The desire to approach absolute values has been the foundation of religious beliefs, Utopian endeavours and artistic creation. It has inspired religious art and influenced the illumination of Haggadoth, relating the Exodus from Egypt to a faith in perennial salvation. Philo, in his book *The Special Laws* (vol. ii, p. 148), says with regard to the Festival of the Passover "On this day every dwelling house is invested with the outward semblance and dignity of a temple". This statement suggests the essence of the festival's ritual and the character of the medieval illuminated manuscripts describing it.

The Spanish Haggadoth, containing the ritual for Passover, are fairly numerous. Among them the John Rylands Library Haggadah is outstanding. It contains preliminary liturgies,

---

1 I wish to thank Professor E. Robertson, the Librarian of the John Rylands Library, for permission to study this manuscript. I also wish to thank Mr. P. R. Weis and Dr. M. Wollenstein for their advice with regard to the interpretation of the Hebrew text, Professor Wormald, Dr. S. A. Birnbaum and Dr. F. Taylor for valuable suggestions. Mr. J. Leveen of the British Museum put at my disposal Hebrew illuminated manuscripts, Professor Preissendanz manuscripts of the Heidelberg University Library, Mr. C. W. Dyson Perrins kindly allowed me to study the works in his possession, and the History of Art Department of the University of Manchester provided for the acquisition of photographs in connection with this study.

2 Hebrew MSS. no. 6. Collation: i (paper) + 57 (vellum) + ii (paper), made up as follows: a4, b3-f3, g10 (+ 1, fol. 55), h2. The Haggadah proper occupies fols. 13-36v, of which the miniatures are on fols. 13-19v. Fols. 1-19, 5, 11-13 and 37 are blank. On the remaining folios are ppyutim: fols. 2-4v, based on Exodus; 5v-7v, 'Azharoth, part of the 613 precepts, by Zarahyah Halevy; 8-10v, the first night of the Passover; 17v-41, the first day; 41-42v, the second day; 43-48, Hol ha Mo'edh Pesaḥ (the Passover week-day); 48-50v, the seventh day by Jehuda Halevy; 51-53v, the last day; 54-57v, grace after the meal, with some blessings on wine.

The most important publication on the subject is still D. H. Müller and J. von Schlosser, *Die Haggadah von Sarajevo*, Vienna, 1898. Mr. D. J. R.
twelve full-page illustrations representing the Exodus, one page describing the preparations and celebration of the "Seder" meal, the liturgy of the Haggadah proper and further liturgical poems. There exists a striking resemblance to the manuscript Or. 1404 in the British Museum.

The subjects and general arrangement of the full-page illuminations are identical in the two manuscripts, their sequence being as follows: (It will be noted that Moses and Aaron are frequently almost indistinguishable, and have to be interpreted with reference to the Old Testament text.)

I. A. Moses keeping Jethro's flock; Moses before the burning bush.
   B. Moses with a rod turned into a serpent; the serpent turned into a rod.

II. A. Moses seen twice putting his hand into his bosom and taking it out infected and cured.
   B. Moses taking his wife and sons to Egypt; circumcision of his son.

III. A. Moses and Aaron meeting in the wilderness; Aaron speaking the words of the Lord.
   B. The signs in the sight of the people.

IV. A. Moses and Aaron before Pharaoh and sorcerers.
   B. Taskmaster and the children of Israel.

V. A. Pharaoh and sorcerers; the rod turned into serpents.
   B. Moses and Aaron before Pharaoh; the river turned into blood.

VI. A. The plague of frogs. (Here the narrative moves from left to right, contrary to the general arrangement, which follows the Hebrew custom, of moving from right to left. This is no doubt due to the unaltered taking over of a Christian model.)
   B. The plague of lice.

VII. A. The plague of flies. (Including serpents.)
    B. Moses and Aaron before Pharaoh; the cattle in a landscape, some dying from murrain.

Scott just returned from Sarayevo kindly informs me that the marginal decorations and the gold lettering are less conspicuous than in the Rylands Library Haggadah, and the colouring is less strong. It is unfortunate that no detailed information is available from the authorities of the Musée de la République Populaire, who, however, informed the writer that no decorated pages similar to those containing the Hymn "How great are the calls of the Almighty" exist in their Haggadah.

VIII. A. Pharaoh and followers; Moses and Aaron; boils on men and beasts.
   B. The plague of hail, including a representation of Pharaoh losing his crown in anguish.
IX. A. The plague of locusts.
   B. The plague of darkness.
X. A. The smiting of the first-born. (Much abbreviated in Or. 1404.)
   B. The borrowing of jewels.
XI. A. The people take their dough, their kneading troughs on their shoulders.
   B. The pursuit of Pharaoh and the Egyptians.
XII. The drowning of the Egyptians and the children of Israel walking through the sea.
XIII. A. The killing and roasting of the lamb. The painting of the lintel with hysop.
   B. Two families celebrating the Seder.

The style of the illuminations is familiar from Spanish manuscripts, although some of the formal elements in the decorated margins are unusual, as will be shown below.¹ The preliminary pages of illustrations are succeeded by the text of the Haggadah ritual which is richly illuminated by monumental lettering in blue, mauve, red and other colours and gold leaf, forming borders and panels, emphasizing important passages and the beginning of sections. In the Rylands Haggadah the representations of the "mazzah", the unleavened bread, in gold leaf and the "maror", the bitter herb, in a green stylised fleur-de-lys-like pattern are included in the text. Marginal figures are also related to the text, such as the "Wise Son", the "Wicked Son" and the seated figures of the Rabbis Jose, Eliezer and Akiba, as well as Gamaliel, the latter being especially singled out by a canopied seat, reminiscent of the Evangelists and scribes in Christian illumination. The marginal single figures belong therefore to a Jewish iconographic programme, although they are not integrated in the decorations and thus reminiscent of the full-page pictures which are kept separate from the text; the marginal drolleries (humorous figures) are executed in the ruling Gothic style of the period, without any particular reference to Jewish subject-matter.

The great emphasis given to the Hymn "Kamah maalot towot"—"How great are the calls of the Almighty"—by its drolleries is unusual in the Rylands Haggadah and distinguishes it from other related manuscripts. The nearest parallels to the style of its drolleries are found in England, developing from the Rutland to the Gorleston Psalters. It is worth considering whether the Expulsion of the Jews from this country in 1290 may have exerted an influence on the spreading of the style of English illuminations, since the Jews were not only allowed to keep unredeemed pledges deposited by Christians but some remained in this country for some time; subsequently an English manuscript may easily have found its way into a Jewish-Spanish scriptorium. It is worth noting that the illuminator seems not to have copied, but to have interpreted freely, the models he chose, a characteristic fact with regard to the quality of his work, which will also appear in other instances.

Special emphasis is given to the "Wicked Son", who is represented as a Moorish warrior, according to Müller an indication that the Haggadah of Sarayevo and the manuscripts connected with it are of Spanish origin. But the relations between Jews and Moslems were cordial and therefore no reason existed to represent the "Wicked Son" as being of a dark complexion. There exists, however, a Jewish literary tradition for portraying the "Wicked Son" as black, based on Genesis xxxvi, 7, and interpreted in Midrash Rabbah: "Your seed will be ugly and dark-skinned".2

The Spanish origin of the Rylands Haggadah explains not only the general style of its illumination but more specifically the Islamic influence which can be seen in the arrangement of the Hebrew lettering in decorative panels and borders. This


2 Müller, op. cit. p. 96. Midrash Rabbah. Translated and edited by H. Freedman, vol. i, 1939. A friendly attitude is expressed by the attendance of a Moor, presumably a servant, at the Passover meal of the Haggadah of Sarayevo. Incidentally, no member partaking in the ritual is seen with a Jewish hat.
arrangement evokes Kufic script and is particularly striking in a "gate motif", one broader panel supported by two vertical ones, a large panel marking the beginning and the conclusion of the first part of the Hymn "How great are the calls of the Almighty" respectively. This architectural arrangement is reminiscent of structural decorations such as those of 1085 on the mihrab of the mosque of al-Guyushi or on the framework of the gates of the Alhambra.¹

The close relationship between the British Museum Haggadah Or. 1404 and the Rylands Haggadah can be observed by comparing the pages of the Haggadah liturgy proper, in which the layout of the lettering and drolleries is similar, and the same can also be said of the programme and execution of the full page illustrations. They share with other Spanish Haggadoth the underlying attitude, which presents realistic scenes in their ritual connections but are singled out among them by their close relationship. The Seder feast and its attributes are seen not only as singular happenings, but as the tokens of the ever recurring miracle of deliverance; in Or. 1404 these scenes are spread over two pages whilst the more compact arrangement of the Rylands Haggadah concentrates on one page only. Particularly noticeable are the drolleries of the former, whilst its Hymn "How many are the calls" has the lettering arranged according to the "gate motif" on top of the page discussed above. In Or. 1404 the scribe, whose framework was set by the illuminator, since text and illumination are connected, did not allow for sufficient space and had therefore to squeeze in a number of words in abbreviation or in smaller lettering. On the other hand, the Rylands Haggadah starts the incantation with the panel of the "gate motif" in the middle of a page and allows full space for the artistic development of the treatment of the lettering, the word "Dayenu" being shown in small gold letters against a rectangular panel connected with the border. The conclusion of the chant is identical with the beginning in its layout of a large panel of lettering, so that these passages are

¹ Cf. K. A. C. Creswell in *Art Bulletin*, March 1953, pp. 1 ff., especially Fig. 3.
related not only as subject matter, but also in their ornamental
layout in both manuscripts (see Pl. I.).

Marked differences between the Rylands Haggadah and Or. 1404 exist in that the panels for the word Dayenu have been dropped in the latter, thus strengthening the vertical aspect of the relevant pages. As has been noted, the "gate motif" is used in Or. 1404 to commence the section on top of the page, whilst it is seen lower down in the Rylands Haggadah. The panels for captions of the full page illustrations are included for both the higher and lower portions in the lay-out of Or. 1404, whereas the separate upper panels seem unconnected in the Rylands Haggadah. The lower ones are not provided in illuminations XII and XIII, which are treated as one unit from the point of view of content, this feature being found in both manuscripts. As to the figures, they are more numerous and animated in the Rylands Haggadah, and the colouring there is more delicate. As to details of illuminations, in Number VI, for example, Moses is seen in dramatic gesticulation, toned down in Or. 1404; in illumination X of Or. 1404, the dying of a prisoner has been so simplified as not to be understood easily without recourse to the Rylands Haggadah, where a variety of scenes illustrates the different social classes. A slight coarsening and lack of respect for Jewish tradition is seen in the introduction of a head in the design of the "Burning Bush" in illumination I of Exodus of Or. 1404. It may, therefore, be concluded that the Rylands Haggadah represents a more original and sensitive work, its author experimenting whilst producing it. The manuscript Or. 1404 has to be regarded as a free copy, adding some compositional improvements with regard to the arrangement of the "gate motif", and vertical panels, but on the whole coarsening its model and multiplying detail, such as the Seder scenes. A great deal remains in common between the manuscripts, however, one of the characteristics being the arrangement of the original captions, which are added to the Exodus stories above the pictures in two bands, mainly based on abbreviated Old Testament quotations, but including descriptive words, such as "Pharaoh", "sorcerers", "blood", which clearly show that they were
added after the completion of the pictures, in order to facilitate their understanding.

That the Rylands Haggadah influenced Or. 1404 is also clear from stylistic comparisons, since the latter is more advanced in style and shows, for example, in the picture of the Seder meal included in the text (illumination XIV) a stress on spatial depth which connects Or. 1404 with Italian Trecento work.

There cannot be any doubt that the Master of the Haggadah Ritual was the main scribe and illuminator of the Rylands Haggadah, since the outlines of the borders and the decorative lettering as well as of the figures are identical, so that no separation is possible between them, and this in the most literal sense of the word. Especially striking are the similarity of the ornamental backgrounds in the full page illustrations and those of the panels of lettering. The liturgical poems enclosing the Rylands Haggadah Ritual proper are decorated by bands in blue and purple tints of a "grisaille" character. They include four vertical panels, two with ornamental plant forms, two showing animals reminiscent of oriental patterns. These ornaments consist of diminutive Hebrew letters, derived from the Masorah, set against an ornamental background, which forms an unusual enrichment of the lettering. Artistically the prototypes of these forms go back to the early Middle Ages, where ornamental letters and decorative patterns of lettering are well known. But the illuminator of this portion of the Rylands Haggadah is unusual in the combination of elements derived from different sources, and in that resembles the Master of the Haggadah Ritual.\footnote{Cf. W. Stassow and D. Günzburg, \textit{L'ornement hébraïque}, Berlin, 1905.} It is worth noting that in the Appendix of Or. 1404 the "masoretic" lettering is absent, thus simplifying the decoration. This may be due to the fact that the main part of Or. 1404 was copied before the inclusion of the liturgical Appendix.

The similarity in artistic treatment of the different parts of the Rylands manuscript suggests that they are, if not the work of one designer, at least of one scriptorium, the only exception being the last four pages, which are of a later date, crude.
and old-fashioned in style and of poor quality. The additional captions at the side of the full page illustrations may well be by the same hand, possibly as late as about 1700.

It is a well-known fact that Jews worked as artists in Spain, but it is doubtful which particular manuscripts may be assigned to them,\(^1\) since all internal evidence is lacking. Starting off with the Dayenu page in the Rylands Haggadah, one is confronted with such an intimate relationship of meaning and lettering that the Master of the Haggadah Ritual has to be regarded as a Jew. If this hypothesis is denied, one has to assume a Jewish mind guiding a Gentile artist, a sort of "Raphael without hands", and this surely is the less likely theory. It is in this light that the other Spanish Haggadoth have to be considered. More difficult is the assessment of the Jewish contribution with regard to the full page illuminations. In the case of the Rylands Haggadah the colouring and style of figures is so similar to the drolleries that unity of the scriptorium, although not necessarily of hands, has been assumed. This may well apply to most Haggadoth, including the Sarayevo Haggadah, but not to Add. 27210 of the British Museum, in which a discrepancy of style exists between the typical Spanish-Hebrew type of lettering and the illuminated pages, which clearly denote a French, markedly Christian, influence.

It has to be borne in mind when assessing the iconographic importance of the Haggadath that some are derived from older Biblical cycles affording fuller and more varied illustrations. To this tradition belong the Haggadah of Sarayevo and the British Museum manuscripts Or. 2884, as well as Add. 27210. But these facts are insufficient to establish their chronology, as Schlosser suggests.\(^2\)

When comparing the Haggadah of Sarayevo with that in the Rylands Library, it appears that the richer iconographic programme of the former is deeply indebted to Christian prototypes. To quote one example: the French Bible Moralisée of the thirteenth century in the Rylands Library edited by Dr. R. Fawtier shows Latin inscriptions on the panel frames, comparable

\(^1\) A. L. Mayer in Italiener, op. cit. pp. 51 ff.
\(^2\) Müller, op. cit. pp. 211 ff.
476 THE JOHN RYLANDS LIBRARY

to the Hebrew ones in the Spanish Haggadoth. The earth in the shape of a sphere found there held by and in juxtaposition with God on the First Day reflects a popular prototype for the Third Day. It is retained as the main feature of the representation of the days of creation in the Sarayevo Haggadah, the figure of God being eliminated, a fact which suggests that the seated man as an emblem of the Sabbath is a youth resting, and not the Creator. The creation of the world is thus shown not by God revealed in the act, but by the effects of his activity. This disposes of the unlikely interpretation of God resting on the Sabbath, propounded by Schlosser and accepted by other writers including Leveen.

One is also struck by a difference of style between the Haggadah of Sarayevo and that of the Rylands Library, with regard to the full page pictures, since the former is more closely related to the graceful elongated outlines of French illuminated manuscripts such as are found in Add. 27210. Both show a slight Italian influence, whilst the realism of the Rylands Haggadah exists in more characteristically Spanish works. As far as can be judged from the facsimile edition of the Sarayevo Haggadah, its drolleries are restrained; and the chant "How great are the calls of the Almighty" has received no special artistic emphasis, since it is not mentioned in the relevant list of Schlosser. The representation of the Temple is similar to the frankly Gothic rendering in the fourteenth century manuscript of Peter Comestor's *Historia Scholastica*. But whereas the latter depicts the Solomonic Temple and fittings in six panels, the Sarayevo Haggadah reproduces only one, simplifying the type and omitting the faces of the Cherubim. The comparison with the


2 This tradition is not without importance historically. It is alive in the representation of John Gower shooting at the world, the illumination of a manuscript of *Vox Clamantis* (British Museum, Cotton MS., Tiberius, A IV). It is seen in the representation of the earth on the closed vollets of the "Millennium" by Hieronymos Bosch now in the Prado Museum in Madrid, and may even inspire late eighteenth century designs of the universe as found in French drawings. (Cf. H. Rosenau, *Boullee's Treatise on Architecture*, London, 1953.)

3 Pp. 34 and 101 respectively.

4 Schlosser, op. cit. pp. 44 ff.

5 Bordona, op. cit. pl. 111 (Madrid, National Library, R. 199).
illumination in the *Historia Scholastica* implies that it is the first Temple which is represented in the Haggadah of Sarayevo. The latter's caption, which might well be of a later date, is ambiguous and can designate the Solomonic as well as the Messianic Temple, but in view of the comparison with the *Historia Scholastica* the former interpretation is to be preferred. In this connection it is interesting to recall a group of eighteenth century Polish and German synagogues, which were decorated with wall paintings on which towns were prominently seen, as, for example, the picture of Jerusalem in Kirchheim, which belonged to the Würzburg Museum. The Temple and Jerusalem express the same meaning: both stand for redemption.\(^1\) The delicate colouring of the Haggadah of Sarayevo connects it with French Bibles from which the detailed description of Genesis, unusual in Gothic Haggadah illuminations, derive. Other examples of Christian influence are found in the Haggadah with the French style of illuminations belonging to the Spanish rite in the British Museum (Add. 27210), especially in the scene of Miriam leaving Egypt with her two children, reminiscent of the Flight from Egypt.\(^2\)

It has been observed above that the iconography of the Rylands Haggadah and Or. 1404 corresponds. The same is true of the style, which is based formally on Gothic sources, mainly French, but adapted in Christian Spain, and with an addition of English influences for the drolleries. Added to this are some Italian influences in Or. 1404 which shows spatial architectural motives, such as are found on the second illumination (XIV) representing the Seder meal and preparation, which seem derived from North Italian, perhaps Bolognese, sources.\(^3\) But in spite of these influences, the style has been adapted to the designs

---

\(^1\) On the relationship between Temple and Synagogue, cf. Megillah, 29a of the Babylonian Talmud. This relationship is stressed by S. Krauss, *Synagogale Altertümer*, Leipzig, 1922. Cf. also the present writer in *A Short History of Jewish Art*, London, 1948, where the importance of the orientation towards Jerusalem is stressed on p. 15 and also pp. 53 and 55, with notes.

\(^2\) Leveen, op. cit. p. 100. The same scene is found in the Rylands Haggadah, Or. 1404 and Or. 2884.

prevalent in the scriptorium, and no particular Italian model
seems to have been copied. The facts enumerated above make it
clear that the Rylands Haggadah is earlier than Or. 1404, which
is to a large extent copied from it, probably in the same scrip­
torium. Since Italian motives, expressing spatial relations also
abound in the Haggadah of Sarayevo and are missing in the
Rylands Haggadah, this also corroborates the latter's earlier
date.

The fact that its cycle is more restricted than that of either
the probably late thirteenth century manuscript Add. 27210,
the later Or. 2884 in the British Museum or of the Sarayevo
Haggadah has no bearing on the question of chronology, since,
as stated above, Bible illustrations precede those of Haggadoth,
and shorter or longer extracts from biblical types could be
made at will.

It is unfortunate that none of the Haggadoth belonging to
the groups here studied possesses an exact date. The dating of
the Sarayevo Haggadah has hitherto depended on its ambiguous
inscription, relating to a sale, which may be read either 1314 or
1510; the lettering as well as the recording of the sale as such
seem to indicate the later date, which is historically useless, since
the work belongs obviously to the fourteenth century.¹ The
question remains, whether it should be assigned to the begin­
ning or the middle of this period. At the present no con­
clusive answer to this question is possible, but the latter period
appears more likely. The Rylands manuscript, which seems
earlier than the Sarayevo Haggadah, should therefore be dated
about 1320-30,² that is rather earlier than the manuscripts Or.
1404, Or. 2884 and that of Sarayevo, but later than the Haggadah
Add. 27210 of the British Museum, commonly dated in the late
thirteenth century.

The literal and isolated interpretation of iconographic themes
has obscured the underlying meaning of medieval manuscripts,

² This date is confirmed by a study of the armours represented in the Rylands
Haggadah and Or. 1404, which, according to Mr. C. Blair, can be dated to the
period 1320-30. The latter shows that later copies frequently retain the original
armour or fashion design. Similarly, in writing, an older man habitually con­
tinues using shapes taught in his youth.
whether Jewish or Christian. Only when the illustrations are studied in their sequence is their allegorical or anagogical meaning revealed.\(^1\) For example, in the Haggadah of Sarayevo the picture of the Temple precedes that of the Synagogue, since the Synagogue took the former's place in worship, thus establishing the relationship between the two subjects, in the way so well formulated by Philo, quoted above. Between them is seen the home which could take the place of the Synagogue. Nor is talmudic authority lacking. "At the time when the Temple stood, the altar used to make atonement for a person: now a person's table makes atonement for him."\(^2\) Even as late as in Heine's famous fragment "Der Rabbi von Bacherach" of 1820-31 the festive and holy aspect of the Seder and the traditional attitude of the participants are vividly stressed.

The formal and liturgical character of the Spanish Haggadoth is distinctive. No trace appears of the popular trends which are so noticeable in the later German groups, of which the Rylands Library also possesses a good specimen.\(^3\)

The scenes in the Rylands Haggadah can be divided into two main types from the point of view of costume. Among the fully illustrated pages some figures are dressed in contemporary fashion, especially noticeable in the knights representing the Israelites crossing the Red Sea, and the same can be said of the drolleries. The interiors showing the Seder are enlivened by figures in costly and elaborate contemporary garments, stressing the fashionable element. None of the illustrations shows a Jewish garb or hat, since the differentiation between Christians and Jews based on the edicts of the Lateran Council of


\(^3\) Typical is the picture of the Jewish children hidden behind a curtain in an orchard in this manuscript. The illumination is based on Sotah 11b of the Babylonian Talmud. It has been wrongly interpreted as representing monkeys (Müller, op. cit. p. 186). Incidentally the mnemonic formula as represented in illuminations of "Jagd den Haas" (Yaknehas) was popular with German Jews, and goes back to a frequent motif found in Spain. It was adapted but not created as a help to students for the recital of the Kiddush of certain festivals.
11 November 1215 was not strictly enforced in Spain. Furthermore, the Jewish tradition that the head should be covered on religious occasions (based mainly on Exodus iii. 6) was not strictly enforced during the Middle Ages. Jews, when "called to the Law" in the synagogues were bareheaded, states Mr. Hyamson with regard to France and Germany, a fact also mentioned by Italiener who points out that the Spanish Jews were commended for covering their heads, as is seen in Seder and Synagogue representations. Since the artistic prototypes are Christian, and no strong feeling against bareheadedness obtained it is not surprising that the Rabbis are seen in this manner. From time to time, however, Jews were made to wear a round badge, three to four fingers wide, whilst the "capa rotunda" was required in Barcelona after 1283. The signs of shame were almost entirely suppressed in Spanish illumination, although in the fifteenth century, especially in Germany, the Jews appear in their decorations less sensitive in this matter. Perhaps by then they had become used to discriminatory laws. But as a general statement it is true to say that any special restrictions on Jews in costume were ignored in illumination as well as in current custom in Spain.

The marginal figures of Rabbis in the Rylands manuscript reflect the classical tradition, as found in the Christian iconography of Evangelists and scribes, mentioned above. In the Seder scene in the British Museum manuscript Or. 1404 the male participants are also seen without hats, no doubt influenced by the iconography of the Last Supper.

These Jewish manuscripts thus differ from the typical Christian ones, in which the Jews are strikingly characterized by their costume, especially the Jewish hat, and sometimes also by a protruding nose. This does not apply, however, to the figures of Christ and the Apostles, whom it is unusual to find

represented as Jews, an exception being the twelfth century English "Life of Christ" in the Perrins Collection, where Christ and the Apostles are seen with Jewish hats, set against haloes. Well known examples of the Jewish hat are found in the Spanish Bible of 1273 in the Perrins Collection by Johannes Poncii, the figures in relief of the Naumburg rood screen and the Jewish Minnesinger Süsskind von Trimberg as represented in the "Manesse Handschrift" in Heidelberg which in turn goes back to representations of legal scenes as found in the Heidelberg manuscript of the Sachenspiegel. It also perhaps appears in three of the men in the scene of the Seder in the British Museum Haggadah Or. 2884. In this it is at variance with both the Rylands Haggadah and British Museum Or. 1404, as stated above. A difference of colour is also striking in the former manuscript, especially in the predominance of red. There the design of the Hymn ending in "Dayenu" is not singled out artistically to the same extent, although it possessed a flower border, now partly trimmed off. The costume worn by Jews when represented in Synagogue is similar in all the manuscripts mentioned and analogous to that of Christians, except that their heads are covered with hoods, the white one of the reader being possibly a "tallit", a prayer shawl in Or. 2884. Incidentally the lamps represented here and in numerous Seder scenes are identical with Moslem ones, the Arabic script only being lacking.

The prototypes of the illustrations of the Exodus as seen in the Haggadoth may be reconstructed from the wall paintings of Dura-Europos of the third century. Here the large repeated

1 No. 1 of the Catalogue, op. cit.
2 The Jewish hat is a marked feature of Süsskind. Cf. B. Badt, Die Lieder des Süsskind von Trimberg, Berlin, 1920, whose conclusions we mainly accept. The scepticism voiced by R. Straus in Jewish Social Studies, vol. x (1948), pp. 19 ff. seems to respond to antisemitism by an inverted nationalism. Cf. also Allgemeine Deutsche Biographie and Encyclopaedia Judaica under "Barhäuptigkeit, Kleidung, Judenzeichen".
figures of Moses are dominant in scale over the Israelites, and
their enemies the Egyptians. But older specimens of such
Biblical illustrations may have existed, as reflected in the
"Jonah" sarcophagus of Arles, for example. Dura itself was
no more than a provincial outpost and must have been in­
fluenced by artistic centres like Antioch and Alexandria.
Finkelstein's theory, dating the passover Haggadah as early as
the Talmudic period, tends to give additional weight to the
evidence in Dura.

Two iconographic details are worth noting: the division
into stripes of the panels of victorious Israelites and Egyptians
drowning among large fish is found in Dura as well as in some of
the Spanish Haggadoth, although the number of these divisions
varies: two vertical panels are found in Dura, whilst five hori­
zontal panels appear in the Rylands Library Haggadah, and four
in Or. 1404 of the British Museum (see Pl. II). This scene is less
popular in Christian cycles, for which it was comparatively mean­
ingless, whereas for the Jews the deliverance from Egypt is
traditionally regarded as the foundation of their future existence as
a people. The Sarayevo Haggadah contains a picture of the
Temple, as stated above. The "Aaronic" Temple as a classical
building is also seen in Dura, and appears in Palestinian syna­
gogues, such as in Beth Alpha. The city of Jerusalem, frequently
seen in eighteenth century paintings, continues the meaning, if not
the form, of this tradition. The picture of the Temple or
Jerusalem seen in the synagogue, expresses the latter's religious
significance. In the Sarayevo Haggadah the Temple is found,
together with the distribution of the Seder meal and the exterior of
the Synagogue, which clearly relates the three places, as united in
holiness. Pictorial representations of synagogues of the Roman
Imperial period are known in an abbreviated form, since the
Torah shrine revealing the Scrolls and ritual objects appear on

1 F. Gerke, Die christlichen Sarkophage, Berlin, 1940, passim. Cf. also O.
Wulff, Appendix to Altchristliche und Byzantinische Kunst, Bibliographisch­
kritischer Nachtrag, Berlin, 1939 and Leveen, op. cit. p. 120 for a survey of
some of the most important contributions to this problem.
3 Cf. Rosenau, op. cit. especially pp. 14, 47 ff.
Synagogues as a realistic subject-matter for illumination seem, however, to have been a medieval innovation. Their style is derived from Italian prototypes, emphasizing interiors and their spatial effects. But the iconographic content is new, and led to a re-interpretation of form.

Uninterrupted and continuous tradition characterizes the life of the Spanish Jews, as is well known. This is found, for example, in their retention of the original pronunciation of Hebrew, the building of synagogues with galleries and their flat tombstones derived from sarcophagi. This continuity lends support to the theory of a Jewish pictorial development, partially submerged at later times, but re-appearing in the Haggadoth and slowly being reconstructed by recent research. With the help of medieval illuminations, the Dura paintings and the Early Christian sarcophagi with their Old Testament cycles, attempts can be made to understand the development of Jewish iconography. In this evolution the Spanish Haggadoth take an important place, the manuscript in the John Rylands Library presenting in its artistic unity and quality an outstanding example.


Cf. C. R. Morey, *Early Christian Art*, Princeton, 1942, especially p. 71, and the authorities quoted in notes. C. Roth's article in the *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* XVI, 1953, Nos. 1-2, appeared after the completion of this study. It adds a number of valuable details to the hypothesis presented as a proof of a Jewish influence through illuminated Hebrew Bibles on Early Christian art, but ignores the fundamental difference between the architectural aspects of the Temple and the Torah shrine, already pointed out by the present writer in 1936 (cf. above note). Cf. on this problem the well-documented study of C. Wendel, *Der Thoraschein im Altertum*, Halle 1950.
