardization is present not only in the details but also in the form of popular music. The terminology of this ‘rigid’ format is known even to lay people. Allegedly, a popular song is conformed as verse, bridge, chorus, fade, with a sequence of repetitions that gives the audience the feeling of recognition. Thus, Adorno (1941:302) believes that the whole popular music experience is ‘pre-given and pre-accepted, therefore, it is not likely to influence, to any great extent, the reaction to detail, except to give them varying degrees of emphasis’.

Morin (1965:1) positioned popular music based on the concept of the Culture Industry, in which the more a ‘product’ is marketable/profitable the lesser it is considered as an art form, saying that the melody develops the art, while the song develops the consumption. Nowadays, ‘pop can only critique its social role in negative terms by refusing to accept its status as a commercial object, while simultaneously participating in. This is precisely what punk did’ (Brett 2011:173). Morrissey’s work insists on challenging the Culture Industry, revealing the artificial foundation on which the mass production of Culture Industry is based and keeps reproducing itself. Yet Morrissey uses the Culture Industry in his favour, exploring its power of communication in order to denounce its class and economical divisions. Furthermore, the negative sides of the mass production of music presented by the Culture Industry ‘has not stopped people from using it to express private joy or public grief; it has given us new means to do so, new ways of having an impact, new ideas of what music can be’ (Frith, 1992:74).

The discussion about the ‘authenticity’ or value of any type of music is no longer relevant in Popular Music Studies. Any music style is a legitimate object of study because it is inserted into a given set of historical, social, artistic circumstances. Morrissey’s legitimacy as an object of study is demonstrated by the academic scrutinization of his work any aspect, from gender issues (see Greco, 2011; Whiteley, 2010; Woronzoff, 2011) and nationalism (see Brooker, 2010; Campbell, 2010; Coulter, 2010; Foley, 2011; Kallioniemi, 2010; Zuberi, 2001 and 2010) to literary value (Hopps 2009) and fandom (Hazard, 2011; Maton, 2010; Snowsell 2011). The acceptance of

Morrissey's work within scholars signals to his position as an exponent in terms of narrative quality, authenticity, and relevance as an artist.

Although this work is not inscribed within Popular Music Studies, it is in dialogue with it. Some relevant aspects of musical composition are not possible to deal with here. This study limits itself to Source and Target Texts of lyrics as well as the strategies amateur translators adopt to render them into Brazilian Portuguese.

Audience

The advent of mass consumption introduces the notion of an audience, which has been conceptualised in a variety of ways. Martin Allor (1988:219) describes audience as 'an abstract totality', while John Fiske (1992) states that in Cultural Studies the term 'audience' should be replaced for 'audiencing', which would better describe the process of creating and spreading meaning. Vincent Mosco (1996:262) believes that audience 'is not an analytical category, like class, gender or race, but a product of the media industry itself' (see also Ang, 1990). This notion seems to forget that 'people's positioning as members of a particular class, gender or generation is itself mediated through their 'audiencehood' (Livingstone, 1998:197). In the case of popular music, audience is conceptualised according to the ideology in which its discourse is embedded. Whereas Adorno exclusively considers the mass audience of the music industry as service, more recent academics do not consider audience as the product of an industry that forces people to watch, listen or reproduce what is offered to them. Modern audience is a product of the modern channels of communication, which made possible not only to select what kind of information one may receive, but it is also possible to access information from different points of view coming from different parts of the world, or to decide to completely abstain from any type of information.

Being a social activity, audiencing implies a psychological disposition, which in the case of Morrissey's Brazilian fans lies in investing their quality time of leisure to involve in the creative production of meaning for the artist's lyrics in the form of translations, explanations, and forum discussions. As a product of mass consumption or an artifact of art, songs produce different impacts on the audience. These impacts depend on the level of 'commitment' the audience devotes to them. The level of audience's involvement with music can be divided in Highly-involved listeners

(19.7%), Medium-involved listener (74.2%), and Low-involved listener (6.1%)¹³. Although no similar study is available to measure the involvement of Brazilian audience, the website *Microfone* states that 90% of the Brazilian homes and 83% of the vehicles in Brazil possess a radio, and that the profile of a radio listener in Brazil is feminine (53%), aged between 20-49 years old (58%). The amount of time spent on listening to radio weekly (17 hours) can define the Brazilian audience as highly-involved listeners. Morrissey's audience can also be defined as highly-involved audience since they are not passive recipients of the lyrics, but producers of other forms of arts inspired by the lyrics, as seen in 1.4. Highly- and medium-involved listeners are the section of the audience where the functions of music are clearer.

The audience uses music in order to manage their mood. The power of music to induce and support positive emotional states is used in many occasions, such as music therapy, waiting rooms etc (Wells & Hakanen, 1991; Larson, 1995; Hargreaves & North, 1999; O'Neill, 2000; North, Hargreaves & Sloboda & O'Neill, 2001; Juslin & Laukka, 2004). This management of mood leads to the use of music as a mean to cope with problems. Music is used to alleviate such feelings as loneliness and sadness (Avery, 1979; Kurdek, 1987; Larson, 1995; DeNora, 1999). People also use music to acquire knowledge of the world, which influences in the building of identity. The construction of identity occurs because 'listeners are influenced by lyrics and ideas expressed by artists, and also subtly through identification with images of an artist or band' (Ter Bogt, Mulder, Raaijmakers & Gabhainn, 2011:149). This identification is possible because the listeners can recognise themselves in the lyrics and/or the artist's style of presentation. The identity recognition function of music can be extended from personal identity to social identity. The listeners' choices of music is a way to define and present themselves as part of a specific group (Frith, 1981; Hargreaves & North, 1999; DeNora, 2000; Sloboda & O'Neill, 2001; Hargreaves, Miell & MacDonald, 2002; Tarrant, North & Hargreaves, 2002). Besides presenting themselves as individuals, music also helps the audience to identify and perceive other people's identities (Knobloch, Vorderer & Zilmann, 2000; Rentfrow & Gosling, 2006). The social identification of audiences influences friendship formation (Selfhout, Branje, Ter Bogt & Meeus, 2009).

¹³ Nomenclature and percentage presented by Ter Bogt, Mulder, Raaijmakers and Gabhainn (2010) in a study on the profile of music listeners. The level of involvement was measured according to the declared time of consumption of music by 997 Dutch respondents aged between 12-29. Although Dutch, these findings are relevant to my discussion of Brazilian audience relationship with songs because they help to position the fan-translator in relation to their involvement with music and the artist.

Adolescents and young adults have been the main focus in research on the relationship between audience and the functions and uses of music. Medium- and especially high-involved audiences, who express their musical preferences more openly, are more likely to follow their favorite artists' messages. These audiences maintain a strong bond with their musical choices since 'musical preferences tend to have high stability, at least across adolescence and young adulthood, and music that was favoured during young adulthood is remembered best later on, suggesting people carry on a liking for the music they preferred as young adults throughout the rest of their lives.' (Ter Bogt, Mulder, Raaijmakers & Gabhainn, 2011:159)

That is probably the case of Morrissey's audience in Brazil. Although Morrissey's reputation as a cult figure is respected by all age groups of music listeners in Brazil, his fans are mainly female (52.1%), mean age of 35.5 years, educated, with home access to internet, working in graduate positions¹⁴. Their dedication in providing information on the artist's activities (release of new songs, interviews etc) are part of their weekday leisure time¹⁵. Although Morrissey's fans' motivations cannot be determined with precision, posts in the virtual communities studied shows that they believe Morrissey transcribes their 'emotions and feeling like no one else' (Isolda¹⁶), he is 'always saying things that I need to hear' (Raquel). The fan Danilo explained that he started to learn English in order to understand Morrissey's lyrics. The fans' dedication to the translation of Morrissey's lyrics seems to lie in their beliefs that the texts they translate are, in fact, an expression of their own feelings. The posts also make clear that Morrissey's fans in Brazil do not feel as part of the 'mainstream' of the popular music culture, rather being part of a select group, one that grants them a certain exclusivity, forming what can be called as fan-base or subculture.

The subdivisions in musical taste mean that, not only the standardization of musical taste is not a reality, but also that even inside 'subcultures' the audience is in search of certain individualization. For Gary Clarke (1981) the meaning of youth culture cannot be reduced to a series of groups, which look homogeneous from the outside, and which present themselves in different styles. Members of some subcultures can be recognised

¹⁴ This average fan profile was drawn after I analysed the profiles of the three main virtual communities dedicated to Morrissey. See footnote 13.

¹⁵ According to the data and time most comments appear in the main virtual communities.

¹⁶ All names were changed in order to maintain fans anonymous, according to the Ethics form signed by all participants.

by their clothes choices, hair styles etc, but these characteristics are more part of a strategy of differentiation from other subcultures/cultures than an attempt to find a 'gang', which ultimately happens due to the life style every subculture presents to their members. According to Dick Hebdige (1979), music taste and music choice are not arbitrary, but culturally generated. So, the higher the exposition to a certain type of songs, the more probable it is that a person may attach to that subculture. Although this idea can find its roots in the culture industry, the number of subcultures, styles and modes of consumptions are far from the initial 'pasteurization' proposed by Adorno and the Frankfurt School. Modes of consumption have been approached in many different ways, especially through fan culture perspective.

Theories of mass culture saw music consumption as a fanaticism associated with individual psychological weakness or crowd hysteria. Subcultural theory understood music production to be one element of a particular cultural group's homology through which it resisted the domination of the powerful elites of modern society. Some more recent theories rethought the cultural practices of fandom using ideas of active participation derived from subcultural theory. Others have tried to keep the ideas of the 'subcultural' – aligning its sense with that of 'the underground' used by music fans themselves – and so highlighting cultural discursive practices, rather than emphasizing academic interpretations of resistance. (Wall, 2001:172)

The analyses of fan culture have mainly drawn on the concept of Bourdieu's 'cultural capital'. According to Bourdieu (1984), intellectuals who lead not only educational systems but also the media build hierarchies of what constitutes 'good' or 'bad' in culture. The power to differentiate what is culturally good and bad is a source of social power that comes from the ownership of the means of production and reproduction of culture. The Cultural Capital concept allows its owners to create and reproduce differences between bad and good culture. For them 'good culture' is what is considered high arts, which they like to consume; while 'bad culture' is the popular culture that consists of what subordinate groups consume. Although Bourdieu's claim seems sympathetic to the cause of popular culture, he does state that it is not high art, which serves only to reproduce the established notion of popular music as a working class, unintelligent, easy to digest type of culture.

The dissemination of mass culture products can be understood in the light of McLuhan's (1962, 1964) Global Village concept. Not very different from the culture industry, McLuhan believed in an electronic interdependence in which the visual culture would be replaced by electronic media, abolishing the aura that only exclusive original art objects possess. This new cultural configuration would lead to a standardization of

identity. This collective identity would replace individualism and fragmentation, which would privilege the owners of the cultural capital. The Global Village can explain how an artist and his/her work can reach similar levels of success in different parts of the globe. However, the meaning attached to an artist may vary considerably not only from culture to culture but also from audience to audience or from listener to listener.

Morrissey's production, both during The Smiths period (1982-1987) and his solo career (1988-present), is considered part of the independent/alternative music, which places his songs in a non-mainstream position. The independent tag relocates his songs from standardised art to a subculture of listeners whose main characteristic is the search of an artist that reflects their feelings of sorrow and pain, their failures and wishes, using words with which they can identify. His audience does not have a physical characteristic, nor uses a specific sort of clothes or a special type of language. However, the influence of the artist in their lives can be noticeable in their ideologies and choices of other art, like literature, theatre and cinema. Similar to his audience in other parts of the world, Morrissey's audience in Brazil shows an active reaction to the artist's songs, which encapsulates not only their forms of consumption but also forms of meaning-making.

One of these forms of meaning-making is the production of new texts, in our case translations which bring a new dimension to the artist's lyrics since this new production is completely detached from its geographically, historically and chronologically intended audience. This appropriation and recreation of an artist's work by his audience is seen with some restriction by Lawrence Grossberg (1992:52-4), who states that 'even if it is true that audiences are always active, it does not follow that they are ever in control'. Grossberg seems to forget that the attempt to be in control is not a preoccupation of the audience, but of the music industry. The audience seeks to follow the musical style or artist they admire, but in so doing they take ownership as well. The Brazilian audience's 'cannibalistic'¹⁷ tradition allow the fans to appropriate the lyrics and resignify them.

¹⁷ The cannibalist manifesto is inspired in the writings of Oswald de Andrade during the modernist movement in 1922. 'It expresses the experience of a colonized people who devour what is offered to them by their colonizers but do not swallow it whole: quite the opposite, they spit what is noxious to them, but what they keep they make wholly theirs by altering and changing it to suit their nutritional needs' (Barbosa & Wyler: 1998:332)

Cult figures and fandom

According to Biskup & Pfister (1999:199), ‘people need role-models and idols. (...) They are the substance from which dreams are made; they make the world more lively and colourful, and they bring sparkle and glamour into the workday routine’. Even being conceptually slightly different, role-models and idols can be seen as forms of modern myths and cult figures. Richard Dyer (1979:10) believes that ‘stars are images in media texts, and as such are products of Hollywood (or wherever)’. He says that these images are constructed by four main components: what the industry releases as promotional products; what the critics for different media say; what the star says and does; and what the audience says about the artist. Dyer’s notion of a four-layer star is adopted here to understand the relationship between Morrissey and his audience since different audiences produce different meaning out of a star’s work. Still according to Dyer (1979:24), ‘in the early period, stars were gods and goddess, heroes, models – embodiments of *ideal* ways of behaving’, which contribute to the idea of stars as myths. According to Roland Barthes (1957:117), ‘*myth is a type of speech*’, and ‘*myth is a value*’ (Barthes, 1957:133) that results from the audience’s resignification of their object of adoration, which means that the meaning of a cult figure is always under construction.

Barthes (1977) sustains that the value of a myth is a collective representation which can be present in the press and mass consumer goods because it is something socially determined. The myth appears when the culture, or social culture, ideology or history are ‘naturalised’. Barthes (1977:165) considers the modern myth a ‘product of class division and its moral, cultural and aesthetic consequences are presented as being a “matter of course”’. Different from classic myth forms, the contemporary myth is no longer expressed through narratives. The modern stars ‘are identification figures, people like you and me – embodiments of *typical* ways of behaving’ (Dyer, 1979:24). The modern cult of celebrity produces stars that sometimes do not last long enough to become a myth or an idol. This new relationship between audience and mass media artists just proves the relevance of those artists that can achieve the status of cult figures and that manage to keep not only an audience but also the media interested in their works. Brazilian fans relate to Morrissey not only as a singer but also as myth, a star. This image is best described by Frith.

Frith (1996:212) believes that a pop star is constituted of three layers: singers can sing their own experience, 'enact both a star personality (their image) and a song personality, the role that each lyrics require'. Philip Auslander (2010:06) refers to these three layers as the real person, the performance persona, and the narrator present in the lyrics. Hirschi's (2008:20) French concept of 'canteur', which is the equivalent to a narrator in a novel, is the term chosen to refer in this thesis to a narrator for a song. According to John Ellis (1982:91), a star is 'a performer in a particular medium whose figure enters into subsidiary forms of circulation, and then feeds back into future performances'. This 'feeding back' works is a false attempt of completeness. Although the modern myth may be seen as a hermetic sign, Nicholas Greco (2011) insists that it is the incompleteness of the myth that makes it so irresistible to their audience. 'Each mediation of the celebrity is necessarily incomplete, giving the consumer or audience a 'stream' that is only partial and may even contradict the previous elements of the celebrity's star image' (Greco, 2011:94). The constant appearance of new clues about the 'complete' identity of the artist feeds the highly-involved audience of a certain artist with material to continue chasing new clues in the hope of achieve the completeness. Thus, the main strategy to maintain a celebrity status is a constant production of uncertainties about the celebrity's identity. One of the results of an uninterrupted provision of clues to describe a celebrity persona is the notion of mystery and unknown. According to Barthes (1974:17), the unknown is part of the enigma, the embodiment of the mystery. He analyses the constituents of what is enigmatic through a hermeneutic code. In this code, all units of the discourse function 'to articulate in various ways a question, its response, and the variety of chance events which can either formulate the question or delay its answer; or even, constitute an enigma and lead to its solution'.

As pieces of a puzzle, the small pieces of information about an artist are collected in order to form an 'identity'. The quality and quantity of these clues are crucial to produce the cult figure. Different from celebrities, cult figures are able to control the information fans receive. Morrissey is one of the artists whose personal life exposition is partially mediated by himself. The exposition of his figure, band and opinions during almost a decade, especially from 1984-1992¹⁸, served only to magnify some ambiguities present in his public persona and was not able to dissociate the artist from the man, an image

¹⁸ In the period, Morrissey was the cover on *NME* 12 times, and had 7 number 1 or 2 albums in the UK.

that was explored by the artist himself in his early interviews¹⁹. The constant interviews made available his political views about key aspects, such as monarchy, education, animals' rights, vegetarianism, literature and working class issues.

2.2 Translation Studies

If traditional forms of thinking art value depend on the aura and uniqueness of a piece, the mass media products and their reproduction in global scale represent their democratization and accessibility. Mass media products are unique in their multiplicity. Every copy of CD or DVD has its own meaning to its owner, and its never-ending possibility of reproduction does not diminish the sensation of pleasure a fan can experience. A popular form of art, like films, can be appreciated with virtually the same level of devotion when its text is transposed to the local language.

The traditional, linguistic definition of translation as 'the replacement of textual material in one language (Source Language) by equivalent material in another language (Target Language) formulated by Catford (1965:20), or the use of the term 'creative transposition' coined by Roman Jakobson (1959:238) applied to the translation of poetry badly fit for the translation of lyrics. The translation of lyrics usually requires more than finding an equivalent word because there are other elements that must be taken into consideration when producing musical lines in a target language. Franzon (2005:265) believes that, 'in song translation, adaptation may well be the only possible choice'. The term 'adaptation' opens space to different interpretations to which extent the maintenance of the original idea is kept in translation. According to Toury (1980:20), a 'translation is any target language utterance which is presented and regarded as such'. Toury's notion of translation and Franzon's idea of song translation are useful here because they summarise the relationship fan-translators in Brazil have with their Target Texts. There is a strong bond between fan-translator and reader, and Target Texts presenting 'expected'²⁰ translations are usually well received.

The acceptance of the Target Text does not have much to do with the amount of its original words or ideas kept in translation, but to how much of it serves its function in the Target Culture (Vermeer 2000, also Nord 1991 and 1997). The fan-translator of

¹⁹ The first reference in which Morrissey person is mixed with his public persona and the *canteur* appears in an interview to William Shaw, for *Zig Zag* Magazine in February 1984.

²⁰ 'Expected' here does not refer to how a text was expected to be translated, but to the fulfillment of the audience expectations of it, which sometimes can be very different.

lyrics in Brazil is filling a gap in a market that does not produce the products they demand. The lyrics they translated have the function to provide the type of texts they are not receiving anywhere else, both textually and semantically. These texts are usually loaded with cultural references. Lawrence Venuti (1995, 1998) believes that a translator of a given text must keep as many foreign aspects as presented in the Source Text, or add some foreignizing passages whenever possible. Venuti (1995:20) believes that any translator chooses between

A domesticating method, an ethnocentric reduction of the foreign text to target-language cultural values, bringing the author back home, and a foreignizing method, and ethnodeviant pressure on those values to register the linguistic and cultural difference of the foreign text, sending the reader abroad.

Following Antoine Berman (1985:89), Venuti believes that a ‘good translation is demystifying: it manifests in its own language the foreignness of the foreign text’. This practice is not very common, however, due to an editorial preference to what Venuti calls a ‘transparent’ translation in which the translator is a mere instrument in the process. The translator’s invisibility is the product of a translation which reads fluently,

when the absence of any linguistic or stylistic peculiarities makes it seem transparent, giving the appearance that it reflects the foreign writer’s personality or intention or the essential meaning of the foreign text – the appearance, in other words, that the translation is not in fact a translation, but the “original”. (Venuti, 1995:01)

Venuti (1995) defends that the idea of transparency in translation is more popular not only among editors but also among the readers. This preference is due to the fact that ‘the popular aesthetic requires fluent translations that produce the illusory effect of transparency, and this means adhering to the current standard language while avoiding any dialect, register, or style that calls the attention to words as words and therefore preempts the reader’s identification’ (Venuti, 1998:12). This ‘easy-to-read’ approach seems to be in accordance with the idea of an ‘easy-to-listen’ music proposed by Adorno.

According to Venuti, a literary translation can be conceived in two different ways. On one hand, the translator may seek transparency, and in order to achieve a fluent text whose appearance is of an original text, s/he ‘leaves the reader in peace, as much as possible, and moves the author towards him’ (Schleiermacher, 1813:43). The domestication of a text may not be a choice, but an imposition of the target

language/culture. It is more likely in translation of children's literature because a child's world knowledge is not yet complete. In Brazil, most versions of popular songs domesticate cultural aspects in order to provide a more intimate experience for listeners²¹. On the other hand, the translator may seek to maintain the text 'intact', inviting the readers to deal with aspects they are not familiarised with. The foreignisation seems to be a practice which serves well the amateur translators who translate their favorite artists' lyrics. Venuti's ideas of domestication and foreignization serve here to describe amateur translators' practices and preferences to render meaning in their Target Texts, analysed in chapters 4, 5 and 6.

Translation of songs and skopos theory

The challenge in translating songs lies in finding solutions to multiple constraints imposed by the pre-existing music, made of various complex features, such as rhythms, note-values, phrasing and stresses. These constraints refer to 'the physical limitations of the vocal apparatus, the metrical rigors of a rigid pre-set prosody, and the need to match verbal sense to musical color' (Apter 1989:27). The attention to rhymes and rhythm, which are components frequently found in lyrics, is one of the crucial points song translators face. The combination of all these variables creates an expectation that 'the target text must give the overall impression that the music has been devised to fit it, even though that music was actually composed to fit the ST' (Low, 2005:185). However, these expectations are rarely fulfilled.

In practice, it is noticeable that songs in translation, especially popular songs, resemble very little their original lyrics. The reason, according to Peter Low (2005), is that it would be unwise to adopt an approach that is loyal to the lyricist, focusing mainly on the characteristics of the Source Text. The focus lies instead in the function that particular song will present, stressing its importance in the target culture as an end-product.

The focus on the Target Text is defended by the functionalists and their skopos theory. Vermeer (2000:230) defines the term skopos to designate the 'goal or purpose, defined by the commission and if necessary adjusted by the translator'. Although the skopos theory is often considered more adequate to informative texts, Vermeer does not discard

²¹ In the Brazilian version of Steve Wonder's 'I just called to say I love you', the word 'Halloween' was translated as 'Carnaval', because Halloween is not commonly celebrated in Brazil.

its use in expressive texts, which is the case of songs and lyrics. In the case of song translation, the commissioner may be the singer/group/band who will sing it independent to the mean in which the song will be reproduced.

The functionalist approach (Vermeer, 1978:100) stresses that the methodology and strategies of translation should be determined by their *skopos*. It is the *skopos* that helps the translator ‘to determine whether the source text needs to be “translated”, “paraphrased”, or completely “re-edited”’ (Vermeer, 2000:231). Every song translated in order to supply a market need, fits in one or a combination of these forms of translation. This may be case of songs intended to be sung, but it cannot be applied in the case of amateur lyrics translation for understanding. Although the Source Text is translated, paraphrases are not very-welcomed among readers of lyrics and also not very popular with certain types of amateur translators²², and re-editions are not used by any of the amateur translators of popular songs.

The translation of pop songs

In the last ten years, the translation of songs has gathered space within Translation Studies. Andrew Kelly’s and Peter Low’s systems for the translation of lyrics seem to be the most used to analyse the translation of songs for singable purposes. Although this is not the aim of the translations studied in this work, their theories can be adapted taking into consideration the practice of amateur translators, and will be used in the analysis of the translations in Chapter 3.

A systematic study of translators’ work on popular songs started to gain visibility in the late 1980s, when Kelly developed a methodology to sytematise the translation of popular songs aiming to improve the learning of French. His study is based on a seven-item method in which ‘respect’ is the most important aspect since it determines the treatment given to the lyrics. Kelly (1987) considers that a translation must not be a copy of the source text in a different language, but that the original features should be preserved as much as possible in the target text. Kelly’s method is shaped in the form of advice. This advice covered aspects already present in the translation of poetry, but also included aspects concerned only with the translation of songs. Although these advices were created to translate popular songs, there is not a single feature that works exclusively for them. Kelly (1987) advises that a good translation of popular songs

²² Journalists use more paraphrases than fan-translators in Brazil.

should respect the rhythm, find and respect the meaning, respect the artists' style, respect the rhymes, respect the sound, respect your choice of intended listeners, respect the original.

The overlapping structure of Kelly's method was a first attempt to rationalise the practice of translating popular lyrics. More recently, Low (2003, 2005, and 2008) presented his strategy for the translation of lyrics. Low's experience as a musician²³ allowed him to formulate a more concise strategy to translate lyrics. Low's 'Pentathlon Approach', is based on five items, and the translator is supposed to keep a high regularity in each of these five items, but not necessarily have to score a five star in all of them to achieve the best result possible. The Pentathlon Principle cover such aspects as:

a) Singability: this principle deals with the effectiveness of the translation when performed. The translated song 'must function effectively as an oral text delivered at performance speed' (Low, 2003:93) taking into account that the audience may not have the lyrics in hand, and so, do not have another source but the voice to understand the text. Low's strategy to guarantee a good score in singability is the recitation, when the translator is able to identify consonant clusters and other types of problems the singer may face with the diction of the lyrics. Some changes are also advisable, according to him, in order to fit better the singer's vocal skills. A change of the definite 'the' for a demonstrative, as 'these', for example, produces longer vowels, which may bring some smoothness to the performance. Singability is only necessary for singable translations, being of no use for this work. Even if a few of the translators had tried to produce a singable translation, it is very improbable that readers were able to notice their efforts without a performance. The singability effort can be understood as a strategy to produce a target text whose fluency of reading may not find a mirror in the source text. Morrissey's lyrics present some intentional cacophonies and tongue twisters that contradict this item in the source language.

b) Sense: this principle claims for some flexibility. If other types of texts require some closeness to meaning, according to Low (2005:94), lyrics accept 'some stretching or manipulation of sense'. His advice to achieve a good balance in sense lies in changing a

²³ Peter Low, besides being a senior lecturer in French at the University of Canterbury, New Zealand, translated songs for singing and recitals, subtitles for operas, he is also a pianist, harpsichordist and songwriter.

precise word to a near-synonym, or to a superordinate term, a metaphor for another with similar function in context in order to keep the syllable-count. However, the author recognizes that some lyrics deserve more ‘respect’ due to their poetic merits or because the value of the original lies exactly on the lyrics. In that case, ‘sense’ should receive more attention. If the singable translation claims for more flexible possibilities in the use of words, the same cannot be said about translated lyrics which will only be used for understanding purposes. Once the original words normally appear in the same page as the translations, the readers instantly notice any change in sense. The higher is the level of commitment this reader has with the artist, the lower is their acceptance of flexibility in sense.

c) Naturalness: Low thinks it is advisable that the translation of a song sounds as if it was written in the listeners’ mother language. This item involves aspects such as register and word-order. ‘Naturalness’ aims a perfect communication between lyrics and audience in their first encounter. Low defends that ‘naturalness’ is a paramount in song translation (although it may not be in other kind of texts) because unnaturalness demands from the audience additional and superfluous processing effort, in which they may not be very interested. Naturalness may also be desirable in non-singable translation of lyrics. Even when the reader has the time/energy/technology to spend in trying to understand what is written, the translation may be better received if it reading flows easy. Naturalness in translation does not mean that the translator aims for a domesticated translation, but that any foreign word in the lyrics have to make sense for the reader when read.

d) Rhythm: according to Low, rhythm is a matter of syllable-count. In Low’s principles, the same number of syllables is just desirable, but not an obligation. As in Kelly’s strategy, it is also possible to add or subtract a syllable in ‘acceptable places’ (Low, 2003:97). The addition or subtraction of a syllable may change the rhythm, but not the melody. Low also suggests that any additional word must leave the impression that it is coming directly from the subtext of the lyrics. The addition of words also has the function of keeping the rhythm once they are inserted to adjust the number of syllables between source text and target text. Rhythm is not necessarily important in non-singable translation of lyrics once the reader is not interested in how fast some words may be sung or how long some syllables can be expressed. However, some sense of rhythm can

be achieved using a combination of words whose stressed syllables appears in strategic cyclical positions, mirroring the target text.

e) Rhyme: in a translated song, according to Low, the rhymes do not need to be perfect or as numerous as in the source text. The rhyme scheme also does not have to be strictly followed. His suggestion is to concentrate on the most important rhyme (the ‘clinging rhyme’), generally the last one, but not at the cost of the meaning or other items. Low (2008) developed a table to measure the quality of the rhymes in translation which starts in 10 points for vowel and consonants on both sides of the rhyme and ends in 1 point for different vowels. Although there are richer and poorer rhymes, choosing to use any of them does not make the target text a better translation. This table of points forgets to take into consideration the original rhymes. Attribute low points to a translation that can be just reproducing the same pattern of rhyme present in the original lyrics does not seem appropriate. The reproduction of the lyricist’s style seems to be more important than improving his/her rhyme pattern in translation. In a more recent review of his Pentathlon Approach, Low (2008:18) advises that ‘the guideline most emphasized here is this: be flexible about the frequency and quality of the rhymes’. Strangely, ‘rhymes’ is the only principle that deserved a table to measure its quality. It seems that Low’s notion of flexibility in the appearance of rhymes must be framed and quantified.

The Pentathlon Approach serves as a template to the development of a strategy that allows a general description of the translation of lyrics for understanding purposes, which is presented next.

Fan-translation: process and production

The proliferation of fan-translator is the product of technological developments. These developments not only popularised once professional, expensive softwares but also allowed fans to produce and distribute their own versions of their object of adoration or the work of their favourite artists. This type of translator is ‘more prepared to “innovate”, play around with the material in hand, retell it in a way that is likely to be more interesting and intelligible for their audience – often because they are themselves part of the audience’ (Pérez-González & Susan-Saraeva, 2012:158). Being part of the audience gives the fan-translator legitimacy and credibility among the fan community as an expert in the subject. ‘Fans such as these are notable not just for their ability to publicize, but also for their expertise’ (Baym and Burnett, 2009:439). The question on

the expertise on translational techniques is not often expressed. Their acceptance can be understood in two different ways. Tseng (1992) recognizes that bilingual individuals have an intuitive ability to produce translations. But not all fan-translators are bilingual in the sense that they have a high level of proficiency in the Target and Source Languages, some of them just have studied the foreign language for a short period of time. These fan-translators make use of what Toury (1995) named as 'native translation', in which the person acquires translation skills unconsciously from their exposition to translations as they do when developing their mother language. The application of native translation provides a notion that there is no need of any exclusive knowledge to be a translator, and that is why the audience does not feel that the fan-translator provides a translation with less quality than a professional translator.

Usually fan-translators are considered as co-creators who have the competence to deal with the costs, risks and rewards that may follow their interventions. Most interventions are made by means of 'self-mediation'. The term self-mediation generates some discomfort among scholars who believe that it makes superficial 'politics in the name of a narcissistic celebration of the private, the ordinary, the everyday' (Turner, 2010:22) or that see it only as unpaid/voluntary work which reproduces inequalities and asymmetries in the labour force (Scott, 2005; Beckett and Mansell, 2008; Thumin and Chouliaraki, 2010).

The celebration of the everyday pointed out by Turner (2010) not only popularized user-created content media such as YouTube or Wikipedia but also made visible that creative participation was not mere play, marketing or entertainment. Creative participation produces value for media industries, and points out how creative consumers have been 'working for nothing and beating the pros at their own game' (Grossman, 2006). Ross (2009:22) adverts that fan-translators' free work is 'a clear threat to the livelihoods of professional creatives whose price are driven down by, or who simply cannot compete with, the commercial mining of these burgeoning discount alternatives'. The notion of exploitation is commonly associated with fan-translator, whose work is seen as a profit-making provider in a capitalist market. However, the fan-translator work, as pointed out by Banks and Deuze (2009:423), 'cannot be reduced to one of simple manipulation at the hands of corporations and firms', especially because the translations provided by fan-translator were not commissioned or deliberately appropriated by the media but voluntarily given. Fan-translators do not perceive the 'donation' of a translation as work

but as leisure, and therefore do not conceive themselves as professionals or invading the professional field. The main discussion pervading the issue of fan-translators should be how user-created content is challenging the relations of cultural production and expertise that once marked established media professionals.

The discussion about the exploitation of user-creatives, and their impact on professional work force has low impact in Brazil, where the translator is not a recognised profession²⁴. In some countries, particular genres are not and never were translated by professional translators thus the work provided by the fan-translator does not intervene in the professional market as deeply as it does regarding more traditional genres of translations, such as literary translation. In Brazil, lyrics were never translated by ‘professional translators’, i.e. someone who has a degree in Translation Studies. Lyrics translation for understanding purposes is culturally accepted as a fan activity.

Being it a voluntary work or a narcissistic exercise, the work provided by fan-translators comes to prove that

Something is going on in the daily lives of media users worldwide that makes them (us) accept the fact that reality is constructed, assembled, and manipulated by media, and that the only way to make sense of that mediated world is to intervene and thus adjust our worldview accordingly (Deuze, 2006:66).

In order to make sense, the fan-translator becomes an active agent in the process of meaning-making, modifying manipulating and reforming consensual ways of understanding the world while formulating their own particular version of reality (Deuze, 2006). The communities around which they assemble share the same worldviews, providing the fan-translator a high level of acceptance because they incorporate ‘notions of mutuality, solidarity, interactivity and the freedom to choose affiliations’ (Deuze, 2006:68). They are part of a participatory culture which empowers its member to participatory authorship. The participatory authorship is inspired by private interests. Members of virtual communities seek to have their worldview heard, read, understood, and above all, they look for a collective identity. The same can be said about the public assembled in specific sections of major website providers’ pages. Morrissey fans do not comment on or try to contribute to the translations of Justin

²⁴ The list of recognised professions in Brazil can be found on <http://www.mtecbo.gov.br/cbosite/pages/regulamentacao.jsf#>. Interestingly, the profession of sign language translator was recognised on 1 Sept 2010, but not the translator of any foreign language. Last access on 03 October 2012.

Bieber's songs and vice-versa. Bloggs, however, are 'acts of self-assertion' (Chouliaraki, 2010:231) where participation is limited to their owners' specification, and therefore are less referred as sources of translations than other media in Brazil²⁵.

One of the main contribution of fan-translator is the consolidation of "common people peer production" structures inside translation and cultural and media industries (Benkler, 2006). Although the term 'bricolage'²⁶ is commonly used to describe fan-translators' work, the term peer production seems more adequate for the purpose of this work because 'peer production' can be understood as individuals discussing and working together to find a solution, while 'bricolage' brings the notion of a 'simple' assembly of given texts. The translation of lyrics in Brazil cannot be seen as an assembly, disassembly and reassembly activity, but as an under construction site whose part of the structure is tried to be discovered here. And, as pointed out by Deuze (2006), no version of the Target Text can be seen as final, especially because they can be changed in a matter of seconds, but as the raw material in which fan-translators' peers will mould the groups' visions of the text according to their sense of identity and their previously agreed ethics and ethics.

The communities formed around the translations of Morrissey's lyrics in Brazil resemble other types of communities of fan-translators in the sense they perform 'a foreignising translation of the text to provide viewers with a "closer" understanding of the original' (Pérez-González, 2012:336), which is a strong characteristic of fan-translation. Otherwise, the translation of songs in Brazil presents specific features.

While fansubbing²⁷ or scanlation²⁸ can be considered illegal because of the appropriation and retransmission of someone else's creative products, the translation of lyrics, does not substitute the pleasure of listening the songs. Listeners still have to access the song for themselves. Film-makers make profit selling the films to be broadcast. Singers do not make profit with their lyrics; they sell songs. The translation

²⁵ No references to blogs as sources of translations in virtual communities or major websites' pages of Morrissey's songs in translation were found during my study.

²⁶ According to Deuze (2006:66), *bricolage* is a 'highly personalised, continuous and more or less autonomous assembly, disassembly and reassembly of mediated reality'.

²⁷ According to Cintas & Sanches (2006: 37), a fansub is a fan-produced, translated, subtitled version of a Japanese anime programme'. I would add to that any other subtitling performed by fan. It is possible to find subtitled international TV series in many languages and countries.

²⁸ Scanlation is a compound of 'scan' and 'translation', which denominates the translation of mangas (a type of Japanese comics) by fans.

of lyrics does not even function as a direct artifact of advertisement for the artist because people only look for the translation of songs they already know and care to read the translation. Different from some countries, CD booklets in Brazil do not come with the translations of the songs²⁹, and translations are never released officially. The music industry in Brazil does not interfere with the fans' production of translations or seeks to tax them or the media where they appear for copyrights because it is perceived as an indirect form of advertisement for the artist.

Another difference is the level of dissatisfaction in fan-translations. The main complaint about fansubbing is the poor quality of their translations (Simó, 2005; Cintas, 2005; and Cintas & Sánchez, 2006). The main reason for the poor quality of Japanese Fansubbings used to be related to the fact that many of these translators, contradicting the advice that translators should translate into their mother tongue (Newmark, 1988:03), are 'Japanese native speakers producing subtitles in English' (Cintas & Sánchez: 2006:45). This translation serves as basis for many other translators from different languages and countries produce their own subtitles of the episode. So, any 'mistranslation' in the first fansubb will be passed to future translations into other languages. The same does not happen in Brazil where English is the most popular foreign language. The translations are made direct from the Source Language. The mistakes are not perpetuated because the 'publishing' format allows immediate 'correction'.

Although there are examples of fansubbing translators in Brazil, amateur translators of lyrics are the most common form of fan-translator. Their methods are not as sophisticated as the fansubbing translators because the technology used for the translation of lyrics is simpler than the one applied for subtitling, and their publication follows pre-established pattern or forms. The lyrics are collected from two main sources, the albums' lyrics sheet and live performances in the case of unreleased songs, usually copying them from international websites. After that, a first translation is produced and published. Subsequent revisions are carried out and republished. Fan-translators publish their translation on websites and virtual communities, while other types of amateur translator of lyrics, such as journalists, have their translations published on the magazines or newspapers where they work. The translation provided

²⁹ The booklet of Morrissey's Japan-only CD *Rare Tracks* (1998) brings the lyrics and translation of all songs side by side.

by amateur translators in Brazil can be described using a strategy which, different from Low, does not aim to give marks or advise how the translations should be done, but to describe the items that are more important for the Brazilian ‘market’ and how the translators deal with them. The strategy for the analysis of the translation of lyrics used here has four points based on the analysis of the comments fan-translators posted to explain their choices or to justify why they are suggesting changes for the translations posted on the virtual community *Morrissey – Letras Traduzidas* (2006-2012).

1. Meaning: Meaning is the most important feature of the lyrics because, if it is not reproduced in the translation of songs for understanding purposes, its translation has no reason to exist. Sometimes the meaning may not be there for some different reasons: a) there is a misunderstanding of the words in the lyrics; b) there is a misunderstanding of the meaning of sentences in the lyrics; c) implicit meanings are not very clear to the translator; d) there are different interpretations of the content of the lyrics, such as irony; e) there is an already accepted, pre-established understanding of the song.

The purpose of looking at the meaning of the lyrics in both languages is to discover how much of the meaning is kept in translation and discover if there is a pattern in the mistranslations and its causes, i.e. false cognates, words/concepts not present in the target culture and so on.

2. Fluency: Fluency has to do with how the translation sounds in the target language. Two main points seem to be relevant to secure fluency to a translation. The first one is the word order. Not all languages have the same structure, so the translator has to take into account if the order of the words used in the original is the ‘normal’ word order for that specific language. The idea is to check what type of language (written or oral) the translators chose to produce their texts. The second point deals with phonetic aspects of the language. Even if the song is not supposed to be sung, some phonetic elements when combined may produce cacophonous sounds or give the impression of another word/expression by the combination of the final sound of a word and the beginning of the other. In Brazilian Portuguese it is very common, as in ‘Me dá uma mão!’ (‘Give me a helping hand’) and ‘Me dá o mamão!’ (‘Hand me the papaya’), in which both sentences are pronounced exactly in the same way.

3. Style: Style can be defined as the broad particular way in which a lyricist writes, but it can also be identified in every lyrics once they can present their own singularities. The

main issues concerning ‘style’ are the choice of words (colloquial, formal, slangs, obscure etc) and how these words are combined in the text. Another question is the register the lyricist uses to deliver his message. Sometimes a song has two or more different voices that are differentiated by the use of distinct registers.

4. Sound: the ‘sound’ of the lyrics in this strategy does not look for the right vowel or consonant in translation to fit the same sound in the original but analyse if noticeable sounds like assonances or alliterations are kept in translation. The rhymes are also another issue that may be taken into consideration for the analysis of the lyrics. Although they are not essential for the purposes of the translation, they are part of the original lyrics’ features and can also be considered part of the lyricist’s style. This item does not have the intention to point out an absence in the existent translations, since it is quite predictable that most of them do not pay attention to rhymes, but to describe how the translator who tried to keep some rhymes carried out their task.

Summary

This chapter presented an overview on popular music studies, introducing key concepts on audience, fandom and how they interact with artists, producing cult figures and myths contradicting the view that popular music is not a high art form. The notion of highly-involved listeners and the psycho-sociology of fandom explain the interest some fans develop in producing their own expressions of the artist’s work.

The section on translation studies introduced the translation of songs with a special attention to the translation of popular songs. The Pentathlon Approach, which prescribes how lyrics should be translated, served as template for our strategy to describe the translations by amateurs in Brazil.

This chapter serves as basis to the analysis that is carried out next. Chapter Three presents the Source Text, establishing lyrics as a genre whose specifications must be taken into account in translation. Then, the corpus of the present work is introduced, focusing on the main aspects of the Source Texts. The context of the translations explains the different treatments each media presents in their Target Texts.